

THE NEW MIDDLE AGES

BONNIE WHEELER, *Series Editor*

The New Middle Ages is a series dedicated to transdisciplinary studies of medieval cultures, with particular emphasis on recuperating women's history and on feminist and gender analyses. This peer-reviewed series includes both scholarly monographs and essay collections. The following books have all been published by Palgrave:

- Women in the Medieval Islamic World: Power, Patronage, and Piety*
edited by Gavin R. G. Hambly
- The Ethics of Nature in the Middle Ages: On Boccaccio's Poetaphysics*
by Gregory B. Stone
- Presence and Presentation: Women in the Chinese Literati Tradition*
by Sherry J. Mou
- The Lost Love Letters of Heloise and Abelard: Perceptions of Dialogue in Twelfth-Century France*
by Constant J. Mews
- Understanding Scholastic Thought with Foucault*
by Philipp W. Rosemann
- For Her Good Estate: The Life of Elizabeth de Burgh*
by Frances A. Underhill
- Constructions of Widowhood and Virginity in the Middle Ages*
edited by Cindy L. Carlson and Angela Jane Weisl
- Motherhood and Mothering in Anglo-Saxon England*
by Mary Dockray-Miller
- Listening to Heloise: The Voice of a Twelfth-Century Woman*
edited by Bonnie Wheeler
- The Postcolonial Middle Ages*
edited by Jeffrey Jerome Cohen
- Chaucer's Pardoner and Gender Theory: Bodies of Discourse*
by Robert S. Sturges
- Crossing the Bridge: Comparative Essays on Medieval European and Heian Japanese Women Writers*
edited by Barbara Stevenson and Cynthia Ho
- Engaging Words: The Culture of Reading in the Later Middle Ages*
by Laurel Amtower
- Robes and Honor: The Medieval World of Investiture*
edited by Stewart Gordon
- Representing Rape in Medieval and Early Modern Literature*
edited by Elizabeth Robertson and Christine M. Rose
- Same Sex Love and Desire Among Women in the Middle Ages*
edited by Francesca Canadé Sautman and Pamela Sheingorn
- Sight and Embodiment in the Middle Ages: Ocular Desires*
by Suzannah Biernoff
- Listen, Daughter: The Speculum Virginum and the Formation of Religious Women in the Middle Ages*
edited by Constant J. Mews
- Science, the Singular, and the Question of Theology*
by Richard A. Lee, Jr.
- Gender in Debate from the Early Middle Ages to the Renaissance*
edited by Thelma S. Fenster and Clare A. Lees
- Malory's Morte Darthur: Remaking Arthurian Tradition*
by Catherine Batt
- The Vernacular Spirit: Essays on Medieval Religious Literature*
edited by Renate Blumenfeld-Kosinski, Duncan Robertson, and Nancy Warren
- Popular Piety and Art in the Late Middle Ages: Image Worship and Idolatry in England 1350–1500*
by Kathleen Kamberick
- Absent Narratives, Manuscript Textuality, and Literary Structure in Late Medieval England*
by Elizabeth Scala
- Creating Community with Food and Drink in Merovingian Gaul*
by Bonnie Effros
- Representations of Early Byzantine Empresses: Image and Empire*
by Anne McClanan

- Encountering Medieval Textiles and Dress: Objects, Texts, Images*
edited by Désirée G. Koslin and Janet Snyder
- Eleanor of Aquitaine: Lord and Lady*
edited by Bonnie Wheeler and John Carmi Parsons
- Isabel La Católica, Queen of Castile: Critical Essays*
edited by David A. Boruchoff
- Homoeroticism and Chivalry: Discourses of Male Same-Sex Desire in the Fourteenth Century*
by Richard Zeikowitz
- Portraits of Medieval Women: Family, Marriage, and Politics in England 1225–1350*
by Linda E. Mitchell
- Eloquent Virgins: From Thecla to Joan of Arc*
by Maud Burnett McNerney
- The Persistence of Medievalism: Narrative Adventures in Contemporary Culture*
by Angela Jane Weisl
- Capetian Women*
edited by Kathleen Nolan
- Joan of Arc and Spirituality*
edited by Ann W. Astell and Bonnie Wheeler
- The Texture of Society: Medieval Women in the Southern Low Countries*
edited by Ellen E. Kittell and Mary A. Suydam
- Charlemagne's Mustache: And Other Cultural Clusters of a Dark Age*
by Paul Edward Dutton
- Troubled Vision: Gender, Sexuality, and Sight in Medieval Text and Image*
edited by Emma Campbell and Robert Mills
- Queering Medieval Genres*
by Tison Pugh
- Sacred Place in Early Medieval Neoplatonism*
by L. Michael Harrington
- The Middle Ages at Work*
edited by Kellie Robertson and Michael Uebel
- Chaucer's Jobs*
by David R. Carlson
- Medievalism and Orientalism: Three Essays on Literature, Architecture and Cultural Identity*
by John M. Ganim
- Queer Love in the Middle Ages*
by Anna Klosowska Roberts
- Performing Women: Sex, Gender and the Medieval Iberian Lyric*
by Denise K. Filios
- Necessary Conjunctions: The Social Self in Medieval England*
by David Gary Shaw
- Visual Culture and the German Middle Ages*
edited by Kathryn Starkey and Horst Wenzel
- Medieval Paradigms: Essays in Honor of Jeremy duQuesnay Adams, Volumes 1 and 2*
edited by Stephanie Hayes-Healy
- False Fables and Exemplary Truth: Poetics and Reception of a Medieval Mode*
by Elizabeth Allen
- Ecstatic Transformation*
by Michael Uebel
- Sacred and Secular in Medieval and Early Modern Cultures*
edited by Lawrence Besserman
- Tolkein's Modern Middle Ages*
edited by Jane Chance and Alfred Siewers
- Representing Righteous Heathens in Late Medieval England*
by Frank Grady
- Byzantine Dress*
by Jennifer Ball
- The Laborer's Two Bodies*
by Kellie Robertson
- The Dogaresa of Venice, 1200–1500: Wife and Icon*
by Holly S. Hurlburt
- Medieval Theology of Work: The Contributions of Peter Damian and the Medieval Movement*
by Patricia Ranft
- On the Purification of Women: Churching in Northern France, 1100–1500*
Paula Rieder
- Logic, Theology, and Poetry in Boethius, Abelard, and Alan of Lille: Words in the Absence of Things*
by Eileen C. Sweeney

LOGIC, THEOLOGY, AND
POETRY IN BOETHIUS,
ABELARD, AND ALAN OF LILLE

WORDS IN THE ABSENCE OF THINGS

Eileen C. Sweeney

palgrave
macmillan



LOGIC, THEOLOGY, AND POETRY IN BOETHIUS, ABELARD, AND ALAN OF LILLE

© Eileen C. Sweeney, 2006

Softcover reprint of the hardcover 1st edition 2006 978-1-4039-6972-9

All rights reserved. No part of this book may be used or reproduced in any manner whatsoever without written permission except in the case of brief quotations embodied in critical articles or reviews.

First published in 2006 by
PALGRAVE MACMILLAN™

175 Fifth Avenue, New York, N.Y. 10010 and
Houndmills, Basingstoke, Hampshire, England RG21 6XS
Companies and representatives throughout the world.

PALGRAVE MACMILLAN is the global academic imprint of the Palgrave Macmillan division of St. Martin's Press, LLC and of Palgrave Macmillan Ltd. Macmillan® is a registered trademark in the United States, United Kingdom and other countries. Palgrave is a registered trademark in the European Union and other countries.

ISBN 978-1-349-73540-2

ISBN 978-1-137-06373-1 (eBook)

DOI 10.1007/978-1-137-06373-1

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Sweeney, Eileen.

Logic, theology, and poetry in Boethius, Abelard, and Alan of Lille:
words in the absence of things / by Eileen Sweeney.

p. cm.—(New Middle Ages)

Includes bibliographical references and index.

1. Latin poetry, Medieval and modern—History and criticism—Theory, etc. 2. Christian poetry, Latin (Medieval and modern)—History and criticism. 3. Alanus, de Insulis, d. 1202—Criticism and interpretation. 4. Abelard, Peter, 1079–1142—Criticism and interpretation. 5. Boethius, d. 524. *De consolatione philosophiae*. 6. Christianity and literature—History—To 1500. 7. Boethius, d. 524—Poetic works. 8. Boethius, d. 524—Influence. 9. Logic, Medieval, in literature. 10. Theology in literature. I. Title. II. New Middle Ages (Palgrave Macmillan (Firm))

PA8056.S94 2006

871'.03093822—dc22

2005051334

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library.

Design by Newgen Imaging Systems (P) Ltd., Chennai, India.

First edition: March 2006

10 9 8 7 6 5 4 3 2 1

Transferred to Digital Printing 2011

*For my father,
J. Vincent Sweeney*

CONTENTS

<i>Abbreviations</i>	ix
<i>Acknowledgments</i>	xi
Introduction: Words in the Absence of Things	1
1. Boethius: Translation, Transfer, and Transport	7
Integrating Multiple Perspectives	7
Logic: Distinguishing Words and Things	8
The Tractates: Creating the New Language of Theology	20
The <i>Consolation</i> and the Transformation of Perspective	38
2. Abelard: A Twelfth-Century Hermeneutics of Suspicion	63
Keeping Open the Wound of Exile	63
Logic: Dissolving Old Narratives and Making New Fictions	66
Theology: Sounding the Battle Cry	79
The Laments: Rejecting/Rewriting Allegory	95
The Ethics and Letters: Living in the Wound of Exile	114
3. Alan of Lille: Language and its Peregrinations to and from Divine Unity	127
The Paradox of Form: Fighting Fire with Fire	127
<i>Regulae caelestis iuris</i> : Order in Mystery and Mystery in Order	130

<i>Summa quoniam homines: Disputation as Defense and Diversion</i>	140
<i>Liber in distinctionibus dictionum theologicalium: The Wonder of Words The Allegories and the Proper Impropriety of Theology</i>	148 157
Conclusion: Language and the <i>Ascensus Mentis ad Deum</i>	177
<i>Notes</i>	185
<i>Bibliography</i>	213
<i>Index</i>	230

ABBREVIATIONS

For full bibliographical information, consult the bibliography. Translations are my own unless otherwise noted here or in the text.

- AC Alan of Lille, *Anticlaudianus* (Cited by the book number; page numbers from Sheridan's English translation, and line numbers from Bossuat's Latin text. I have used Sheridan's translation unless otherwise noted in the text.)
- ADLMA *Archives doctrinale et littéraire du moyen âge*
- ALGCJG *Alain de Lille, Gautier de Châtillon, Jakemart Giélée, et leur temps*
- AST *Abélard et son temps*
- B-FG Boethius, edited by Manfred Fuhrmann and Joachim Gruber
- CCCM *Corpus christianorum continuatio mediaevalis*
- CCSL *Corpus christianorum series latina*
- CSEL *Corpus scriptorum ecclesiasticorum latinorum*
- Comm Is* Boethius, *Commentaria in Porphyrium*
- Comm PH* Boethius, *Commentarium in librum Peri hermeneias*
- Conf.* Abelard, "Confessio fidei ad Heloisam"
- Consol.* Boethius, *Philosophiae Consolatio* in *The Theological Tractates and The Consolation of Philosophy*
- De Heb* Boethius, *De hebdomadibus* in *The Theological Tractates and The Consolation of Philosophy*
- DP Alan of Lille, *De planctu naturae*. (Cited by the book number, page numbers from Sheridan's English translation, and line numbers from Häring's Latin text. I have used Sheridan's translation unless otherwise noted in the text.)
- De Trin* Boethius, *De trinitate* in *The Theological Tractates and The Consolation of Philosophy*
- Dict.* Alan of Lille, *Liber in distinctionibus dictionum theologialium*
- Eth.* Abelard, *Ethica sive Scito teipsum*
- EN Boethius, *Contra Eutychen et Nestorium* in *The Theological Tractates and The Consolation of Philosophy*
- Ep. 1–4* Abelard and Heloise, "The Personal Letters between Abelard and Heloise"

<i>Ep.</i> 5–6	Abelard and Heloise, “The Letter of Heloise on Religious Life and Abelard’s first Reply”
<i>Ep.</i> 7	Abelard, “Abelard’s Rule for Religious Women”
<i>Exp Hex</i>	Abelard, <i>Expositio in hexaemeron</i>
<i>Gl Por</i>	Abelard, <i>Glossae super Porphyrium</i>
<i>Gl PH</i>	Abelard, <i>Glossae super Peri ermeneias</i>
GPC	<i>Gilbert de Poitiers et ses contemporains: Aux origines de la “Logica Modernorum”</i>
HC	Abelard, <i>Historia calamitatum</i>
<i>Hym Par</i>	Abelard, <i>Hymnarius paraclitensis</i>
LH	<i>Listening to Heloise: The Voice of a Twelfth Century Woman</i>
LNPS	Abelard, <i>Logica nostrorum petitioni sociorum</i>
PA	<i>Peter Abelard</i>
PAPV	<i>Pierre Abélard—Pierre le Vénérable: Les courants philosophiques, littéraires et artistiques en occident au milieu de XIIe siècle</i>
PAPWW	<i>Petrus Abaelardus (1079–1142): Person, Werk, und Wirkung,</i>
PG	<i>Patrologiae cursus completes, series graeca</i>
PL	<i>Patrologiae cursus completes, series latina</i>
<i>Pl Din</i>	Abelard, “Planctus Dinae filiae Jacob” in <i>Petri Abaelardi Planctus</i>
<i>Pl Jac</i>	Abelard, “Planctus Jacob super filios suos” in <i>Petri Abaelardi Planctus</i>
<i>Pl vir Is</i>	Abelard, “Planctus virginum Israel super filia Jephthe Galadite”
<i>Pl Sans</i>	Abelard, “Planctus Israel super Sanson” (I have used Dronke’s translation unless otherwise noted in the text.)
<i>Pl Ab</i>	Abelard, “Planctus David super Abner filio Ner quem Joab occidit” in <i>Petri Abaelardi Planctus</i>
<i>Pl Saul/Jon</i>	Abelard, “Planctus David super Saul et Jonathan” (I have used Stevens’s translation unless otherwise noted in the text.)
<i>Reg.</i>	Alan of Lille, <i>Regulae caelestis iuris</i> (Cited by the rule number.)
SN	Abelard, <i>Sic et non</i>
<i>Solil.</i>	Abelard, <i>Soliloquium</i>
SQH	Alan of Lille, <i>Summa quoniam homines</i> (Cited by the section divisions in the text.)
TChr	Abelard, <i>Theologia christiana</i> in <i>Petri Abaelardi opera theologica</i> , CCCM, vol. 12
TSch	Abelard, <i>Theologia ‘scholarium’</i> in <i>Petri Abaelardi opera theologica</i> , CCCM, vol. 13
TSum	Abelard, <i>Theologia ‘summi boni’</i> in <i>Petri Abaelardi opera theologica</i> , CCCM, vol. 13

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

I wish to thank Sebnem Yavuz for permission to reprint portions of chapter one on Boethius' logic which appeared as "Connecting Boethius's Logic and Theology," in *Neue Prozesse um Boethius, Schriften zur Gregorianik-Forschung*, Vol. 2, Köln: Verlag der Gesellschaft für Gregorianik-Forschung e.V. A very early version of my interpretation of Alan of Lille's *Anticlaudianus* appeared as "The *Anticlaudianus* and the 'Proper' Language of Theology," *Essays in Medieval Studies*, Vol. 4 (Fall, 1987): 45–54, some parts of which are reprinted in chapter three with permission.

Early research for this volume was supported by a grant from the Alexander von Humboldt Foundation, by a summer grant from the Bradley Foundation, as well as by a sabbatical leave from Boston College. I especially want to thank Klaus Jacobi of the University of Freiburg for serving as my sponsor and mentor while I was a Humboldt fellow and member of the seminar, *Mündlichkeit und Schriftlichkeit im Mittelalter*. I thank Prof. Jacobi for his great hospitality during my stay in Germany, his unwavering support for the project, ungainly as it seemed, and helpful direction as I began my research. I wish also to thank Steve Brown for his advice on many aspects of this project, from early grant proposals to composing a prospectus; Steve has been most generous with his time, expertise, and friendship, for which I am most grateful. The most important influence on my thinking was my teacher and mentor, Louis Mackey, who died in 2004. I miss him deeply and can think of no higher compliment than to be called his student.

I am grateful to Jane McIntosh Snyder for looking over my translations of Abelard's laments, Robert Crouse and Jaroslav Pelikan for reading the Boethius chapter, Klaus Jacobi for his reading of the Abelard chapter, and my colleague Richard Cobb-Stevens who read various parts of the manuscript at different stages. I wish to also thank Marcia Colish for her very careful reading of the manuscript and for her suggestions and corrections which have improved it. My graduate assistants over the past few years,

David Bollert, Tedmun Chan, John Burmeister, Susan Bencomo, Maggie Labinski and Matthew Robinson also worked hard gathering sources, checking and correcting footnotes and bibliography and proofreading; my mistakes made their work harder.

I am especially grateful to Boston College and my colleagues in the Philosophy Department. They have allowed me to take a somewhat indirect and extra-philosophical path in my research and writing, given me great freedom in my teaching, and in many ways provided a community that has fostered my work. Lastly, I wish to thank to my husband, Ira Kronitz, and my two daughters, Mariel and Eliana, born during the composition of this book, for the many sacrifices they made so that I might write. One can, as many others have, give birth to both books and babies, but not alone.