

International Perspectives on Migration 6

Georgina Tsolidis *Editor*

# Migration, Diaspora and Identity

Cross-National Experiences

 Springer

---

# Migration, Diaspora and Identity

The series publishes original scholarly books that advance our understanding of international migration and immigrant integration. Written by academic experts and policy specialists, each volume addresses a clearly defined research question or theme, employs critical analysis and develops evidence-based scholarship. The series includes single- or multi-authored monographs, volumes and edited collections.

The scope of the series is international migration and integration research. Topics include but are not limited to thematic and current issues and debates; comparative research of a regional, national or international nature; the changing character of urban areas in which migrants or refugees settle; the reciprocal influence of migrants/refugees and host communities; issues of integration and social inequality as well as policy analysis in migration research.

**Series Editors:**

Peter Li and Baha-Abu-Laban

For further volumes:

<http://www.springer.com/series/8811>

---

Georgina Tsolidis  
Editor

# Migration, Diaspora and Identity

Cross-National Experiences

 Springer

*Editor*  
Georgina Tsolidis  
School of Education and Arts  
University of Ballarat  
Ballarat, Australia

ISBN 978-94-007-7210-6                      ISBN 978-94-007-7211-3 (eBook)  
DOI 10.1007/978-94-007-7211-3  
Springer Dordrecht Heidelberg New York London

Library of Congress Control Number: 2013950928

© Springer Science+Business Media Dordrecht 2014

This work is subject to copyright. All rights are reserved by the Publisher, whether the whole or part of the material is concerned, specifically the rights of translation, reprinting, reuse of illustrations, recitation, broadcasting, reproduction on microfilms or in any other physical way, and transmission or information storage and retrieval, electronic adaptation, computer software, or by similar or dissimilar methodology now known or hereafter developed. Exempted from this legal reservation are brief excerpts in connection with reviews or scholarly analysis or material supplied specifically for the purpose of being entered and executed on a computer system, for exclusive use by the purchaser of the work. Duplication of this publication or parts thereof is permitted only under the provisions of the Copyright Law of the Publisher's location, in its current version, and permission for use must always be obtained from Springer. Permissions for use may be obtained through RightsLink at the Copyright Clearance Center. Violations are liable to prosecution under the respective Copyright Law.

The use of general descriptive names, registered names, trademarks, service marks, etc. in this publication does not imply, even in the absence of a specific statement, that such names are exempt from the relevant protective laws and regulations and therefore free for general use.

While the advice and information in this book are believed to be true and accurate at the date of publication, neither the authors nor the editors nor the publisher can accept any legal responsibility for any errors or omissions that may be made. The publisher makes no warranty, express or implied, with respect to the material contained herein.

Printed on acid-free paper

Springer is part of Springer Science+Business Media ([www.springer.com](http://www.springer.com))

---

## Acknowledgements

I would like to acknowledge Maria Tsolidis whose memories of how things were continue to inspire; Eirene and Alexis Tsolidis-Noyce whose hopes for the future make efforts worthwhile; David Sharples for his support, particularly his meticulous engagement with the technicalities of page layout; the contributing authors who shared their ideas with me; and the staff at Springer, particularly Bernadette Deelen-Mans, for all their work.



---

# Contents

<b>Introduction: Does Diaspora Matter When Living Cultural Difference?</b> .....	1
Georgina Tsolidis	
<b>Part I Multiple Belongings</b>	
<b>Living on the Move: Belonging and Identification Among Adolescent Children of Immigrants in Italy</b> .....	19
Enzo Colombo	
<b>Muslim Women in Western Preschooling: Diasporic Effects on Identity Issues</b> .....	37
Jeanette Rhedding-Jones	
<b>‘When I Land in Islamabad I Feel Home and When I Land in Heathrow I Feel Home’: Gendered Belonging and Diasporic Identities of South Asian British Citizens in London, in Leicester and in North England</b> .....	51
Ulrike M. Vieten	
<b>Part II Representing a Way of Being</b>	
<b>Refugee Women, Education, and Self Authorship</b> .....	77
Melinda McPherson	
<b>Invoking an Ivory Tower: Journalistic Misrepresentation of Me as a Critic of Race and the Content of My Criticisms</b> .....	95
Stella Coram	
<b>‘Trouble in the Mall Again’: Naming as Social Drama in Multicultural Melbourne</b> .....	109
Vikki Pollard and Georgina Tsolidis	
<b>Beyond Fear and Towards Hope: Transnationalism and the Recognition of Rights Across Borders</b> .....	123
Peter Gale	



**Part III Sexualised Identifications**

**Pedagogies of the Japanese Diaspora: Racialization and Sexualization in Australia** ..... 141

Julie Matthews and Yuriko Nagata

**Body as Gendered and Sexualised and Recent Migration of Poles to the United Kingdom** ..... 157

Bernadetta Siara

**Part IV Marriage and Family**

**Men’s Experiences and Masculinity Transformations: Migration and Family Reunification in the Bangladeshi Diaspora in Italy** ..... 175

Francesco Della Puppa

**Shifting Gender Roles and Shifting Power Relations: Immigrant/Migrant Nepali Families in New York and Los Angeles**..... 191

Shobha Hamal Gurung

**Comparing the Family Lives of Vietnamese Wives in Taiwan and the USA** ..... 203

Chyong-fang Ko

**Index**..... 219

---

## Introduction

### Does Diaspora Matter When Living Cultural Difference?

Georgina Tsolidis

---

#### Introduction

I grew up with what I have subsequently come to realise, was an unrealistic sense that speaking many languages and living amongst diverse communities was not only possible but normal and desired. My parents were born and reared in Egypt. I spent a childhood listening to stories told by nostalgic adults describing life in Cairo or Suez. The stories told in Greek and Arabic with smatterings of French and English would begin slowly, reach a crescendo of excitement and invariably move to the point where the sadness of remembering times no longer lived overtook the joy. I was told that a cosmopolitan life was possible with very little money. A few coins would buy you a drink and an opportunity for dancing at a café along the *corniche* where my grandfather worked as a waiter. Fueled by tiny sepia photographs and on the basis of the fashions of the day, my mother and father morphed into Humphrey Bogart and Ingrid Bergman and Cairo, in my imagination, became Casablanca minus the Nazis.

After leaving Egypt, Melbourne became the third city of settlement for my parents. In the 1960s Melbourne was coming to terms with the mass migration that has subsequently come to define its character. Suburbs close to factories became home for many migrant families. Where we lived, it was common to hear Greek, Italian, Serbian, Macedonian or Croatian and become acquainted with these different communities and their histories of migration. In contrast to their life in Egypt, my family experienced Australia as xenophobic. I have a vivid memory of my father arguing with my teacher after he inquired about which languages were offered at the school. He was told that no 'foreign' languages were offered and further to this, I would be better served if my parents spoke English at home. Speaking other languages would inhibit my scholastic development. My father explained, in extremely animated tones, that if people could learn three or four languages at school where he grew up,

---

G. Tsolidis (✉)

School of Education and Arts, University of Ballarat, P.O. Box 663, Ballarat 3353, Australia  
e-mail: g.tsolidis@ballarat.edu.au

there was no logic in restricting my exposure to just one. My parents conferred and decided that I would continue my Greek but that they would not teach me Arabic as this was their preferred way of communicating on ‘serious’ adult topics. In this way, Arabic remained a familiar, albeit incomprehensible, soundtrack in my life.

I have grown up with contradictory narratives of living cultural difference. One is the view of cosmopolitan Cairo with its vibrant communities, languages and religions. The other is of migrants brought in as ‘factory fodder’ living on the peripheries of a society that was suspicious of Italian coffee and the hissing machines that were imported to produce it (May 2007). My parents lived proudly as part of the working class in the four cities they shared as a married couple. The romance that surrounded their memories of life in Egypt was not linked to émigré stories of more opulent life-styles left behind. And it is my parents’ nostalgic views of Egypt that have made it possible for me to imagine something different to lived xenophobia. So while the debate about the cosmopolitan imagination continues (Harvey 2000; Skrbis et al. 2004; Beck 2006; Werbner 2008; Donald et al. 2009; Kendall et al. 2009), for me its promise of living cultural difference, even if this may be utopian, has some merit.

My parents were not alone in romanticising life in Egypt. It is perhaps not surprising that there is a resurgence of academic interest in Egypt and Ottoman port cities such as Alexandria, Beirut, Odessa and Thessaloniki (Singerman and Armar 2009; Fuhrmann 2003; Mansel 2010; Starr 2009; Gekas 2009). Such cities, strongly imagined as centres of cosmopolitanism, speak to contemporary interest in the spatial politics of cultural difference and belonging. And unsurprisingly, the way life in these cities, as read by contemporary analysts, speaks to current debates about living cultural difference and the character of concepts used to describe this including cosmopolitanism, diaspora or transculturalism. Ilbert (2004) for example, challenges the view of Egypt as cosmopolitan. Rather than cosmopolitan, which implies some form of integration, it is described as pluralist with separate communities living side by side. Nonetheless, Ilbert argues that in order to maintain harmonious coexistence, it was necessary for parochial nationalisms to be denounced. Manifestly there is the argument that equates cosmopolitanism with bourgeois privilege and in the case of Egypt a Levantine sensibility, which was either engrained, aspirational or perpetually out of reach, depending on one’s background. However, Starr (2009) reminds us that while Egyptian cosmopolitanism was inextricably linked with colonialism this did not render an uncomplicated foreigner/bourgeois versus local/impoverished binary. Instead she argues that not all members of the *haute bourgeoisie* were ‘foreign minorities’ and not all ‘foreign minorities’ were members of the *haute bourgeoisie*. Instead it was the visibility of the minority of foreign capitalists that became a ‘lightening rod for Egyptian frustration’ and ‘shaped their view of the entirety of the foreign minority community’ (p. 22).

At a broader level, Gekas (2009) distinguishes a cosmopolitan city from one that is multicultural, diverse or international. Drawing on the work of Fuhrmann he provides a definition of cosmopolitanism that includes the following elements;

- A publicly visible diversity;
- An ability of individual or collective agents to navigate between different coded spheres;

- An active practice of sociabilities that cross community borders; and
- A belief and a policy of enhancing cohesion without a monolithic base. (p 102)

Gekas then goes on to explore the notion of ‘vulgar cosmopolitanism’ developed by Hanley (2008) who is concerned to counter elitist understandings of the term. Hanley argues that cosmopolitanism is at best a romantic and nostalgic apologia for a racist Eurocentricism that eludes rehabilitation. Hanley, in different ways, is concerned with micro-level analysis and how a ‘bottom-up’ view can bring into focus the Egyptian maid, for example, who has learnt to speak Greek to better serve her household of employment, or the illiterate labourer, who carries several currencies in his pockets and exchanges between them. This is the underbelly of the cosmopolitanism more commonly considered by scholars. This ‘bottom up’ view challenges understandings of cosmopolitanism as the prerogative of those ‘visiting’, who live difference on their terms, and instead centres the experiences of the autochthonous.

Mine is a second-hand experience of Egypt and by drawing on my parents’ nostalgia for a cosmopolitan life left behind, I risk what Hanley describes as ‘grieving cosmopolitanism’ – cosmopolitanism as bourgeois romantic fantasy that renders the complexities that underwrite it invisible, most of all the colonial and class privilege that allowed some to experience elite forms of cultural exchange and the false sense that this contributed to the well-being of a community. I remain unconvinced that all forms of cosmopolitanism are linked to privilege. This simply makes it the domain of the bourgeoisie and in so doing extinguishes other ways of living cosmopolitanism that do not require elite forms of cultural capital.

---

## Persisting with Difference

My personal history flags the questions that shape this project. People persist with their cultural difference and for families such as my own they carry a sense of somewhere else into multiple migrations, destinations and ways of being. How is this persistence of cultural difference lived, at what cost and for what benefit? How is the response to this question nuanced by the complex interplay of power related to class, religion or gender, for example? How do complex and shifting identities both shape and respond to spatial politics of belonging? Hanley argues that without attention to historical and other forms of specificity the notion of cosmopolitanism risks referring only to the elite, relying on nostalgia that triggers a form of lament for the present day and;

serves as a tag, a reflexive, generic piece of shorthand that promises to draw together and organize scholarly interventions when in fact it camouflages productive differences. (p. 1346)

Whether we adopt the term ‘cosmopolitanism’ or some other term, Hanley’s point remains pertinent. There is a need to be vigilant so that differences remain

visible within the scholarly categories we develop, in order to better understand social experience. One of the aims of this collection is to ‘organize scholarly interventions’ in a way that does not camouflage different ways of framing and understanding cultural difference but instead draws on epistemic differences towards a more productive way of engaging with the ways in which cultural difference is lived.

However it may be understood, cosmopolitanism requires people to persist with their cultural difference, and in an increasingly globalised world, difference is no longer different. Challenging the ‘monogamy of place’ (Beck 2006) is the core business of modernity. People are taken away or leave voluntarily in search of futures that destabilise our understandings of ‘home’, to the point where it no longer denotes a sense of place but rather a space determined by the relationships of the people who form it. These are relations that involve others left behind who nonetheless are there because we communicate with them over the internet, visit them when we return or keep them dear in the way we imagine our pasts. Regardless of the number of migrations or their distance from our current experience, this sense of personal history continues to colour our present to a greater or lesser degree. According to Hall;

Although you can never go back to the past, you do have a sense of loss of an intimate connection with a history, a landscape, family, tradition, custom – the vernacular. In a sense, this is the fate of all modern people – we have to lose those connections, but we seem to require the myth, the illusion that we are going to go back to them. (Hall 2008, pp. 349–350)

This dynamic of loss and yearning is commonly linked with the notion of diaspora. It is associated with a place left behind voluntarily or otherwise. According to Hall, this simultaneous sense of loss and yearning for the illusion of return characterises modernity.

Globalisation both dismantles and instills the significance of place because of this ‘illusion of return’. People persist with their difference and families carry a sense of somewhere else into multiple migrations to multiple destinations that ripple out from the imagined homeland over many generations. This does not imply that what makes such families and the identities of their members different remains essential and immutable. The difference is the experience of being different, which is why minority communities can share a commonality across various cultures, languages and religions. Cosmopolitanism provides one way of framing an engagement with these issues. But do labels really matter? At one level they are fundamental and yet at another, they distract from exploring the ideas behind the words. Hannerz (undated) provides an overview of the various words that have been used to explore the connections between culture (meanings and meaningful forms) and society (people and their relationships) over the last century. He concludes that words such as ‘creolisation’, ‘transculturalism’, ‘synchronisation’ and ‘hybridity’ have similar intentions and as such choosing between them is not particularly significant despite their different histories and emphases. These are all words that denote an ongoing and evolving cultural mixture.

## Does Diaspora Matter?

This collection has been framed in relation to 'diaspora'. As with so many terms, 'diaspora' remains contested with regard to its meaning and its potential to provide conceptual clarity. Since the 1990s there have been attempts to delineate its defining characteristics. Instead, the number of meanings attached to the term continue to proliferate. Rather than this being its weakness, some commentators have judged its elasticity as a testimony to its success (Winland 2007). We are familiar with its etymology linked to dispersal, however, this does not provide a shared understanding with commentators distinguishing between forced and voluntary dispersal or victim and expansionist diasporas. Safran (1991) and Cohen (1997) have provided ways of understanding diaspora on the basis of the Jewish experience in particular. Key features of diaspora include dispersal from a 'centre' to at least two 'peripheries'. Within these 'peripheries' a collective memory about an imagined homeland continues. Those in the diaspora remain to some extent, separate within the society in which they live, imagining that one day, they or members of their family will return to their idealized homeland. Towards this end, those in the diaspora contribute to maintaining or restoring the status of their homeland and this in turn, feeds their sense of being a community in exile. The attention given to what were understood as archetypal diasporas (Jewish, Armenian and Palestinian for example) and whether these could be defined on the basis of what pushed them from their original homeland, the way they were organized within their societies of settlement or on the relationships they built between their countries of origin and residency has lost momentum. Constituting diasporas as communities in exile not only affirms their minority status as perpetual, it also marks this status in relation to a centre whose dominant status is confirmed in the process. Instead there is sustained interest in diaspora in relation to cultural globalization and the extent to which, for example, transnationalism has contributed to our capacity to differentiate 'traditional' diasporic communities from any other type of community.

In his exploration of the relationship between transnationalism and diaspora, Faist (2010) concludes that both concepts are attempts to '...deal with time-space compression across the borders of states' (p. 33). While he recognizes differences between these terms Faist suggests these relate more to scope and that the two concepts have in common a focus on agency and process in relation to cross-border phenomena. These concepts are a way of understanding the impact of formal organisations, states or small kinship groups, on social processes related to migration in contexts of departure and arrival. In this way, the study of diaspora has the potential to engage with broader issues of social transformation by shedding light on how cross-border social formations influence national, international and transnational spaces. By contrast Glick Schiller (2010) argues that transnationalism is a 'cold view' political theory; that is, a way of understanding change that is top-down and thus concentrates on status, rights etc as allocated by established political authorities. By contrast, diaspora studies is a 'hot view' that concentrates on the politics of passion and identity. While she concedes that such grass-roots mobilization based

on forms of identity can be supported by institutions, on the whole it is promulgated by non-state actors. On this basis Glick Schiller concludes that diaspora studies allows a more bottom up examination of the discursive and practice elements of transnationalism, in contrast to the more common focus on institutions and their impact on minorities.

While Faist and Glick Schiller consider diaspora as political theory, its flexibility as noted by Winland referred to above, has enabled its integration into an ever widening discursive field. According to Brubaker (2005) there exists an explosion of interest in diaspora with the term entering a growing range of conceptual, semantic and disciplinary spaces. In contrast to Winland, rather than denoting this as a strength, Brubaker argues that the vast array of groups and scholarship linked to diaspora leads to the term loosing its meaning. Despite this expansion in academic and wider usage of the term, Brubaker identifies three elements that are core to the way it is used. These are dispersal, homeland orientation and boundary maintenance. He argues that these elements contribute to an understanding of diaspora that is problematic because there is an assumption of ‘groupness’ – a teleological sense of identity that is bounded and in so being assumes a universal character or sense of belonging. This is contrasted to ‘the nation-state’, its meaning in a similar way, linked to a definition that is idealized as homogenous – a product of the sociological imagination. Instead Brubaker cautions us to consider nations as fragmentary and diverse. Rather than link diaspora to a group, Brubaker understands it as a category of practice, which may or may not be useful as a category of analysis. He states;

As a category of practice, ‘diaspora’ is used to make claims, to articulate projects, to formulate expectations, to mobilize energies, to appeal to loyalties. It is often a category with a strong normative charge. It does not so much describe the world as seek to remake it. (p. 12)

Brubaker argues that rather than attribute an identity or set of practices to a group, which is defined as a diaspora by virtue of this attribution;

We should seek, rather, to bring the struggles themselves into focus, without presupposing that they will eventuate in bounded groups. (p. 13)

Brubaker’s is one solution to a problem that has continued to provoke reflection. How is a group constituted as such, without the assumption that it is marked by some form of essentialism and requires boundaries and their maintenance in order to retain its distinctiveness? This problem was once posed in relation to ethnicity and ‘race’ and as Anthias reminded us in 1998, was one that the notion of diaspora was intended to dispel. The ethnic, ‘race’ or diaspora problem is about identity and how it is constituted in the context of postmodern frameworks. Postmodern understandings of diaspora promised a more complicated view of cultural affiliations that uncoupled them from the nation state and instead highlighted hybrid identities nuanced by place, space and time. This challenged the traditional view of diaspora as a range of ethno, religious or national collectivities living in exile (e.g. the Armenians living in Turkey, the Jews living in France or the Greek Cypriots living in England). The work of Clifford 1997, Gilroy 1993, and Hall 1996, 2002 has been

pivotal to these contemporary understandings of diaspora. Nonetheless the project of constituting hybrid identities that are not essential or exclusive at some level remains in doubt. Brubaker makes the point that discussions of diasporas as fluid, hybrid, creolized and syncretic fail to explain what makes communities described in this way and their associated identities distinct.

For a long time, anti-racist feminists (e.g. hooks 1981; Yuval-Davis and Anthias 1989; Brah 1996) have considered, whether in relation to 'race', ethnicity or diaspora, how unequal power relations, particularly but not exclusively those related to gender, have been ignored with the consequence that terms such as 'Black', for example, instead of representing a collectivity, simply represents men. Intersectionality is linked to feminist ways of understanding and resolving the contradictions implicit in constituting identities in non-essentialist ways. Perhaps because of its longevity as a social movement, debates within feminism about the constitution of identity and its necessity for a politics of equality have fueled related theoretical explorations. Debates have ranged from identifying the primary oppression, for example, whether class determined the nature of gender oppression to debates about triple disadvantage or jeopardy that rendered initially, gender, class and colonial or imperialist oppressions as cumulative or additive. In 1983 Anthias and Yuval-Davis challenged both the notion that one could be disadvantaged because of their gender for example, and the idea that this disadvantage would compound by virtue of other characteristics such as class or ethnicity. Instead they drew attention to systemic discrimination and elaborated the intersections between factors such as gender, class and ethnicity. In her review of this work Yuval-Davis (2006) argues that at the core of this debate is '...conflation or separation of the different analytic levels in which intersectionality is located, rather than just a debate on the relationship of the divisions themselves.' (p. 195) Intersectionality forms a framework that accounts for macro axes of social power but is also sensitive to people, their material realities and how these are mediated by systems and organisations.

---

## Framing the Collection

The constitution of some groups as marginal has deeply significant lived consequences. And the debates that surround this constitution are complex and on-going, resulting in shifts in the way we understand our social world and build a politics aimed at challenging inequality and oppression. An aim of this collection has been to highlight the variety of experience linked to cultural difference and the variety of ways in which this experience is understood. There was never an intention to collect papers that drew on similar epistemological frameworks. On the contrary, the aim was to let a 'thousand flowers bloom' which in my opinion is more in keeping with a project, the aim of which was to discover and value difference. In line with this, there has been no attempt to sequence or characterize the theoretical frameworks adopted by the various authors. If these are stated, they are stated by the authors themselves and on their own terms. The aim has been to highlight the work of scholars who are trying to make sense of the experiences of women and men from



a range of ethnic backgrounds, who are negotiating identities through family, work and education by drawing upon multiple cultures. The micro dynamics of the everyday offer an evocative ‘bottom up’ means of understanding the tensions implicit in new ways of becoming. Through this framework it is possible to shed light on the lived experiences of racism, dislocation and alienation on the one hand, and on the other hand, to consider how the complex power relations within the everyday mediate a sense of resistance and hope.

While the collection is framed in relation to diaspora, this is understood in a variety of ways and it is left to authors to explain their attachment (or otherwise) to the term. Diaspora can be a space in the terms Brah (1996) established, that joins those who have left as well as those who have stayed behind and thus incorporates various ways of belonging simultaneously. Diaspora can be shaped in response to memories, nostalgia and a romanticised loyalty to other places, peoples and ways of doing and being. Diasporic identification can incorporate a type of retrospective utopian vision, which is not necessarily a simple and stultifying backward-looking process. Instead, as Hall (1996, 2002) reminds us, it is a two-way vision that informs being in the present and becoming in the future. It may be best to consider diaspora as denoting a community of practice rather than a bounded community (Brubaker 2005). While there is always likely to be debate about concepts such as diaspora or terms that have preceded and follow it in the teleology of scholarly practice, there is at some almost intuitive level a sense that we are probing the same issues. There are two elements in this discussion of diaspora that move some way towards framing the papers in this collection. Firstly, that if nothing else, diaspora is a concept, which because of its elasticity remains useful and resilient (Winland 2007). And secondly, more than anything else; *‘It does not so much describe the world as seek to remake it’* (Brubaker 2005).

This is an eclectic collection of papers because authors use various theoretical frameworks to explore a variety of groups of people with a variety of experiences in a diverse range of settings. It is the glimpses these authors provide into the remaking of our world that offers the collection some commonality. The papers have been arranged loosely around four themes;

1. Multiple Belongings,
2. Representing a Way of Being,
3. Sexualised Identifications and
4. Marriage and Family.

## **Multiple Belongings**

In the first three papers Colombo, Rhedding-Jones and Vieten describe the lived experience of difference. While the contexts are distinct each author draws on research with people to illustrate ‘multiple belongings’, that is, belonging simultaneously to a variety of cultures, including minority cultures that continue to matter regardless of the lack of support these receive or the cost of their persistence at some level.

Interviews with immigrant adolescents living in Milan form the basis of Colombo's discussion of belonging and identification. He argues that change is today's currency and in this context, these young people do not face a choice of either becoming like their immigrant parents or like their autochthonous peers. Instead they are adept at managing difference and its presentation strategically. In some contexts, for example difference is hidden to avoid discrimination, while in other contexts, difference becomes a signal for inclusion into a set of networks such as those connected to their parents' place of origin. This is a tactical ethnicity that allows young people '...to cope with situations in such a way as not to be excluded and not miss those precious opportunities for self fulfilment'.

Rhedding-Jones explores discourses of belonging. She takes as a focus the use of the word 'aunty'. Rhedding-Jones is interested in the experiences of Muslim childcare providers in Norway and the UK. The tensions implicit in providing culturally and linguistically appropriate care are trapped in the debate about whether it is acceptable for children to refer to their carers as aunts. In centres where Muslim children attend the word 'aunty' has become a marker of difference and as she describes, '...an example of where cultures meet and are accepted or rejected as different.' Rhedding-Jones goes on to illustrate resistance to this expectation through the words and experiences of women involved in the care of these young children.

The legacy of Empire forms a backdrop for Vieten's examination of diaspora in Britain. South Asian communities in London, Leicester and other cities are the focus for her argument that BrAsians' sense of identity is linked to becoming rather than belonging. It is not a matter of being one or other but a matter of being both. Vieten draws on interviews conducted with professional members of these communities and states that '...ways of being are most central to the local expression of ways of gendered belonging.' Close examination of changing policy contexts and political resistance frame her argument.

## **Representing a Way of Being**

The four papers in this section are engagements with various forms of representation (newspapers and policy) and how these contribute to the discursive constitution of the Other. While all these papers link to Australia, the groups that are the focus of each paper provide insights into very different communities and types of experience. McPherson considers refugee women, Gale explores debates about Indian nationals who are commonly sojourners and Pollard and Tsolidis explore the Melbourne Greek community which is one of the largest and most long-standing diasporic communities. Coram's paper warrants specific comment. She describes her experiences as a Maori living in Australia. New Zealand remains one of the largest source countries for migration to Australia. Coram describes the consequences of speaking out about racism, including that experienced by Australian indigenous footballers. This is a paper about being Maori in Australia and should not be misinterpreted as an attempt to elide indigenous and diasporic experience. Indigenous peoples in

Australia have maintained a strong association with the land, despite colonisation and this heritage marks their experiences of racism and dislocation as distinct from those of other communities.

McPherson is concerned with refugee women and the material consequences of how they are represented. She argues that 'Dominant representations of refugee women in forced migration policies have rendered those women invisible or emphasised their victimhood and ineffectuality'. McPherson argues that if education policy is framed on the basis that refugee women are victims or if they remain invisible under the rubric of universal provision, education provision is likely to offer closure rather than build potential. On the basis of interviews with refugee women that illustrate the emphasis given to education by them, she argues for an education premised on potential instead.

In his paper, Gale explores the representation of Asians. In particular, he examines Indian residents who are most often sojourners. He analyses newspaper coverage of two cases involving Indians. One relates to violence against international students and the other the legal prosecution of a doctor, accused of having links with terrorism. Both cases gained notoriety in Australia and India. Gale discusses the media reports about these cases in the context of policy shifts related to a change of national government. According to Gale these two incidents illustrate '...the tension within contemporary narratives on popular nationalism on the one hand and concerns for more inclusive cosmopolitanism on the other.'

The controversy surrounding the naming of a shopping mall is explored as a way of understanding the possibility of diasporic belonging. In a Melbourne suburb known for its large Greek population, the local community was divided when it was suggested that the mall be renamed to reflect the current character of the suburb. Rather than a name linked to the suburb's history of British settlement, some community members suggested a name linked with Greece, which reflected its history of post-World War Two migration. Pollard and Tsolidis examine arguments for and against the proposed change published in the local press. The authors argue that this was a social drama that involved various community leaders and members of the public playing significant advocacy roles. Through these exchanges we come to understand that power is linked to forms of legitimacy that invoke some histories as more significant than others.

Newspapers are also the focus in the paper written by Coram. She reflects on her experiences writing a letter to the editor in which she criticizes the commonplace representation of indigenous footballers as intuitive and naturally talented, in contrast to white players who are represented most commonly as hard-working and thinking. Coram received a hostile response to her 'Letter to the Editor' and the same newspaper included an article by the author she critiqued quoting Coram's academic work and accusing her of racism. Coram uses Critical Race Theory and gives us a 'counter story' which '... provides a context and platform grounded in hearing the "other" to enunciate multiple diasporic dislocations in relation to my racial-ethnic identity and academic marginality so as to disrupt journalistic privilege and authority.' She examines the accusation of racism brought against her in the context of her identification as a diasporic Maori academic.

## **Sexualised Identifications**

This short section takes up an important and often neglected issue. Migration and consequently, identifications that are linked to cultural difference, can be premised on ways of portraying women that deny them agency. This is most pronounced in relation to women whose migration histories can be linked to overt sexualisation. So-called floating brothels were sent to Australia so that the maleness of the new colony could be dissipated. Sex-trafficking continues today with dire consequences for the young women affected.

Siara is concerned with gendered and sexualised bodies and explores these through contemporary migration between Poland and the UK. Through an analysis of internet forum discussions she explores the social body and how power mediates its construction. This process, she argues, is further complicated by migration, particularly when norms related to acceptable sexual behaviour are different in the country of origin relative to that of settlement. She provides interesting insights into how Polish men living in the UK construct Polish women as promiscuous and in turn argue that their sexuality becomes a metaphor for the Polish community's standing more generally.

Mathews and Nagata explore migration to Australia prior to and after World War Two in order to expose how representations of Japaneseness have been linked to the history of women who migrated to work as prostitutes or who came as war brides. They argue that sexualisation and racialisation render these experiences at variance with common understandings of diaspora linked to dispersal and a collective identity. Mathews and Nagata build their argument that '...racialization and sexualization constitute the power relations of the Japanese diaspora and thus shape and mobilize collective conditions, experiences and meaning. They inform the regimes of truth and sites of struggle by which knowledge and bodies are regulated'.

## **Marriage and Family**

Marriage and family are in many ways the cornerstone of diasporic or hybrid identities. More than most institutions they speak directly to the maintenance or breakdown of boundaries between various communities. Families provide a kick-start for identification and marriage often acts as the means by which women's bodies are policed in the effort to maintain the character of the collectivity. On the other hand, families can be diaspora spaces where cultures come together through inter-marriage and the subsequent co-ownership of cultural difference. These twin and paradoxical aspects of family are illustrated in the last three papers.

Della Puppa looks at family reunification as it relates to Bangladeshi men living in Italy. Through interviews with these Muslim men he considers how their diasporic experiences away from family and community are prompted by their desires to establish better family conditions and yet when family reunification occurs their aspirations can be thwarted. Citizenship is tied up with work permits and a man's

responsibility to provide for his family may tie him into long-term unskilled labour regardless of his education, in order to be eligible for Italian residency. Della Puppa argues that in such circumstances, the men's aspirations are deferred and transferred to their children. Because of this investment, there can be a hardening of traditional gender roles *en route* to the more flexible identities that are associated with diaspora.

In her paper, Gurung considers the experiences of the Nepalese community in the United States. She is particularly concerned to explore how women's lives change through the impact of migration on gender roles. On the basis of interviews conducted with women living in New York or Los Angeles, she argues that men, unlike their wives, are less inclined to take low status service work after migration. Because women support their husbands' decision to wait for better work they become the main breadwinners for the family. According to Gurung this creates a paradox in gender roles because; 'When the wives are engaged in paid work outside of the home, the husbands are engaged in household non-paid work. This shift dismantles the traditional patriarchal gender relations.'

Marriages between Vietnamese women and Taiwanese or American men are the focus of a paper by Chyong-fang. Interviews with nearly 50 women are the basis for a comparative analysis of their lives in America and Taiwan respectively. The women who are married to Taiwanese men are reported as less satisfied with their marriages than those married to American men. Commonly these women met their Taiwanese husbands through marriage agencies and although they reported more cultural affinity with their husbands than did the Vietnamese women married to American men, they were less happy, possibly because of increased family obligations and larger workloads.

As with any collection, the papers can be combined in a number of ways to evoke alternative themes. I would like to draw attention to the significance of gender in the collection as well as the sense of defiance, which is a prerequisite for the maintenance of cultural difference. Without a resistance to racism and assimilation, there can be no sense that the boundaries of normalisation are indeed porous.

---

## The Significance of Gender

Many of the authors deal with gender explicitly and explore how living somewhere through the experience of having been somewhere else alters what have been hitherto taken for granted assumptions about the way the family works, the way education is undertaken or the way children are reared. Through these papers we come to understand that their lived experience of diaspora takes individuals, their families and their communities in very different directions. With regard to women's place in the family and the ways in which this shifts we get contrasting insights from Gurung and Della Puppa. Nepalese women in the USA support their husbands' desire for higher status work and thus become the main breadwinners for their families. Their low-status work nonetheless, shifts the patriarchal dynamic within their families. The Bangladeshi men described by Della Puppa, on the other hand,

experience the opposite dynamic. Their need to work, regardless of the status of this work relative to their education, consolidates traditional gender roles within the family as they strive to make their sacrifice worthwhile through the lives of their children.

Two papers include analyses of marriage between women from Vietnam and Japan respectively. Chyong-fang argues that Vietnamese women married to American men report better lives than those married to men from Taiwan. Here relative affluence takes precedence over cultural affinity. Mathews and Nagata provide a very different type of exposition. Their concern is with the echoes of previous migration experience and how these work to shape current representations of Japaneseness linked to racialisation and sexualisation. Siara takes us outside the family but nonetheless provides a similar sense of how women's bodies are taken to represent a collective identity. Current internet conversation is analysed to consider how Polish women's sexuality becomes a metaphor for a type of ethnic purity. McPherson is concerned to understand how women are represented also. However her focus is on institutional practice and the consequences of this on women's lives. By evaluating education policy discourses and contrasting these to women's aspirations, she argues that refugee women's opportunities are limited by sexism and racism.

---

## Defiantly Different

Rather than argue that diaspora denotes a bounded community living more or less as a type of nation in exile, the papers provide glimpses into how a sense of somewhere else is lived in ways that are dynamic and evolving. There is no straightforward teleology of settlement where migrants become the parents of their so-called second-generation children, who in turn are more likely to have children within mixed marriages *en route* to eventual assimilation. Instead authors provide insights into the lives of people and their communities that illustrate complexity. Rather than coming and staying there are circular movements even if these are discursive and metaphorical rather than embodied journeys.

Rhedding-Jones indicates how in the childcare centres of Norway and the UK the simple word 'aunty' denotes a sense of struggle against a system not adequately sensitive to its cultural significance. The naming of a shopping mall is used by Pollard and Tsolidis to explore how spaces are culturally colonised with reference to time. A suburb might belong to the first British inhabitants in contrast to post-war European settlers, but in this social drama there is no meaningful engagement with indigeneity. The term 'BrAsian', for Vieten, marks a way of becoming rather than belonging that is responsive to gender and spatiality. In her analysis spatiality takes account of the relationships between the local, regional and global at moments between de and re-territorialisation. In this sense also, Colombo provides insights into how young people strategise their identifications taking full advantage of their cultural repertoires to best suite where they find themselves at any given time or any given place.

Racism exists as one means of disciplining difference. Gale and Coram draw attention to this most vividly. Both provide expositions of the press and its role in representing the Other. Gale considers contemporary narratives of terrorism and their impact on Indian nationals living in Australia. Violence against students and the prosecution of a medical practitioner are taken to illustrate shifts in national policy away from multiculturalism and towards nationalism. Coram provides a very different level of analysis. The personal as political is evoked in the retelling of her experiences challenging racism in the press as a Maori. In response to her 'Letter to the Editor' her accusation of racism is reversed.

There is a careful sense of optimism in this collection of papers. It takes account of how living cultural difference is not always romantic. Authors describe how lingering difference is not just about language, cuisine and folkloric resonances that are taken to mark community. Instead they describe the messiness, discomfort and negative implications implicit in being different. Nonetheless there is a sense of going forward from somewhere else in ways that provide potential rather than defensive and stagnant ways of living diaspora.

---

## References

- Anthias, F. (1998). Evaluating 'diaspora': Beyond ethnicity? *Sociology*, 32(3), 557–580.
- Anthias, F., & Yuval-Davis, N. (1983). Contextualizing feminism: Gender, ethnic and class divisions. *Feminist Review*, 15, 62–75.
- Beck, U. (2006). *Cosmopolitan vision*. London: Polity.
- Brah, A. (1996). *Cartographies of diaspora – Contesting identities*. London/New York: Routledge.
- Brubaker, R. (2005). The 'diaspora' diaspora. *Ethnic and Racial Studies*, 28(1), 1–19.
- Clifford, J. (1997). *Routes: Travel and translation in the late twentieth century*. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press.
- Cohen, R. (1997). *Global diasporas: An introduction*. London: UCL Press.
- Donald, S., Kofman, E., & Kevin, C. (Eds.). (2009). *Branding cities: Cosmopolitanism, parochialism, and social change*. New York: Routledge.
- Faist, T. (2010). Diaspora and transnationalism: What kind of dance partners? In R. Brubaker & T. Faist (Eds.), *Diaspora and transnationalism: Concepts, theories and methods* (pp. 9–34). Amsterdam: Amsterdam University Press.
- Fuhrmann, M. (2003). Cosmopolitan imperialists and ottoman port cities: Conflicting logics in the urban social fabric. *Cahiers de la Méditerranée*, 67, 150–163.
- Gekas, A. (2009). Class and cosmopolitanism: The historiographical fortunes of merchants in Eastern Mediterranean ports. *Mediterranean Historical Review*, 24(2), 95–114.
- Gilroy, P. (1993). *The black Atlantic: Modernity and double consciousness*. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press.
- Glick Schiller, N. (2010). A global perspective on transnational migration: Theorising migration without methodological nationalism. In R. Brubaker & T. Faist (Eds.), *Diaspora and transnationalism: Concepts, theories and methods* (pp. 109–320). Amsterdam: Amsterdam University Press.
- Hall, S. (1996). The meaning of new times. In K. Morely & K. Chen (Eds.), *Critical dialogues in cultural studies*. New York: Routledge.
- Hall, S. (2002). Political Belonging in a World of Multiple Identities. In S. Vertovec & R. Cohen (Eds.), *Conceiving cosmopolitanism: Theory, context and practice* (pp. 25–31). Oxford: Oxford University Press.

- Hanley, W. (2008). Grieving cosmopolitanism in Middle East studies. *History Compass*, 6(5), 1346–1367.
- Hannerz, U. (undated) Flows, boundaries and hybrids: Keywords in transnational anthropology WPTC-2K-02, Department of Social Anthropology, Stockholm University. <http://www.transcomm.ox.ac.uk/working%20papers/hannerz.pdf>. Accessed 10 Jan 2013. Published in Portuguese as (1997) Fluxos, fronteiras, híbridos: palavras-chave da antropologia transnacional. *Mana (Rio de Janeiro)*, 3(1), 7–39.
- Harvey, D. (2000). Cosmopolitanism and the banality of geographical evil. *Public Culture*, 12(2), 529–564.
- hooks, b. (1981). *Ain't I a woman: Black women and feminism*. London: Pluto Press.
- Ilbert, R. (2004). A Certain Sense of Citizenship. In R. Ilbert & I. Yiannakakis (Eds.), *Alexandria 1860–1960 – The brief life of a cosmopolitan community*. Alexandria: Harpocrates Publishing.
- Kendall, G., Woodward, I., & Skrbis, Z. (2009). *The sociology of cosmopolitanism: Globalization, identity, culture and government*. Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan.
- Mansel, P. (2010). *Levant – Splendour and catastrophe on the Mediterranean*. London: John Murrery Publishers.
- May, A. (2007). *Espresso: Melbourne coffee stories*. Melbourne: Australian Scholarly Publication.
- Safran, E. (1991). Diasporas in modern societies: Myths of homeland and return. *Diaspora*, 1(1), 83–99.
- Singerman, D., & Armar, P. (Eds.). (2009). *Cairo cosmopolitan: Politics, culture and urban space in the new globalized Middle East*. Cairo: American University Press.
- Skrbis, Z., Kendall, K., & Woodward, I. (2004). Locating cosmopolitanism between humanist ideal and grounded social theory. *Culture and Society*, 21(6), 115–136 (SAGE, London, Thousand Oaks and New Delhi).
- Starr, D. (2009). *Remembering cosmopolitan Egypt: Culture, society and empire*. Abingdon: Taylor & Francis.
- Werbner, P. (Ed.). (2008). *Anthropology and the new cosmopolitanism- rooted feminist and vernacular perspectives*. Oxford, NY: Berg.
- Winland, D. (2007). Why we come back to diasporas: Heterogeneous groups and the persistent dream of political action. *Diaspora – A Journal of Transnational Studies*, 16(1/2), 254–265.
- Yuval-Davis, N. (2006). Intersectionality and feminist politics. *European Journal of Women's Studies*, 13(3), 193–209.
- Yuval-Davis, N., & Anthias, F. (Eds.). (1989). *Woman-Nation-State*. London: Macmillan Press.



---

**Part I**

**Multiple Belongings**

---

## Living on the Move

### Belonging and Identification Among Adolescent Children of Immigrants in Italy

Enzo Colombo

---

#### **Beyond the Dichotomous Choice Between Assimilation and Ethnic Closure**

The destiny of so-called second and third generation immigrants used to be and still is a central topic for research. The deep and constant interweaving between modernity and migration makes this subject a good starting point towards understanding some of the most relevant transformations of western societies (Sassen 1993; Portes and Rumbaut 2001).

Until the mid-1970s immigrants' children's potential within the new society was understood in relation to two theories – assimilation or deviation. In brief, immigrants' children were either destined to integrate into the host society, adopting its values, behaviour and the ambitions of the majority; or to remain on the margins of society demonstrating forms of attachment to what were understood as the more backward aspects of their parents' country of provenance, incompatible with full inclusion into a modern society (Child 1943; Gordon 1964).

The profound transformations of the last 50 years, which have been summarily telescoped into the idea of globalisation, have rendered these readings less plausible. The children of immigrants do not seem irremediably destined to either melt into the autochthonous middle class, abandoning any reference to the place of origin of their parents, or to establish a rigidly closed enclave tied to parental traditions and impervious to the culture and the society in which they live.

Following a brief critical synthesis of the historical interpretations of the destiny of the children of immigrants in contemporary western society, this paper proposes to use a generational perspective. The empirical data presented are based on 72 narrative interviews with immigrants' children attending high schools in Milan,

---

E. Colombo (✉)

Department of Social and Political Sciences, Università degli Studi di Milano, Milan, Italy  
e-mail: enzo.colombo@unimi.it

in Northern Italy. Starting from the experience of the young people interviewed, it is suggested that these adolescents be considered as an active minority in a new unit of generation that finds itself growing up in an increasingly globalised context. One special characteristic of this new generational experience is their ability to move continually from one context to another, a condition of continuous (micro) diaspora, which implies the ability to translate and adapt what they have acquired in one context to the exigencies of other new contexts. After the presentation of two significant examples of their ability to move without losing what they have acquired both in the diachronic dimension – switching back and forth between continuity and change – and in the synchronic dimension – seeing themselves as equal and different – the concept of “tactical ethnicity” will be proposed to account for the growing spread of hyphenated identifications.

---

## Methodology and a Brief Sketch of the Italian Situation

The data presented here are part of research, conducted in 2007–2008, which aimed to analyze how a relatively privileged section of immigrants’ children re-elaborates the projects and the experiences of their parents; how they react to the perceived opening and closing of the Italian social context; how they are similar to their Italian peers in patterns of consumption and way of life whilst projecting a demand for recognition of difference; and how they pose the problem of inclusion and participation. The research is a follow up of a prior study (2003–2004) focusing on everyday collective identification among children of immigrants in Italy (Colombo et al. 2009; Colombo and Rebughini 2012).

The 72 adolescents interviewed (41 boys and 31 girls, all between the ages of 17 and 22) are not a statistically significant sample of children of immigrants in Italy. Rather, they represent a potential elite who decided to continue in education beyond compulsory schooling. The choice of this group of participants responds to a precise research question. Following Melucci (1996a) and other scholars of “new social movements”, the research aimed to explore if it was possible to detect a potentially active minority which, having acquired specific skills, cultural capital and social position, is able to develop new languages and codes, styles of thinking, acting and consuming that may act as an *avant garde* example for wider sections of the population.

The peculiarity of the Italian migratory situation supports this hypothesis. In fact, only in the 1970s did Italy switch from being a long-standing country of emigration to being one of massive immigration. The migratory flux towards Italy is quite different from the Fordist model that characterized the bulk of previous European migration. Some scholars (Pugliese 2006; Wihtol de Wenden 2008) introduced the idea of a new “Mediterranean” model of migration, characterised by the presence of immigrants who show a very complex, pluralistic and fragmented differentiation (culturally, economically and professionally). They stress the peculiarity of the migratory context in countries such as Italy or Spain: the existence of a widespread informal labour market and the demand for labour in sectors that cannot be

delocalised (tourism, agriculture and, mainly, home services, caring for the elderly and other service jobs connected with the accelerated ageing of the population).

All these factors contribute to the creation of an extremely heterogeneous settling pattern. Italian immigration is marked by a strong difference in relation to place of origin, gender, professional skills and education. No single national group accounts for more than 20% of the total foreign population and immigrant men and women present different patterns of inclusion and family formation. There is a huge differentiation in the autochthonous reception also. In Italy, where there is not yet a long immigration history, migrants enter a fluid, hierarchical representation system of ethnic relationship. This assumes different meanings for different social groups often changing in response to the political discourses and news of the day.

In this context, the social collocation of the children of immigrants is anything but defined. On the one hand, a restrictive citizenship law, based on *ius sanguinis*, denies them the possibility of full recognition as Italian children born in Italy of immigrant parents. On the other hand, their presence is more and more visible and imposes rethinking “Italianness”.<sup>1</sup>

Given their position, it is increasingly compelling to explore how these young people understand representations of their place in Italian society, their aspirations, goals and future expectations. Within this group, it is young people who have more consistent cultural capital who seem to be in a privileged position and as a result be able to elaborate innovative forms of presence and action which may become points of reference for a new unit of generation (Mannheim 1928).

The narrative interviews focused on everyday life, family, school, friendship, lifestyle, and patterns of consumption for this potential “new elite”. They also attempted to capture how these young people think and present themselves and how they imagine their future. A significant part of each interview explored their interest in parents’ societies and cultures, the conservation of transnational ties, and the ideas of citizenship and belonging. The respondents were contacted personally at school, while a survey exploring young people’s social condition was being undertaken with each class in its last years of high school. The research was conducted in the 12 high schools in Milan with the most foreign pupils. The interviewees’ involvement was voluntary on the basis that they had a foreign parent. Generally, the interviews (lasting from 45 to 90 min) took place by appointment, in the University; only a few of them took place in the school attended by the interviewees. Of those interviewed, 21 were born in Italy, 14 arrived at a pre-school age and 37 arrived before they turned 13. Those in the latter category had attended some years of school in the country of origin and were put into elementary school or into lower secondary school when they arrived in Italy. Their parents’ country of origin varied and reflected immigration patterns in Italy: 23 come from Asia (4 from China), 17 from Maghreb, 3 from sub-Saharan Africa, 20 from Central or South America and 9 from Eastern Europe. All names have been changed to maintain anonymity.

---

<sup>1</sup>For a presentation of recent research on children of immigrants in Italy see the special issue “Schools, migrants and generation” of the *Italian Journal of Sociology of Education* (vol. 2, n. 1, 2010) (<http://www.ijse.eu/index.php/ijse/issue/archive>) [26 July 2013]

## The Development of a Complex Identification

Current research shows how the children of immigrants tend to identify through multi-faceted definitions of themselves which encompass just as much the attraction of the culture, the social network and the traditions of their parents as the strong bond with the society in which they live and wherein they are planning their own future.<sup>2</sup> Among the adolescent children of immigrants, *hyphenated* ethnic self-identification is widely becoming a common way of presenting and describing themselves, pointing to a different way of interpreting their presence and participation in the society in which they reside (Zhou and Xiong 2005; Levitt 2009; Crul and Schneider 2010; Song 2010).

The interpretations of the ever more widespread tendency among adolescent children of immigrants towards multiple hyphenated identification are still diversified and not always convergent.

Some scholars read this growing willingness to see themselves in an articulated way as an indicator of the spread of a symbolic ethnicity (Gans 1979, 1997). The persistence of identification with the parental ethnic group is purely cultural. It is not founded on the permanence of the actual ethnic networks and organisations to which they belong on a concrete and continuous basis. It is more a question of forms of expression which claim recognition of a specific and particular identity, an instrument of valorisation in itself and of social inclusion rather than the manifestation of isolation or dissociation from the majority. In an increasingly multicultural society, to call oneself “Egyptian *and* Italian” or “Peruvian *and* Italian” is a way of celebrating one’s own difference without feeling excluded, marginalised or segregated. If anything, the expression of a specific ethnic difference is, in many cases, a sign of cultural assimilation, since symbolic ethnicity, rather than being a mechanical reproduction of the cultural aspects of the family’s group of origin, tends to be an endorsement of attachment to the cultural traditions of the society in which they live and which they merely decorate with the frills and superficial modifications referring to a different (appealing, exotic) symbolic language. More than as an indicator of difference, it is used to indicate a specificity that valorises inclusion. From this perspective, hyphenated identification refers to a weak and voluntary ethnicity, intermittent and strongly subjective. This ethnicity demands little or no involvement and is not a discriminating factor in relationships with others.

A second interpretation emphasises how the tendency towards self definition in accordance with articulated forms of belonging indicates the emergence of a “reactive” identity imposed more by external prejudices than by personal choices of expression (Kibria 2002; Purkayastha 2005; Skrobaneck 2009). Young people, especially those of the middle class with a high level of cultural capital who want to be “integrated” and considered on a par with their peers thus run up against prejudices and racism and find themselves obliged to give a new meaning to the label of

---

<sup>2</sup> Among the many research sources available, I shall limit myself to mentioning (Aparicio 2007; Baldassar and Pesman 2005; Butcher 2004; Colombo et al. 2009; Kasinitz et al. 2008; Lee and Bean 2004; Rumbaut 1996; Zéphir 2001; Zhou and Xiong 2005).

ethnic difference imposed upon them from the outside. The valorisation of ethnic belonging does not derive from a *habitus*, from a family socialisation within cultures and community networks referring to the parents' country of origin; on the contrary, it is the result of a subsequent awareness that fully manifests itself only in adolescence when the children of immigrants experience discrimination and stereotypes applied to themselves and they become conscious that other children consider them "different". Positive and proud enhancement of what is imposed as a brand of inferiority is an attempt to overcome the marginalisation they experience. Hyphenated identification would therefore demonstrate a reaction to the existence of a "glass ceiling", an obstacle that many children of immigrants experience in their efforts to become full and active participants in the society in which they live.

From the standpoint of segmented assimilation (Portes 1996; Portes and Rumbaut 2001), the spread of hyphenated identification indicates the advantage that can be gained through the ability to maintain solid ties with the parental ethnic network. In an hourglass economy and in a segmented job market where there is a clear distinction made between jobs requiring high professional skills and those requiring only physical strength, the children of immigrants must enter the job market with high professional and cultural skills already acquired. They therefore find themselves obliged to acquire in only one generation those social positions that the children of immigrants of the Fordist context took several generations to acquire, passing from unskilled workers to specialised workers and then to the middle class (Portes et al. 2009). A hyphenated identification indicates both the desire to integrate successfully with the society of residence and recognition of the importance that the ties with the family context had in achieving such results. United families with a high level of cultural and social capital successfully transmit to their children great pride in the family history which stimulates interest in maintaining a bond with their "ethnic" traditions and culture. Pride that also acts as protection against discrimination and nourishes self esteem and the awareness of their own qualities. The tie with the ethnic network acts as a "moral force" which, by binding the individuals to the expectations of the group, protects against deviance. The maintenance of a strong identification with parental culture and tradition is then an expression of economic rationality – maintaining bonds that allow them to have greater resources at their command to cope with a segmented and increasingly demanding labour market – and a form of protection against possible forms of discrimination and racism.

The prospect of transnationalism (Levitt and Glick 2004; Levitt 2009) tends to see the spread of hyphenated identification as evidence of the spread of transnational practices and social fields. Hyphenated identification would describe the current condition of immigrants who are bound by multiple loyalties extending beyond a specific place and a specific community. Immigrants who experience the "bifocality" (Vertovec 2004) of lives lived "here-and-there" based on information, interests, practices and sentimental ties which transcend the dimension of the nation state or the physical locality. The growth of hyphenated identification would be a sign of the decline of a "methodological nationalism" (Levitt and Glick 2004) which compels us to regard the nation state as adequate and necessary to comprehend social life.

From this point of view, hyphenated identification is a new way of thinking of self, better able to account for the continuous experience of being immersed in a network that extends and crosses the borders of various nation states. It manifests the awareness of being included in relationships and practices that cannot be described as one sole belonging. It is a sign of a form of identification based on life styles and consumer patterns taken from the transnational social space rather than from “local” experience, on abilities and possibilities of maintaining long distance relationships rather than those based on proximity and the sharing of physical space. It indicates that the individual’s experience of real, concrete and daily relationships reflects back a self image that is always “fuller” than that which a national identification can portray.

---

### **A Supplementary Hypothesis: The Emergence of a New Generational Experience**

Although they are helpful, the interpretations advanced to account for the growing tendency towards identification in an articulated and plural way seem to overemphasise the peculiarity of the children of immigrants. According to these interpretations, the need to articulate self identity and belonging in such a complex way is an imperative only for these young people, so clearly but rather arbitrarily differentiating them from their peers who do not have a family experience of immigration. Reflection on the spread and intensification of phenomena of globalisation tends instead to point up how the experience of living within complex and highly dynamic information flows today may define a specific generational experience (Appadurai 1996; Hannerz 1992).

A significant number of today’s youth – at least those who have high social and cultural capital – must be able to cope in an even more changing world. They must contend with patterns of consumption, information and identification circulating within the global flows rather than, as happened in the past, extract material and relational resources they find in the local context within which they live. The opportunity to take disparate elements from these current models in order to put together one’s life in a specific way depends on economic and technological resources, on the network of accessible relationships and on the individual’s own personal abilities to choose. It requires the development of specific skills based mainly on the ability to access and to manage symbolic codes used and valued in various contexts and to move from one context to another (Noble 2009; Colombo 2010a). It becomes important to develop the ability to adapt to different relational contexts, characterised by different rules, audiences and interests, coping with the increasing difficulty in transferring what one learns or acquires in one sphere of life to other spheres (Melucci 1996b). The ability to count on differentiated cultural references, a certain relativism in one’s idea of the rules, the ability to adapt and be flexible seem to be fundamental skills that every young person must have in order to succeed in an increasingly global world. It is not simply a question of “accumulative” skills: being

able to handle contexts that are always different implies the ability to “translate”, to “mediate” what one is or what one has learned in one context into resources appropriate to different contexts. Thus building a hyphenated identity, for example, is not merely a question of putting two parts together. Very often what defines the content of the two parts is not automatic but is the result of complex reconstructions that relate to an articulated stratification of local, regional, national and transnational dimensions which are regularly in contradiction to or in conflict with each other (Purkayastha 2005).

Being “included” and respected in one specific milieu does not rule out the possibility of finding oneself in a position of marginality and exclusion in others. Thus a self image is advanced that is not necessarily consistent and stable, but rather many-faceted with different levels and potentials. This perception of self may lead both to forms of resistance which are employed in the reconstruction of a consistency and of a stability which are felt to be threatened and to the habit of managing a certain degree of variability and individual eclecticism, replacing consistency and continuity as forms of unitary reconstruction of one’s own experience with the ability to transform and adapt self to different contexts. For adolescents growing up in a global world which is changing and interconnected, managing this ambivalence may often be more important than being consistent: being able to cope with the context in order not to lessen personal opportunities may be more important than showing an integrity unaffected by the diversity of the situations.

If this ability/need to manage complexity and variability has become a code of experience of contemporary youth and is a basic component in creating a *generational bond* (Mannheim 1928) then it is possible to view the experience of the children of immigrants as if it were a more general case, able to cast light on social processes which affect most contemporary youth. The offspring of immigrants – at least those young people who have access to greater family, cultural and social resources and who invest heavily in higher education and in professional success – can be seen as an “active minority” engaged in processing new codes and new languages in order to cope with specific historical experience.

It is not a question of encouraging an uncritical exaltation of what is produced nor of embracing a conciliatory vision which suppresses the dimensions of the conflict. Instead we need to propose an analytical viewpoint that identifies the social and identification processes activated by these youths as a “significant and privileged place” where new codes are being produced. Recognising that these codes might not be necessarily better, democratic, able to promote a more pacific cohabitation nor to avoid new discriminations.

From this perspective, the procedures by which a complex, mobile and articulated hyphenated identity is constructed and presented may be a good starting point for a better understanding of some significant transformations in contemporary society as they have been experienced and processed by new *generational units* (Mannheim 1928).

Starting from this premise, it is important to try to analyse more deeply how the children of immigrants handle the experience of complexity and variability.



## Diachronic Fluctuations: The Complex Bonds with Memory, Traditions and Family Ties

The need to ensure a certain amount of harmony between the wish to maintain continuity with experience and parental teaching and the desire to break loose from what has been felt as fetters reining in complete self fulfilment create front line tensions. These tensions are managed by modulating the two polarities rather than by making a flat choice of one pole only. Continuity and change are the necessary and ineradicable elements of daily experience and must be managed in accordance with situations and goals rather than by demanding exclusive choices which may be consistent but overly rigid.

The continuity pole consists of a positive valorisation of parental teachings, a sense of pride in family history and “traditions”. The bond with parental “culture” is considered a “given” that impacts on character and the deep sense of self. Parental culture associated in a non-problematic way with national belonging, language and religion is seen as an “essential” element of one’s own identity, something that is received “at birth” and that now influences sensitivity, moral orientation, preferences and behaviour. Culture is also considered a sort of lowest common denominator that ensures facility of understanding, elective affinities and the most direct communication among those who share it.

Possession of a specific culture is commonly thought of as defined by birth and deriving from the bonds with one’s own family, parental teachings and emotional attachments. The origin of the family established, depending on individual cases, by national or religious belonging counts much more than the place of birth or where one grew up in determining that “profound” character, given and unchangeable, on which autonomy and the ability to make personal choices are founded.

I feel very Singhalese ... because I have the real personality of a Singhalese person, I’ve got ... my traditions, I’ve got ... well, I respect the principles that I was given when I was a little kid, no? Even if here when you see Italian kids, you feel like changing ... but ... what your parents taught you is stronger ... even religious values, let’s say ... here maybe lots of kids aren’t ... don’t believe in God, this sort of thing, but I ... being Singhalese, well, it’s really a way of understanding things (Shan, age 18, born in Sri Lanka, in Italy since the age of 7).

Losing contact with one’s own culture means “betrayal” of one’s own essence, changing one’s own nature.

We all have our own cultures and we must respect them, because it’s as if it were a betrayal of one’s own identity not to respect it and to take on the culture of the place where one lives. No! I mean, my own culture I keep for myself, I admire it because it represents what I am – we all have our cultures, our languages, our traditions and we should never forget them. I am against the foreigners who – there are Egyptians who come here, and they really give me a jolt – they’re glad to have forgotten their language, they’re glad not to talk to Egyptians anymore and to talk only to Italians. The Italians are fine, they’re good people, but you are an Egyptian, you betray your people, your traditions, no! This is betrayal (Christine, age 17, born in Egypt, in Italy since the age of 9).

Recognising one’s self in one’s own culture and maintaining a strong bond with family history does not, however, mean a mechanical reproduction of models that have been learned. Parental tradition and cultural experience must be adapted to

contemporary needs. Conditions change and with them, culture must also change. Not every aspect of culture can be defended or be considered exempt from any criticism and transformation. Personal ideas, the logic of the situation and goals one sets for oneself make it possible to take a critical look at culture and to accept the useful features while modifying those which are now considered anachronistic. To criticise and make an effort to modify one's own culture is not "betrayal", but rather a sign of a bond: it is proof that one's own culture is considered so important that it deserves a serious commitment to continue to improve it, to keep it alive and to adapt it to the transformations of the contemporary world.

I think you should never forget your own culture, because, in the end, it's you, you were born there and that is your culture. There are things that you may not share, but it is your identity .... You should never forget your own roots, but sure, if there are things you cannot agree with in your culture ... this shows that you care, that you want it to improve, you don't want it to look bad to others .... I feel that I have the Egyptian culture, but I also have my ideas and some of them go against Egyptian culture, but I don't care, because if Egyptian culture includes some things that are wrong, it is not right that if I am an Egyptian, I have to go along with things I do not agree with. (Christine, age 17, born in Egypt, in Italy since the age of 9).

The culture of the parents should not be forgotten, but I am not saying, however, that we have to be fixated, glued to how they are, but we must change a little, just that we have to keep the ties with the culture of the parents (Shanika, age 19, born in Sri Lanka, in Italy since age 13).

There is not necessarily any contradiction between the recognition of the deepest part of oneself bound to parental culture and another more practical and goal-oriented part influenced by the place in which one lives. When the continuity of the bonds and family tradition are emphasised, the essential reified trait of culture is used as the central reference: it signals the desire to maintain close sentimental relationships, it helps describe the feeling of involvement and it brings in the emotional dimension. When emphasis is laid on opportunities in life, on plans for the future, on self fulfilment and professional fulfilment, the ostensible essential character of culture inherited from parents becomes relativised: it appears diluted or needs to be adjusted to the different contexts.

Very often the "original" culture is interpreted as an "additional resource", a pool of knowledge, skills and sensitivities that enhance the individual identity or that may prove to be useful tools for achieving greater success in life.

The bond with culture, most of all, points up the importance of family ties. Maintaining one's own culture means keeping open a communication channel with one's own history and one's own group. But whatever "culture" the families transmit to the second generations it is an active selection and does not always correspond to the "ethnic culture" as it is understood and experienced by those who remain in the home country (this is fairly evident, and sometimes stridently so, for second generation children when they return to their parents' native land). Parents insist that their children are able to both maintain a bond of continuity with family traditions and to know how to make the most of the opportunities that are deemed to be given by living in Italy. It is just that chance to give children a future different from what they would have by remaining in the original nation that has often been

the reason for migration. Parents therefore encourage their children to acquire all the tools needed to achieve success in their new life context. Strong emphasis is placed on scholastic investment:

my father imposed an education on me anyway and was fixated that I had to finish school because finishing school is important, it opens doors to the world of work, it gives you chances that they never had ... they came here also to give us this chance and now I don't want to disappoint them ... They always tell me "school first. You think about finishing school, then you can think about a boyfriend and about love". They don't want me to do what the Filipino girls do, getting married at sixteen, they want me to finish school, to get a good job and to be independent (Maria, age 19, born in Italy, Filipino parents).

One of the fundamental needs expressed by the youth interviewed is that of maintaining, all at the same time, a certain continuity with the past, with family history and the traditions of the group to which they feel they belong as well as the ability to adjust to the contexts in which they find themselves living, to feel on top of the situation and not to miss important opportunities due to too much rigidity. It is starting with this need that the bond between continuity and change can be synthesised and processed.

The culture of parents should never be forgotten because of the fact of its origins, to know where we come from, we can compare it to the study of humanity. Why do we study history? To find out what men did before us, and we have to do the same thing with the history of our parents and our origins [...]. I think, from a certain point of view, that we have to be able to remember our own traditions but we also have to know how to adapt to the situations in which we find ourselves, to the environment in which we find ourselves. It's a little blending of these two things, we have to know how to live with these two aspects. That's what I'm trying to do (Titus, age 19, born in the Philippines, in Italy since the age of 8).

A hyphenated, fluid and adaptable identification allows avoiding radical decisions between supposed irreconcilable choices. It doesn't express a state of confusion or indecision, it rather highlights the value attributed both to the continuity with the family bond and the capacity to fit into changing contexts. It is not a new fixed form of identification, placed side by side a rigid identification with the past and the family's tradition and an amorphous and passive form of assimilation. It rather represents the capacity to use both continuity and change, differentiation and adaptation, reification and relativism, as useful skills which can be employed in different contexts for different goals.

---

## **Synchronic Fluctuations: The Complex Bond Between Inclusion and Differentiation**

In addition to dealing with continuity and change, the young people interviewed seemed engaged in managing continuous fluctuation between identification and differentiation. A fully autonomous identity must find a way of coping with the opposing needs of feeling part of the significant contexts in which one lives and, at the same time, being different, emerging in one's individuality, assuming a specificity

that allows recognition. Being accepted without getting lost in the crowd, being recognised as distinctive without being defined as deviant, are the skills needed.

Difference proves to be a resource when it helps activate relations, arouses curiosity and allows distinction and a restraint when it is rigidly imposed from without and when it is a vehicle for discrimination and an excuse for exclusion (Colombo 2010b). Young people learn to manage double skills in the use of difference, hiding it when it may be a source of discrimination, and emphasising it when it can be used to claim the right to participate or to signal specific individual qualities (Semi et al. 2009). The double skill further enables them to consider and present their difference as “essence”, as a characterising given that must be accepted and recognised as constituent and unchangeable, as well as the result of contingent choices that can always be modified, the result of intention and ability to make individual choices (Baumann 1996).

This skill appears particularly important when young people reflect on belonging and identification. In this case the chance to make cultural difference count as an element of distinction comes into play alongside the interest in the possibility to participate without exclusions or handicaps on a par with their peers in Italian life. The desire for inclusion and participation cannot therefore turn into assimilation. It must manage equality and difference in such a way as to ensure a certain degree of recognition and inclusion without implying total homologation.

Complete assimilation and rigid closure within the confines of one’s own group are generally considered unacceptable and negative solutions. Two of the main forms of integration contemplated in the hypothesis of segmented assimilation – full assimilation in the dominating middle class and strong recognition in an opposite but marginal culture – are both considered undesirable options.

I feel one hundred per cent Italian ... in fact the way I live is different from my cousins [who live in the Philippines], my cousins would never dream of going out alone with their boy-friends, because thinking there is a little backward, even going around holding hands is different ... but I don’t find it hard being a Filipino, actually I am proud to be one ... I even asked my parents to speak more Filipino at home so that I can learn it better ... I don’t want to lose this part of me (Julie, age 17, born in Italy, Philippine parents).

my parents are pretty closed, they don’t open up much. They were born in Morocco, they live here but it’s as if they were in Morocco. Not me. I’m different. I’m different. I was born in Morocco too and this ties me to Morocco but it’s different ... I would never live in Morocco because there they have a different mentality from here. By now I am more used to the ... western mentality because I’ve been in Italy for so many years ... and I’ll stay here in the future ... so then there’s no use being so attached to Morocco (Mochine, age 19, born in Morocco, in Italy since the age of 5).

A hyphenated many-faceted and mobile identification is certainly the most commonly used because it best reflects the complexity of one’s own personal experience. Not having to choose one sole option but keeping open several corresponds best not only to daily personal experience where equality and difference are open questions to be defined case by case rather than by given elements requiring simple unproblematic recognition, but it also corresponds to the skills required to pass from one context to the other.

Difference and equality seem to be linked to contextual definitions: they can be taken and used in substantial reified form as well as in procedural relative form. Assuming a hyphenated identity means not having to give up multiplicity and knowing how to move among the different situations without the risk of being excluded:

In some ways I feel Italian, maybe because of some habits I have. In other ways I feel definitely Bulgarian; that is, I am in the middle ... exactly the way I feel right this moment, I feel both Bulgarian and Italian. It depends on things .... It's just because of the fact that for my origins and the way I am it makes me feel still Bulgarian, that is, in my soul inside I'm Bulgarian, but for the way I live every day, and maybe even more generally in the way I think, I feel more Italian.... But I think that society is now changing very fast and that you have to adapt to changes in ways of thinking, in ways of being of various cultures, of various people, I mean, I think you have to know how to change (Iva, age 19, born in Bulgaria, in Italy since age 11).

Being recognised as persons fit to have access to different contexts, persons who deserve a hearing and who have the chance to participate requires continuous effort – understanding the codes considered important in that specific situation, activating or hiding equalities and differences, translating personal skills into tools that can be used to achieve personal objectives.

The management of the ambivalence of equality and difference is accomplished, on the one hand, by the ability to recognise variability in contexts and, on the other hand, by the ability to modulate forms of involvement in different situations.

In the first case, a person must be able to recognise that the contexts within which he or she lives are characterised by diversity and that a certain degree of mediation and agreement is needed in order to interact with others. The situation is always characterised by heterogeneity and one cannot limit oneself to staying in places that are “familiar”. This leads, for example, to assuming an instrumental attitude to the place where one has chosen to live: it is not necessary to live among those with whom one identifies. Following personal objectives leads to living wherever there are opportunities.

I feel as if I am more from Salvador because I am more ... easy-going, I mean, they don't make such a fuss, they like even simple things, I don't absolutely have to have designer labels or whatever, but Italian girls are more superficial, I mean, if it isn't a brand name, then it's a knock-off and then you're a sucker ... there, however, if you can afford it, that's great for you, but otherwise it doesn't matter, nobody's going to die. But I feel more Italian because I am more open to many things, to people, I think in a different way from there. But I'm sure not going to go back to live in Salvador because there is no hope for the future there ... and it is hard for me to get a good-paying job ... and besides, it would be useless, what would I go back there to do? My mother brought me here to have a better future and so I should go back there? I mean, it would be like ruining everything she has done up till now ... no, I'm not going back there (Xenia, age 18, born in Salvador, in Italy since age 7).

In the second case the young people interviewed tend to make a fairly clear distinction between admittance, involvement and allegiance (Colombo et al. 2011).

Admittance concerns the need to be accepted on a par in different contexts. In this dimension of meaning, difference should not be cause for any exclusion or privilege. Everyone should have equal opportunities to participate and should be able to play their cards on the same terms as others in fair competition, transcending

cultural difference and traditional bonds. Recognition of individual and group dignity precedes affirmation and recognition of difference. Participating on the same terms *even though* they are different becomes the central demand.

Everybody should be treated the same way, and their nationality should not enter into it, the fact that we are foreigners or not ... personal abilities should count for more, not nationality ... we are all equal and what distinguishes us from others are our personal abilities and not the group we belong to ... I feel just like the other young people ... and I want others to see me that way, for what I can do, not as a Filipino or an Italian or other ... (Titus, age 19, born in the Philippines, in Italy since age 8).

Involvement concerns a more complex level of participation. In this case, the important issue is to be recognised as an integral part rather than to be merely accepted. It means feeling involved and having the right to intervene directly. Feeling part of things does not necessarily mean being accepted: the possibility of conflict and the manifestation of one's own difference as opposed to other differences remain central aspects. Difference in this case requires a more precise recognition. Asking not to take it into consideration in order to avoid exclusion is not enough. Rather, difference has to be recognised as the legitimate basis for the expression of preferences and criticisms that deserve to be heard and taken into consideration. Belonging to different contexts means having full rights to participate and act, even in conflict, and to be able to fully express one's own difference. It does not mean, however, binding oneself exclusively. It is possible to be accepted and to belong without full identification. Loyalty and allegiance can be differentiated because each one has multiple and hybrid identities, because people are constantly crossing borders and moving from one context to another (Anthias 2006). Being able to express themselves and their own difference is the central point.

You see, if I decide to live here, it's because I like it here, I feel that this place has now become a part of my life ... I am the one who decides ... then if I decide to live here it is right that I have my say, that I am accepted and can contribute to make things go well here ... if I have some good ideas that can help, they must not tell me "you can't talk because you are a foreigner!" I want to have my thoughts heard and I don't want them to even say "First become an Italian and then you can talk.", no, I want to live here and therefore I want to say what I think but I also remain a Kosovar (Marcus, age 21, born in Kosovo, in Italy since age 13)

Finally allegiance evokes the essentialist dimension attributed to difference. In this case, difference is assumed to be one of the basic traits of identity. Allegiance expresses the idea of a deep sharing based on common roots. The "true sense of self" derives from an original difference linked to a destiny that must be taken as a given, to hereditary values which must be preserved and reproduced. The essentiality of identification supplies a kind of raw material that must then be adapted to the contexts rather than mechanically reproduced. Thus there emerges an area where it is possible to manage the tension between reification of identity and the need to cope with changeable and differentiated experiential contexts. Continuity and adjustment are not mutually exclusive and are, rather, a continual fluctuation which ensures recognition of self and inclusion, autonomy and the chance to develop one's own personal abilities.

## Tactical Ethnicity

The tendency to introduce oneself using composite identifications, *hyphenated* – Egyptian *and* Italian, Chinese *and* Italian, etc. is tuned in to generational experience: it manifests the need to manage multiple identifications that elude the possibility of being over-synthesised.

It does not seem possible to reduce the spread of hyphenated identification to symbolic and superficial forms of ethnic identification or to an instrumental use of ethnicity or to the spread of concrete and repeated transnational practices. In addition to these factors which are certainly important, the hypothesis that new and specific generational experience is leading contemporary young people to develop the need and ability to manage difference, to move from one context to another and to adapt what they learned from their parents to diverse situations, is asserting itself.

For the children of immigrants, hyphenated identification serves to signal the desire to be included, to participate actively without, nevertheless, having to become fully homologous with the majority rule. It signals a desire for integration that cannot be reduced to assimilation. A certain degree of difference coming from the recognition of a solid bond with tradition and family experience is deemed inalienable. However, this “cultural” difference is seen as a surplus qualifying identification that encourages rather than limits full integration. To be *both* Italian *and* foreign does not mean becoming isolated, using difference as a sign of incommensurable diversity, but it does mean sharing a large part of the dominant way of life without having to give up personal specificity. It is a relational resource rather than a stigma. Fluctuating between one identifying pole and another makes it possible to criticise extreme and excessive stances considered unreasonably inflexible and demanding a loyalty that reduces opportunities.

Keeping a certain distance does not appear to express *symbolic ethnicity*, and does not have a purely expressive characteristic, a pretext for celebrations and the formation of cultural associations for the purpose of entertainment and pleasure. Nor does it appear to be simple *instrumental ethnicity* (as supporters of the idea of segmented assimilation would contend), an area of protection and solidarity where one can gain access to greater resources to achieve the goal of improving one’s personal social position. It does not even appear to be linked to the emergence of concrete *transnational ethnicity*, related to the spread of relations and practices that extend over the native land of parental provenance as much as over the nation of residence.

It does, however, seem to mark the emergence of a *tactical ethnicity* that takes into account contexts and is able to use different references in different contexts.<sup>3</sup>

---

<sup>3</sup>The idea of tactical ethnicity is close to Okamura’s concept of *situational ethnicity* (1981). Both stress the importance of context, but while the latter insists on the role of situation – and the actor’s perception of that situation – in determining which of a person’s communal identities are appropriate in a point in time, the former intends to attract attention to the capacity to manage multiplicity and ambivalence as a necessary skill for continuously constructing or deconstructing communal identities which appropriately fit specific contexts. In other words, people are not only engaged in interpreting the situation and choosing the appropriate identification, but in actively – although not necessarily with coherent, fully conscious strategies – mediating, resisting and fitting specific contexts.

Management of ambivalence rather than consistency seems to give direction to the manifestation of tactical ethnicity: being able to cope with situations in such a way as not to be excluded and not miss those precious opportunities for self fulfilment is more important than the ability to demonstrate integrity and consistency that do not let themselves be influenced by context.

This is a case of mobile and globalised ethnicity consisting of elements taken from various contexts and ready to change and adapt even further – an “effective” ethnicity that opens up to opportunities rather than closes to them. It is, finally, a “distilled” ethnicity that selects some traits and blocks out others, that develops in a critical and reflective way and that focuses on what from time to time proves to be useful, reasonable and legitimate.

Tactical ethnicity is as much instrumental as it is reactive. Characteristic of tactics is adapting to contexts, finding expedients in order to obtain something, exploiting situations and taking advantage of the moment when the opportunity presents itself (de Certeau 1990). It is neither a completely self-determined achievement nor an injunction that was totally imposed. It arises rather from the need and the ability to construct a moving multiple identity that is continuously being defined and that can and must be differentiated depending on the contexts, the audience and the goals. The main purpose is to avoid being excluded from environments that can be advantageous and necessary for complete self fulfilment.

The management of tactical ethnicity that does not deny either full recognition in Italian society or full recognition of a specificity linked to family history, often leads to making a distinction between lifestyle and culture.

Lifestyle is the field of choice, freedom and autonomy. It is here that one seeks to carry out personal plans, where individual and generational specificity emerges. The central point of reference for lifestyle is the western world. It is here that the distance emerges from parents, cousins and friends left back home in the countries from which the families come. Lifestyle manifests an inevitable “Italianness”, the awareness of having become “different” and, in many cases, “privileged” compared to parents as well as not thinking of oneself as “a person who returns”, unable to give up the autonomy, freedom and opportunities offered by the western context.

Culture, however, refers to the most profound core of personal identity, understood as essentialist, reified, as something received “through education” or “through nature” and that cannot be completely abandoned without betraying one’s personal and deepest inclinations. Culture is the area of values, family ties and religion. Here a certain degree of distance from “autochthonous” peers is manifest, a distance that makes possible a critical attitude and that denies the willingness to fully assimilate. The essentialist rhetoric does not prevent the assumption of critical attitudes even of parental traditions. Just because culture is something to which one belongs and without which no one can be fully him- or herself, it is one’s duty to make an effort to change its obsolete aspects or those which are obviously wrong rather than to “abandon it”.

Requests for participation and recognition are not then reduced to the desire for complete assimilation leaving no residue. Instead they portray the birth of a new generation of “hyphenated” Italians who question the current idea of “Italianness”



and prompt us to rethink the meanings of belonging and national identification and the rules of cohabitation in a society that has inevitably become multicultural. A society where the experience of the diaspora (Hall 1994) of a persistent and vital interdependency between at least two cultural formations challenges any “monogamy of place” (Beck 2002), that is, any exclusive, durable and absolute reduction to a unique identification. The experience of the diaspora that no longer requires either actual physical displacement or the memory of a different past. Rather it consists of a specific condition which is widespread and typical of the world of today’s young people.

---

## References

- Anthias, F. (2006). Belongings in a globalising and unequal world: Rethinking translocations. In N. Yuval-Davis, K. Kannabiran, & U. Vieten (Eds.), *Situated politics of belonging* (pp. 17–31). London: Sage.
- Aparicio, R. (2007). The integration of the second and 1.5 generation of Moroccan, Dominican and Peruvian origin in Madrid and Barcelona. *Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies*, 33(7), 1169–1193.
- Appadurai, A. (1996). *Modernity at large: Cultural dimensions of globalization*. Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press.
- Baldassar, L., & Pesman, R. (2005). *From paesani to global Italians. Veneto migrants in Australia*. Perth: University of Western Australia Press.
- Baumann, G. (1996). *Contesting culture. Discourses of identity in multi-ethnic London*. Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University Press.
- Beck, U. (2002). Cosmopolitan society and its enemies. *Theory, Culture & Society*, 19(1–2), 17–44.
- Butcher, M. (2004). Universal processes of cultural change: Reflections on identity strategies of Indian and Australian youth. *Journal of Intercultural Studies*, 25(3), 215–231.
- Child, I. L. (1943). *Italian or American? The second generation in conflict*. New Haven: Yale University Press.
- Colombo, E. (2010a). Crossing differences: How young children of immigrants keep everyday multiculturalism alive. *Journal of Intercultural Studies*, 31(5), 455–470.
- Colombo, E. (2010b). Changing citizenship: Everyday representations of membership, belonging and identification among Italian senior secondary school students. *Italian Journal of Sociology of Education*, 2(1), 129–153.
- Colombo, E., & Rebughini, P. (2012). *Children of immigrants in a globalized world. A generational experience*. Basingstoke: Palgrave MacMillan.
- Colombo, E., Leonini, L., & Rebughini, P. (2009). Different but not stranger: Everyday collective identification among adolescent children of immigrants in Italy. *Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies*, 35(1), 37–59.
- Colombo, E., Domaneschi, L., & Marchetti, C. (2011). Citizenship and multiple belonging. Representations of inclusion, identification and participation among children of immigrants in Italy. *Journal of Modern Italian Studies*, 16(3), 334–347.
- Crul, M., & Schneider, J. (2010). Comparative integration context theory: Participation and belonging in new diverse European Cities. *Ethnic and Racial Studies*, 33(7), 1249–1268.
- de Certeau, M. (1990). *L'invention du quotidien. I. Arts de faire*. Paris: Gallimard.
- Gans, H. J. (1979). Symbolic ethnicity: The future of ethnic groups and cultures in America. *Ethnic and Racial Studies*, 2(1), 1–20.
- Gans, H. J. (1997). Toward a reconciliation of ‘Assimilation’ and ‘Pluralism’: The interplay of acculturation and ethnic retention. *Ethnic and Racial Studies*, 31(4), 875–892.

- Gordon, M. M. (1964). *Assimilation in American life*. New York: Oxford University Press.
- Hall, S. (1994). Cultural identity and diaspora. In P. Williams & L. Chrisman (Eds.), *Colonial discourse and post-colonial theory: A reader* (pp. 392–401). London: Harvester Wheatsheaf.
- Hannerz, U. (1992). *Cultural complexity*. New York: Columbia University Press.
- Kasinitz, P., Mollenkopf, J. H., Waters, M. C., & Holdaway, J. (2008). *Inheriting the city. The children of immigrants come of age*. New York: Russell Sage.
- Kibria, N. (2002). *Becoming Asian American. Second-generation Chinese and Korean American identities*. Baltimore: The John Hopkins University Press.
- Lee, J., & Bean, F. D. (2004). America's changing color lines: Immigration, race/ethnicity, and multiracial identification. *Annual Review of Sociology*, 30, 221–242.
- Levitt, P. (2009). Roots and routes: Understanding the lives of the second generation transnationally. *Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies*, 35(7), 1225–1242.
- Levitt, P., & Glick, S. N. (2004). Conceptualizing simultaneity: A transnational social field perspective on society. *International Migration Review*, 38(3), 1002–1039.
- Mannheim, K. (1928). Das problem der generationen. *Kölner Vier teljaheres Hefte für Soziologie*, 7(2), 157–185.
- Melucci, A. (1996a). *Challenging codes*. Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University Press.
- Melucci, A. (1996b). *The playing self*. Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University Press.
- Noble, G. (2009). Everyday cosmopolitanism and the labour of intercultural community. In A. Wise & S. Velayutham (Eds.), *Everyday multiculturalism* (pp. 46–65). Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan.
- Okamura, J. (1981). Situational ethnicity. *Ethnic and Racial Studies*, 4(4), 452–465.
- Portes, A. (Ed.). (1996). *The new second generation*. New York: Russell Sage.
- Portes, A., & Rumbaut, R. G. (2001). *Legacies. The story of the immigrant second generation*. Berkeley: University of California Press.
- Portes, A., Fernández-Kelly, P., & Haller, W. (2009). The adaptation of the immigrant second generation in America: A theoretical overview and recent evidence. *Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies*, 35(7), 1077–1104.
- Pugliese, E. (2006). *L'Italia tra migrazioni internazionali e migrazioni interne*. Bologna: Il Mulino.
- Purkayastha, B. (2005). *Negotiating ethnicity. Second-generation South Asian Americans traverse a transnational world*. New Brunswick: Rutgers University Press.
- Rumbaut, R. G. (1996). The crucible within: Ethnic identity, self-esteem, and segmented assimilation among children of immigrants. In A. Portes (Ed.), *The new second generation* (pp. 119–170). New York: Russell Sage.
- Sassen, S. (1993). *Migration system*. New York: Russell Sage.
- Semi, G., Colombo, E., Camozzi, I., & Frisina, A. (2009). Practices of difference: Analysing multiculturalism in everyday life. In A. Wise & S. Velayutham (Eds.), *Everyday multiculturalism* (pp. 66–84). Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan.
- Skrobanek, J. (2009). Perceived discrimination, ethnic identity and the (Re-)ethnicisation of youth with a Turkish ethnic background in Germany. *Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies*, 35(4), 535–554.
- Song, M. (2010). What happens after segmented assimilation? An exploration of intermarriage and “Mixed Race” young people in Britain. *Ethnic and Racial Studies*, 33(7), 1194–1213.
- Vertovec, S. (2004). Migrant transnationalism and modes of transformation. *International Migration Review*, 38(3), 970–1001.
- Wihtol de Wenden, C. (2008). Bassin méditerranéen: Frontières et réseaux. *Migrations – Société*, 20(120), 49–208.
- Zéphir, F. (2001). *Trends in ethnic identification among second-generation Haitian immigrants in New York city*. Westport: Bergin & Garvey.
- Zhou, M., & Xiong, Y. S. (2005). The multifaceted American experience of the children of Asian immigrants: Lessons for segmented assimilation. *Ethnic and Racial Studies*, 28(6), 1119–1152.

---

# Muslim Women in Western Preschooling

## Diasporic Effects on Identity Issues

Jeanette Rhedding-Jones<sup>†</sup>

---

### Introduction

In unpicking some discursive complexity, the chapter analyses selections of data, aiming to show how identity issues impact on women who work every day with young children in the Islamic diaspora. For Muslims what matters most is Islam. That means practising, embodying and articulating particular aspects of a religion, in all of the daily activities in which one is engaged. After moving to the west, for whatever reason, Muslims take up what is normalized practice in their new nation, but at the same time keep their faith and its enactments. The content of this paper is thus pertinent to new times, diasporic blendings, transnational positionings and re-thinking.

The chapter focuses on a situation when there is a conflict between a desire for courtesy and child care/education from a Muslim standpoint, and a desire for professionalism from the standpoint of a western nation that funds and regulates preschooling. The particular instance focused upon here is the use of the term 'Auntie' for the Muslim women doing the childcare. As a contested term this is unacceptable to Norwegians, who link it to the simple and unstudied minding of the young. In contrast, an Auntie in Muslim cultures is a woman respected for her age, knowledge and skills with children. The honorary title of Auntie in preschooling is given to show that the family matters, and that those who work with children form a supportive extension of children's families. For the western nation of Norway, an Auntie in preschooling (called *barnehager*, for children from the age of 1 to 6 years before they start school) is a throw-back to earlier times. In the 1970s a compulsory 3 years of higher education for early childhood work was introduced, and since then the practitioners (teacher-carers) have been addressed by just their first names.

---

Sadly, Jeanette died during the production of this collection after a brave struggle with illness. Her chapter stands as part of her important academic legacy.

<sup>†</sup>deceased

Earlier they were called Auntie, but this is now regarded as a derogatory title. For the few men who work(ed) with the young, the title Uncle has a similar history.

The example of the use of 'Auntie' in early childhood education and care is just that: an example of where cultures meet and are accepted or rejected as different. What would be expected is that the dominant culture wins the argument, and the Muslim Aunties must be called just by their first names. In a Norwegian preschool however, the women are not known by their first names (such as Noor, Isnina and Suada). Here where these women work they are called Tante Noor, Tante Isnina and Tante Suada, by the children, by the parents and by the other practitioners. *Tante* is Norwegian for Auntie.

There is no problem here, because their workplace is a private Muslim preschool, with special agreements regarding the national curriculum and the practice of Islam as it connects to the Norwegian pedagogy and care with the young. The starting point for the narrative of 'no Aunties in our preschools' was that we could not publish a book in Norwegian language, for a Norwegian audience of preschool teachers, with the word Auntie (*tante*) in it. What happened was that these women (Noor, Isnina and Suada are pseudonyms) are together with me and many other Muslim practitioners writing a book in Norwegian, about practice (Rhedding-Jones et al. 2011). Told by our publisher we had to cut out the word 'Auntie', because that would not be acceptable to our reading public, we re-wrote the book accordingly. This chapter presents in English some of what is forthcoming in that book, together with some theorizations around the complex matters of discourses. It now seems that we can have Aunties in our book after all, as long as we do not mention them too soon or too often. What clinched this possibility was that a non-Muslim mother wrote a short vignette for the book, saying what her small son had learned because of his *barnehage tante* (preschool Auntie) and how beloved she is. This non-Muslim family decided to send their son to this particular preschool because of the quality of the care and learning; and because they wanted their son to learn about cultural difference from an early age.

---

### **'Auntie' as a Term**

In Aotearoa/New Zealand (Ritchie 2008) the use of the term Auntie is a normalized practice. This is because Māori people (indigenous) have transformed what counts in early childhood curricula and the ways that Pākehā (non-indigenous) conduct themselves professionally and personally. In Māori culture and language it is impolite for a child to call an adult by a first name only, and family is seen to matter. So the professional child educator/carer takes on the title of Auntie when Māori are present. This is not the courtesy case for Muslims in Norway at a mainstream preschool, as there are a few non-Muslims who are aware of the critical issues around the honorary title. However, in large cities in Norway many Muslim families send their children to non-Muslim preschools because there is no private Muslim preschool available. The situation appears to apply to other nations in Europe also, where the Islamic diaspora has its effects on childhoods.

In a provincial city in England, a Muslim nursery school operates privately but, as in the Norwegian case described, with national funding and national curriculum mandates. Here the word *Khala* is said a lot, before the name of each of the women practitioners (the teacher-carers). At this nursery school the only language spoken is English, except for this word *Khala* and some Arabic words of greeting (e.g. *Assalamo alaykum*), religious observance (e.g. *Ramadan*, *Eid*) and adjectives for taboo or acceptance (*haram* and *halal*). *Khala* is the Arabic word for Auntie. The English word Auntie would be forbidden, I was told when I visited, so these English Muslims (mostly non-Arabs and mostly with Bangladeshi heritage) say it in Arabic, the language of the holy *Qur'an*. This happens even though these practitioners do not themselves speak Arabic, as first or second generation English citizens whose linguistic heritage is mostly from the Indian subcontinent.

As project participants, the Muslims in early childhood education in Norway and England say that being a Muslim is more important than anything else, including heritage, language and former nation. Here identity, diaspora and gender blur the effects of the new nation and the continuing religion. For Muslim women in the west what the public and right-wing politicians have focused on are the visible signs of Islam, notably the wearing of *hijab*. Many practising Muslims do not however wear *hijab*, choosing western clothes instead (*hijab* is not only a head covering but the wearing of wide and modest clothes not revealing the shape of the female or the male body, and not revealing much skin). A word such as Auntie is perhaps its counterpart, as an audible sign. In a Muslim preschool all women who work there, whether Muslim or not, are called Auntie if the children consider them to be their teacher-carers. For me this came as quite a shock, as one day a 2 year old said to me in Norwegian '*Tante, tante, passe på meg.*' I had been visiting the preschool one day a week for some time and had been acting like some kind of older assistant to the teacher-carers: building in the block corner with the children, playing outside in the snow, eating lunch together, singing songs. On this day the 2 year olds were going to sleep on their small mattresses placed on the floor of the darkened playroom. I had been stroking a child's back, and thought she had finally fallen asleep. I was wrong. The words she said as I tried to creep out the door were 'Auntie, Auntie, take care of me'. Until that moment I had not here been called an Auntie. From now on I was.

One reason for continuing the project in the Muslim preschool(s) was the awareness (by the Muslim practitioners and the non-Muslims who work with them) of the 'waves of social unrest and anti-immigrant sentiment [that] are already washing over Europe' (Beck 2009, p. 19). Making public what happens, and bringing Muslim childcare and education practices to the awareness of the west is part of our agenda for the project. Given Beck's statement about anti-immigrant sentiment, it is not surprising that both *hijab* and Aunties are unwanted by a majority not critical of its own hegemonic positioning of cultural dominance. Here what the majority resists is Muslim appearance and the sound of Muslim politeness: the term Auntie being heard by non-Muslims as non-professionalism. Here the discursive binary is between family read as lacking in professional expertise, and higher education which bestows it.

The worst case scenario that a cultural majority (in Norway) desires is that immigrants identify with national norms, downplaying the fact that these Muslims are now in fact Norwegian citizens. These Aunties speak fluent Norwegian, in addition to the many other languages that are in use every day in their preschool. This then is about transnationalism (at least once a year the Aunties travel back to their heritage nations if they are war-free, for annual holidays and extended family visits) and also about cosmopolitanism (the cities where there are Muslim preschools are not only national but regional, meaning that there are connections to other large cities in Europe to which their families and compatriots have migrated). The implication of such transnationalism and cosmopolitanism, in the case of the Aunties, is that they long for and belong to wider circles of cultures than monocultural families can imagine (Rhedding-Jones 2007). As Beck (2009, p. 19) states: 'The unit of political action in the cosmopolitan era is no longer the nation but the region'. So the Aunties in Norway or England are part of a much larger picture in what is currently happening or being wished for by Muslims in the so-called 'west', which is north of Africa but west of the Middle East and Turkey. The Muslim cosmopolitan citizen's identity is thus a postmodern juxtapositioning made up of the nation(s) of heritage, the nation(s) of recent residence and the region (of northern Europe, for example, but it could be the USA or the Antipodes). All of this has its effects on political action, such as early childhood education and care, the wearing of *hijab* or being called an Auntie. In a normalized preschool in the west, where Muslim practices are seen as not mattering, assimilation in the name of integration curtails moves towards transforming the dominant culture and its signifiers related to its historical constructions. These might include national becoming, Christianity even if the word is unsaid, and patriarchy even in a supposed post-feminist age.

---

## Communities and Religious Identity

Critical multicultural issues (Rhedding-Jones 2010), in the situation of the Aunties, can thus be seen as going beyond pedagogy, curriculum and care in early childhood education. The issue also regards how religion matters to identity: the identities of Muslim women who have migrated to the west and who now work in institutions for the young. In such a preschool, religious identity is fostered and respected because the preschool itself is a community for the children and adults who are there every day. Having Aunties there makes it into a kind of family where education happens. This education is not only about emergent literacy, the learning of Norwegian, beginning mathematics, social collaboration, and aesthetic and scientific starts before schooling. It is also about being a Muslim in a Muslim community; or about learning and being with Muslims if you are not a Muslim yourself.

For Muslims in the west, languages, pedagogical practices and Islam make a difference in the nations to which they have migrated and become citizens. These are effects of the recent Islamic diaspora, when wars and deprivation caused mass migrations. For Muslim women who now work in private but state funded Muslim

preschooling in the west, collective identity (Anthias 2002) is complex. Cultural, religious and national locations construct practices of difference as education and care for the young. Hence Muslim children in England and Norway are discursively positioned in private nursery schools and *barnehager* to take up or acknowledge Islam because of the women practitioners, for whom it is a way of life. Non-Muslim children here are also learning about Islam, and that their families are outside it but respectful of it. This chapter aims to shift the focus of identity (Hall 1996; Hall and Du Gay 1996) to *religion* as an unacknowledged category of inequality, a marked binary and a construct of subjectivity. What work with Muslims does is negate ethnicity (Rhedding-Jones 2001), because Muslims in the diaspora (Hall 2000) move across ethnic, national and linguistic borders. Identity however is not negated, as having a Muslim identity (Haddad and Smith 2003) is central.

Here though, there are some apparently unresolved theoretical problems regarding postmodernity. It is the postmodern shift that has made possible the multiplicities of waves of migrations, mixings of languages, and juxtapositionings of twenty-first century cultural practices. The Muslim preschool in Norway exemplifies this with its six or seven languages in use every day, its many representations of former nations, and its blendings of what is 'Norwegian' and what is not. Yet a Muslim identity that is essential, or central, locates identity as within the structures of the modern. This theoretical dilemma can perhaps be resolved by saying that the modern is always within the postmodern, even linguistically, and that this has its effects on identity. Yet the assumption that a Muslim reading of the *Qua'ran* is essentialist and sits uneasily with the critical readings of the poststructuralist theory driving much research into subjectivity (Davies 2004). For this chapter I choose to stay with the concept of identity, knowing that it will not allow for the agencies available theoretically through theories of the discursive constructs of the subject. I stay with identity theory here to connect to sociological work such as that of Stuart Hall, which links directly to religion:

Maintaining racialized, ethno-cultural and religious identities is clearly important to self-understanding in these communities. "Blackness" is as critical to third-generation Afro-Caribbeans' identity as the Hindu or Muslim faiths are to some second-generation "Asians". ... there is very considerable variation, both of commitment and of practice, between and within different communities – between different nationalities and linguistic groups, within religious faiths, between men and women, and across the generations. ...Identities declare not some primordial identity but rather a positional choice of the group with which they wish to be associated. Identity choices are more political than anthropological, more "associational, less ascribed". (Madood et al. cited in Hall (2000), p. 220)

The Muslim preschool in Norway is clearly a community of Muslim families, children and practitioners, where non-Muslims (including me) are welcomed. All of us must think about who we are and who we are becoming, because of the place and the practices. For Muslims there is solidarity across former nations, languages and forms of Islam. There is a politics here that fosters self-understanding, that encourages dialogues across difference and that allow for associations not possible elsewhere. As an inner-urban community this preschool includes parents who make major efforts to get their children here with an hour in the car or on public transport,

women practitioners for whom this might be their only paid work opportunity in Norway, and children who are growing up bilingual or multilingual, and who learn to recite the *Qua'ran* and to celebrate both *Eid* and the Norwegian national day with their preschool friends and Aunties.

---

## Muslims in Diaspora and Globalisation

Because of Muslims in the west, languages and religion can make a difference in the nations to which they have migrated and become citizens. This is an effect of the Islamic diaspora since the 1970s, when wars and deprivation caused mass migrations. A diaspora is a dispersal of people to other places, resulting in non-homogenized diasporic identifications, as Tsolidis (2001) has shown with her work about schooling and being different. She states (p. 116) 'diasporic communities have a range of skills ... including entrepreneurship, the building and utilization of networks and a facility with education.' Whilst preschool practitioners who have migrated may not be positioned to develop 'global cultural production', or 'take advantage of the new era' (pp. 115–116), the children from a Muslim children's centre in the west will be.

What follows presents some extracts from the writings of some Muslim practitioners who work every day with the children. Some practical effects of diaspora can be read into their texts. Noor is fully qualified as a preschool teacher in Norway and is of Urdu/Pakistani background. She wrote the following in Norwegian. The English is my translation.

We want you to know that we can't describe ourselves without saying something about Islam, and how this affects everything we do, and everything we want to do.

I have worked in this Muslim preschool for about seven years. This is where Muslim women from different countries work together. It feels almost like a family to work in this preschool, because we all act like a big family and we support each other on good days and bad. Here we can practise our religion with prayers and celebrations of Holy Times such *Eid-ul-fitr* and *Eid-ul-adha*.

On Fridays, our Holy Day in the week, the children learn about Islam. They also get to eat food from different countries when they all sit together to eat. The children do not only learn about Islam, they also learn about Norwegian culture, music and language. We take the children out on tours [into the woods, into the centre of the city and to islands in the fjord travelling by boat]. In these ways they learn the Norwegian language [from us] and at the same time some of us also learn to speak [more] of this language.

We are lucky, we who live in Norway, where there is freedom of religion. This is very good for the children in the preschool, which prepares them for when they will go to school. The first priority is the Norwegian language, so that children from other countries do not have problems with language later in their school life.

Noor writes *Eid* the Norwegian way as *id*, with small letters and without the E. This is an example of the effects of Norwegian normalizations on spelling. Not only spelling has been Norwegianized by the processes of migration and diaspora as these affect Islam in the west. Because Noor's preschool is called a Muslim preschool,



what she describes is able to happen. In a non-Muslim preschool she would not be positioned to celebrate Fridays and *Eid* as she would like; nor would she be called Auntie.

Isnina migrated from Somalia and learned to write in Somali language before moving to Norway. There was no written Somali until 1970, when the Roman alphabet was selected for it. Now Isnina writes better Norwegian than Somali, but she wants Somali published so that other Somali people can see it and value it. In the Muslim preschool she works as an assistant. The English is my translation from her Norwegian, following one of our multilingual writing workshops on a professional learning day without the children, as part of the development project.

Maalin maalmaha kamid ah ayaan u fariisanay in aan cunteyno markii ey ilmaha soo dhaadeen gacmaha kadib oo ey boosaskoodi soo fariisteen kadib ayaan waxaan bilaawney eedooyinkeena meesha ka shaqeeye in aan caruurta caana u shubshubno oo an ilmaha qaar u baahnaa in wax loo soo qandiciyo aan. Ilmaha badan kood waxey bilaabeen in ey cuntadoodii furtaan oo ey conteeyaan. Muda yar kadib ayaa waxaa isheyda qabatay wiil yar oo iska fadhiga oo aan cantadiisii furan. Wiilkii baan utagay waxaan kudhahay maxaa kugu dhacay oo aad cuntadaada u furan weyday oo aad u bilaabi weysay in aad cunto waxuu iigu jawaabay ducadii mannagaa akhrinay, taas oo caado noo ahayd. Waxaan kudhahay aad ayaad u mahadsantahay waaxaan ku jeestay ilmahii kaloo dhan waxaa kudhahay waan iloownay manta ducadii waxaa na xasuusiyey hebel waxaana nagu filan hada in aan dhahno bismi laah waanasii wadan kartaan cuntadiina. Waxaan u jeestay wiilkii xagiisa waxaan ku dhahay adiga sidoo kale waa cunteyn kartaa. Wuu ii dhoolacadeeyey kadib ayuuna furtay cuntadiisa.

One day we sat down to eat, all the children had been to wash their hands and they came back to their places. The Aunties began to help them with their milk, and some of the children began to eat from their lunch boxes. After a while I went to a boy [aged about four] who had not yet opened his lunch box, I went up to him and I asked him why he had not started. The little boy answered that he had not read the *dua* [the prayer] before eating. I thanked him for reminding us. Then I turned around to the other children and said we had forgotten to say the prayer and he had reminded us. So I said *Bismillah* [the prayer] then, aloud. Then I said they could all now begin to eat. The boy smiled so broadly as he opened his lunch packet and began to eat.

Here Isnina uses the Arabic words for the Muslim practices to do with praying. Her narrative shows what kind of relationship she has with the children and how important the Muslim practices are to her. In choosing to write this narrative from an event that stays in her mind, Isnina highlights the importance of what a child knows, and lets us see the funny side of what she forgot.

Bina wrote first in Urdu by hand in one of our workshops, as we all sat around on our many small groups before we bilingually read aloud to each other what we had written. Here she writes about a child who calls her Auntie. Tante Bina has worked as an assistant for over 10 years in Norway and speaks Norwegian fluently. After she translated her Urdu by hand into Norwegian, Bushra's mother put the Urdu into a computer file in the Urdu alphabet, which like Arabic is read from the right.

یہ ایک نارویجن بچے کے بارے میں ہے جو ایک بچوں کے سکول میں پہلی جماعت میں جاتا ہے، لیکن وہ پہلے بارنے ہاگن جاتا تھا، جو پسند کرتا تھا کہ میں اس کے لیے نارویجن میں کتاب پڑھوں۔ جب وہ کتا بین پڑھتا تھا تو اسکو شور بالکل پسند نہیں تھا۔ ایک دن اس نے مجھ سے کہا کہ اٹنی بینا “میں آپکو پڑھنے کیلئے اسلئے کہتا ہوں کیونکہ میں آپکا استاد بنوں گا، آپکو نوشک سکھاؤں گا۔”

میں محسوس کرتی ہوں کہ اس کے کہنے کا یہ انداز بہت پر لطف تھا۔ لیکن یہ حقیقت ہے کہ ہم غیر ملکی ایک اجنبی زبان کے سیکھنے میں بہت وقت لگاتے ہیں۔ مزید اس نے کہا کہ “میں تمہارا دوست ہوں” تب میں نے مسکراتے ہوئے اس سے پوچھا، “کہ کیا میں تمہاری بترین دوست ہوں؟” نہیں “اس نے بے ساختہ کہا اور وضاحت کی کہ انسان کا بہترین دوست ایک ہی ہوتا ہے جس کے ساتھ وہ اپنے راز بانٹ سکتا ہے۔

This is about an ethnic Norwegian child who is now in the first grade at school. He went to this preschool before that, and he liked me to read books to him, in Norwegian. He was very quiet when we read books. One day he said to me, “Tante Bina, I want you to read for me so that I can be your teacher, I will teach you Norwegian.” I think that was so wonderful, the way he said that. We immigrants have to use much time to try to learn this foreign language. Then he continued, “I am your friend.” I teased him a bit. “And am I your best friend?” “No” he said, and then explained that you only have a best friend when you share your secrets.

What Bina points to here is not only her Auntie relationship which blends pedagogy, care and family values. She also describes what an ethnic Norwegian child says he will do to help her perfect her Norwegian reading. Ethnic Norwegians, who usually speak only Norwegian, are very much in the minority in this Muslim preschool.

Suada wrote the next narrative in Bosnian. She was at the time of writing the only one of the practitioners who knew this language, yet it was important that she read it aloud and we listened. After that she told us in Norwegian what she had written, so that we understood her. In this setting, there was respect for not only Suada’s language but her practices of being a Bosnian Muslim. The story is about her care with the youngest children. The 2 year old who speaks in the story has understood both Suada’s Norwegian and the situation, which is quite an achievement for the 2 year old and for Suada. The bionotes she wrote for our co-authored book (Rhedding-Jones et al. 2011) state the following, which she wrote in Norwegian: Suada moved to Norway together with her family because of the war. She is now a grandmother, likes sport and goes skiing and paragliding with her husband quite often. Suada wears hijab at all times in public. She is a qualified preschool teacher in Bosnia, and is professionally experienced in work in Bosnia with children aged from three to six. At the time of writing this narrative she had just begun paid work in Norway. Suada chose to not reveal her true name even in the bionotes, for international security reasons.

Jednoga dana bili smo vani sa djecom da se igramo. Posle igre djeca su usla unutra da se odmore, i tada sam ja njima objasnila da djeca moraju sad da legnu, da se odmaraju, da bi posle mogli ustati odmorni. Za nase tijelo je jako vazan odmor. tada sam ja rekla njima "sad je vrijeme za spavanje, sva djeca moraju leci i spavati", i ja sam im pjevala pjesmicu da bi bolje zaspali. sva su djeca legla, samo jedna djevojica sto se zove Selma nije htjela spavati, i ona je ustala i uzela jednu lutku. S njom je pocela ponavljati moje rijeci koje sam ja uputila

djeci. Tada je ona rekla: "sad je vrijeme za spavanje, sva djeca moraju spavati, da bi kasnije mogli biti odmorni i raspoloženi.

Today we have been outside playing for a long time. After being very active the children came inside to sit down and some to sleep. They were so tired and they need a breathing spell. I explained to them how we were all going to lie down. [The practitioners usually lie down beside these young children until they are asleep. They stroke backs and sing, on mattresses on the floor.] I said to them, "Now it is sleep time. All the children will lie down and sleep." All the children lay down, except one, who went and got a doll and said to it, "Now it is sleep time, all the children have to sleep."

This story represents the shift Suada has made to another culture, another language and another workplace. Sending me an email with the Bosnian and the Norwegian versions of the narrative was one more step on the long road to 'cultural and written language competence' in her new location where she identifies as a Muslim Auntie in a Norwegian preschool.

In England, the ethnic English who are Muslims have not migrated, but have been affected by the migrations of others, and perhaps by their own travel. A related concept to diaspora is thus globalisation. There are also complex connections between globalisation, transnationalism and transmigration (Adams and Kirova 2006, p. 8) as identities formed within them are 'fluid and open to transformation'. Here immigrant children often have highly conflicting discourses in their homes and in their schools, say these researchers. In contrast, Muslim parents in Norway say that having a preschool that functions as a community house, with practitioners speaking the many languages of the families, who share the Islamic faith and practices, and who know what it is to shift around the world and become different, is a great blessing.

Two English Muslim practitioners I met in the course of the project are Hawwa and Saira. They give permission for their names and the following notes of mine to be published.

At the end of my 2 days of visits to the Muslim nursery school in an English city I meet Hawwa Haide, the managing director of the centre, who says I can publish using her real name. She gives me her card, tells me her name in English means Eve. She is as Anglo as I am, but wearing full black hijab including head covering. She says I can write down what she says about being Muslim and working in a Muslim centre, she would like to be quoted.

"This is like a home from home." "They say it's multicultural [the workers in English nursery schools are not Muslim] and they believe they are working with cultural diversity. But it's Christian based. [In contrast] we project our Islamic values onto others."

I'm quietly reading the children's books in the bookcorner. *Amir and the Ants* is the third book in a Muslim nature series, written by Rowaa El-Magazy. The series 'explores the scientific and spiritual wonders of Allah's creation.' As I handwrite this, Saira, who works with the children, comes up to me and says

It's good to work in mixed environments. I came here because I need a job and I hoped to get this one. I also do child minding at home, until I get qualified. I'm doing my level 2 now. I got level 2 in 2000 and level 3 in 2003. It's kind of good here. All our staff speak different languages. It's really good working in a Muslim environment. We feel at home, you know.

I don't know what to say about that. I don't mind if you put my real name in the book. I work from home and have my own business minding children now. [She's part time here and part-time there]

Arjun Appadurai (1996, p. 9), writing of cultural dimensions of globalization, calls for a rupturing and subverting of what is contextual when this denies the rights of marginalized cultures and speakers. In the project presented in this paper the marginalised culture is a religious culture, across nations and across languages. Here in the Muslim preschools the practitioners are 'producing locality ... in new globalised ways' (p. 9). Following Appadurai I attempt to radically re-think what has mattered in early childhood education in the west, here considering effects on identity. Appadurai states (p. 19) 'the nation-state, as a complex modern political form, is on its last legs'. What postmodernity requests, (p. 158) is to 'think beyond the nation'. The implications of this are not only about Norway and England, They regard what is happening globally as a Muslim child is identifying, and as a non-Muslim child grows up knowing about and respecting Islam. Part of these childish identifications come about because of the women who are their teacher-carers in the preschools. For ethical reasons I decided not to focus on the children and the 'examination' of their identities. Instead I have worked with adults and also questioned my own positioning.

The Aunties are not only individuals but together form a collective, and this collective identity (Anthias 2002) is highly complex. For Muslims who have migrated to Norway, their heritage nations and languages continue at the same time as their adoptions and transformations of Norwegian practices and language. They are thus positioned in Norway as:

diasporic communities are understood not as stranded minorities, but as providing, through the lived experience of their members, insights into cultural production as it occurs in both of the locations they function between. (Tsolidis 2001, p. 114)

For the Muslim children in Norway, the lived experiences and cultural locations the Aunties bring with them to their jobs in the preschool stem from Norway, Morocco, Turkey, Syria, Somalia, Kurdistan, Tunisia, Bosnia, Pakistan and Iraq. Every day about 75 children are with these women, in Norway. The centrality of religion, for Muslims, matters because early childhood education must reflect the values and wants of parental communities as well of the nationally mandated curriculum. Here the 75 children come mostly from Muslim families, and occasionally from families with one Muslim parent.

---

## Non-Muslim Families

Some non-Muslim families in Norway want their children to grow up learning about cultural, religious and linguistic differences. They know that their children will learn in the preschool about Islam, whilst at the same time their children will know that their families are outside this faith but respectful of it. One such

mother is Synnøve (pseudonym) who sent the following on email, specifically for publication.

Hei! Dette med tanter og kjærlighet er nok det vi liker aller best med [denne]barnehagen. I tillegg til at Bo får en fantastisk forståelse og naturlig forhold til det at folk er forskjellige, Jeg har lyst til å dele en liten samtale jeg hadde med Bo for omtrent ett år siden, da han var to. Jeg synes denne lille praten taler for seg selv, samtidig som den er et av mange eksempler på hvorfor vi er så strålende fornøyd med de kjære "tantene" i barnehagen.

"Jeg elsker deg, mamma", sa Bo en dag. Jeg ble litt forundra, for vi hadde ikke brukt dette ordet. Jeg lurte selvfølgelig på hvor han hadde lært dette. Var det via Beste? Så jeg spurte ham om det var noen andre han elsket, og antok at jeg med svaret ville få vite hvem som hadde lært ham det. "Tante Beren", svarte Bo. (Jo was not his pseudonym. Bo is.)

Hi! All this about Aunties and love [another word the Aunties use a lot] is what we like best in [this] preschool. Also Bo [her son aged three] gets a fantastic understanding and learns in a natural way that people are different. I want to share a little conversation I had with Bo about a year ago when he was two. I think this little chat speaks for itself, at the same time it is one of many examples of why we [she and Bo's father] are so especially pleased with the dear "Aunties" in [this] preschool.

"I love you, Mummy", said Bo one day. I was a bit surprised, because we hadn't used this word. I wondered of course where he had learned it. Did he get it from his grandmother? So I asked him if there was anyone else he loved, and assumed that with his answer I would find out who had used this word with him. "Tante Beren", he said.

Bo has learned not only the word from Tante Beren. He has also learned the concept, at the age of two, from a Muslim practitioner. Knowing the concept he can then apply it to his mother, who he knows he also loves. Here then are twisted discourses of family and professionalism. Beren is educated in Norway as a preschool practitioner. She speaks her heritage language which is Turkish and she is the mother of two small boys. Her Norwegian education for the profession would certainly not have included anything called love or anyone called Auntie. What she does in the context of the Muslim preschool is resist her Norwegian education asserting instead her Muslim identity as a woman in diaspora. It took a non-Muslim mother to write this about the place of love and of Aunties as they connect to it. Synnøve knows that love matters and is delighted that her child is learning this from his Muslim Aunties. She chose to write this for publication because she wants to support the professionalism of the Aunties/practitioners and she knows that the family (including Aunties) is quite often assumed to be lacking in appropriate knowledge, arts and skills as these relate to childhood.

A letter that two other non-Muslim parents sent to one of the Aunties shows further the support such parents are giving to the Muslims. Amina [pseudonym], who got the letter, showed it very proudly to me. Later they wrote her another letter, perhaps after they were sure she was comfortable reading Norwegian.

Dear Amina,

Thank you so much for taking such care of our son Per [pseudonym]. With you we know that he is always in the very best of hands. We are all going to miss you so much now. We hope we can soon see you again.

Have a great summer,

Hugs from Per, Ragnvald and Inge [pseudonyms]

Later they wrote again. Amina kept these notes as signs that she values. It was her idea to copy them for publication.

Dear Amina,

We didn't get to give you the flowers and the card because you were away sick. We thought we would visit you at home but time has got away from us. Anyway we are sending you another card now and thanking you so very much for all you did with Per. He just loved being with you. Now he is a big strong boy [in another preschool] and he is very clever to run and eat up all his dinner [He is aged two]. He can say quite a lot more words and he is learning many things all the time ... but he thought it was tough to begin in another preschool. [They moved away] He really misses you, and at the start [in his new preschool] he would only be with a woman who was wearing hijab and speaking Arabic. [Here the parents have drawn a smiling face on their card] Hope everything is going really well for all the people in ... [the name of the preschool unit]. We are going to come and visit you soon. Say a big hello from us to Suada and Mona [Amina's colleagues in the barnhage].

Hugs from Per, Ragnvald and Inge

There are not many non-Muslim families whose children attend this preschool. Mostly their children are aged two or three. After that, when the children are more verbal and the more explicit instruction about Islam starts, the non-Muslim family mostly send their children somewhere else. An exception was Maria, whose mother is Polish and who kept Maria in this preschool until she started school at the aged of six. "Such a wonderful start she has had", Maria's mother told me (in Norwegian) at the preschool's summer party when Maria was six. "We will really miss this place and all the Aunties who know these children so well and teach them and care for them so wonderfully." I have not heard how Maria got on at school (the summer party was a year ago; when I first met Maria she was three) but it is fairly certain she would not get the care and understanding there the Aunties gave her. Eating pork sausage in the preschool, for Maria, was quite acceptable, as the Aunties simply explained to the other children that Maria was different. Everyone accepted that she ate what was *haram* (forbidden) to Muslims with no problems.

---

## Conclusion

As the title of this chapter indicates, there *are* Muslim women in western preschooling. Not yet in positions of relative power (in higher education or in government ministries) and mostly working as assistants to teachers educated to work with young children, Muslims are rarely positioned to actually practise their religion in the work they do in the west. Usually Muslim practitioners are acting in the preschools as if they were non-Muslims, although they might be wearing Islamic clothing and fasting during Ramadan (Rhedding-Jones 2010, p. 82). In private Muslim preschools operating with both private and state funding in Norway and in England however, Muslim practices flourish. Here Muslim identities are materialized by the eating of *halal* food, the wearing of *hijab*, the recitations from the *Qur'an*, particular ablutions and regular praying, the daylight fasting by healthy adults during Ramadan, and the

celebrations with the children and their families of *Eid*. As representations of Muslim identities, these practices are passed on to Muslim children in these private preschools, and are acknowledged and understood by the non-Muslim children and adults there. Practical examples include the singing of Muslim children's songs and the non-representation of persons and animals in children's art. Norway has two such preschools (*barnehager*) which operate with state and private funding combined, and which follow the re-writing of particular clauses of the national Curriculum Frameworks (Kunnskapsdepartementet 2006) plan so that Islam may be practiced instead of Christianity or the lack of a religion. This initiative has come not from institutions that would 'manage' religious difference, but from those who are concerned about the differences and want them positioned as acceptable: namely from Muslims themselves. Here the uncritical use of the term 'multicultural' is not in use, presumably because of its overtones of neo-liberalism, management strategies and normative agendas. Relatedly, Hall says:

Like other related terms – for example, “race”, ethnicity, identity, diaspora – multiculturalism is not so discursively entangled that it can only be used “under erasure”. ... multicultural is used adjectivally ... multiculturalism is substantive. It references the strategies and policies adopted to govern or manage the problems of diversity and multiplicity which multi-cultural societies throw up. (Hall 2000, p. 219)

The question then becomes: Who should be governing Muslims in the west? In the case of the Muslim preschools Muslims govern themselves, whilst still following the rulings and mandates of their new nations of citizenship. Such preschools, however, are rare. What can be the future for Muslim children in the west, given the difficulties and the complexities of who is positioned to work as a practising Muslim with them? These are questions closely connected to diasporic effects on identity issues for children and for those Muslim practitioners now working in the west.

---

## References

- Adams, L. D., & Kirova, A. (Eds.). (2006). *Global migration and education: Schools, children and families*. New Jersey: Lawrence Erlbaum.
- Anthias, F. (2002). Where do I belong? Narrating collective identity and translational positionality. *Ethnicities*, 2(4), 491–514.
- Appadurai, A. (1996). *Modernity at large: Cultural dimensions of globalization*. Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press.
- Beck, U. (2009). This crisis can help transform Europe. In *The guardian weekly*. 17 April 2009, p. 19.
- Davies, B. (2004). Identity, abjection and otherness: creating the self, creating difference. *International Journal of Equity and Innovation in Early Childhood*, 2(1), 58–80.
- Haddad, Y. Y., & Smith, J. (2003). Adjusting the tie that binds: Challenges facing Muslim women in America. In H. Jawad & T. Benn (Eds.), *Muslim women in the United Kingdom and beyond: Experiences and images* (pp. 39–64). Leiden: Koninklijke Brill.
- Hall, S. (1996). Introduction: Who needs identity? In S. Hall & P. Du Gay (Eds.), *Questions of cultural identity* (pp. 1–17). London: Sage.
- Hall, S. (2000). Conclusion: the multi-cultural question. In B. Hesse (Ed.), *Unsettled multiculturalisms: Diasporas, entanglements, 'transcriptions'* (pp. 209–241). London/New York: Zed Books.

- Hall, S., & Du Gay, P. (Eds.). (1996). *Questions of cultural identity*. London: Sage. <http://English.peopledaily.com>.
- Kunnskapsdepartementet. (2006). *Rammeplan for barnehagens innhold og oppgaver* (Curriculum Frameworks Plan for Preschools in Norway) Oslo: Ministry of Education.
- Rhedding-Jones, J. (2001). Shifting ethnicities: 'Native informants' and other theories from/for early childhood education. *Contemporary Issues in Early Childhood*, 2(2), 135–156.
- Rhedding-Jones, J. (2007). Monocultural constructs: A transnational reflects on early childhood institutions. *Transnational Curriculum Inquiry*, 4(2), 38–64.
- Rhedding-Jones, J. (2010). Critical multicultural practices in early childhood education. In S. May & C. Sleeter (Eds.), *Critical multiculturalism: Theory and praxis* (pp. 69–80). New York: Routledge.
- Rhedding-Jones, J., Nordli, H., & Tanveer, J. (Eds.). (2011). *Beretninger fra en muslimsk barnehage i Norge* (Tales from a Muslim preschool in Norway). Bergen: Fagbokforlaget.
- Ritchie, J. (2008). Honouring Māori subjectivities within early childhood education in Aotearoa. *Contemporary Issues in Early Childhood*, 9(3), 202–210.
- Tsolidis, G. (2001). *Schooling, diaspora and gender: Being feminist and being different*. Buckingham/Philadelphia: Open University Press.



---

# 'When I Land in Islamabad I Feel Home and When I Land in Heathrow I Feel Home'

Gendered Belonging and Diasporic Identities of South Asian British Citizens in London, in Leicester and in North England

Ulrike M. Vieten

---

## Introduction

In the nineteenth and early twentieth century, their Majesties' subjects imagined 'an Empire upon which the sun never sets.' (Gorman 2006: (1) However, the idea of an 'imperial citizenship' vividly debated at that time, never took hold (Gorman 2006). 'Imperial citizenship' was meant as 'an extension of, rather than a replacement for, the identity of "British subjecthood (sic!)". The concept of subjecthood was the repository for the benefits accrued by all those who lived under the crown, including the right of protection and the right to move freely about the Empire.' (Gorman 2006, p. 206) As Gorman considers, 'imperial citizenship' was an attempt to resist dissolution and propagated by men such as Lionel Curtis or John Buchan combining their ideal of 'superior' whiteness and a mission to spread English civilisation.' (ibid)

Contemporary Britain is confronted with the legacy of this Empire, its racism and also with diverse postcolonial struggles challenging the supremacy of whiteness and hegemonic notions of English culture. Further, the existence of a Commonwealth indicates a scale of 'special' overseas relationships. It underlines, too, when talking about diasporic identities regarding British South Asians we also have to take on board a more complex fusion of South Asian, African and European passages and identity emergences. While referring to the Black (African) Diaspora, Gilroy (1993, p. xi) wants us to regard Diaspora as 'cherished for its ability to pose the relationship between ethnic sameness and differentiation: a changing same'. It is this flickering tension between the boundary of ethnic sameness and differentiation that

---

K., male, aged 40, living in Leicester; the chapter was accepted in 2011. By now, K. is older.

U.M. Vieten (✉)

University of Sheffield, ICOSS, 219 Portobello, Sheffield S1 4DP, UK

e-mail: u.vieten@sheffield.ac.uk

interrogates discourses of essentialism, single homeland visions and ideas of a static national belonging.

In this chapter, I am going to discuss how Diaspora, gendered locality and spatiality affect complex transnational belonging that has emerged with respect to the situation of South Asian British citizens in the twenty-first century. In Britain, long standing communitarian orientations are shifting more recently from multiculturalism to multi-faithism: 'religious identity' as a more central angle for group cohesion and societal inclusion has widely taken over the public debate, however, alongside the privatization and cutting off of publically funded welfare services. As Kim (2010, p. 128) observes in a reflection of the previous Labour Government; 'New Labour stressed the lack of deliberation among different cultural groups in the form of segregated residence rather than poverty and economic deprivation in the form of slum residence'.

The current British Prime Minister, David Cameron's, mantra of a 'big society' is going to deepen social frictions further as it aims at an even thinner role of the welfare state. But who else is going to provide? Does this imply a re-gendering of public services to female citizen's care duties? Beyond this British case, in what ways do new modalities of citizenship and group formations come into existence that have to be read on the background of increasing processes of Europeanization, a de-legitimization of social solidarity and cultural globalization?

Inspired by Deleuze's and Guattari's (1987) term 'deterritorialization' this chapter endeavors to capture the transformative space that comes into sight when individuals and ethnic communities are moving nations and moving places. Importantly, the moment of de-territorialization should be understood as followed by a process of re-territorialization (Deleuze and Guattari 1987). This moment could be regarded as a continuing educational process that *becomes* a different spatial site of social practices (Vieten 2006). Here, the focus is on a '*process of becoming*' (Kannabiran 2006); different national identities and realities are absorbed and could merge to an original state of mind and being, which does not match with binary either/or nationalities (Ghorashi and Vieten 2013).

While referring to the struggle of Dalit Women in India, Kannabiran (2006, p. 57) argues 'The politics of becoming is a self-conscious movement – a re-invention of the 'we', to echo Minow (1996) towards a goal of belonging better somewhere else, interrogating the foundations of culture and solidarity, transgressing every notion of territoriality and "integrity".' Accordingly, *politics of becoming* emphasizes resistance to any easy fits and collective closures, in particular when combined with an explicit political and feminist outlook. It embarks on a dynamic model accommodating individual agency as well as challenging social structure.

In order to study social processes that characterize these sites more systematically, Levitt and Glick-Schiller (2007) propose a 'Transnational Social Field Theory of Society' (2007, p. 160). The concept of '*social field* distinguishes between *ways of being*<sup>1</sup> and *ways of belonging*.<sup>2</sup>' According to Levitt and Glick-Schiller (2007, p. 163)

<sup>1</sup> Ways of being refers to the actual social relations and practices that individuals engage in rather than to the identities associated with their actions'. (2007, p. 163).

<sup>2</sup> Ways of belonging refers to practices that signal or enact an identity which demonstrates conscious connection to a particular group.' (2007, p. 164).

'Movement and attachment is not linear or sequential but capable of rotating back and forth and changing direction over time. The median point on this gauge is not full incorporation but rather simultaneity of connection.'

As this simultaneity challenges any hegemonic understanding of 'either/or' notions of belonging, in the following, I am going to adopt Sayyid's term 'BrAsians' for 'South Asian British Citizens'. Sayyid (2006, p. 7) proposes this term, because

...it refuses the easy decomposition of the British and Asian into its Western and Non-Western constituents. BrAsians is not merely a conflation of the British and the Asian; it is not a fusion but a confusion of the possibility of both terms... BrAsians demonstrates that transformations occur across the national majority/ethnic minority divide, and disrupts that balance of power in which the national majority holds all the cards, since the boundaries that constitute that national majority are themselves subject to the process of social and cultural transformations.

While taking on board this provocative terminology British postcolonial critique is acknowledged as a symbolic and semiotic intervention in hegemonic discourses of categorizing minorities; South Asian British citizens in Britain, respectively. Further, in this chapter the prominent function of gender is explored more closely as 'gender is critical to the establishment of community as it pertains both to ethnic collectivities and to public pedagogies related to citizenship.' (Tsolidis 2001, p. 5)

It is argued that *regional, local and global identifications* override national and mono-ethno cultural identities. Based on a sample of interviews with professional and academic *BrAsians* in London, in Leicester and in a number of Northern English cities gendered and generational patterns in terms of local diasporic identities are examined. Apart from multiple cultural belonging, foremost, territorial bonds and notions of group loyalty collapse at a point where temporary migration and settlement alternate in individual biographies. What will become apparent is that *ways of being* are most central to the local expression of ways of gendered belonging.

This chapter unfolds in three parts. First of all, the notion of (gendered) belonging, diasporic space and multiple, intersecting identities is explained and anchored theoretically. Secondly, the impact of specific clusters of national-ethnic settlement, the particularity and hegemony of London will be discussed, and contrasted with the socially different region and symbolically disregarded diasporic ethnoscape<sup>3</sup> in Northern England. This helps to contextualize the following third part, illustrating how my interview partners relate to the locality of their residence, to the British nation and also to further interwoven layers of group identities. While talking briefly about the composition of the study first, I am going to discuss then second, some sequences of the personal narratives. It will be demonstrated among others, how 'widening participation' to Higher Education in England on the one side, and gendered and classed spaces, on the other, affect social mobility and individual choices of BrAsians. This chapter will conclude with an outlook on the meaning of multiple sites of belonging in Europe.

---

<sup>3</sup>Tsagarousianou (2007, p. 112) modifies Appadurai's (1996) term 'ethnoscape' into 'diasporic ethnoscape'.

## **Diaspora, Gender and Belonging: 'The Homing of Diaspora,' 'The Diasporising of Home'**

The classic notion of Diaspora is based on the Jewish, Armenian and Greek experiences of dispersal.<sup>4</sup> Characteristically, a dispersed group keeps a memory of the past and a metaphoric imaginary of their original homeland (Safran 1991; critical to the idea of 'return' see Clifford 1997; also for a principal critique see Cohen 1997) across different generations. Similarly, Shuval (2007, p. 31) refers to a Diaspora discourse as reflecting 'a sense of being part of an ongoing transnational network that includes a homeland. It is characterized by a sense of living in one place while simultaneously remembering and/or desiring and yearning for another place.' Tsagarousianou (2007, p. 108) insists that 'the uncritical insistence on the primacy of the relationship with an original homeland can support the essentialization of origins and the reification of what is supposed to be found at the origin.' Nonetheless central to a diasporic identity are the 'affective-expressive components (Shuval 2007, p. 30) that bind members of a diasporic community together.

What matters foremost to the contemporary moment is the way *diasporic identities* are spreading across various migrating communities and taking roots as ongoing routes and routines in different places. If we regard this as a persisting effort it means that any generation of diasporic descent constructs multiple links to distinctive territories engendering new transnational and local social spaces. A case of this more complex web of transgressing diasporic identities is given when looking at the phenomenon of the South Asian Diaspora: according to Agnew (2005, p. 4) it 'is not characterized by its orientation to roots nor its desire for a permanent return to the homeland... it is defined by its ability to recreate a culture in diverse locations. Diasporas can thus denote a transnational sense of self and community and create an understanding of ethnicity and ethnic bonds that transcends the borders and boundaries of the nation state.' This transcendence, however, gets altered meanings at the time of increased processes of globalization: 'mediascapes, ideascapes and ethnoscapescapes (Appadurai 1996) collude as previously fixed national 'imagined communities' (Anderson 1983/1991) got into flux. Thus, the imaginary longing for a collective bond is assembled in new directions, and in more complex and even contradictory ways. As Koshy (2008, p. 11) puts it '(d)iasporic South Asians are at the vortex of some of the defining concerns of the new global order: high-tech guest workers, post-industrial coolies, resurgent religious fundamentalisms (sic!), transnational terrorist networks, transnational cyber communities, and queer internationalisms.'

Nonetheless, there is a danger that multiple hybridization, diasporic dynamics and global culture create a kind of 'banal Diaspora' while merging trans-nationalism<sup>5</sup> and Diaspora into one flawed and 'one for all' identity container. Besides, as Goodman

<sup>4</sup>(Brah 1996, p. 190).

<sup>5</sup>Levitt and Glick-Schiller (2007, p. 157) characterize transnational activity as 'Simultaneity, or living lives that incorporate daily activities, routines, and institutions located both in a destination country and transnationally is a possibility.'

argues (2006, p. 57) 'We need to pair the concept of a free-ranging and apparently unbounded hybridity and cultural creativity with its polar twin – the disciplining of ethnicities, their policing and narrowing, the substitution of the actively challenging by the opposition that succumbs. But this requires that diaspora is not unhistorically (sic!) posited but situated instead within a definite historical framework, understood dialectically as an interaction with the dominant – and that the outcome of this interaction is made the subject of empirical study and not imposed as given.'

Anthias (2006, p. 21) argues 'Belonging and social inclusion (rather than cohesion) are closely connected, although this does not mean that belonging itself brings about social inclusion (or cohesion). It is, however, through practices and experiences of social inclusion that a sense of a stake and acceptance in a society is created and maintained. As it will be illustrated later on, diasporic identities assemble along the lines of life course settlements and depend on the way citizenship is enacted in concrete places also underpinning gendered and generational ways of being.'

Whereas citizenship could be approached as the crucial and legal angle delivering political participation in a nation state the notion of belonging is trapped in emotional needs that go beyond pragmatic strategies or reasonable decisions to acculturate to a particular society. As noted elsewhere (Yuval-Davis et al. 2006, p. 1) 'Politics of belonging encompass and relate both citizenship and identity adding an emotional dimension which is central to a notion of belonging.' Crucially, 'Politics' comes in as we are leaving behind the state of individual emotional nature considering also the social spheres where belonging is shaped by ideological boundaries. Contemporary feminist social analysis takes Crenshaw's (1989) analytical model of 'intersectionality'<sup>6</sup> on board while interrogating complex structures of oppression cutting across boundaries and national borders (for example, Yuval-Davis 1997, 2004, 2006), and as far as Europe is concerned, addressing EU institutional anti-discrimination issues (Verloo 2006; Vieten 2009). Hence, notions of belonging encompass a feeling of being at home and individual capacities to act on personal choices. Lister et al. (2007, p. 4) argue that '(.) various forms of regimes – welfare, care, gender, citizenship and migration – dovetail together to constitute formal citizenship and to frame the lived experience of gendered (and racialised) citizenship in different ways.' Further, due to an increase of overlapping social and legal spaces in the European Union the patterns of individual and collective references concerning 'national' identities and belonging are changing, too. It is this rise in complexity that challenges the perception of diasporic identities and gendered belonging in the twenty-first century. Despite global transformations the situated context of the particular diasporic communities of BrAsians, their settlement in specific cities and regions within the UK have to be approached more concretely, in order to understand how individuals relate to their imagined Diaspora community while facing distinctive realities in their daily lives.

---

<sup>6</sup>Confronted with concepts unresponsive of a critical understanding of the unfair treatment of black women and, thus, inadequate to grasp different social complexities, black feminist and academic Crenshaw (1989, 1991) initiated a theoretical debate on the intersections of different layers of social identities and group belonging in the United States.

## **Class, Gender and 'Diaspora Space': South Asian Settlers in the City of London, in the Midlands and in the North of England**

The 1947 post-partition immigration to the UK features geopolitical patterns that are related to particular 'homeland' localities. According to Brah (1996, p. 208) 'Diaspora space is the intersectionality of diaspora, border, and dis/location as a point of confluence of economic, political, cultural, and psychic processes. It is here where multiple subject positions are juxtaposed, contested, proclaimed and disavowed.'

Groups of immigrants departed from few regions, and often settled within kinship clusters in particular UK counties or cities. Hence, ethnic-local connection, gendered dimensions and places of residences match: one of these departure regions is the Punjab and 'the geographical core of outmigration to the UK was the area of the Jullundur Doab.' (Brown 2006, p. 41) Jat Sikhs, who often had served in the British Imperial Army tended to migrate due to increased post-partition social upheaval and demographic changes. They migrated as groups to London and settled here in Gravesend and in Southall. Jat Sikhs again came mainly from Jullunder. 'Another distinctive region of out-migration was Mirpur in what was Pakistani-controlled Kashmir after 1947.' (2006, p. 42) People from Sylhet, what became Bangladesh in 1971, made up another substantial group leaving for work in the UK and another important group came from Gujarat. A high proportion, however, entered the UK via East Africa in the 1960s, and 1970s, when Africanisation forced South Asians out of Africa. (ibid)

Quite typical for the profile of groups, who emigrated from rural areas was a high percentage of female illiteracy and a lack of professional degrees for both sexes. Quite a small faction started working in factories, located in London and South England; however, a larger percentage of South Asians settled in the North of England while working in the textile and heavy industry. This means spatial clusters developed with, for example, kinship settlement in London as both important for Indians and Pakistani. But, 'the greatest number of Indians were to be found in Greater London, as were Bangladeshis, whereas Pakistanis were almost equally heavily concentrated in London, the West Midlands and West Yorkshire.' (Brown 2006, p. 45)

Certain British cities, for example Leicester, took extreme measures warning South Asians immigrants of the 'Ugandan Argus' not to settle in Leicester. Similarly, Ealing (London) and Birmingham undertook anti-immigration and hostile policies. (Brown 2006) Interestingly, in the twenty-first century, the city of Leicester was labeled a 'tolerant multicultural city and with a rather harmonious multi-ethnic posture in contrast to the "riot" Northern cities of Oldham, Burnley and Bradford in 2001 (Herbert 2008, p. 2) Hence, the Midlands city of Leicester 'crowned' itself as the city 'which had overcome racial disharmony to become a role model for multicultural cohesion' (Herbert 2008, p. vii) Herbert (2008) deconstructs this rose-tinted picture that hides a more complex and contradictory story (2008, 169 pp). However, she argues further that 'Leicester's population is one of the most ethnically diverse in the European Union and this has prompted conclusions that perceptions of ethnic

difference were less pronounced as there was no simple dichotomy between a white and non-white population.' (2008, pp. 19–20)

As a further important finding; her study disclosed a principal gendered pattern in the context of migration. Whereas first generation immigrant men expressed a higher degree of 'a desire for eventual return to the "homeland"' (2008, p. 172), immigrant women rather preferred the 'prospect of permanent residence in the new country of settlement.' (ibid) While referring to Grasmuck and Pessar (1991), similarly, Levitt and Glick Schiller (2004, p. 613) contend, 'Men who may have higher status than women at home are generally more interested in maintaining political homeland connections and identities.' Intersecting with sex/gender status it is the class status in the country of heritage that matters, too (ibid). This reveals the impact of shifting orientations towards female independence (not only working at home, but earning money independently), and therefore causing irritations to traditional gender roles and authority. Also, recent studies into national surveys (Modood 2007/2008) on ethnicity, religion, race and national identity in Britain have underscored what Modood calls an '*associational identity*' (Modood 2007/2008, p. 128). Beyond the identification with specific ethno-cultural minority practices, this identity also contains 'pride in one's origins, identification with certain group labels, and sometimes a political assertiveness.' (ibid)

Characteristic to the British postcolonial context is a longstanding struggle of black citizens against discrimination and racism. This, however, contrasts the situation in Continental Europe, where critical debates on white normativity and institutionalized racism rather are marginalized. In Continental Europe, at large, the terminology of 'race' is refused though increasingly, Islam as 'cultural identification' is racialised and targeted as an ideologically threatening and hence, 'unwanted' group reference (Vietsen 2011).

Blackness as a political umbrella was positively embraced by BrAsians since the 1970s; but more recently, critical debates challenging structural discrimination turned a more explicit eye on religion as an important group organizing principle in Britain. It is here, where, for example, a Muslim Diaspora or Sikh Diaspora comes into sight. While referring to the 'Fourth National Survey of Ethnic Minorities in Britain',<sup>7</sup> Modood (2007/2008, p. 127) argues that 'religion was prominent in the self descriptions of South Asians.' This also implicates that socio-cultural matters, such as marriage and parenthood, which are particularly affecting the role of women as gendered social spaces, rather remain bounded to religious community boundaries (ibid). Besides, when comparing groups of African Asian and Indian descent on the one hand, and Pakistani and Bangladeshi descendent groups on the other, the latter appeared 'more "conservative"' (Modood 2007/2008, p. 129). Also, a lower class position, both with respect to the country of origin and in the country of settlement, e.g. Britain, meant a higher percentage held blue-collar jobs<sup>8</sup> and this social class also was intersecting with more active religious attitudes (Modood 2007/2008).

---

<sup>7</sup><http://www.esds.ac.uk/findingData/snDescription.asp?sn=3685>.

<sup>8</sup>Mishra and Mohapatra (2001) draw similar conclusions concerning a more urban and white-collar profession for those with an 'Indian profile' (2001, p. 1); rather blue-collar for Pakistani and Bangladeshi social profiles (ibid).

Yet in the late 1990, research by Brah (1993) and Bhopal (1998) highlighted a high level of diversity when speaking about BrAsian women, making it clear that due to better qualifications and higher degrees of education their proportion in the female workforce was increasing steadily. What matters to the study of gendered diasporic belonging and ethno-local settlements is the observation that the next generation, in particular as daughters, turn out as very successful in Higher Education. Despite often ‘departing’ from a lower class family background individual career aspirations are getting stronger for all BrAsian women (Bagguley and Hussain 2007). In the long run this hints at a female upward mobility into the middle classes. This is happening on their own terms, and does not go hand in hand easily with traditional female life course perspectives concerning marriage, motherhood and broader kinship duties. Otherwise, female upward social mobility is connected with the (right) choice of husbands and partners. Nonetheless, as Bagguley’s and Hussain’s (2007) research makes clear, there is a divide between the situation of Indian women, on the one hand, and Pakistani and Bangladeshi women, on the other. The latter, still ‘remain among the lowest paid in the workforce.’ (Bagguley and Hussain 2007, p. 44)

In the final report of the Equalities Review commissioned by the UK Government and published in 2007, we learn that ‘the situation of Pakistani and Bangladeshi women merits particular focus and attention because ... the employment penalty associated with this group of women, has remained relatively constant over the 30-year period, in contrast to white women.’ (2007, p. 78) As Bagguley and Hussain (2007) suggest, ‘widening participation’ strategies at universities could be very helpful and should be institutionalized and funded, permanently.<sup>9</sup> ‘Widening Participation’ programs at British universities aim to address structural inequalities in society, e.g. more disadvantaged young people from lower class background are encouraged to choose a professional career. H., one of my interview partners in England,<sup>10</sup> is working as a ‘Widening Participation Officer’ at a University.

H. only works on temporarily fixed contracts as the University doesn’t have a long term funded *Widening Participation Office*. Nonetheless, she enthusiastically is talking about her work with young people from disadvantaged social backgrounds.

I work on a ‘Pathways to Law’ project. -And the ‘Pathways to Law’ is essentially that, so it’s offering people pathways to law. It targets young people from disadvantaged and disaffected backgrounds. And as a project, it is funded by the College of Law because the College of Law has invested interests in ensuring that law firms’ solicitors represent the wider society that they are supposed to represent and reflect. And it is also funded by the Social Trust, which is an educational charity which has done quite a lot of research in legal profession in England, Scotland and Wales and came to the conclusion that particularly higher up, there are still predominantly white, male, upper class. So they obviously saw a need to make the legal profession more reflective. So currently, I work with young people

<sup>9</sup> Bagguley and Hussain (2007, p. 45) criticize the lack of stable resources here. One of my interview partners works in this field of ‘widening participation’ and conformed staggering success despite unreliable funding for her job.

<sup>10</sup> I will come back to some issues related to the scope and scale of the study later on.



from schools in Leeds, Bradford and Wakefield. Now, Wakefield is predominantly white, working class or demographic just because Wakefield generally is. Bradford is predominantly Asian, Muslim, working class demographic and Leeds is a mixture of African Caribbean and white working class, Asian working class. So Leeds has more of a kind of dynamic demographic but the mixture of the three is actually very interesting. So we do things, for example when they are in year 12, we do things just like introduction to law, introduction to jargonism, introduction to university life generally, introduction to students; we have an e-mentoring scheme in which, each of them has an e mentor that they communicate with virtually on the internet and they have access to that e mentor 24 hours, seven days a week if they wish. And we do placements in law firms, at some of the big law firms, the CPS, the Magistrates Courts, so they get quite a lot of varied experience in the legal profession as well. But for me, it is not only about breaking down misconceptions in terms of the young people that I work with, so if they think that going to university is going to be impossible for them, it is trying to break down those misconceptions, trying to raise their awareness and raise their aspirations but for me it is also about breaking down misconceptions for example, in the legal profession or in the magistrates or in the CPS or even our lecturers or even some of our undergraduates students; they are not all young people from working class backgrounds.

H. gives some concrete examples of how to implement 'widening participation' strategies and also offers information about the young people she is working with. All young people share a working class upbringing though they are diverse in terms of ethnicity and race. With respect to the demographic make-up of the different cities (Leeds, Wakefield, Bradford) H. identifies characteristic groups also making a plea in what ways successful widening participation enhances social mixture at universities. In H.'s view her aim is twofold; strengthening the self esteem of young people from socially disadvantaged backgrounds, and second, challenging middle classed prejudices in academia and, particularly, in the sphere of legal studies and law towards the aspirations and career performances of those young people. Very clearly, in her perception 'class' overrides the impact of gender, ethnicity and race. About her educational and professional experiences she relates:

I always wanted to be a lawyer, so I worked really hard in spite of nobody in my family... I mean I am the youngest of my sisters and I was the first one ever to go to University. You know, nobody in my family had ever been to university. At that time, most of the girls of my age in Loughborough had never been to university. So it was a big... So I had worked really hard to get to the legal profession. So it was a big decision and in that same year my father died as well. So that impacted on my decision but I just... I mean I remember sitting in a police interview; one of our clients was accused of murdering his wife and I just remember sitting in a police station and he was being interviewed and I was in there. One of the partners of the firm that I worked for was in there, an English white man, and there were two police officers, one happened to be an Asian male and one official interpreter. And I quickly came to realize that official interpreters are very good at interpreting the English into their language but sometimes are terrible to do this reverse; their own language back into English is very difficult and because the Asian policeman was in there and he understood Punjabi as well, but there were so many occasions, if I hadn't been there, he would have let lots of things go because it would have benefitted the police. With things like that, I just thought how...you know, that is such an abuse of power and abuse of your own ability to speak different languages. Rather than use that ability positively, you are using it so negatively. So lots of things like that as well impacted on...I didn't want... I knew that if I stayed in the legal profession I would fundamentally have to change as a person and I wasn't willing to fundamentally change as a person.

We can learn from H.'s biographical information that her effort to support young people of socially disadvantaged heritage is connected to her own struggle to establish a career as a lawyer, which further was shaped by racial and classed prejudices. In her professional career as a lawyer she experienced institutional racism, sexism, lack of power and ethnic prejudices, first hand. Whereas in her professional work the main focus is on class based disadvantages and prejudices, her biographical experiences refer to intersecting dimensions of being female, non-white, Indian-British and of working class upbringing.

H.'s testimony illustrates how structural dimensions (gender, race, ethnicity, class) impeded, but didn't stop her individual agency. In a broader picture access to Higher Education is essential to increase individual life chances and choices, in particular of women. According to Arnot (1997, p. 289) it needs 'identity, particularly in the sense of belonging, and agency in the sense of empowerment' to achieve 'maximal versions of citizenship, which are inclusive and egalitarian', even if it is difficult to define or to create them (ibid).

This context of education, gendered belonging and diasporic identities matter explicitly when taking into account the public debates that emerged after the Northern Riots in 2001.

The Northern 'violent urban protest' of 2001 (Farrar 2005, p. 103) took place in smaller cities such as Bradford and Oldham (Glodwick), but also in a neighborhood area of Leeds, Harehills. All these neighborhoods are characterized by a high percentage of citizens with Pakistani and Bangladeshi roots. Thus, it is important to keep a closer eye to the official interpretation of 'riots' and the meaning of the national social fabric in twenty-first century Britain. Hence, the notion of 'segregated life' and what to expect from 'community cohesion' in different localities is of core importance to advance our understanding of what gendered belonging, diasporic identity and finding fulfilling social life chances means.

Different official reports on community cohesion (Cantle Report 2001; Ritchie Report 2001; Ouseley Report 2001) set up in the aftermath of the Northern Riots address the causes of those local 'disturbances'. First of all, the observation that the local population in the Northern cities live a much ethnically demarcated and divided life was one of the major concerns expressed in the official reports, for example in the *Cantle Report*. This message was channeled, too, through media in the aftermath of the 'riots' in 2001.<sup>11</sup> According to the Cantle Report (2001, p. 4) the situation in Oldham was described as of 'communities leading parallel lives delineated by high levels of segregation in housing and schools, reinforced by differences in language, culture and religion.' In addition, this report (2001, pp. 6, 8) stresses the role women have to play in working towards a more cohesive community, the need to engage with youth and also the investment in leadership. That means that *education and gender* is placed very high on the national and regional cohesion agenda, notwithstanding mentioning the persistence of broader frames of social disadvantages and poverty, which affect among others minority communities (2001, p. 7).

<sup>11</sup> <http://news.bbc.co.uk/1/hi/uk/5032166.stm>; <http://news.bbc.co.uk/1/hi/england/1702799.stm>; <http://www.guardian.co.uk/uk/2001/jun/10/race.thefarright>.

Very explicitly, the report argues about race equality, 'In our opinion, community cohesion and equality are two sides of the same coin. One is unachievable without the other.' (2001, p. 17) Due to a demographic change in the make-up of Oldham citizens it is predicted that 'Oldham will experience dramatic changes in the composition of its population over the next two decades, with its white population declining and its BME population increasing.' (2001, p. 10)

In April 2010, I met K. for an interview. He is affiliated with PEACE Oldham and works as a Guidance Counselor and Diversity Manager. He confirms the drastic change in the local population, however pointing at a shift in the percentage of Bangladeshi youth. Further, K. draws his knowledge from his own biographical background as born and brought up in Oldham.

We are an ethnic minority. The problem is that census goes back to the last census which was quite a long time ago. The new one is about to be released. At the moment I would say, in terms of population, we are nearing close to 20%. Late Teens. In terms of youth population it is well over 25% when you are looking at schools. That is the actual figure for infant babies born.

I'm forty-two. I went to school locally. When I went to an infant school, to put it in context, maybe about 4 or 5% of that infant school were either Pakistani or Bangladeshi. That same school is 100% Bangladeshi now. I know that because I am a governor of that school and I have been the governor of that school for 18 years. I have seen it move from majority white to 100% Bangladeshi.

Not unlike H.'s 'Widening participation' job, K. also is engaged with structurally disadvantaged young people aiming to support their individual educational success and social upward mobility; though at an earlier age. Whereas, H. is Sikh, female and does have her family roots in India, K. is Muslim, male and having family roots in Pakistan. Interestingly though, K. makes reference more directly to what Levitt and Glick Schiller (2004, 2007) call 'ways of belonging': he emphasizes his 'ethnic' belonging to the local Pakistani and Bangladeshi minority community. Both born and brought up in North England contribute to a more inclusive notion of contemporary Britain.

Ali (1992, p. 113) emphasizes; 'So the obvious connections have never been made between the characteristics of the white Northern working class and South Asian working class communities who live in such close geographical proximity. The social conservatism of both groups and some of the social roots of their intermittent disaffection are in many ways a regional British factor.' In that respect the traditional kinship settlement of poorer Bangladeshi and Pakistani communities in the North prolongs a social rift with 'the South', e.g. London that sustains the yet existing class divisions.

The remaining part of this chapter will illustrate in what ways the interviewed BrAsians grasp their multidimensional 'de-territorialized' gendered belonging and diasporic identities with reference to the regional disparity outlined above and described further in the following section. Metaphorical images come to the fore, which are used to display different local bonds. Also, a political genealogy can be discovered connecting different generations of female resistance. As we will see the tension between London as *the* centre of national identity and a more regionally

coloured emotional attachment shines through the individual narratives. Bringing forward their testimonies is a necessary step forward in acknowledging an individual right to narrate one owns narrative into the national community while advocating multiple belonging as part of BrAsian identity. This approach is going to change the focus on 'migrants' with primarily diasporic identities to a perception of fellow citizens, whose identities evolve under more complex biographical circumstances.

---

### **Being a Londoner' or 'from Yorkshire': 'Heathrow' or What Does It Mean to Live Here and There?**

In Northern England with small sized cities, for example Bradford<sup>12</sup> or Oldham,<sup>13</sup> local neighbourhoods in inner cities are clustered in nodes of white working class areas on the one hand, and predominantly, Pakistani and Bangladeshi minority communities, on the other. More affluent suburban parts of cities become middle class specific localities where aspiring professionals move to. Though in London ethnic and national communities are as well spatially organized, the size and density of the 7, 5 million City<sup>14</sup> as the major metropolitan centre of England allows spatial proximity, cross over and transgression of individuals and multiple encounters with differences. The notion of the city of London conveys a specific vernacular cosmopolitanism (Nava 2005, 2006, 2007) that could be understood as an outcome of the long lasting history of global commercial trade on the one hand, and a specific metropolitan culture of openness and *indifferent* tolerance towards strangers, on the other (Vieten 2012). The London bid for the Olympic Games 2012, for example, made a strong claim of a diverse British multicultural nation; however, 1 day after the bid's success, in fact, on 7/7 2005, the terrorist killings in London turned this view upside down. The violent extremists came from Yorkshire, more precisely from Leeds and Bradford, reminding us shockingly of a strong social-cultural, economic and faith based rift between South and North England.

Historically, the cultural hegemony of Englishness was continually re-enforced through political institutions such as the crown, the parliament but also through common values and a particular notion of English 'tolerance'. The latter has lost its convenient appeal as it largely signifies elite rule and a very much classed social fabric. As Wemyss (2006, 2009) argues; tolerance is connected to power; tolerance is principally granted by those who structurally and culturally define the rules of belonging and appropriate behavior. Central to it is a 'hierarchy of belonging' (2009, 133 pp); the normalization of whiteness makes colonial crimes and also resistance to it, but also the long lasting contributions of black people to the nation,

---

<sup>12</sup>The population of Bradford is counted as around 293.000; including 26,1 % South Asian, predominantly with Pakistani heritage.

<sup>13</sup>Oldham is part of Greater Manchester with an estimate of 104.000 inhabitants; roughly 29, 4 % South Asian

<sup>14</sup>12, 01 % of Londoners are categorised as South Asian; though a larger percentage of Indian heritage.

largely invisible (Wemyss 2009). Further, Wemyss argues that different subcategories of more or less tolerable subjects are constructed over time; that means the objects of tolerance might be shifting, but the subjective power to grant tolerance does not (ibid). This inscribed hegemony of whiteness and a classed character of gendered relationships imprint on more recent debates.

These spatial contradictions in terms of London as the signifier of the multicultural nation, on the one hand, and the North as enshrining 'white' English provinciality, on the other, motivated me to approach key minority activists engaged with human, women and citizens rights in both English regions. The 15 interviews were conducted in England in Fall 2009 until Spring 2010 and are part of an international and comparative research project on 'Intersectional complexity and modes of "new" citizens' inclusion in Britain, the Netherlands and Germany'. The scope of the study is to test emerging cosmopolitan subjectivities and trans-national ideas of belonging against the different histories of colonialism, mono- and multiculturalism and increasing *domestication* policy in these three European countries.

All interviewed BrAsians,<sup>15</sup> beside one, lived in London at some stage of their life. Those, who grew up in the North (for example in Hull, Leeds or Loughborough) came to London either for university studies or to start a first job. Interestingly, those, who grew up in London and still live here, had moved temporarily to smaller cities either following a university degree (Liverpool; Portsmouth) or had migrated from India or Pakistan, where first degrees were obtained (Delhi; Islamabad). Therefore, a pattern of geographical/spatial movement is prevalent to all biographies not only regarding international migration, but also in terms of domestic migration across England. This contrasts somehow the findings of Stillwell and Hussain (2010, p. 1386), who argue that South Asians 'peak age of migration is lower' due to 'cultural norms of leaving home at a later age than other ethnic groups, accentuated by their choice to live at home whilst studying in higher education.' (ibid)

In terms of age, it turned out that a significant number (70 %) were in their thirties and forties; echoing also a generational link to the current political elite in Britain: both, David Cameron and his Deputy Prime Minister Nick Clegg are in their mid forties.

As the sample of interviews is spanning different religious heritage (Sikh, Hindu and Muslim) as well as agnostic, secular, liberal or orthodox views it means that the broader *secular* category of *BrAsian* citizens as a supra-national-lingual container was accepted by those, who responded positively to my interview requests. It hints at the historical dimension of the British Raj, pre-partition cultural roots and a larger postcolonial context. A minor group of all interviewees shared that they realised social upward mobility through individual ambition and Higher Education degrees despite growing up in working class environments. This upward social mobility is spanning different religious-cultural backgrounds and was anchored biographically either in strong personal will power; encouraging influence of loved ones (aunties; grandfathers) or previous middle class status in the country of origin. Significant,

---

<sup>15</sup>I interviewed eight women and seven men.

too; four out of 15 studied at the *School of Oriental and Asian Studies* (SOAS), University of London.

One of my London based interview partners is a feminist activist working with Southall Black Sisters (S.B.S.) and Women against Fundamentalism (W.A.F.). SBS was founded in 1979; it was set up in the immediate aftermath of the local protest against English fascists marching through Southall where a white teacher, Blair Peach, was killed by police and hundreds of BrAsian demonstrators were arrested. As a black feminist project it combines ambitions to intervene politically, but also provide services to Afro-Caribbean and South Asian women.

In various decades since the 1970s violent protests had erupted in inner cities in the South of England and in the North. The ‘Race Riots’ that shook London and Liverpool in 1981, and in 2001 in Bradford and Oldham have to be regarded as violent eruptions of group anger in socially deprived city areas. In addition, both the Brixton (London) and the Bradford riots have to be interpreted as classed, gendered and generational responses to the local presence of fascist groups<sup>16</sup> and institutionalized racist<sup>17</sup> and violent interference by the police. Whereas in the 70s and 80s it was predominantly black Youth, who protested collectively in some inner city parts of London, namely in Notting Hill in 1976 and in Brixton in 1981 also in the North of England; in a neighborhood of Leeds, which is Chapeltown, in 1975 as well as in Liverpool in 1985, the violent protest of BrAsians that erupted in 2001 shifted public attention more to the social fabric and community situation in the Northern cities. In terms of the meaning of ‘multiculturalism’ Bauman (1999, p. 197) refers to Alaine Touraine’s (1997) distinction of ‘multicultural’ and ‘multicomunitarian’ societies. He argues that it is the second term that labels hermetically closed communities where cross-cultural exchange and switching of allegiance is banned. The latter would indicate a rigid system of ‘communities of communities’ that, however, does not match the more complex social-cultural fabric of Britain. With respect to 9/11, but even before in the context of the ‘Honeyford’<sup>18</sup> and the Salmon Rushdie Affair<sup>19</sup> in the mid 1980s, Bradford became the signifier and ‘focus for a concentration of anxieties’ (Alam and Husband 2006, p. 3). Despite the more recent targeting of religious minority, e.g. Muslim communities ‘skin color’ racism remains salient, too: in the British context ‘minority ethnicity’ conveys non-whiteness and whiteness is identified with the dominant national collective (Vieten 2011).

While sketching the situation and struggles of the ‘second generation’ BrAsians, Brah (2006) emphasizes that in the view of the public, ‘reports focused almost entirely on young men’ (2006, p. 55). Nonetheless, women were actively involved. In the case of the ‘Southall Black Sisters’ it can be illustrated, particularly, how a

<sup>16</sup>In Bradford, National Front allies gathered in a pub provoking protest and resistance among Asian South youth.

<sup>17</sup><http://www.guardian.co.uk/uk/2003/apr/22/lawrence.ukcrime>.

<sup>18</sup>Honeyford was a Bradford primary school head teacher, who disrespected ethnic-religious diverse pupils at his school and was dismissed as response to public local protest.

<sup>19</sup>Some orthodox Muslim men burnt the book ‘Satanic verses’ in Bradford and this action was widely broadcasted adding to the negative of the Bradford Pakistani Muslim communities.

feminist Black and South Asian feminist consciousness developed 'interrogating the gender politics of the male-dominated youth movements and "Left groups", as much as the ethnocentrism and "race" politics of white feminist groups.' (2006, pp. 55–56) Women Against Fundamentalism (W.A.F.) was established as a further feminist project aiming to combat fundamentalisms as intertwined with various sorts of patriarchal rule and at different community frontiers. Since its foundation the project is fighting actively for secular spaces. P. joined Southall Black Sisters (SBS) in 1982; today she is a very prominent figure of SBS,<sup>20</sup> who describes the context of the 1979 protest in Southall as part of her individual political initiation as following:

I was going to that school we had the first major racial uprisings in South London in 1979, because the right, the fascist right wing precursor of BMP was known as the National Front. And they were being very provocative and decided they wanted to organize a meeting in Southall Town Hall. And the community said we're not having it. And said to the Home Secretary, you need to ban this. And the Home Secretary said, "We're not banning this." So the policing was very heavy. And the policing was very heavily against the *Indians* who tried to defend themselves. So the National – so they were seen to be incredibly biased in the way it was policed... Blair Peach by the – well, they never established, but they think that it was one of those crack specialist police units who are trained to deal with riot situations. And only now, you know, after years and years, and years, there's been some kind of inquiry as to what happened. So when the National Front decided to march in Southall, the policing was very heavy, but nevertheless you had a community that was quite defiant, particularly the younger generation, my generation... saying we're not putting up, yeah, not putting up with this. So in that – but also a lot of – it was then the beginnings of the anti-racist movement. So you had popular cultural, political movements like *Rock Against Racism* which involved white, black, Indian. And the teacher Blair Peach, he came from that kind was killed whilst on the march in Southall expressing solidarity. And 400 Asian youth were arrested. Not a single white youth. And what happened was that, in fact, in order to prevent the community from showing support like, you know, you turn up at court in large numbers to show your support, solidarity... they shipped all of the hearings outside into suburbs, white-dominated suburbs. So, that there is no support. So that was all part and parcel of that experience.

Only in 2010, Metropolitan Police took responsibility for the killing of Blair Peach.<sup>21</sup> P. recalls very precisely the events of that day, which impacted on her further political struggle. She shares how unfairly and racist she and the other young South Asians were treated. Whereas 400 BrAsians were arrested no single white person was taken into police custody. But it was not only the police, but the whole judicial system that failed them while trying to undermine black solidarity. It is the notion of race as non-whiteness that overrides the meaning of gender/sex and class in her narrative. P.'s engagement with the local BrAsian resistance at the end of the 1970s initiated a strong political feminist and secular agenda. Despite the force of *Thatcherism* until the mid of the 90s and the more recent backlash in official conservative policy towards secular project such as Southall Black Sisters her struggle goes on.

---

<sup>20</sup> Pragna Patel was just named as one of the 100 most inspirational women by the British newspaper, Guardian, 08.03.2011.

<sup>21</sup> <http://www.guardian.co.uk/uk/2010/apr/27/blair-peach-killed-police-met-report>.

H. is another London based female interviewee. Her political consciousness developed in a different direction, as far as religion is concerned. Humera is co-founder of An-Niza, a Muslim women group. She was a little baby when arriving in London, originating from Pakistan. But as she phrased it ‘my family came here in 1961 and I was 1 year at the time, so I tend to sometimes say I was born here, but just about born here.’ Very much engaged with the race politics of the 60s and 70s *Zeitgeist* H. refers, too, to the London locality as her site of political engagement and consciousness raising: ‘If you are growing up in Kilburn in London, which is very diverse and complex inner city, by definition you are interested in political stuff and about things happening around. So I was sort of involved in those kinds of things to do with racism primarily.’

Not unlike P., she witnessed social and political upheaval in the 1970s, which impacted on her further engagement with society. Though H. studied in Portsmouth, a rather white port city at the South West Coast, she returned to London afterwards and started to work within an Islamic framework. At several stages of the interview she stressed the significance of her Muslim identity and the relevance of the *internal diversity* of the Muslim community. Her strong wish to cherish a particular ‘we’ – Muslim community and their bonds contrasted somehow with her pragmatic attitude concentrating on local social activities. Despite her sense of Muslim belonging her reference point remained the London borough in which she lived. As she describes it; An-Niza looks at possibilities to improve neighbourhood daily life for the local community.

And in the work that we did with Muslim women we found if you asked them, what is the issue that concerns you most for yourself? And ironically what they would say is invariable, we would like our husbands to have a job, and somebody to talk to them, they’d understand this and our sons they are going, they don’t have role models and all this kind of stuff. So the first thing they want in order for them to get on with what they want is they need those things to be resolved and they need to have a better relationship with it. So, eventually that got us on to the whole issue of, particularly, Muslim fatherhood, because with have a big problem with absentee fathers, as many other communities, but either because the marriage is not working or because the men are working a lot.

H.’s focus on Muslim women’s needs as an improvement of their overall family situation links to an overall gendered and hetero-normative social relationship pattern that governs society at large as well as the needs of the particular local Muslim community. Largely, gendered relationships are enshrined in the communal task to manage class, cultural and generational conflicts. H.’s clear ‘we’ belonging to the Muslim community does not contradict her sense of being *a Londoner* primarily, or of being British. When asked whether she held contact or knew about similar projects in the North of England, more explicitly a local project in Leeds, called HAMARA, she denied it. On the one hand, this was due to limited resources of the project as she argued (lack of staff support; no office), on the other, it appeared as characteristic to the ‘southern’ locus of identification, hardly following projects and developments in the North.

In fact, all but two of my interview partners were struggling with contradictions surrounding the multicultural image and their own biographical, more positive experience of multi-color London at some point in their life, and an understanding



that beyond the City of London much more homogenous, racially dividing and socially excluding living conditions exist. In the context of the biographical trajectories of my interview partners, 'Higher Education' had become a key to their social and spatial mobility, also identified with a more cosmopolitan attitude towards group difference and individual differentiation. In what ways does this tension between strong metropolitan London identities of inclusion and experiences of marginalization and social exclusion in the 'white landscape' (Aygeman (1989) of the rural North unfold? As we will see next, intersecting dimensions of race, class and gender shape the local ways of being. To illustrate this point, I will quote S., who is a Professor and an UN expert living in London while working at the University of Leeds.

The balance is that in the North there is still a huge divide. That is one thing. That is mainly due to the level of education. In London, people are more educated and enlightened and exposed to the international environment. They are willing to embrace. But, in the North, especially in Leeds or some other city people haven't had that level of exposure. They aren't willing to give credit to the contribution people from other countries can make. That is number one. Number two is that in this country, until very recently, the percentage of students going to university was very low. Even to this day I think it is about 40 % or 45 %. The goal is 50 %. Education is not just getting the degree. It is exposing yourself to a huge variety of situations and becoming an outward looking citizen. Those who haven't had that education haven't had that benefit. In the North the majority of the population didn't benefit from that process. When a population goes to university you will see change in the north. In London, I would be quite happy to go to any pub and mingle with people. That may not be the case in Leeds because the people who come there may not have conversations with me. Or, the level of conversation would be very different. In the South where I live, I could go to any pub.

S. gives some ideas how he feels in different places and in his perception of the different spaces; class, gender and caste elements are blending into each other. Both, in terms of heritage and social status he is positioned in the upper section of society. Speaking from a highly educated and middle class background it is white prejudice and projection that matters in his daily life experience in the North; e.g. in Leeds. The proportion of higher educated middle class professionals and academics that belong to an ethnic and visible minority is relatively low in the Northern cities. This does not only hold for the institution 'university', but even more so for any leisure activities in Leeds. Being a Brahmin, which is the highest Hindu caste, S. takes particular pride in his achievements and 'banal' everyday racism and street disrespect means an insult to him. It is the *local space* that matters foremost as a personal site of social activity and day to day self expression. However, the daily life in the North unfolds in biographical patterns that are further gendered. Whereas going to a cricket game or visiting a pub rather might be part of an acclaimed male leisure experience a different dimension is emphasized by A. She works and lives permanently in Leeds, but also lived temporarily in London during her study years.

Asked about her connection to London; she replied:

I was there for four years and I had a great time. I was a student there and I had lots of friends and it was good. But yeah, and London then was a great city. I think it is now but, isn't a nicer sort of, you know, you have to make thousands and thousands, hundreds of

thousand pounds to live a really good life in London....So, yeah but Leeds, I do have a *very Yorkshire side* to me, too. You know, which I love, I love walking in the country here. Have you been to Bolton Abbey? It's just oh it's my favourite place in all the worlds it's.

A. arrived at the age of four in the UK; the father was a hospital Doctor from Galgadeh, India, who took up the job offer to work as a NHS doctor in Hull, in 1976. Hull is a port city at the east coast of Yorkshire; thus A. grew up in the North and despite her years of academic studies in London, she lived in the North most of her life.

Her emotional expression to have a 'Yorkshire side' makes reference to the landscape of the Dales, which surround cities, such as Leeds and Bradford. The image of this countryside contrasts the media aired dominant vision of urban deprivation and, usually portrayed as male, young BrAsians' violent anger. Conventionally, hiking and walking the countryside allure to 'white' leisure activities, often intersecting with middle class and beyond 20 age groups. Hence, as A. claims to love walking in the English countryside she claims her English and rural belonging, or in that regard, claims the *regional belonging* as part of her identity, but further her middle class position as well her way of being a mature woman.

As underlined above, the various spatial and regional dimensions shape notions of gendered belonging in specific localities. Hence, a taken for granted single national belonging, territorial bonds and notions of self and group loyalty collapse at a point where individuals relocate and mix their inherited angles of national, classed and cultural identity. This mingling influences their perspectives on regional and 'new' national identities.

Finally, the time of entry to the country and the impact of gendered and generational linkages will be discussed.

The meaning of the London airport 'Heathrow' unfolds with significantly distinctive connotations. Heathrow is one of five airports in London, which, however, is the most internationally renowned as intercontinental flights to Asia, Australia or America departure from here. Besides, the city of London as hub world business centre is associated with this airport, too.

P., who was yet introduced above, was born in Kenya. She grew up in Kilburn, in West London and very close to Heathrow airport, not unlike H, the Muslim-identified woman. As P. states;

Cause multiculturalism as a concept particularly took hold in schools in the 80s.... I am talking about just before that... mid 70s to late70s. And the teachers, the head, had very low expectations of the Asian students. Very low expectations. So a lot – in fact, a lot of the Asian students were seen as – it had become a feeder school for Heathrow Airport. So a lot of the Asian students were naturally expected to progress to some kind of working class at the airport. And even – although I was doing extremely well in my studies, I remember the head saying, you know, (you) make a good ground stewardess at the *Heathrow* Airport.

P.'s father worked as a baggage handler at Heathrow and her mum in a factory. P. developed from early age on an understanding that only education might get her out of a circle of low expectations, racism and gender discrimination as she told me. Heathrow in her memory is the signifier of her father's difficult and exploitive work life and also the symbolic reference point to stop BrAsians, females in particular, to excel.

Another angle to illustrate the range of contradictory, multiplied and generational meanings of *Heathrow* for BrAsians comes in through An.'s piece of research. She moved to London in the 1990s and co-conducted an exhibition<sup>22</sup> on the struggle and labour strikes of BrAsian Women. The first of these strikes took place in 1976 (the 'Grunswick' strike) and the second, and more recent one, at Heathrow airport in 2005, protesting against *Gate Gourmet*. An. reflects on her encounters with Grunswick activists,

I managed to speak to five of them (Grunswick strikers), and it was amazing to talk to – especially to women who hadn't spoken about it since. And one of them, for instance, had a grandson and she'd never told him about this part of her past. And when I was coming to interview her she said 'Oh, my grandchildren are so excited it's the day of interview'. And she said they were like 'What, you did this, grandma?'. They can't believe it of you."

The thing is, see, it failed in the end, and so for women who moved onto other jobs, they may not ... If they didn't have the education and they weren't reading historical accounts about Grunswick, they wouldn't know that it's become such an iconic moment. At that point it was very big, but then it fizzled out, so they wouldn't know that then 20 years on it's remembered as a turning point. And so in some senses, yes ... And later on, her son did a school project on it and so it was almost ... felt very good to see that she could reclaim that history because of that.

Though the strike failed at the end of the day, what makes these two examples of women led BrAsian strikes particularly interesting is its historical impact; it creates material evidence of connectivity and settlement, also for different female generations: mobilisation, organisation and resistance give voice to their claim to have a stake in this country. In what ways is gendered and generational belonging intertwined with locality and shapes diasporic identities of BrAsians, accordingly?

I will finish this chapter while returning to the phrase, mentioned in the title; 'If I land in Heathrow I feel home, if I land in Islamabad I feel home'. In a more extended section, K. describes his feeling of belonging to Britain and Pakistan.

If I use one phrase; that phrase would be 'when I landed at Islamabad, if I go by air and I land at Islamabad airport, when I land in Islamabad I feel home, and when I land in Heathrow I feel home'. That is itself the biggest thing that I feel that being part of this country; inclusion means that I feel included because I feel included when I'm in Pakistan. I mean my place of birth and my place of my first nationality. I am included there. I am included in the political processes. I'm included in education, I'm included in social life, and I think Britain has achieved much more and I feel included here as well. I think unless Europe understands this, that people need to feel home, while they're in Germany or in Holland or other places, then they would make that country their home. So to me inclusion is very much being part of everything. And I feel home both places.

In K.'s view Heathrow symbolizes 'home' and his gateway to London and the UK. Hence, London's most international airport unfolds here with its dominant meaning; mostly relevant to those, who travel between different Continents of the world. While he is referring to both angles he expresses a transnational identification, challenging any connotation of an either/or belonging. What is striking though

---

<sup>22</sup><http://www.londonmet.ac.uk/thewomenslibrary/whats-on/exhibitions/strikingwomen.cfm> <http://www.leeds.ac.uk/strikingwomen/>; also see Anitha et al. (2012).

is that K. refers to *Islamabad*, but not to the actual name of its airport. Since 2008, the International Airport of Islamabad is named after Benazir Bhutto, who was the first female Prime Minister of Pakistan and assassinated in 2007. We might consider that K. lives predominantly in the UK and to be more precise since 1997, and for that reason he might be not that closely in touch what is going on in Pakistan. Further he might not identify that closely with the London history of South Asian struggle and settlement as he lives in Leicester. Hence, as he migrated to the country in the 1990s, unlike P., who was born and brought up in Britain, his memory and connection to other settled BrAsians might be limited. Nonetheless, the significance of the murder of Bhutto, and K.'s own confession of feeling like he belonged to Pakistan as well as to Britain also might hint at a principal and wider dilemma that spans all societies: the perception of female achievements and female resistance as intrinsic to the gains of public space and political community is relatively low and rather confined as a private matter.

---

## Conclusion

Brah's (1996) focus on 'diaspora space' pinpoints the modality of travel and movement; it is a mode of transcending contradictory and multiplied cultures, indeed. While moving through various spaces and inheriting diverse national-cultural claims a *process of becoming* is visible in all different narratives. Migration and sedentary experiences mingle biographically. It is this active search for inclusion or for participation in society that makes all the difference. It matters whether there is 'something at stake' (An.) in society; something BrAsians feel worth while to engage with or to strive for.

As it is illustrated above gendered belonging and diasporic identities of BrAsians emerge in diverse and local spaces as *ways of being* rather than the ways of belonging. Having said that, access to Higher Education, at least with respect to the interviewed activists, was a prerequisite to excel individually and to be able to leave behind some of the racialised, classed and gendered constraints. Whereas feminist activists such as P. continue to defend secular spaces, H., who anchors her female identity in Islam, chose a different direction. She serves her local community when focusing on 'harmony' between the sexes. However, these individual choices are embedded in broader national domestic as well as European outlooks.

By now, domestic British policy supports societal cohesion while prioritizing religiously bounded and rather homogenous community work. In the long run that might lead to a situation where the spatial icon of multicultural Britishness, the cosmopolitan and 'progressive' city of London, might be transformed to a conservative, religiously and ethno-culturally segregated place. However, the underpinning sound in all interviews was that BrAsians love London, and are proud of being part of a Britain that embraces its multicultural difference. They do so though living their diasporic lives in very different regions of the country.

As argued elsewhere (2006, p. 263) 'we can regard the contemporary political system of European nation-states as being figuratively in crisis, bringing in to the

fore an ideological struggle among within and across states over the definition of symbolic space of belonging in Europe.' David Cameron's claim of the 'failure of multiculturalism' in Britain hints at a European map of 'New Integrationism' (Triadafilopoulos 2011, p. 864) putting further pressure on visible minorities and diasporic communities to assimilate and express civic loyalty. This is a trend across Europe conveying new racialising boundary discourses. As Triadafilopoulos (2011, p. 866) makes clear 'The intensification of this civilisational self-identification has also been driven by the eastward expansion of the EU.' Further, anti-Islam rhetoric is combined with anti-Turkey rhetoric as most EU member states are reluctant to accept this Muslim nation state as a future member state. Largely Islam is viewed as a 'threat to European Identity' (ibid). On the background of these processes the possibility of feeling at home in different places; respectively in London as located in Europe and in Islamabad as located beyond Europe is particularly significant.

It is K.'s description of 'home' as linked to Britain and to Pakistan that should be recalled for a final second, 'I think unless Europe understands this, that people need to feel home, while they're in Germany or in Holland or other places, then they would make that country their home. So to me inclusion is very much being part of everything. And I feel home both places.'

**Acknowledgements** I would like to thank the editor and the helpful comments of the anonymous referee. The research was funded by the VSB, a Dutch grant, and carried out as a research project of the interdisciplinary research group 'Inclusive Thinking' in 2009–2011. I would like to thank particularly Halleh Ghorashi (VU Amsterdam) and James Kennedy (University of Amsterdam) for their generous support.

---

## References

- Agnew, V. (2005). Introduction. In V. Agnew & V. Agnew (Eds.), *Diaspora, memory and identity – a search for home* (pp. 3–17). Toronto: University of Toronto Press.
- Alam, M. Y., & Husband, C. (2006). *British pakistani men from Bradford: Linking narratives to policy*. New York: Joseph Rowntree Foundation.
- Ali, Y. (1992). Muslim women and the politics of ethnicity and culture in Northern England. In G. Sahgal & N. Yuval-Davis (Eds.), *Refusing holy orders – women and fundamentalism in Britain* (pp. 106–130). London: WLUML.
- Anderson, B. (1983/1991). *Imagined communities: Reflections on the origin and spread of nationalism*. London: Verso.
- Anitha, S., Pearson, R., & McDowell, L. (2012). Striking Lives: multiple narratives of South Asian women's employment, identity and protest in the UK. *Ethnicities*, 12(6), 654–775.
- Anthias, F. (2006). Belongings in a globalising and unequal world: Rethinking translocations. In N. Yuval-Davis, K. Kannabiran, & U. M. Vieten (Eds.), *The situated politics of belonging* (pp. 17–31). London: Sage.
- Appadurai, A. (1996). *Modernity at large: Cultural dimensions of globalization*. Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press.
- Arnot, M. (1997). "Gendered Citizenry": New feminist perspectives on education and citizenship. *British Educational Research Journal*, 23(3), 275–295.
- Aygeyan, J. (1989). Black people, white landscape. *Town and Country Planning*, 58(12), 336–338.
- Bagguley, P., & Hussain, Y. (2007). *The role of higher education in providing opportunities for South Asian women, study on behalf of the Joseph Rowntree foundation*. Bristol: Policy Press.

- Bauman, Z. (1999). *In search of politics*. Oxford: Blackwell.
- Bhopal, K. (1998). How gender and ethnicity intersect: The significance of education, employment and marital status. *Sociological Research Online*, 3(3), 1–14. Available at: [www.socresonline.org.uk](http://www.socresonline.org.uk) [accessed: 05.06.2011].
- Brah, A. (1993). Race and culture in the gendering of labour markets: South Asian young Muslim women and the labour market. *New Community*, 19(3), 441–458.
- Brah, A. (1996). *Cartographies of diaspora – contesting identities*. London/New York: Routledge.
- Brah, A. (2006). The “Asian” in Britain. In N. Ali, V. S. Kalra, & S. Sayyid (Eds.), *A postcolonial people – South Asians in Britain* (pp. 36–61). London: Hurst & Co.
- Brown, J. M. (2006). *Global South Asians – introducing the modern diaspora*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Cantle Report. (2001). *Community cohesion: A report of the independent review team, chaired by Ted Cantle*. London: The Home Office.
- Clifford, J. (1997). *Routes: Travel and translation in the late twentieth century*. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press.
- Cohen, R. (1997). *Global diasporas: An introduction*. London: UCL Press.
- Crenshaw, K. (1989). Demarginalizing the intersection of race and sex: A black feminist critique of antidiscrimination doctrine, feminist theory and antiracist politics. *University of Chicago Legal Forum*, 1989, 139–167.
- Deleuze, G., & Guattari, F. (1987). *A thousand plateaus: Capitalism and schizophrenia* (trans: Massumi, B.). Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press.
- Farrar, M. (2005). Leeds foot soldiers and London bombs. ([http://www.opendemocracy.net/conflict-terrorism/leeds\\_2696.jsp](http://www.opendemocracy.net/conflict-terrorism/leeds_2696.jsp))
- Ghorashi, H., & Vieten, U. M. (2013). Female narratives of ‘new’ citizen’s belonging(s) and identities in Europe: Case studies from the Netherlands and Britain. *Identities: Global Studies in Culture and Power*, 1(1), 1–17.
- Gilroy, P. (1993). *The Black Atlantic: Modernity and double consciousness*. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press.
- Goodman, M. (2006). Diaspora, ethnicity and problems of identity. In H. Moghissi (Ed.), *Muslim Diaspora – gender, culture and identity* (pp. 54–67). London/New York: Routledge.
- Gorman, D. (2006). *Imperial citizenship – empire and the question of belonging*. Manchester/New York: Manchester University Press.
- Grasmuck, S., & Pessar, P. (1991). *Between two Islands: Dominican international migration*. Berkeley: University of California.
- Herbert, J. (2008). *Negotiating boundaries in the city – migration, ethnicity, and gender in Britain*. Farnham: Ashgate.
- Kannabiran, K. (2006). A cartography of resistance: The national federation of dalit women. In N. Yuval-Davis, K. Kannabiran, & U. M. Vieten (Eds.), *The situated politics of belonging* (pp. 54–71). London: Sage.
- Kim, N.-K. (2010). Deliberate multiculturalism in new labour’s Britain. *Citizenship Studies*, 15(1), 125–144.
- Koshy, S. (2008). Introduction. In S. Koshy & R. Radhakrishnan (Eds.), *Transnational South Asians – the making of a neo-diaspora* (pp. 1–41). Oxford/New York: Oxford University Press.
- Lister, R., Williams, F., et al. (2007). *Gendering citizenship in Western Europe: New challenges for citizenship*. Cambridge: Polity Press.
- Levitt, P., & Glick Schiller, N. (2004). Conceptualizing simultaneity: A transnational social field perspective on society. *International Migration Review*, 38(145), 595–629.
- Levitt, P., & Glick Schiller, N. (2007). Conceptualizing simultaneity: A transnational social field perspective on society. In A. K. Sahoo & B. Maharaj (Eds.), *Sociology of Diaspora – a reader* (Vol. 1, pp. 156–193). Jaipur: Rawat Publications.
- Minow, M. (1996) Comments on ‘suffering, justice and the politics of becoming’. In *William E. Connolly, presented as the Roger Allan Moore Lecture*, 11 May 1995. *Culture, Medicine and Psychiatry* 20, 279–286.
- Mishra, P., & Mohapatra, U. (2001). *South Asian Diaspora in U.K.: A bibliographical study*. Delhi: Kalinga Publications.

- Modood, T. (2007/2008). South Asian assertiveness in Britain. In S. Koshy & R. Radhakrishnan (Eds.), *Transnational South Asians – the making of a neo-diaspora* (pp. 124–145). Oxford/New York: Oxford University Press.
- Nava, M. (2005). Visceral cosmopolitanism: The specificity of race and miscegenation in UK'. In A. Kumar and M. Ryan (Eds.), *Politics and culture* (<http://www.aspen.conncoll.edu/politicssandculture/page.cfm?key=255>)
- Nava, M. (2006). Domestic cosmopolitanism and structures of feeling: The specificity of London. In N. Yuval-Davis, K. Kannabiran, & U. M. Vieten (Eds.), *The situated politics of belonging* (pp. 42–53). London: Sage.
- Nava, M. (2007). *Visceral cosmopolitanism – gender, culture and the normalisation of difference*. London: Berg Publishers.
- Ouseley Report. (2001). *Community pride not prejudice – making diversity work in Bradford, chaired by Herman Ouseley*. Bradford: Bradford Vision.
- Ritchie Report. (2001). *One Oldham, one future*. Oldham: Independent review.
- Safra, E. (1991). Diasporas in modern societies: Myths of homeland and return. *Diaspora*, 1(1), 83–99.
- Sayyid, S. (2006). Introduction: Br Asians – postcolonial people, Ironic citizens. In N. Ali, V. S. Kalra, & S. Sayyid (Eds.), *A postcolonial people – South Asians in Britain* (pp. 1–10). London: Hurst & Co.
- Shuval, J. T. (2007). Diaspora migration; definitional ambiguities and a theoretical paradigm. In A. K. Sahoo & B. Maharaj (Eds.), *Sociology of Diaspora – a reader* (Vol. 1, pp. 28–42). Jaipur: Rawat Publications.
- Stillwell, J., & Hussain, S. (2010). Exploring the ethnic dimension of international migration in Great Britain using migration effectiveness and spatial connectivity. *Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies*, 36(9), 1381–1403.
- Touraine, A. (1997). *What is democracy?* Boulder: Westview (translated by D. Macey).
- Triadafilopoulos, T. (2011). Illiberal means to liberal ends? Understanding recent immigrant integration policies in Europe. *Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies*, 37(6), 861–880.
- Tsagarousianou. (2007). Reevaluating 'Diaspora': Connectivity, communication and imagination in a globalised world. In A. K. Sahoo & B. Maharaj (Eds.), *Sociology of Diaspora – a reader* (1st ed., pp. 101–117). Jaipur: Rawat Publications.
- Tsolidis, G. (2001). *Schooling, Diaspora and Gender – being feminist and being different*. Buckingham: Open University Press.
- Verloo, M. (2006). Multiple inequalities, intersectionality and the European Union. *European Journal of Women's Studies*, 13(3), 211–229.
- Vieten, U. M. (2006). "Out in the blue of Europe": Modernist cosmopolitan identity and the deterritorialization of belonging. *Patterns of Prejudice*, 40(3), 259–279.
- Vieten, U. M. (2009). Intersectionality scope and multidimensional equality within the European Union: Traversing national boundaries of inequality? In D. Schiek & V. Chege (Eds.), *European Union Non-discrimination Law – Comparative Perspectives on Multidimensional Equality Law* (pp. 91–113). New York: Routledge-Cavendish.
- Vieten, U. M. (2011). Tackling the conceptual order of multiple discrimination: Situating different and difficult genealogies of race and ethnicity. In D. Schiek & A. Lawson (Eds.), *European Union non-discrimination law and intersectionality – investigating the triangle of racial, gender and disability discrimination* (pp. 63–76). Farnham: Ashgate.
- Vieten, U. M. (2012). *Gender and cosmopolitanism in Europe: A feminist perspective*. Farnham: Ashgate.
- Wemyss, G. (2006). The power to tolerate: Contests over Britishness and belonging. In K. Kannabiran, U. M. Vieten, & N. Yuval-Davis (Eds.), *Boundaries, identities and borders: Exploring the cultural production of belonging*. *Patterns of Prejudice*, 40(3), 215–236.
- Wemyss, G. (2009). *The invisible empire – white discourse, tolerance and belonging*. Farnham: Ashgate.
- Yuval-Davis, N. (1997). *Gender & nation*. London: Sage.
- Yuval-Davis, N. (2004). Borders, boundaries and the politics of belonging. In S. May, T. Modood, & J. Squires (Eds.), *Ethnicity, nationalism and minority rights* (pp. 214–230). Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

- 
- Yuval-Davis, N. (2006). Intersectionality and feminist politics. *European Journal of Women's Studies*, 13(3), 193–209.
- Yuval-Davis, N., Kannabiran, K., & Vieten, U. M. (2006). Introduction – Situating contemporary politics of belonging. In N. Yuval-Davis, K. Kannabiran, & U. M. Vieten (Eds.), *The situated politics of belonging* (pp. 1–14). London: Sage.



---

## Part II

# Representing a Way of Being

---

# Refugee Women, Education, and Self Authorship

Melinda McPherson

---

## Introduction

Feminists have long taken an interest in the ways that women are represented within society because representations have material effects (Foucault 1980, p. 193). For marginal social groups, including women, these material effects have commonly been negative and limiting. Feminist researchers have critiqued representations of women in media and advertising (Wolf 1990; Benedict 1992), the law (Scutt 1994; Kaspiew 1995), social policy, and service delivery (Gozdziak 2004) drawing links between these ‘understandings’ of women and their social consequences. Such research has extended to the material impacts upon girls and women of representations in education (McLeod 1990). Participation in education confers upon participants certain social and cultural capital (Bourdieu 2006) and other positive material outcomes (Feinstein et al. 2008). If education is premised upon representations, then the subjects in relation to whom education policy is crafted will attract a particular quality and nature of education.

It has been argued that the impacts of feminism have flowed disproportionately to certain groups of women, with positive economic and educational benefits especially flowing to wealthy and middle class heterosexual white western women. Feminist insights were slower to impact upon development policy, and especially forced migration policy (Indra 1999; Charlesworth 2001, 2005). While educational opportunities and standards for girls and women have increased in many parts of the world, this has been less so in development and forced migration environments. It is with marginalizing and negative representations of refugee women in education policy, and mechanisms for their interruption, that I am concerned in this chapter.

---

M. McPherson (✉)

Honorary Research Fellow, University of Ballarat, Ballarat, Australia  
e-mail: melinda.mcpherson@digitall.net.au

Marginality occurs when policy subjects are represented as not conforming with dominant social norms (Foucault 2002). Such marginal groups are commonly construed by government policies as problems to be fixed (Bacchi 1999; Marston 2004). I begin this chapter with a brief description of the ways in which refugee women have been marginalized and negatively represented in dominant forced migration policy discourses. I then turn to the specific example of Australian settlement policy, and the education which flows from it, as a site in which participants are problematized against dominant, gendered Australian values and norms. Positioning marginality as a product of representation enables an examination of the techniques used to perpetuate that representation, and consequently the means by which such representations might be interrupted (Foucault 2002; McLaren 2002, Ch. 2). Influenced by Foucault's (1980, p. 82) appeal to marginal voices (see also Hooks 1984 and Spivak 1988) I conducted interviews with nine refugee women about education's purposes, looking to examine the ways in which their responses might present a different picture of subjectivity than that in the dominant policy discourses.

The women's feedback seemed to me to resonate with the capabilities framework theorized broadly by Sen (1999) and Nussbaum (2000), and explored in the educational context by Olssen (2005). My findings pose a significant challenge to dominant representations of refugee women in education policy environments that under-emphasize the operations of agency in the subject. Review of the interview feedback raises a number of important themes, and precipitates my return to the literature in order to consider various analytical frameworks.

---

## Refugee Women, Policy Norms, and Representations

In Foucault's (2000) view (and that of certain feminist theorists after him – see for example (McLaren 2002; Butler 2006)), it is the representation of marginal subjects in ways antithetical to norms in dominant discourses that can bring about their marginality. Refugee women's marginality can be attributed, at least in part, to their representation in relation to dominant norms in pivotal areas of forced migration policy, such as the Convention Relating to the Status of Refugees (UNHCR 1996) (hereafter the Refugee Convention). Feminist detractors of the Convention have criticized its capacity, or the capacity of those who generally interpret and apply it, to encompass and respond to the discrete needs of refugee women (Martin 1991; Indra 1999; Kelley 2001; Pittaway 2001). The material effects of absence or invisibility for refugee women are linked closely with the ways in which refugee women have been represented and framed in the policy debates and research.

We are aware that the framing of policy problems carries with it implications for policy resolution (Bacchi 1999). Dominant representations of refugee women in forced migration policies have rendered those women invisible or has emphasised their victimhood and ineffectuality (Nordstrom 1999; Johnson 2006). Indeed, privileged representations of refugee women have emphasised their status as subjects of charity (Choules 2007). As Nordstrom notes, 'Children and girls are of course constantly used as symbols of war, starvation, forced displacement, and other

calamities' (Nordstrom 1999, p. 65). Nordstrom (1999) observes that representations of refugee women are commonly invoked to legitimate particular calls to policy action. A 2010 *Time Magazine* (Crowley 2010) cover brandishing a mutilated Afghani woman as evidence of the continuing need for US and allied troops in Afghanistan usefully illustrates this phenomenon. These representations of refugee women inform service provision in camp environments and third countries of settlement. It has been argued, for example, that the Western biomedical model of mental health assessment and service provision pathologises refugee women at the expense of recognising their agency, strengths, and resilience (Gozdziak 2004).

The point of raising these concerns about representation is not to negate or dismiss refugee women's negative experiences; indeed, refugee women's experiences have remained invisible from the policy agenda for too long (Pittaway 1991, 2001; Kelley 2001). It is rather to explore what is absent from dominant representations, and why the eyes of privilege should choose to emphasize certain representations over others. Without underemphasizing the wretchedness of their circumstances, historical representations of refugee women negate a complex view of their identities and experiences, including any suggestion that strength, resilience, and strategy characterize their subjectivities (Lifton 1994; Masten 2001). This is evident in Australian settlement education policy, which positions participants as policy problems (Marston 2004) requiring Western benevolence.

---

## **Integrationist Norms and the Microphysics of Power in Settlement Education**

Over approximately the last century, Australia's migration policy has metamorphosed through periods of assimilationism, integrationism, and multiculturalism back to a focus on integrationism (Lopez 2000). In light of events such as September 11 2001, and local fears about boat arrivals (Clyne 2005), Australia's policy of integrationism is concerned with facilitating social cohesion through teaching conformance by outsiders with dominant social and cultural norms (Lopez 2000; Jacobowicz 2008). Refugees especially, have been represented as unable to effectively 'integrate' because of their purported resistance to, antipathy to, or misunderstanding of, Australian values (Caldwell 2007). It is through the discourse of citizenship or citizenship values especially that the problematic nature of settlement policy subjects is commonly highlighted. Gendered aspects of these discourses imply greater marginality – or rather greater deviance from 'the norm' – in particular respects by refugee women.

The representation of outsiders, including refugee women, as antithetical to Australian norms leads to a particular set of material effects, including the framing of strategies by which they might be 'helped' (Bacchi 1999). Foucault's (1980) microphysics of power can be observed in the operations of Australian settlement policy upon the bodies of refugees. These operations of power are visible in practices ranging from a mandatory requirement that all migrants, including refugees, sign an Australian 'Values Statement', to the practices and curriculum of settlement education.

Australia's settlement policy links the teaching of English through the Adult Migrant English Program (AMEP) with facilitating improved prospects for employment, mainstream social participation, and the adoption of dominant Australian values by migrants and refugees. Supporting refugees to find work and participate socially is of critical value, however it is the ways in which these normative concepts are applied in the representation of refugees that is of concern in this chapter. It is my argument that 'citizenship' education (as measured by Australia's 'Citizenship Test' – a significant focus of the AMEP curriculum) – is directed towards teaching refugees a set of dominant values, rather than laying the foundations for critical democratic engagement.

In this sense, representations in the policy de-emphasize agency through promoting pedagogies designed to facilitate conformance by different 'others' with a normative, static ideal of the citizen subject. The concept of equality encapsulated in the policy is premised on a view of equality as sameness; that is, the current policy promotes a view of citizenship which emphasizes 'equal rights' (Ager and Strang 2008, p. 176) over equal status (Benhabib 2005, p. 673). Such a model presumes that participants either want or are better off having 'the same' as an imagined, homogenous, and more civilized citizenry of the dominant culture. It is in the context of these representations that I undertook to furnish a new and different perspective about subjectivity to that represented in settlement education policy – a reverse discourse (Foucault 1990, p. 101) that draws heavily on refugee women's reflections about the role of education in society.

---

## **Speaking with Refugee Women: Engineering a Reverse Discourse**

Using a participant centered approach, I undertook open ended interviews during late 2007 with nine refugee women in Melbourne about the purposes of education. The questions were not structured around policy imperatives, but rather designed to encourage deep engagement with the meanings and purposes of education as a general proposition. Each woman participated in a digitally recorded interview that lasted approximately 2 h. I used the interviews as discourse and logged each purpose which arose in the text, developing a series of codes for understanding these (Neuman 2006). Amongst other themes which arose was that of capabilities (discussed in the next section).

Recruited through a snowball sampling technique, the women were referred to me through a number of advocacy and support organizations, and through contacts of my own. This resulted in participants who were already active in community and who were keen to talk about education (because they knew this to be the subject of my research). For the purposes of reporting, the women have been allocated pseudonyms, detailed in the table below [Table 1]. The women originated from nine countries – Bosnia, the Czech Republic, Ethiopia, Iran, Poland, the Sudan, Somalia, Turkey, and Zimbabwe. Participants' ages ranged between 23 and 45 years and all except 1 of the women above 30 were mothers. Their educational backgrounds were

**Table 1** Research participants

Name	Country of birth	Ethnic identification	Age at interview	Education pre-arrival	Education post-arrival
Jasmina	Bosnia	Bosnian Muslim	30	Equivalent Year 8	Language school, Years 11 and 12, B.A. Hons, Graduate Diploma International Relations
Hodan	Somalia	Undisclosed	38	Equivalent Year 9	Tertiary and Further Education, Certificate IV in Accounting
Cecylja	Poland	Undisclosed	47	Equivalent Year 12 Diploma in Administration	Language classes, Year 10, B.A., M.A., many short adult education courses
Semira	Ethiopia	Undisclosed	37	B.A. (Language and Literature)	M.A. (Counselling)
Afschineh	Iran	Undisclosed	43	Equivalent Year 12	Language classes, TAFE Diploma, B.A., B Social Work (continuing)
Nasrin	Sudan	Sudanese/Eritrean	24	Equivalent Year 6	Primary to Year 12, B.A. Hons
Parze	Turkey	Kurdish	46	Equivalent Year 12	Language classes, Tertiary and Further Education Certificate, B.A., M.A.
Fadzai	Zimbabwe	Undisclosed	24	Equivalent Year 12	B Social Sciences (Youth Work) (continuing)
Karolina	Czech Republic	Undisclosed	30	Equivalent Year 5	Year 5-12, B.A. Hons (Psychology), Ph.D. (Psychology) (continuing)

diverse; however they had all received some or all primary schooling in the home country. At the point of interview, all except one was university qualified, or working towards a degree. Because I was looking for deep reflection based on experiences across the spectrum of the refugee journey, I drew upon women who had been in Australia at least 7 years, and who were at least 10 years of age before leaving the home country. Participants were all conversant in English. I address some possible implications of this particular group of women for the interview feedback in my Discussion section.

---

## Capabilities for Freedom

I noted during the introduction that certain themes in the women's feedback about the importance of education in facilitating autonomy and choice resonated with Olssen's (2005) 'capabilities for freedom'. The traditional concept of autonomy has been problematized by educational theorists of Foucault, who understand freedom as discursively constrained (Marshall 1997; Olssen 2005). In order to traverse this theoretical impediment, Olssen (2005) coins the phrase 'capabilities for freedom' to stand in for autonomy. From Olssen's (2005) perspective 'If we are to educate for the political virtues required for democracy, in my view education must pursue a capabilities approach' (Olssen 2005, p. 379). While acknowledging the importance of concepts surrounding autonomy, Olssen (2005) articulates two primary objections to use of this term. First, in common with Sen (1999) and Nussbaum (2000) he argues, people are inter-dependent and inter-connected, and thus he considers autonomy to be technically 'inappropriate' as a term. Further, he suggests it is almost impossible to rid the term of its liberal philosophical baggage (Olssen 2005, p. 372).

With respect to the former point, which is of importance in this chapter, Olssen argues that autonomy is an idealized notion of freedom or independence that is not possible in a Foucaultian paradigm because complete freedom is an illusion (Olssen 2005, p. 366). Indeed, the concept of autonomy exaggerates the degree to which we are actually independent and self-legislating. 'In that people are socialized, they are 'responsibilized' through strategies of 'power-knowledge' to believe they are freer than they really are' (Olssen 2005, p. 374). Additionally, Olssen (2005) argues that our interdependence as social beings comes with obligations. 'If the 'autonomy' of each is emphasized, one also, by definition as it were, underplays the responsibilities and duties which we owe to each other, individually and collectively' (Olssen 2005, p. 378). Thus, Olssen (2005, p. 373) suggests, while many individuals may aspire to a certain 'self sufficiency', he suspects they frequently confuse the ideology with the reality.

For the reasons described above Olssen contends that 'concepts other than autonomy can do ... just as well, and with far fewer negative effects than use of the concept of autonomy brings with it' (Olssen 2005, p. 370). Instead, he adopts the term 'capabilities', which he lists as;

critical reason, cognitive and cultural capital and resources, emotional and social capital, and so on. Capabilities also linked with needs, where resources and the structures of support are emphasised (Olssen 2005, p. 379).

Olssen positions the capabilities in a framework of interconnected community which values the defense and protection of certain rights – freedom, security, equality, and inclusion. The exercise of individual capabilities should be directed towards securing the quality and voracity of the institutions which defend and protect these rights. As he explains it, ‘While children develop [through education] and hopefully realize their potentials, what is needed to be understood is what freedom means, and how it can be expressed in the context of social, national and global connectedness’ (Olssen 2005, p. 378). Thus, for those sympathetic to a Foucaultian perspective, autonomy might better be described as,

a degree of reasonable self-sufficiency, of mature judgment, and reasonable detachment of perspective, as they balance the interests of themselves and their families with those of the community and the polis (Olssen 2005, p. 373).

To this Olssen adds ‘What are required are the arts of criticism’ (Olssen 2005, p. 382). Olssen’s views about self-sufficiency, mature judgment, critical thought, and balancing personal with social interests accords with many of the perspectives expressed during my interviews.

---

## Feedback

Every interviewee spoke to a number of ‘capabilities’ during our discussions, which I shall elaborate upon immanently. These included:

- Cultivating an informed perspective;
- Making informed and independent decisions and exercising choice;
- Engaging in debate and expressing an informed position;
- Developing skills in order to understand the local Australian culture;
- Cultivating an open mind; and
- Exercising critical enquiry and developing the capacity to question

Education was understood by the women as a critical vehicle for facilitating these capabilities; for increasing autonomy in a manner consistent with the views of Olssen (2005) and MacKenzie et al. (2007) that autonomy is always relational.

## An Informed Perspective

A premium was placed on knowledge or a knowledgeable perspective by all of the interviewees. Seven spoke overtly about the importance of having a knowledge of facts and having exposure to information. As the following quotations illustrate, the sentiment was expressed largely in terms of needing or desiring ‘to know’ facts and information.

For me, it’s actually giving me satisfaction that I am . . . somebody who likes to know (Cecylja).

It makes me depressed if I don’t know something (Jasmina).

It makes me feel like I know a little bit more about what’s going on in the world... (Karolina).



It is worth noting that in Cecylja, Nasrin, and Jasmina's interviews, knowledge was afforded an innate value; that is, knowledge acquisition was seen to be important even without an immediately evident, instrumental purpose. As Nasrin expressed it,

Acquiring knowledge is a good thing for the sake of knowledge (Nasrin).

In various ways, all of the interviewees spoke to the importance of cultivating a perspective based on more than speculation, whim, or uninformed bias. Jasmina, Nasrin, Karolina, and Fadzaï in particular were critical of individuals articulating uninformed perspectives, as the following excerpt illustrates.

It's really to have the knowledge. Not to be dumb, you know? (Jasmina)

## Independent Decision Making and Exercising Choice

Six interviewees emphasised the role of the knowledge gained from education in making informed and independent decisions. As Fadzaï expresses it below,

[Because of education] I have the choice to pick. I think I make smarter decisions (Fadzaï).

The capacity to make decisions independently was connected to accessing information from a range of valid information sources (such as education institutions), and then being able to put that information toward 'thinking' outcomes. Hodan, for example, explained the importance of education to facilitating decision making independent of the pressures of community groups or religious authorities.

You're more aware of choices. But without an education, you go . . . with the flow, you know? With the community. With whatever you hear, is right to you – you don't have that sense of . . . you don't have a choice, more or less (Hodan).

In this quotation, Hodan places value on bringing her own 'mind' to conversations, debates, and engagements about varying issues.

## Engaging in Debate and Expressing an Informed Position

A number of interviewees described the capacity to engage in discussion, express an 'educated' opinion, and to persuade others of a particular perspective, as being an important function of education. In the following examples, Jasmina and Karolina speak about education as enabling their capacity to express an opinion amongst others.

to share my opinion. To be able to share my opinion with people who I would respect and I respect and, uh, and I am to be like them. You know what I mean? (Jasmina)

it helps me clarify why I think what I think and backs it up a bit more and it helps me just to have that knowledge so that if I discuss it with someone else I can be aware of the different points of view and argue against it if necessary (Karolina).

To be critical, to think, to be able to deal with one another (Jasmina).

## Developing Skills in Order to Better Understand the Dominant Australian Culture

Participating in institutional education was identified by four interviewees as an avenue for learning local culture – attitudes, approaches, idiosyncratic values and behaviours, ways of doing and being. This kind of ‘capital’<sup>1</sup> (Bourdieu 2006) was valued highly. As long term settled refugee women working with large settling communities, Cecylja and Semira placed a premium on this kind of experience.

I strongly believe that to actually study in Australia, regardless of what qualifications people have, it’s actually the best thing that migrants can do. . . It’s just the local educational experience and the supportive environment to get the confidence to . . . be able to compete in the [job] market (Cecylja).

Afschineh made a similar point from her own more recent experience.

that’s why I choose to go to TAFE — to get the experience (Afschineh).

## Cultivating an Open Mind

Every interviewee spoke about the role of education in opening minds and enabling individuals to see the world and its people from a different perspective. Hodan’s quotation below captures this sentiment.

Education has done so much for me because it has given me an open mind, which is, I don’t judge people (Hodan).

Interestingly, Jasmina makes a similar point by emphasizing the undesirability of ‘closed environments’ and ‘closed circles’ – the antithesis of the ‘openness’ which characterizes an ‘open mind’.

making people think things with their heads, and you know, getting out of these closed environments. Like closed circles cos . . . in a utopian world . . . I think everyone would be . . . thinking about the next one [others] as the same (Jasmina).

Open mindedness in individuals was understood as an important condition for a peaceful, just, and civil society.

## Developing Critical Enquiry: The Capacity to Question

I would like to introduce this section with a quotation from Hodan which, although brief, is powerful.

I think education, to me, is light (Hodan).

---

<sup>1</sup> Bourdieu’s (2006) concepts of cultural and social capital have been explained on page 48.

Hodan understood education as a vehicle for shedding light on issues and information that one might not otherwise have. The emergence of this light coincides with a capacity to question the status quo or that which appears as common sense that manifests in dominant discourses. All of the interviewees, including Hodan, placed value on the capacity to question and critique dominant ideas and understandings.

Critical thought enriches the capacity to question and the capacity to make independent choices and decisions; to think (more) independently in relation to questions of family, religion, work, and within the community. In the following excerpts, Hodan and Jasmina describe the importance of being able to think outside ‘the mob’.

Like, I would be told ‘You have to wear the hijab’, you know? As a youngster. And I didn’t know why I had to do it. And I didn’t want to do it unless I knew why. And education give[s] you the asking (Hodan).

Not to be like – sheep – you know? Someone say[s] something, you follow. You know, to be more critical about things (Jasmina).

Like, my community will tell me ‘Oh no no no. This is not good for you in Islam’. But I know. I know better because I have researched it. Or I have read through it (Hodan).

The interviewees who spoke about having an open mind valued learning from ‘different’ others and distilling the wealth of such feedback in order to question, interrogate, and engage with the ‘common sense’ views or view of authority figures which might prevail in their own communities and in the community at large.

If I don’t have any education in this country, when I listen to the TV news, of course I will understand in only one . . . and okay, these people saying this and that, it’s bad for me. But if I am an educated person, if I learn skills and how to analyse everything, then it will be different, my understanding or my perceiving from any news from the TV (Parze).

you can tell me anything about the history and say they write good things about you or bad things about you or whatever you want to say you can say it. But if you can read and write it can make a difference . . . in every step of the way of life (Afshineh).

Importantly, critical enquiry produces the conditions within which an individual can come to know and articulate her own views more clearly.

it helps me clarify why I think what I think and backs it up a bit more and it helps me just to have that knowledge so that if I discuss it with someone else I can be aware of the different points of view . . . (Karolina).

In a vein similar to the notion of an open mind, was the view expressed by Jasmina, Hodan, and Fadzai that education plays a pivotal role in dispelling fears held by new migrants about their new country, and fears held by local residents about new arrivals. Jasmina criticized what she termed ‘the mentality’ of individuals within her community, who repeated information and perspectives without critical regard. In her view, many of these perspectives characterized the attitudes responsible for the Bosnian war.

Nasrin saw the classroom as a place in which she could engage with new ideas, which she could bring to conversations with friends and members of the local community. New ideas gave her the ‘freedom’ to question dominant orthodoxies;

to challenge hegemonic views about women, about ethnicity, and about religion. The ideas she gained from these locations also enabled her to challenge family and friends regarding dominant perspectives on what was considered an appropriate employment pathway for her. Nasrin resisted undertaking medicine, engineering, or business at Melbourne University; career paths that were valued by her parents and her cultural community.

Fadzai explained the importance of critical thought to evaluating one's position in society. She claimed that many Africans from Zimbabwe took for granted their position in the 'social order' and did not recognize that they had a wealth of skills with which to start their own businesses or run their own economy. Parze linked a critical perspective with empathy – she understood education as playing a role in developing one's consciousness about others' situations, which might lead to greater understanding and connection.

---

## Discussion

The 'marginal' perspectives contained in these interviews contrast with representations in the dominant discourse that emphasize a view of refugee women as ineffectual victims in need of benevolent Western charity. Interview feedback illustrates the important role participants considered education should play in facilitating self-authorship – the crafting of one's self and one's life. The women used terms such as empowerment and independence (consistent with a capabilities perspective) to describe education's role in facilitating self-authorship.

Refugee lives are commonly characterized by significant limitations and constraints ranging from material deprivation to impositions upon the capacity to self-direct major aspects of one's life and future. In light of such experiences, autonomy (or independence, as it was expressed) and self-authorship are highly valued. Jasmina, Cecylja, Nasrin, Parze, Afschineh, and Fadzai drew connections between education and the facilitation of independence, whether for individuals, for women, or for communities. Afschineh linked education with employment, financial independence, and self reliance.

It's like, you know, power, as you say, it's a big power because when you are educated and when you marry, I believe if I am educated it is easy for me to find a job and then I rely on myself on my pocket and my money, if I'm married. I think in all cultures there's a big issue for the women, education, you work you have your own money, if you don't work you have to ask for the money (Afschineh).

Nasrin explained her mother's views on the link between education and self-reliance.

[Mum] wants us to get an education so that we feel emp[ower]ed — and you can read and you can write and you can take care of yourself . . . . (Nasrin).

Empowerment was an 'umbrella' term used by participants to describe certain capabilities that should be brought about by education. Jasmina, Cecylja, Nasrin, Parze, Afschineh, and Fadzai used the term empowerment multiple times during interview.

'Empowerment' described the ability to make choices (such as a job of choice), to speak the local language, to be knowledgeable, to see that there were pathways after tragedy, to express an independent perspective, to exercise a critical perspective, and to be financially independent. In the following quotation, Nasrin describes education's importance to facilitating a knowledge of one's own mind, and consequently, to facilitating empowerment and strength for the individual.

so education for me is that empowerment and just giving women the strength to say that I know and I think (Nasrin).

Nasrin illustrates the consequences for women who are not equipped through education to better know their own minds and express their own views.

[Rather than marrying women with an education and who speaks English, a few men from our community] bring over wives who hardly know anything because that's better for them. She stays at home and she will never question him, she will never have the self-confidence to leave him either. She doesn't know what's going on and how things work (Nasrin).

These interviews strongly contest a notion of refugee women as 'blank slates' in need of Western education to impart upon them superior and civilizing values. Certainly, many refugees arrive in Australia with a shattered sense of self because of their experiences of torture and trauma; however these interviews made clear that rather than having an 'absent' self-concept, the underlying self-concept is perhaps better described as trapped by certain barriers, such as language, culture shock, or previous trauma. The importance of education's role in facilitating a path past these barriers is manifest in the following excerpts from Cecylja's interview.

I think I sort of went through a depression. And I would get upset quite easily. If something said to me I would cry for no reason. Although, I don't think I realised at the time what was happening – it was just, you know, I was a very unhappy person. Kind of not knowing English. Working in a factory. . . . you know, at my [young] age (Cecylja)

It was clear from interview feedback that these women saw education as a tool to be *used* by themselves and others for self-development, rather than a process to be imposed upon them in order to condition conformance. The fact of refugee women bringing with them a self-concept was manifest in the stories they relayed to me about their educational histories. In Parze's account below, we note an ambition and drive to achieve particular goals through education.

At 8 years of age, I knew that education was important. I wanted to have a career in my life. I didn't want to be a village girl – to stay at home – to depend on your parents, to be dependent on your brothers. I wanted to have my own career. I wanted to stand up for my own self. I wanted to be something for my own [self] (Parze).

It was the understanding of these interviewees that individuals want to author their own lives; however they require support and assistance to formulate what they want for themselves, in order to carve out a path to fulfilling their own set of opportunities and desires. The capabilities are critical to improving the conditions for self-authorship and the conditions for voice (speaking one's mind, representing oneself).

This pivotal role for education, perhaps above other roles, was emphasized especially by Hodan.

Because, however much education . . . however much you have, if you don't understand yourself and you don't accept yourself for who you are, then you can't make much of [a] . . . contribution to anyone's life (Hodan).

## Implications of the Interview Sample to Recommendations

I have already noted that the women interviewed for this study do not capture the breadth and difference of refugee women's experiences in Australia, especially with respect to those who have not received education. With respect to this limitation, I make the following observations. Even within the group of women interviewed, there were sometimes differing views about education's purposes and its value. Despite such differences, the interviewees believed it was an essential right – perhaps a human right – that all individuals be conceived of by governments and service systems as having a certain potential. I do not define agency as the pursuit by all refugee women of choices deemed important by the women in this study. Rather my point is that the pursuit of such goals must be imagined as possible for – the right of – all.

Further, as Olszen (2005) has pointed out, the notion of absolute freedom is fictional, and some women's capacity to conceive of the possibilities for themselves and others is no doubt constrained by their circumstances, social, cultural, and material. The women I interviewed for this study made the point that it is sometimes difficult to know what is possible in one's life or to decide how one might like to develop, until some level of information, education, and confidence development has occurred. Their argument is that sometimes one doesn't know what one doesn't know – and that attributing 'choice' to some women who may not have access to the conditions for developing capabilities and freedom may be misconstrued. Thus, in relation to my findings, I argue simply that some themes in my interviews, while not strictly able to be generalized, have applicability for refugee women – for all women – in the general population. Primarily, that in order to develop capabilities for freedom, women must be imagined as being capable of developing such qualities. It is not that the exercise of agency is not possible without these tools – but rather, that education might expand understandings of the possible ways in which agency can be exercised. This representation, I have argued, leads to a material effect; that is, the design of an education that can nurture and further the capabilities, and consequently freedoms, of individual women.

---

## Conclusions

Representations of refugee women in dominant forced migration policy discourses have emphasised victimhood and ineffectuality over agency (Indra 1999; Gozdzik 2004). Such discourses have commonly been premised on a universal male policy

subject that negates women's experiences (MacKinnon 2006), and which beckons the intervention of charitable Western hands to 'decide' for women (Choules 2007). These policy representations effectively rob refugee women of their 'minds' – perhaps one of the few vestiges of ownership left to a group of women who have already been robbed of citizenship, home, belongings, and family.

I draw attention to the significance of such representations in the field of education policy because education can impart upon participants important social and cultural capital (Bourdieu 2006) and material outcomes (Feinstein et al. 2008). In Australian settlement education, migrants and refugees are problematized in relation to a set of dominant norms that emphasize citizenship values, work, and mainstream social participation. In particular, the notion of citizenship dominant in Australian settlement policy emphasizes conformance with a range of unreconstructed dominant values (DEST 2005; Costello 2006). It is difference from the values, rather than lack of democratic engagement with them, that is represented to be the problem (Bacchi 1999).

To contest these representations, I engineered a reverse discourse (Foucault 1990, p. 101) by speaking with nine refugee women about why education was important to them. The women I interviewed placed importance on education's role in facilitating 'capabilities for freedom' (Olssen 2005). These capabilities enabled and extended the conditions for self-authorship and contributed to the ongoing task of fashioning identity within a new country. If, as I have argued, representations connect with material effects, then charitable representations of refugee women are unlikely to promote a capabilities based education. Refugee women must be recognised as *having* their own minds and their own selves before education will be offered to *develop* and *extend* those minds and selves.

In *Pedagogy of the Oppressed* Freire (1993) contrasts the normative work education undertakes with its possibilities for facilitating freedom. As Shaull summarises Freire's view,

Education either functions as an instrument which is used to facilitate integration of the younger generation into the logic of the present system and bring about conformity or it becomes the practice of freedom, the means by which men and women deal critically and creatively with reality and discover how to participate in the transformation of their world (Shaull 1993, p. 34)

My research suggests that refugee women conceive of education's purposes beyond its normalizing role, especially as it re-institutes dominant discourses that marginalize. In contrast to a notion of citizenship that emphasizes conformance with dominant values, the interviewees conceived of subjectivity and citizenship in far more complex ways; in ways that illustrate the operation of agency. They aspired to something more than 'equal status'. They emphasized the importance of critical engagement and questioning, which includes the right to equal decision making. They brought a perspective which mandated the inclusion of their *minds* in the conversations within the polis. They did not want the regurgitation of values, but a capacity to be open to new ways of thinking, a capacity to question, a capacity to engage.

If, as I have argued, policy outcomes transpire from policy representations, then looking to the ways in which the most marginalized groups in our communities are represented in policy is a pivotal task. These interviews reveal that significant importance is placed by refugee women upon education's role in facilitating certain capabilities for freedom; capabilities that enable individuals to self-author and self-represent, rather than having institutional systems respond to negative and limiting representations of them. As Hodan, one of the interviewees noted, 'To me, education is light'.

---

## References

- Ager, A., & Strang, A. (2008). Understanding integration: A conceptual framework. *Journal of Refugee Studies*, 21(2), 166–191.
- Bacchi, C. L. (1999). *Women, policy, and politics: The construction of policy problems*. London: Sage.
- Benedict, H. (1992). *Virgin or vamp: How the press covers sex crimes*. New York: Oxford University Press.
- Benhabib, S. (2005). Borders, boundaries, and citizenship. *Political Science and Politics*, 38(4), 673–677.
- Bourdieu, P. (2006). The forms of capital. In H. Lauder, P. Brown, J. Dillabough, & A. H. Halsey (Eds.), *Education, globalization and social change* (pp. 105–118). Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Butler, J. (2006). *Gender trouble*. New York: Routledge.
- Caldwell, A. (2007). Andrews under fire for cutting African refugee intake. ABC News, 3 October. Sydney: Australian Broadcasting Corporation.
- Charlesworth, H. (2001). Women's rights. Human rights defender manual. Australian Legal Information Institute. <http://www.austlii.edu.au/au/other/HRLRes/2001/9/>. Accessed 12 Apr 2006.
- Charlesworth, H. (2005). Not waving but drowning: Gender mainstreaming and human rights in the United Nations. *Harvard Human Rights Journal*, 18, 1–18.
- Choules, K. (2007). The shifting sands of social justice discourse: From situating the problem with "Them" to situating it with "Us". *Review of Education, Pedagogy, and Cultural Studies*, 29(5), 461–481.
- Clyne, M. (2005). The use of exclusionary language to manipulate opinion: John Howard, asylum seekers and the re-emergence of political incorrectness in Australia. *Journal of Language and Politics*, 4(2), 173–196.
- Costello, P. (2006). *Worth promoting, worth defending: Australian citizenship, what it means and how to nurture it*. Canberra: Commonwealth Copyright Administration, Federal Attorney General.
- Crowley, M. (2010). Afghan women and the return of the Taliban. Florida: Time Magazine, 29 July.
- DEST. (2005). *National framework for values education in Australian schools*. Canberra: Commonwealth of Australia.
- Feinstein, L., Budge, D., Vorhaus, J., & Duckworth, K. (2008). *The social and personal benefits of learning: A summary of key research findings*. London: CRWBL.
- Foucault, M. (1980). Two lectures. In C. Gordon (Ed.), *Power/knowledge: Selected interviews and other writings, 1972–1977* (pp. 78–108). Brighton: Harvester Press.
- Foucault, M. (1990). *The history of sexuality volume 1: An introduction volume*. New York: Vintage.
- Foucault, M. (2000). On the genealogy of ethics: An overview of work in progress. In P. Rabinow (Ed.), *Michel Foucault ethics: Essential works of Foucault 1954–1984* (Vol. 1, pp. 253–280). London: Penguin.



- Foucault, M. (2002). *The order of things*. London: Routledge.
- Freire, P. (1993). *Pedagogy of the oppressed*. New York: The Continuum International Publishing Group.
- Gozdziak, E. (2004). *Refugee women's responses to forced migration: Limitations of the trauma concept*. Washington, DC: Substance Abuse and Mental Health Services Administration.
- Hooks, B. (1984). *Feminist theory: From margin to center*. Boston: South End Press.
- Indra, D. (Ed.). (1999). *Engendering forced migration*. New York: Berghahn.
- Jacobowicz, A. (2008). A stunned silence: The slow death of multiculturalism. Australian Policy Online, Institute for Social Research, Swinburne University of Technology, 25 November. <http://apo.org.au/commentary/stunned-silence-slow-death-multiculturalism>. Accessed 25 July 2013.
- Johnson, H. (2006). Constructing victims: Visual images, victimization and imagining the female refugee. *Annual Meeting of the International Studies Association*. San Diego: International Studies Association.
- Kaspiew, R. (1995). Rape lore: Legal narrative and sexual violence. *Melbourne University Law Review*, 20, 350–382.
- Kelley, N. (2001). The convention refugee definition and gender-based persecution: A decade's progress. *International Journal of Refugee Law*, 13(4), 559–568.
- Lifton, R. (1994). *The Protean Self: Human resilience in an age of fragmentation*. New York: Basic Books.
- Lopez, M. (2000). *The origins of multiculturalism in Australian politics 1945–1975*. Melbourne: Melbourne University Press.
- MacKenzie, C., McDowell, C., & Pittaway, E. (2007). Beyond 'do no harm'. The challenge of constructing ethical relationships in refugee research. *Journal of Refugee Studies*, 20(2), 299–319.
- MacKinnon, C. (2006). *Are women human? and other international dialogues*. Cambridge, MA: The Belknap Press of Harvard University Press.
- Marshall, J. (1997). Michel Foucault: Problematising the individual and constituting 'the' self. *Educational Philosophy and Theory*, 29(1), 32–49.
- Marston, G. (2004). *Social policy and discourse analysis: Policy change in public housing*. Aldershot: Ashgate.
- Martin, S. F. (1991). *Refugee women*. London: Zed Books.
- Masten, A. S. (2001). Ordinary magic: Resilience processes in development. *American Psychologist*, 56(3), 227–238.
- McLaren, M. A. (2002). *Feminism, Foucault, and embodied subjectivity*. Albany: State University of New York.
- McLeod, J. (1990). Gender Inclusive Curriculum: Some issues for professional development. *Proceedings of Australian Association for Educational Research Annual Conference*, Sydney.
- Neuman, W. L. (2006). *Social research methods: Qualitative and quantitative approaches* (6th ed.). Boston: Pearson Education.
- Nordstrom, C. (1999). Girls and warzones: Troubling questions. In D. Indra (Ed.), *Engendering forced migration: Theory and practice* (pp. 63–82). New York: Berghahn Books.
- Nussbaum, M. (2000). *Women and human development: The capabilities approach*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Olssen, M. (2005). Foucault, educational research and the issue of autonomy. *Educational Philosophy and Theory*, 37(3), 365–387.
- Pittaway, E. (1991). *Refugee women – Still at risk in Australia*. Canberra: Australian Government Publishing Service.
- Pittaway, E. (2001). *Only rape: An examination of the power of ideology and discourse in the policy process with a focus on policy pertaining to refugee women*. Sydney: University of Technology.
- Scutt, J. A. (1994). Sexism and psychology: An analysis of the 'scientific' basis of the corroboration rule in rape. In J. A. Scutt (Ed.), *The sexual gerrymander* (pp. 139–160). North Melbourne: Spinifex Press.
- Sen, A. (1999). *Development as freedom*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.

- 
- Shaul, R. (1993). Foreward. In P. Freire (Ed.), *Pedagogy of the oppressed* (pp. 29–34). New York: Continuum.
- Spivak, G. C. (1988). Can the subaltern speak? In C. Nelson & L. Grossberg (Eds.), *Marxism and the interpretation of culture* (pp. 271–316). London: Macmillan.
- UNHCR. (1996). *Convention and protocol relating to the status of refugees*. Geneva: UN.
- Wolf, N. (1990). *The beauty myth: How images of beauty are used against women*. London: Virago.

---

# Invoking an Ivory Tower

## Journalistic Misrepresentation of Me as a Critic of Race and the Content of My Criticisms

Stella Coram

*She saw what she wanted to see. But the world does not divide  
as neatly on the ground as it does when gazed upon from an  
ivory tower*

(Baum 2008)

---

### Introduction

Hylton (2005) writes that “where race has been ignored, include it, where it has been marginalized, centre it, and where it has been problematized, theorize it” (p. 89). In May 2008, I wrote a letter to the Editor of a Melbourne newspaper to suggest that an article discussing the differences between two superstars of elite Australian Rules football, one (white) described as “team oriented” and the other black as “self oriented” (Walls 2008), conformed to racial dualism of white intellect and black instinct.<sup>1</sup>

My inquiry to understand the reasons for rejection of my letter drew a stinging rebuff in an article penned by a senior journalist. As Maori critic of race, who writes from the margins, in my adopted country of Australia, I draw on critical race theory (CRT) of counter story (Ladson-Billings 1998, 2003), to deconstruct criticism of me and my comments. I also draw on van Dijk’s (2002) theory of blocking devices to argue that race relations of dominance are inverted as a strategic device to dismiss me through selective reading of my criticisms on the racial representation of indigenous athletes in Australia.

---

<sup>1</sup>This study is derived of the research I presented at the Sport, Race and Ethnicity (SRE) Conference held at the University of Technology of Sydney, December 2008.

S. Coram (✉)  
Monash University, Melbourne, Australia  
e-mail: scoram@dodo.com.au

Identity is at the core of this study. As such, I explore the notion of a critical diaspora to explain my dislocation (dissimilarities) in relation to cultural-ethnic identifications attributed to the Maori diaspora in Australia (George and Rodriguez 2009) and in relation to my interest in the study of race and racism. This is a reflective piece that revisits my experience as the racial “other” trying to raise journalistic consideration on the contradictions of race and racism in media discourse. Critical scholar Essed (2002) proposes that experiences are a suitable source of information for the study of racism because they include the personal as well as vicarious experiences of racism. The location of narrators and their experiences gives specificity to events that allow the narrator to qualify subtle experience of racism (p. 178).

Geok-Lin Lim et al. (2000) propose that the concept of the “stranger” allows for examination of the underrepresentation and marginalization of minorities including women of color in terms of who belongs. They look to transform the structures of power through autobiographical voices. Butler (2000) similarly writes that morality in race relations and fulfillment of the democratic ideal could be embraced if they (Americans) knew the stories of the “other” (p. 15). Borrowing from Butler, I liken journalists to being in a position to create change, to draw readers in to fulfill an ideal.

This is what I naively had hoped to do in writing to the newspaper in the first place. Needless to say, I failed spectacularly. Whilst this study originates in my correspondence with the Editor of the Melbourne newspaper in question, the analysis focuses on a column written by a senior journalist in which I am the subject of derisive criticism. Given his status, I argue that his column in which he defends a colleague can be interpreted as representative of mainstream post-racial liberal discourse in which race and racism are de-historicized and depoliticized. For example, racism is collapsed into the “racist” (Coram 2011).<sup>2</sup> For that reason, I prefer the construct of racial discourse so as to distance from “racist” orthodoxy. To underline the limits of racism marked by “racist” intent, I refer to Taylor’s (2004) notion of racism as unethical disregard, which “captures a range of attitudes from hatred to failure to notice a person” (p. 34).

Sports journalists write to a mainstream readership that implicitly understands the narratives employed to represent the racial “other”. As Fanon (1967) observes, the dominant society comes to know itself by how it defines the “other”. The significance of this is magnified in journalistic reactions to my observations of race and racism.

It is noteworthy that pictorials accompanying columns in the newspaper indicate that sports journalists are typically “white” males though this does not preclude “white” females.<sup>3</sup> The colleague who is vigorously defended by the senior journalist is female. She is respected for her knowledge and reporting on the recruitment of young men to the Australian Football League (AFL). It is this journalist who forwarded an unsolicited email to me in which she wrongly claims that I accuse her of being “racist”.

---

<sup>2</sup>I employ quotation marks in reference to the “racist” to signal the fixed and unquestioned acceptance of racial hegemony bound by the “racist” in media discourse.

<sup>3</sup>My focus on “white” journalists is not to assume that indigenous writers do not contribute to sports journalism or that they do not share similar values toward indigenous athletes.

Van Dijk (2002) identifies blocking devices deployed by media sources to counter critics of race. A typical device is counter accusation, to label the critic a “racist”. Denial of racism represents a major strategy in the reproduction of racism. Journalists deny biased reports by claiming the importance of taking a stand against antiracist censorship (pp. 308–309). A classic move is reversal in which they (the antiracists) are the racists, the ones who are intolerant. It is not the journalist who is “racist” but the accuser (p. 309).

Those who invoke criticism of racism, a taboo according to van Dijk (2002), particularly where discrimination is outlawed, become the “racist” (p. 309). “Accusers” are subject to severe attack especially when the press is the target of criticism. Criticism is explained away by limiting definitions to old style aggressive ideological racism based on notions of racial superiority (pp. 310–311). In this context, denial serves political cause by challenging the legitimacy of anti-racist analysis.

---

## Critical Race Theory and Counter Story

According to Derrick Bell (1992), a founding proponent of critical race theory (CRT), racism is so normal as to be invisible. Thus, a methodological standpoint for CRT is the unmasking of the silences of racism from the perspective of the racial “other” through story telling or counter story. Critical race theorists integrate their knowledge and experience of oppressions such as racism and sexism in an effort to unmask racial hegemony (Ladson-Billings 2003).

Counter story provides a tool to explain omissions and distortions underscoring liberal policy and practice. Mainstream texts marginalise by featuring the “other” while at the same time leaving dominant culture narratives undisturbed (Ladson-Billings 2003). Counter story is epistemologically valuable for gaining understanding to transform (Ladson-Billings 1998). Counter story is gaining traction for scholars working with the concept of diaspora. Ty et al. (2010) draw on critical race theory to highlight the voices of the African diaspora to oppose traditional theory. They write that “powerful interests in society based on the centrality of white privilege work to oppress the African diaspora” (Ty et al. 2010, p. 1). Counter story provides a context and platform grounded in hearing the “other” to enunciate multiple diasporic dislocations in relation to my racial-ethnic identity and academic marginality so as to disrupt journalistic privilege and authority.

Safran (1991) defines diaspora as an “expatriate minority community that is dispersed from an original homeland” (pp. 83–84). Members of a diaspora maintain memory or myth about their homeland. They see themselves as returning to their ancestral home and hold to the view that their cultural identities are shaped by ongoing relationships to homeland. They believe that they are not fully accepted by the host country (Safran 1991).

The concept of diaspora, the dispersal or scattering of people from their homelands to resettle and recreate their cultural identities within new host-nations, reflects Maori mythology of several dispersals (scattering of seed) from the ancient homeland of Rangiatea or Hawaiiki (Winitana 2008). Maori resettlement mirrors

Safran's model of diaspora in that the Maori diaspora maintains cultural connections to Aotearoa (New Zealand) and expresses the desire to return to the ancestral homeland (Winitana 2008).

According to Winitana (2008), Maori women (wahine Maori), living in Australia, face many challenges to maintaining their identity. One way to do this is through the strengthening of "mana" an intrinsic attribute associated with other intangibles such as tapu (sacredness), ihi (awesomeness) and wehi (fearsomeness). Mana is inherited, bestowed and transferred from previous generations. Mana is linked to leadership, authority, mana-eke (uniqueness), the ability to speak for people and their land and to tino-rangatiratanga (self-determination).

Winitana (2008) writes that Maori women exhibit resilience, strength and adaptability drawn from Te Ao Maori (the Maori world). They are robust in dealing with the social realities they are presented within in the Australian context. Winitana (2008) proposes that mana can be likened to the Greek equivalent of "dunamai" which means a "capability towards power". This capability may be described as charisma, an indefinable "x" factor (Winitana 2008).

I question Maori female identity shaped by "tradition" or by a seemingly essentialist politics of culture and place. I am concerned that Maori women are represented as obliged to restore emblems of the "past" and to reconstitute tradition in the contemporary context. This overlooks alternative Maori identities including those based on cultural assimilation and, hence, underscores my reasoning on the need for a critical diaspora to problematize cultural identification and belonging. It is alienating to think that to identify as a Maori woman means to assume that there is only one version of being Maori.

I appreciate, though, that the recreation of tradition as home is to perform the important functions of place and welcome. "As an idea, it stands for shelter, stability, security, and comfort" although as McLeod (2000) points out "experience of home may well fail to deliver those promises" (p. 210). In the context of academe, home can be likened to a tower. Given my lack of place in academe, it is appropriate to interrogate the attribution of an ivory tower to me. As a symbol of an "intellectual" home of ideas, I am deemed to be "locked up" in tower, shackled to outdated ideology. The reality is that I have no access to an ivory tower. My interests appear to irritate institutions. I imagine that raising the pesky spectre of racism in "post-racial" society, such as Australia, might not be welcomed by mainstream media or even academe judging by my lack of inner sanctum.<sup>4</sup>

In the absence of institutional place, a critical diaspora informed by counter story presents a valuable standpoint from which to interrogate relations of dominance within journalistic privilege to know me. It also enables a lived trajectory of experience with which to pierce the hegemonic meanings of race and racism embedded within sports media discourse.

I identify with indigenous people and am empathetic to their representation in media discourse particularly of athletes, who carry the hopes of their people every

---

<sup>4</sup>I have discussed my location as the racial "other" relative to academe in an article published in 2009. See Coram (2009).

time they compete, and whose emergence on the sporting stage is regarded as a symbol of a new dawn in Australian race relations. As a devotee of Australian Rules, I was politicised, and still am, having witnessed in 1992 vitriolic racial abuse of an indigenous footballer by spectators as he took to the field. In my efforts to understand the social and political dynamics of racism in Australian football, I find that whilst mainstream sport discourse is no longer overtly critical of indigenous athletes, it remains that newspaper stories are reliant on racial discourse to misrepresent indigenous athletes.

Smith's (2002) construct of benevolent racism to describe enlightened newspaper editorial favouring of concessions for blacks during segregation in the US is helpful for contextualizing contemporary liberal orthodoxy in Australian media discourse. I propose that journalists construct race relations through the concession of celebratory discourse of indigenous athleticism which does not challenge the status quo. This is befitting of inclusion but necessarily of welcome in that narratives of celebration coexist alongside covert criticism. In the former, racial difference is assumed yet erased in the latter. To be clear, I am not against criticism only that which relies on racial stereotypes.

---

## Background and Context to Letter

The Australian sports media plays a central role in communicating to mainstream consumers the status of play in Australian sporting events. This includes the participation of indigenous athletes in national and global sporting "events". Newspapers represent a central link between the contest and spectators. Given that non-indigenous people do not by and large live amongst indigenous people, newspapers deliver a textual space for constructing narratives on indigenous people for the benefit of non-indigenous readers.

The popularity of sport in Australian culture, coupled with the "x" factor attributed to indigenous performances in sport, means that indigenous athletes occupy a central talking point for debating their place, legacy and contribution to sport (Niall 2000). It is in this context that sport provides a litmus test for examining the status of race relations in sport and through that Australian mainstream culture and society.

The main spectator sports played in Australia are cricket, swimming, rugby league, rugby union, soccer and Australian Rules football. Australians love anything and everything to do with sport, from watching it on television, to playing it, to talking about it ([Immigration 2 Australia](#) website). A unique game, Australian Rules football, administered by the Australian Football League (AFL) is described accordingly:

Australian Rules football (commonly known as Aussie rules) is played in all Australian states and territories. It is played between two teams with 18 players on the field. Teams use an ellipsoidal ball on oval grounds with four goal posts at each end. The aim is to kick the ball between the two inner posts of one set, for a goal, worth six points. If the ball travels between one outer and one inner post, it scores just one point. The game is distinguished from other kinds of football by the fast and relatively free movement of the ball ([Immigration 2 Australia](#) website).

Until recently, indigenous athletes with few exceptions were excluded from competing in elite Australian Rules competition. Their inclusion was complicated by a shameful history of racial vilification of indigenous athletes which was justified as part of the game, something that indigenous athletes were expected to cope with in order to compete (McNamara 2000). Moreover, it was not uncommon for AFL clubs to defer from recruiting indigenous athletes on the basis that they were deemed unreliable and undisciplined (Niall 1999). Not surprisingly, indigenous athletes have been motivated to prove their “worthiness”, to beat the white man at his own game. They have been well represented as recipients of best afield awards especially in AFL grand final playoffs.

Indigenous athletes competed under the weight of racial vilification. This reached a pinnacle in 1993 when the indigenous athlete Neil “Nicky” Winmar lifted his Guernsey to reveal his black skin to opposition supporters who had racially taunted him. Winmar is reported to have declared “I’m black and proud of it” (Smith 1993). This iconic gesture filled the newspapers in the weeks that followed. Even today, it is trotted out to mark the status of Australian race relations. However, it was not until the now-retired indigenous athlete, Michael Long, made a complaint of racial vilification in 1995 that the AFL took belated steps to introduce its Racial and Religious Vilification Code of Conduct that same year (McNamara 2000). Indigenous athletes now comprise approximately 10 % of the AFL playing population yet indigenous people represent less than 2 % of the Australian population. The creation of pathways has aided this trend (Blake 2006).

Sports journalists talk up the successes and opportunities available to indigenous people through sport but with little consideration of the realities of competition underscored by the short term nature of a career in sport (Coram 2007b). Sport is celebrated for its inclusiveness as are indigenous athletes for their talents. Bruce and Hallinan (2006) argue that positive discourse is symbolic requiring no action. Narratives championing indigenous athletes neutralise the politics of race. It is an “easy way out” for non-indigenous Australians to embrace indigenous athletes, such as Catherine Freeman, who “transcends race” and to then claim “we are not racist” (pp. 266–267).

Whilst the “old” guard in journalism dismissed racism in sport, the “new” guard defends against criticism that celebratory narratives draw on racial stereotypes. McKay (1995) refers to positive stories depicting black athletic dominance as good intentions racism. It is generally taken that the inclusion of indigenous athletes in the AFL is indicative that racism in sport no longer exists. However, this ignores the persistence of other forms of racism such as positional segregation. Indigenous athletes are recruited on the basis of racial stereotypes pertaining to speed and instinctive play (Hallinan et al. 1999).

Hoberman (1997) makes the telling observation that the cult of black athleticism serves the fantasy needs of blacks as well as whites in providing symbolic victories and renewal of survivalist thinking (p. xxv). Similarly, normalising discourses of indigenous athletic athleticism presume an uncritical truth of naturalness that serves fantasy needs in the Australian context around racial difference, aptitude and inclusion. Contemporary narratives objectify indigenous athletes as a special category of



naturally gifted athletes. This is consistent with racial discourse of black athletic dominance. By contrast, non-indigenous athletes are rarely constructed as a category. Their talent is not ascribed to their race. This is the basis for my argument that racial discourse is re-inscribed and that it is problematic to claim indigenous athletes are not constructed as a racial category.

---

## Editorial Correspondence

My purpose in writing to the newspaper was to draw attention to the representation of racial discourse in reference to the indigenous athlete Lance “Buddy” Franklin (Quayle 2007). I stress that Franklin is the not focus in this study. He simply represented the catalyst for writing to the newspaper given his high profile in the sports media and the content written about him of which I am critical. Jackson (1998) employs the term “twist of race” to characterise the floating racial signifiers which serve to demarcate racial identity that can shift between hero and scapegoat. Franklin fits this in shifting from hero to scapegoat.

In May 2008 the article: *Two of a kind* written by a former AFL coach and now media commentator Robert Walls was published. The article compares two “young guns”. One is constructed as self-centred, for which he can be forgiven given his “on-ground innocence” and the other “team oriented”.

...To a certain extent he is un-coachable because he acts on amazing impulse and instinct. But Buddy will never captain the Hawks because it's all about me not we. Travis, with a level head and a year of experience will be a future captain. He will take and give more hits and wear more bruises than Buddy. Cloke will be very conscious of creating for his team mates whereas Buddy's team mates will be very conscious of creating for Buddy (Walls 2008).

Here is an extract from the letter I submitted to the Editor on May 7, 2008.

A consistent theme represented in articles celebrating AFL “powerhouse” Lance Franklin is the assertion that though blessed with “natural” talent he is immature, self-centred as well as childlike and therefore a “risky prospect...” Robert Walls writes that: “As exciting as Franklin is there are flaws... he is not overly brave... He will duck his head in marking contests. He doesn't like the unknown...” Whilst the Hawthorn Football Club has made inroads in widening its recruiting policy to include indigenous athletes, demeaning quotes from “insiders” suggest that stereotypes about blacks being natural talents, but hardly leadership material, linger in the assessment of indigenous athletes.

My letter was rejected prompting the following inquiry to the Editor on May 13, 2008.

I have written on numerous occasions to draw attention to racial stereotypes attributed to indigenous athletes in general, but to no avail. As a leading progressive newspaper, I respectfully request that my letter be published as a legitimate and timely response to the tendency in recent newspaper content to unreflectively critique the character of indigenous athletes in particular Lance Franklin... There is an established body of literature in the sociology of race in sport, to which I am a recent contributor, documenting the differentiated roles assigned to black athletes and their misrepresentation within popular media culture....

A summary of my correspondence with the Editor is as follows. I am informed that my letter is too long. I offer to resubmit a shorter version which is accepted, and “processed” for publication but later rejected. The Editor asks me to pen an essay debating the origins of Australian Rules football. I accept. Editorial brief for the commissioned essay was to respond to an essay written by the indigenous athlete Adam Goodes who claimed that indigenous athletes possess a “natural affinity” with Australian Rules (Sheridan 2008).

The sports historian Gillian Hibbins argued that Goodes was “racist” for making such a claim. In my counter, I propose that “natural affinity” could be understood as cultural in origin given that components of Australian Rules are thought to be adopted from the Aboriginal game known as Marn-Grook. My essay is rejected for another written by Harms (2008) who credits a PhD student for “discovering” a reference (cited in my MA thesis, Coram 1999) to a game of football played by Aborigines that pre-dates colonial Victoria.

I am later notified that my letter was passed on to journalists setting off the stinging responses including an irate email from a journalist defending her objectivity to describe Franklin critically. Suffice to say, she lists “Buddy’s” shortcomings as justification and challenges me to deny the truth of her observations. My inquiry to the Editor as to the appropriateness of this drew the following response. “It’s entirely appropriate and normal for journalists to respond directly to their critics. [Journalist] felt you were effectively accusing her of racism, which she found understandably upsetting” (Editor, personal communication, May 16, 2008). Here, criticism of racial discourse is treated the same as an accusation of “racist” intent. My reply to the Editor (May 18, 2008) is as follows.

...Racism is not always a matter of “intent to vilify”, in many respects it is the “ordinary” that few observe except perhaps those on the receiving end, and I don’t doubt that criticisms of Franklin can be rationalised. The crucial difference here is that it seems perfectly okay to denigrate a 21 year old who happens to identify as Aboriginal. As you point out, non-indigenous athletes constructed as ‘bad boys’ are also scrutinised for their character flaws... The difference is that non-indigenous athletes are not subject to social discrimination or exclusion to the same degree as indigenous people, which makes the attention paid to Franklin all the more important.

It is noteworthy that journalistic criticism is reserved for an article published in 2007 in which I examine the depiction of indigenous athletes in media discourse rather than the letter. I was criticized for naming journalists. But, as I explained to the Editor, it is essential to cite authors given the necessity of evidence in academic writing.

My letter also drew a vociferous response in a column. The author clearly read my biographical notes accompanying my letter in which I point out that I am a contributor to debate on racial discourse in sport. This explains his reference to my publication in an international journal (Coram 2007a). And, yes, I was critical of a story of his.

Condemnation of my article, written to an academic audience, took the following truncated form: I am divisive. I am an ideologue, a dangerous fool whom the world must work hard to be rid of. I gaze upon the world from my ivory tower. I am a racial

supremacist who stifles debate. I throw the label ‘racist’ around indiscriminately. I do this to offend. I see nothing wrong in this. My work is specious.

He alludes to the following themes. Racial difference is the measure of equality and inclusion. Biological (race) difference is a cause for celebration (and no longer a cause for derision). Race is immaterial to articles critical of indigenous athletes since the same narratives such as “bad boys” apply to non-indigenous athletes. Racial supremacy (or racism) only exists where there is preferential treatment for a group, to hold that group above criticism, such as indigenous athletes.

---

## ‘Talking in Circles’

In May 2008, Greg Baum’s *Talking in circles as a word loses its meaning* was published. What follows is an edited version of his column.

RACIST has become the put-down of the day, the retort on every lippy lip, the chic insult. It is flung about as freely and indiscriminately as bastard and prick. It has become such a common epithet that it has lost all its meaning. Only obliquely does it connote someone who subscribes blindly to an idea of racial supremacy.

Everyone belongs to a race, so all criticism is in its way racist, and for that matter, all appreciation. Of course, saying so makes me a racist, but it hardly matters.

...[ ] Journalists were assailed for their depiction of Lance Franklin in a paper produced last year by a Monash University academic, Stella Coram. It is a specious work. It chides [ ] for describing Franklin in one article as un-coachable, in another as child-like... It infers stereotyping of indigenous people. It infers racism.

...Colleague [ ] notes that [ ] also has been labeled child-like and [ ] un-coachable. Evidently, Coram saw no problem then. She saw what she wanted to see. But the world does not divide as neatly on the ground as it does when gazed upon from an ivory tower. Anyone who believes in the superiority of one race over another is a dangerous fool, and the world has had to work hard to rid itself of such ideologues.

...Aptitude is fact: Aborigines are more representative on AFL lists than in the population at large by a factor of four or five... No one knows what the word (“racist”) means any more.

---

## Inverting Relations of Dominance

Baum clearly defends his newspaper’s reputation as “anti-racist”. His column however is underscored by hierarchical relations of dominance, a white male journalist and a black female critic. Critical race theorists Omi and Winant (2002) observe that people who identify as black tend to view the centrality of race to society whereas people who identify as white tend to view race as being marginal to society. In this context, we are positioned unequally. Baum has status, authority and privilege, I do not. This is cloaked behind my representation as a threat to social equality and civil society. It is I who invokes race talk and who must therefore be the “racist”. It is I who further invokes the old style ideological demon of racial supremacy in my

attempt to silence free speech. To imply that I write under the banner of political correctness is strategic for allowing Baum to claim the moral high ground.

In a paradoxical twist, it would appear that I am accorded the privilege of being white. This is implied in reference to my presumed occupation of an 'ivory' tower from which I gaze to "neatly divide the world". There is no hint I could be a person of "color". I am not suggesting that had Baum known of my Maori identity he would have been more circumspect in his criticism. It is just that it can be implied he presumes me to be white since it is largely romantic ideologues who suffer from political correctness in seeing something that no longer exists. And, after all, how could a Maori scholar object to good news represented in the depiction of indigenous athleticism?

This suggests telling insight into the discursive boundaries around debate on race and racism. The assertion that "no one knows what the word 'racist' means anymore" seems obtuse when considered in the light that clarity is expressed as to who the "racist" is.

Blocking devices to dismiss me are deployed; counter accusation, reversal, labelling and the limiting of criticisms to pronouncements of aggressive old style ideological racism. I propose additional devices to aid my misrepresentation such as insult and selective reading of my criticisms. It is conceivable that I am vicariously referred to as a "bastard" and a "prick". He could have made his point without resorting to offensive language.

Stigma associated with the perception of being labelled "racist" may explain the ferocity with which critics of race are dealt. That journalists are vociferous in their defence of being colour blind, alludes to the difficulty of engaging in debate in the public domain. There is an uneasy slippage between race consciousness (awareness) in recognising difference and race consciousness to deny difference. It is my contention that journalists attempt to navigate this terrain in unreflective, ambivalent and contradictory ways.

Despite the rising profile and cult status of indigenous athletes, relations of dominance underscored by racial hierarchies remain undeterred in mainstream media discourse. Not surprisingly, it is wrongly implied that I deny journalistic objectivity to celebrate or criticise indigenous athletes and that this is not "racist". This is defended through the assertion that indigenous and non-indigenous athletes are treated the same an example of which is the labelling of non-indigenous "bad-boy" Brendan Fevola, consistent with the depiction of the profile indigenous athlete Lance "Buddy" Franklin, as "childlike". But this ignores racial history in the labelling of indigenous people as "childlike".

A familiar refrain to mark the racial "other", the racial stereotype of blacks as "childlike" is de-historicized within moral equivalence of sameness. The deeper meanings of racial ideology underscored by black cognitive inferiority for example are erased. Franklin is persistently represented as a child whereas Fevola has made a career out of playing the fool. Indeed his antics are read as "good for business" (Perth *Sunday Times* 2008).

Franklin furthermore is described as "un-coachable". This is intended as a compliment explained by his "amazing instincts" (Walls 2008). I am yet to see a similar

depiction for a non-indigenous athlete. In any case, claims of “sameness” are superficial since cultural-racial differentiations in meaning are silenced. The precept “un”, which functions as a racial signifier, performs the role of ambivalence in linking the spaces between the good (tough) and the bad (unpredictable) which in effect cancel out the good (Coram 2007b). “Un-coachable” arguably fits this schema.

---

## Selective Readings

I agree with some of the criticisms leveled at me. The “racist” is flung about indiscriminately but not by me. And I don’t mind too much that indigenous athletes are celebrated so long as “their” difference does not become the explanation for the “good” and or the “bad”. The problem is when criticism of me becomes selective.

To be critical of racial discourse is not the same as to accuse someone of being “racist”. Here, the distance between meanings is collapsed (Coram 2011). In his classic study on the nature of prejudice Allport (1954) defines prejudice as an attitude of favour or disfavour that is related to an over generalised and as such erroneous belief (p. 13). Allport (1954) devised a five point scale of prejudice ranging from antilocution, avoidance and discrimination to physical attack and extermination. Antilocution refers to a majority group making jokes about a minority in which stereotypes, images and speech are seen as harmless. This is not always harmful but may set the basis for more serious forms of prejudice such as avoidance of minorities. Real harm occurs through isolation or exclusion (Allport 1954).

It is implied that if I had my way there would be no reference to the Aboriginality of indigenous athletes which according to journalists is discriminatory and therefore “racist”. I agree in principle that there is nothing wrong with acknowledging the Aboriginality of indigenous athletes even though it would be nice if this was unnecessary. After all, journalists do not describe non-indigenous athletes as “non-indigenous”. My point is that difference is rendered essentialist, fixed. Hence, my concern is not with reference to Aboriginality so much but when explanation is reliant on Aboriginality.

It is implied that I am retentive and need to lighten up, to celebrate and to appreciate indigenous “aptitude”, a welcome variant of black athletic dominance (Coram 2007a). This is consistent with journalistic desire led by Entine (2000) to insist that it is not “racist” to say blacks dominate in sport. However, this ignores individual effort required to become “natural”. Adam Goodes (2010) wrote in a recent essay that the notion of indigenous natural talent takes away from the hard work required to look natural. Moreover, aptitude implies expectation of performance. Indigenous athletes compete under the burden of doing the spectacular. There is no room for being ordinary or unremarkable (Morton 2006).

Aptitude ignores explanatory relevance of social and cultural factors. The recruitment of indigenous athletes to the AFL to perform specific roles reflects racial stereotypes of explosive speed and instinctive play (Hallinan et al. 1999). Aptitude also ignores the creation of indigenous pathways into elite sport (Wilson 2009) and lack of opportunity in other fields. Aptitude is complicated by the reality that some

indigenous athletes do not carry the traits of their people and are able to withhold their racial identity, which begs the question of whether race logics apply to them and if so how.

Aptitude does not take into account that this applies to the “best” and does not address those who do not possess natural talent. Aptitude does not consider that the visibility of indigenous athletes serves to emphasise their athleticism which in turn can distort the realities of non-indigenous athleticism that is not explained by race.

---

## **Conclusion: Deconstructing an Ivory Tower and the Possibilities for Anti-racism**

I agree with some of the criticisms wrongfully attributed to me. I too think that the “racist” is flung about far too indiscriminately. And though I find it cloying to “appreciate indigenous talent”, I agree that this is largely harmless so long as this is not reinterpreted as being different. I have attempted to problematize race with particular emphasis on the contradictory representation of race and racism within sports media discourse through counter story of my experience with an Australian newspaper. I consider my (dis)location as the diasporic ethnic-racial “other” and professional non-belonging to oppose institutional discourse.

The attribution of an ivory tower implies a protective veil behind which to hide. That I do not possess this privilege speaks volumes about the challenges for transforming race and racism. As I have discovered, the politics of privilege determine how debate around race and racism is to be played out as much as the debate itself. In this context, it often becomes the task of the racial “other” to take up the challenge of speaking out, to explain why certain discourses including positively intended ones can be hurtful or unhelpful.

Journalists play an integral role in the development of anti-racism. It is incumbent that they consider the observations of critics not as denouncement but as conversation. Journalistic response to my writing reveals important insight into institutional worldview in and around subjects which with few exceptions make for uncomfortable conversation.

Journalists do not create racial stereotypes. They simply reinscribe what already exists.

Part of the challenge is to disseminate race consciousness as to whether this is an expression of inclusion or exclusion and their implications for decoupling race from racism. At present, race is constructed as a normalising discourse. It is treated as a positive to be championed whereas racism is treated as an abstract, a relict, to be contained within the label the “racist”. Race has become a descriptive. But it is more than that. It is an explanatory category that is marginalised from the centre of critical analysis. Racial discourse is a common language of understanding that is ever present. To deconstruct racial discourse is no easy task, but one that must be pursued.

**Acknowledgement** I wish to express my appreciation to the anonymous reviewer for the encouraging remarks and constructive criticism.

## References

- Allport, G. (1954). *The nature of prejudice*. New York: Perseus Books.
- Baum, G. (2008, May 22). Talking in circles as a word loses its meaning. *The Age*. Retrieved from <http://www.Realfooty.com.au/articles>. Accessed 10 Sept 2008.
- Bell, D. (1992). *Faces at the bottom of the well: The permanence of racism*. New York: Basic Books.
- Blake, M. (2006, May 6). Field of dreaming. *The Age*, 1. Sport.
- Bruce, T., & Hallinan, C. (2006). Cathy freeman: The quest for Australian identity. In D. Andrews & S. Jackson (Eds.), *Sports stars: The cultural politics of sporting celebrity* (pp. 257–270). London: Routledge.
- Butler, J. (2000). Reflections on borderlands and the color line. In S. Geok-Lin Lim, M. Herrera-Sobek & G. Padilla (Eds.), *Power, race, and gender in academe: Strangers in the tower?* (pp. 8–31). New York: Modern Language Association.
- Coram, S. (1999). *Race around the oval: The status of Aborigines in the Australian Football League* (Unpublished masters' thesis). Bundoora: La Trobe University.
- Coram, S. (2007a). Evolutionary hegemony and the “aping” of the indigenous athlete. *International Review for the Sociology of Sport*, 42(4), 391–409.
- Coram, S. (2007b). *The real and the unreal: Hyper narratives of indigenous athletes and the changing significance of race*. Altona: Common Ground.
- Coram, S. (2009). Encountering disregard: The subjective perspective of a disaffiliated racial “other”. *British Journal of Sociology of Education*, 30(3), 275–287.
- Coram, S. (2011). ‘Official’ discourses on race and racism: Inclusion, intent and inversion mediated with journalistic communiqués vis-à-vis the Australian indigenous athlete. *Social Identities*, 17(2), 169–184.
- Entine, J. (2000). *Taboo: Why black athletes dominate sport*. New York: Public Affairs.
- Essed, P. (2002). Everyday racism: A new approach to the study of racism. In P. Essed & D. Goldberg (Eds.), *Race critical theories: Text and context* (pp. 176–194). Oxford: Blackwell.
- Fanon, F. (1967). *The wretched of the earth*. London: Penguin.
- Geok-Lin Lim, S., Herrera-Sobek, M., & Padilla, G. (2000). *Power, race and gender in academe: Strangers in the tower?* New York: The Modern Language Association.
- George, J., & Rodriguez, L. (2009). Hybrid youth identity in the Maori/Pacific diaspora in Australia: A study of urban Polynesian men in Sydney. *New Zealand Sociology*, 24(1), 1–21.
- Goodes, A. (2010, May 19). Stereotypes ignore a lot of hard work. *The Age*. Retrieved from [www.theage.com.au](http://www.theage.com.au). Accessed 20 July 2010.
- Hallinan, C., Bruce, T., & Coram, S. (1999). Up front and beyond the centre line: Australian Aborigines in elite Australian rules football. *International Review for the Sociology of Sport*, 34(4), 369–382.
- Harms, J. (2008, May 24). Bounced out of footy’s history. *The Age*, 3. Insight
- Hoberman, J. (1997). *Darwin’s athletes: How Sport has damaged black America and preserved the myth of race*. Boston: Mifflin.
- Hylton, K. (2005). ‘Race’, sport and leisure: Lessons for critical race theory. *Leisure Studies*, 24(1), 81–98.
- Immigration 2 Australia. Retrieved from [www.immigration2australia.com](http://www.immigration2australia.com). Accessed 4 Oct 2010.
- Jackson, S. (1998). A twist of race: Ben Johnson and the Canadian crisis of racial and national identity. *Sociology of Sport Journal*, 15, 21–40.
- Ladson-Billings, G. (1998). Just what is critical race theory and what’s it doing in a nice field like education? *International Journal of Qualitative Studies in Education*, 11(1), 7–24.
- Ladson-Billings, G. (2003). Lies my teacher still tells me. In G. Ladson-Billings (Ed.), *Critical race theory perspectives on the social studies: The professions, politics and curriculum* (pp. 1–11). Charlotte: Information Age.
- McKay, J. (1995). “Just do it”: Corporate sports slogans and the political economy of enlightened racism. *Discourse: Studies in the Cultural Politics of Education*, 16, 191–199.
- McLeod, J. (2000). *Beginning postcolonialism*. Manchester: Manchester University Press.

- McNamara, L. (2000). Tackling racial hatred: Conciliation, reconciliation and football. *Australian Journal of Human Rights*, 6(2), 5–31.
- Morton, J. (2006, May 17). Culture gets in the way of Aborigines. *The Age*, 17.
- Niall, J. (1999, 5 December). Chance for change. *The Sunday Age*, 12–13.
- Niall, J. (2000, March 5). Aborigines in football: It would be a sorry game without them. *The Sunday Age*, 16–17.
- Omi, M., & Winant, H. (2002). Racial formation. In D. Goldberg & P. Essed (Eds.), *Race critical theories: Text and context* (pp. 123–145). Oxford: Blackwell.
- Perth *Sunday Times* (2008, September 26). Bad boys good for business says brand expert. Retrieved from [www.dailytelegraph.com.au/news/](http://www.dailytelegraph.com.au/news/). Accessed 15 Jan 2009.
- Quayle, E. (2007, May 13). Just buddy minded. *The Sunday Age*, 12–13, Sports.
- Safran, W. (1991). Diasporas in modern societies: Myths of homeland and return. *Diaspora*, 1(1), 83–99.
- Sheridan, N. (2008, May 16). Football's culture wars: Historian tackled. *Real Footy*. Retrieved from <http://www.realfooty.com.au>. Accessed 15 Dec 2008.
- Smith, P. (1993, April 28). League clamps down on racist taunts. *The Age*, 36.
- Smith, J. D. (2002). *Managing white supremacy: Race, politics and citizenship in Jim Crow Virginia*. Chapel Hill: University of North Carolina Press.
- Taylor, P. (2004). *Race: A philosophical introduction*. Cambridge: Polity Press.
- Ty, R., Daniels, C., & Pongo, T. (2010). *And justice for all! The contributions of the African diaspora to the enrichment of critical theory, postcolonial theory and critical race theory*. African and Latino American Leadership Conference, Northern Illinois University, Dekalb. Retrieved from <http://niu.academia.edu/RegTy/papers/269105>. Accessed 6 Dec 2010.
- van Dijk, T. (2002). Denying racism: Elite discourse and racism. In P. Essed & D. Goldberg (Eds.), *Race critical theories: Text and context* (pp. 481–485). Oxford: Blackwell.
- Walls, R. (2008, May 3). Two of a kind. *The Age*, 1, Sport.
- Wilson, C. (2009, 23 May). From little things big things grow. *The Age*, 1 & 4.
- Winitana, M. (2008). Contemporary perceptions of mana wahine Maori in Australia: A diasporic discussion. *MAI Review*, 13(4), 1–8. Retrieved from [www.review.mai.ac.nz](http://www.review.mai.ac.nz). Accessed 14 Nov 2010.



---

# ‘Trouble in the Mall Again’

## Naming as Social Drama in Multicultural Melbourne

Vikki Pollard and Georgina Tsolidis

*‘... an excess of history is harmful to the living man [sic]’*

(Nietzsche, 1874)

---

### Introduction

Melbourne is one of the most ethnically diverse cities in Australia and has a strong association with multiculturalism. It is also renowned for being home to one of the largest Greek populations in the world. The Greek community has many visible markers in the city including a ‘Greek town’. The suburb of Oakleigh, is noted for being a Greek diasporic space. The Greek-identified population is large and long established. The suburb hosts a Greek Orthodox Church and dedicated bilingual day school. There are many shops, cafes and restaurants linked to Greekness. In this chapter we examine a conflict that arose when it was suggested that a mall be renamed after a square in Athens. The ensuing ‘trouble in the mall’ is analysed using Turner’s notion of social drama. We argue that the proposed name change is illustrative of culture as process and as a site of struggle. In this instance we note the invocation of history and how it is used to identify national belonging.

‘Trouble in the mall again is there?’ Thus began a conversation with a council employee about the suggested renaming of a shopping mall in the Melbourne suburb of Oakleigh. This is an evocative comment, which is used to frame this exploration of how the naming of place can inform our understandings about the experiences

---

V. Pollard (✉)

Deaking Learning Futures, Deakin University, Victoria, Australia

e-mail: vikki.pollard@deakin.edu

G. Tsolidis

School of Education and Arts, University of Ballarat, P.O. Box 663,  
Ballarat 3353, Australia

of developing cultural identities within multiculturalism. In this chapter, we aim to present a picture of a struggle to imprint a different form of belonging upon what was an Anglo-Celtic space but, due to policies of multiculturalism, has since developed into what we understand as a diasporic space. These are spaces wherein borders are crossed and belonging is contested (Brah 1996). They are intensely local spaces that have responded to global dynamics and offer examples of the way in which cultural and ethnic differences are negotiated and contested. Through examining a struggle over re-naming a mall, we hope to contribute to the field of literature that argues that local communities and the connections that are made to difference within them are integral to understanding how a nation is faring living with cultural difference (Valetine 2008; Permezel and Duffy 2007; Anthias 2001). We believe Victor Turner's (1980) work on social dramas is useful for exploring how difference impacts upon civic spaces because his method of analysis reveals the tensions and anxieties that underlie culture. It is these tensions that take the pulse of a city and its connections. Our study of the social drama of re-naming the local mall relies upon analysis of the local newspaper.

---

## Difference and the City

The suburb of Oakleigh is a small part of Melbourne, itself a small part of the world. However, it is such small places that can tell big stories about living with difference in a globalised world. In particular, these small places can tell stories in which “issues of cultural and linguistic difference, the dynamics of co-existence, isolation and racism get played out” (Permezel and Duffy 2007, p. 359). In this chapter, we analyse what occurred when it was suggested by a member of the local council that the central mall in Oakleigh change name from the pioneer inspired “Eaton” to one inspired by a mall in Athens, “Omonia”. It was argued that this would reflect the Greekness of Oakleigh. We sum up the resulting tensions by the overheard phrase “Trouble in the mall again”. This type of study is part of a recent trend to understand the city as a place of connections where differences meet and hybrid identities result. But, as Valentine (2008) argues, recent literature that aims to document the practices that contribute to these hybrid identities tends to a “worrying romanticisation of urban encounter and to implicitly reproduce a potentially naïve assumption that contact with ‘others’ necessarily translates into respect for difference” (325). Her work is a consideration of debates around “meaningful contact [...] contact that actually changes values and translates beyond the specifics of the individual moment into a more general positive respect – rather than merely tolerance of – others” (*opcit*). In a similar vein, our work also aims to study contact between groups and we eschew a romantic version of resulting hybridities.

However, unlike Valentine, we cannot offer examples of change towards positive respect as our study of Melbourne as a diasporic space revealed anxiety and tension. By bringing this social drama to the surface, we can examine who is understood as belonging and not belonging in local spaces and analyse the justification used to define and defend this (non)belonging. The ‘anxieties about what constitutes “the community”’ are revealed in such civic negotiations. We cannot offer a way

out from anxiety but we do suggest the continual need to examine local spaces in order to document changing tensions and anxiety. This type of study is aligned with Anthias (2001) who argues that the acid test of hybridity is whether or not the dominant culture changes. Further to this, as we discuss below, the acid test also involves knowing if the inevitable tension that underpins culture is changing.

## Methodology

Tensions and anxieties over the proposed renaming of the mall in Oakleigh were played out most obviously through the pages of local newspapers. It was through newspaper pages that those constituted as the 'natural' residents of the suburb locked horns with those represented as 'new'. In this sense the argument being made here is based on analysis of newspapers. However, in studying the tensions of a small, diasporic space that is suburban Melbourne, we found the work of Victor Turner (1974, 1980) immensely useful. We used his work on social dramas as a structural device to think about one heightened moment in the civic life of Oakleigh. His notion of social drama was useful for several reasons. Firstly, it reveals tensions and dramas amongst various groups. Secondly, it allows a story to be told, in this case, through the reading of local newspapers. Through this 'grass roots' medium the drama associated with the attempt to change the name of the mall was played out through stories told by local residents. Prior to further discussion of this method, we will delineate the elements of Turner's concept of social drama pertinent to our study.

Turner (1974, 1980) argued that social dramas are a processual unit of human life. They occur when a society's cultural symbols and metaphors are challenged from within the community. A social drama could be likened to a story "in that it has discernible inaugural, transitional, and terminal motifs, that is a beginning, a middle, and an end" (149). Social dramas are enacted in a community which is ostensibly harmonious and whose members feel that they share something – a commonality of values, ideals and history. Social dramas breach this commonality. During the drama members of the society become involved and are obliged to put forth opinions, renew and break affiliations, suggest solutions, apply constraints and recognise and respond to claims made by other members of the community. Members are expected to position themselves in relation to the drama. Social dramas make visible the way a society changes and the way that members of that society participate in and feel about cultural change. Turner describes social dramas as "public episodes of tensional irruption" (Turner 1974, p. 33) that bring "fundamental aspects of society, normally overlaid by the customs and habits of daily intercourse, into frightening prominence" (*ibid*: 35). A social drama is marked by four phases: breach, mounting crisis, redress and re-integration and/or permanent schism. During these four phases, the participants transgress cultural norms and then negotiate this trespass with other community members. In doing so, they invoke various types of authority to support their claims.

Here we understand 'the trouble in the mall' as a social drama and history as the cultural invocation used to support conflicting claims of belonging through the naming of place. We track the social drama through newspaper reports and letters to

the editor about the proposed name change. We chose to analyse the drama as it unfolded in newspapers for several reasons. Firstly, not only does the media contribute to shaping reality (Couldry 2002) but the public contributes to the local media. There is a synergy in this that allows insights into discourses as these remain in contention and through this contention shape broader understandings of belonging. In this instance this discursive contestation was particularly obvious because the newspapers involved in the reportage were associated with the 'Oakleigh community' and the 'Greek community' respectively. This division immediately creates two communities, regardless of the fact that the Greeks reside in Oakleigh. The local media was our prime source of data because the media plays a large part in the modern production of social dramas. It is to be expected that the media creates social dramas. Yet this very creation often depends upon the public who, being media savvy, use the opportunity to imprint their view upon the drama. As Turner (1980) argues, "new communicative techniques and media may make possible wholly unprecedented genres of cultural performance and thus new modes of self-understanding" (159). We believe that this drama provides a case study of an immigrant community performing new ways of being Greek-Australian. The media was the main stage on which this was played out. Through analysing papers local to Oakleigh and Greek-Australians in Melbourne, we were able to follow the drama as it was played out in a public arena. This added a different dimension to that which may have been obtained through interviews for example. This was public commentary, made with passion with the intention of swaying opinion in order to impact on the character of lived space.

Newspapers were used by the range of 'players' to convey their position through the conflict. The newspapers produced their own commentary and *vox pops* on the issue. We draw on two newspapers that report on local news, the *Oakleigh Monash Leader* and the *Monash Journal*. The first of these is published by Rupert Murdoch's *News Limited* company it and covered this social drama more extensively than the second newspaper, which is published by another media giant, Fairfax Holdings. Between them, these significant international media conglomerates share the Melbourne media market. In addition, extensive commentary on this social drama was provided by the Greek language newspaper *Neos Kosmos*, a privately owned Melbourne-based, national newspaper. It is published twice weekly in Greek with a weekly English supplement. In this analysis, particular emphasis will be given to letters or articles written by current and former residents of Oakleigh rather than those produced by journalists. These are taken to be the voice of those actively participating in the social drama about the naming of the mall.

---

## The Character of Oakleigh

Oakleigh is located in the south-eastern suburbs of Melbourne, approximately twelve kilometres from the Central Business District. Oakleigh was previously an entrenched working-class suburb. However, it now sits in a middle band of increasingly sought after suburbs, given their relative proximity to the centre of

Melbourne and the size of the housing and land available. Oakleigh was first officially named as a town in early 1857 and as such, is now one of the older suburbs of Melbourne. A railway linking Melbourne to Gippsland, a fertile agricultural and cattle area, has run through Oakleigh since 1879. (A timeline of Oakleigh is available from <http://home.vicnet.net.au/~whsvic/wavhistory.html>.) Until the 1970s Oakleigh had an abattoir, a natural outgrowth of the railway and its link to the cattle grazing area of Gippsland. Reflecting the post Second World War shift away from agriculture towards manufacturing, many factories opened in Oakleigh and its surrounding districts, Huntingdale and Clayton.

Oakleigh's character illustrates the dramatic economic and concomitant demographic shifts that occurred in Australia during this period. The reliance on immigration to build the population necessary for the economic shift away from primary production incorporated a strong element of chain migration. As a result, suburbs became marked as 'ethnic' in various ways. Certain areas were known as Italian, Chinese or Jewish and whilst there were examples of this prior to World War Two, this process was dramatically intensified by the rapidity and volume of post-war immigration.

Greek immigration to Australia was most pronounced in the mid 1960s with most settlement occurring within urban areas of Melbourne. While Italian immigrants remained stronger numerically, the concentration of Greeks within urban areas provided Melbourne with a Greek 'feel'. Oakleigh became an area of high Greek settlement during this period.

Like many other suburbs, Oakleigh's character has changed with subsequent demographic shifts and the increasing gentrification of previously working class suburbs. However, it seems to have defied some of the trends that characterize other suburbs known for their immigrant population, particularly those closer to the Central Business District. Many immigrants who initially populated inner city, working class suburbs, living in what was then cheap and high density housing near factories, moved to far lying, new housing estates illustrative of upward social mobility. Oakleigh is not an inner city suburb and many of the houses and gardens are large enough to support desirable life styles. Possibly this has contributed to the Greek community remaining in the area over many decades. Further to this, the community established a range of social institutions that have functioned to consolidate rather than dissipate the link between Oakleigh and Greekness.

Greekness is part of Oakleigh's cultural landscape. There is a prominent Greek Orthodox church, established in the 1960s by a long-serving and charismatic priest. Originally housed in a weatherboard community hall, aggressive fund-raising by the community established the church as the centre-piece of a range of facilities. Greek language remains central to Greek identity and classes were taught by the priest in the same building that stood in for a church. The desire for culturally appropriate schooling has developed into the largest full-time Greek school in Australia. This caters for almost 800 primary and secondary school students and runs a bilingual programme (OGOC 2007). This school opened in 1983 to meet the needs of the Greek community in the South-Eastern suburbs, which hold about 40 % of Melbourne's Greek-speaking population. Unlike Jewish, Islamic or

Catholic schools, Greek schools most often attract students from the same ethnic background making the link between language, ethnicity, religion and nation of origin very strong.

Many of the businesses in Oakleigh are run by Greek-Australians and their presence is felt more broadly through for example, their sponsorship of the Melbourne Greek radio station, which does a regular outdoor broadcast from Oakleigh. There are several part-time Greek language schools and a soccer club identified with the Greek community. Eaton Mall, the shopping mall which is the subject of this chapter, hosts a number of cafes and *tavernas* run by Greeks, which because of their décor, the food served, music played and the outside tables, are reminiscent of Greece. There is an undisputable Greek feel when you enter Eaton Mall – the smells and sounds, the groups of older Greek men with their moustaches and worry beads and the groups of Greek youth, whose clothing and tans bespeak Greek summer holidaying.

The character of Oakleigh has changed dramatically over some four decades. As its name implies, its heritage was linked to Scotland – a leigh or field of Oaks. It was established around a group of significant buildings – a police station, a school, a library and a football ground. These were situated near a well-tended cemetery and parkland that was more European than indigenous. The Oakleigh post office has been recently transformed and now houses the city's local history collections and the Oakleigh Historical Society. It is a handsome 100-year old building with polished floors and huge windows overlooking the park. On one side of the building is the police station, on the other the local ANZAC shrine and, behind it, the cemetery, half of which was turned into a car park. In some ways it represents the heart of 'old' Oakleigh. It was the woman who tended the desk at this Historical Society who asked, "Trouble in the mall again is there?" when asked for archival material to support the research on which this chapter is based.

---

## The Trouble

You only have to come here [Oakleigh] on a Saturday to see how unbelievable the Greek influence to the area has become. ...If the idea materialises both Greeks and non-Greeks win (Euripidou, *Neos Kosmos*, 2005)

For too long we have been told to subvert Australia's heritage and culture so immigrants do not need to change. (Barry Small, letter, *Oakleigh-Monash Leader*, May 23, 2005, p. 8)

We see too much of Oakleigh being eroded. If you change the name, you change history (Felicity Smith, *Oakleigh-Monash Leader*, May 16th, 2005: p. 1)

The trouble began with a proposal to change the mall's name from Eaton Mall to Omonia Square. The name change was suggested by two local Greek-Australian businessmen who were also involved with local Council politics. The name, Omonia Square, is borrowed from a famous square in the centre of Athens. The heated debate that followed focused on what was perceived as an attempt to subvert Australia's history and culture. The naming of what constitutes history and culture in this way speaks directly and dramatically to the perceived nature of Australianness

and belongingness. The invocation of history has been topical in Australia recently. A number of initiatives taken by the former conservative Government, including the insistence that a particular Australian history needs to be taught in all schools (c.f. Salusinszky 2007), are arguably representative of a politics of exclusion. In this context the renaming of a mall in a multicultural suburb can resonate in significant ways. The proposed name change represents a process of struggle and resistance wherein the invocation of history is made in an attempt to thwart change and to (re)entrench established relations of power.

---

### **'Trouble in the Mall': In Phases**

A social drama has four distinct phases: breach, crisis, re-dressive action and re-integration or schism (Turner 1974, pp. 38–41). These phases provide a useful framework for exploring the mooted name change for the Oakleigh mall. The aim is to examine how this 'trouble' speaks to broader agendas of cultural change. What does this social drama about naming place tell us about how a community understands its identity and history?

---

### **The Breach**

The impetus for change assumes a breach of what has hitherto been 'normal' practice. Such a form of dissidence can involve people who think of their actions as altruistic, that is, representing the interests of a wider group of people (Turner 1974). In the case of the Oakleigh mall, the mooted name change was on behalf of residents of Greek background and the broader community, which was likely to benefit from such an overt sign of the acceptance of multiculturalism. Paul Klisaris, a businessman and local councillor of Greek descent, was quoted as claiming that the name ought to change to reflect the Greek heritage and contribution which is a large part of the area.

He said the name should be "more reflective of the cultural diversity" of the area.

"What we presently have in Oakleigh is a hub of activity," Mr. Klisaris said. "We hope the name will bring more people to the area. You will find a diverse range of businesses will want to set up here. (*Oakleigh Monash Leader*, 16 May 2005 p. 1)

Klisaris and fellow businessman George Euripidou gathered 600 names on a petition to be sent to Monash Council, which covers Oakleigh and surrounding suburbs. These men claimed to be backed by many of traders in the area, some of whom suggested that the change was long overdue. In the same article the President of the Oakleigh Greek Orthodox Community was quoted as saying that the name change would be positive and was 'due recognition' of the contribution made by Greeks to the area (*Oakleigh Monash Leader*, 16 May 2005 p. 1).

In an article in *Neos Kosmos*, (2 June 2006) Euripidou points to the ‘obvious’ Greekness of Oakleigh as a reason for the name change. ‘You only have to come here on a Saturday to see how unbelievable the Greek influence to the area has become’. Klisaris describes how the idea for the name change had been brewing for a couple of years and of the 2,000 signatures in support of the change gathered in 2 weeks. In these two articles the men present themselves as operating on behalf of a large community, which would benefit greatly from the name change it will reflect the population of the area and increase business.

---

## Mounting Crises

The second phase in the social drama is that of ‘mounting crisis’. Unless averted, such crises make it difficult to “pretend that there is nothing rotten in the village” (Turner 1974, p. 39). Turner calls this “a threshold between more or less stable phases of the social process” (*ibid*: 39). In this phase various participants choose a side and “covert antagonisms become visible” (Turner 1980, p. 150). It can be a phase in which the unexpected and deep-rooted hostility which underlies a society, is manifested. It is thus something of a shocking phase as participants hear what is usually silenced. The breach usually widens at this phase unless concerted effort is made to close it down.

The second week of the social drama related to the naming of the mall was marked by the publication of a front page article in *The Oakleigh Monash Leader* (23 May, 2006). The article was titled “Mall name uproar”, which was written in a very large font. The article leads off with the sentence, “A bitter battle has erupted over a bid to rename Oakleigh’s Eaton St. Mall” (p. 1). This establishes the tenor of the piece, which stresses outrage and anger at the attempt to ‘tamper’ with history. A spokesperson for the Oakleigh Historical Society is quoted describing how the move is divisive and works against the efforts of her group ‘to preserve the history that we have’. This view is juxtaposed with that of Klisaris, who draws attention to the support his ‘breach’ has received and his belief that the Historical Society may be ‘scaremongering’. Further to this he argues that the dissidents are ‘adding to the history ...we won’t be destroying it’. Considerations of how history has been invoked in this conflict about naming and through it, belonging, are considered later.

---

## Redressive Action

The third phase of the social drama is characterized by redressive action whereby the potential of the crisis to spread is acknowledged and steps are taken, usually by community leaders, to close the breach. This social drama moved into a redressive phase in the week of 30 May. *The Oakleigh Monash Leader* published a lead article on its front page quoting the Mayor of the City of Monash. He argues that the renaming idea was divisive and that energy could be spent in other ways



promoting the City of Monash as multicultural. He suggests that it may be better to have part of the Antipodes Festival, a Melbourne-based celebration of Greek arts and culture, staged in Oakleigh in acknowledgement of the Greek contribution. The Mayor's statements are a form of redressive action and are strengthened because he is of Greek origin.

## Re-integration or Schism?

The last phase of the social drama is characterised by an attempt at "reintegration of the disturbed social group or of the social recognition and legitimization of irreparable schism between the contesting parties" (Turner 1974, p. 41). In this phase new alliances may be formed that work towards the institution of new norms. In this instance, the then Mayor of Monash is a significant player in the re-integration towards normality. He argues through the newspapers that the proposed name change has little support at the Council level. In the fourth week of the social drama, *The Oakleigh Monash Leader* published the results of a survey of local councillors and reported that almost all of them were against the name change. Klisaris is left with little doubt as to the reception his petition will receive. The petition supporting the proposed name change was dismissed without a viewing.

The alternative Greek voices were effectively temporarily silenced and then, we believe, re-integrated into the local community. The Greek community is strong enough in the area not to be silenced for too long. In the weeks that followed the enactment of the drama, Klisaris turned his attention to securing a long-standing, well-established and large festival for Oakleigh. "Taken aback by the snub, Mr. Klisaris said the proposal would be shelved and support would now be given to the Mayor's plan to bring the Antipodes Festival to Oakleigh" (*The Leader*, 30 May 2006). In a subsequent edition of the newspaper, Mr. Klisaris is reported as saying that such a festival would bring economic benefit to the area and be a 'fitting symbol of the Greek community's place in Australian culture'. It seems that the only way that an official Greek presence can make a dent upon Oakleigh is if there are clear economic benefits. We argue that the dissenting voices have been silenced and then re-integrated into existing social norms. The attempt to make a cultural difference to a local space that would then have an impact upon the transcultural identity of local Greeks seems to have failed. However, the re-integration of the dissenting voices, who in this case happened to be politicians, was successful. Paul Klisaris went on to having two terms as Monash Mayor. Despite his passion on re-naming the mall, the issue did not arise again.

---

## Analysing the Trouble

In this chapter, the 'trouble in the mall' is interpreted through various newspaper commentaries and is taken to be a social drama about belonging in multicultural Melbourne. The multicultural Melbourne community has strong links with a number

of places 'elsewhere' representing the settlement of Australia through various waves of immigration. Yet it is the history linked to British immigration that is taken to be legitimate. When the name change was mooted the local paper set the tone of the debate by arguing that history was about to be tampered with. In this context, history was represented through images of hard-working Englishmen driving a wedge of civilization through untamed bushland. These same men sent their sons to die on the fields of Gallipoli and as such their 'sacred' memory must be preserved in the names they gave to the civilised wedge. Despite not being able to prove that the mall's name 'Eaton' originated from the pioneers, the argument about historical legitimacy gained credence and authority through the prominence given to it by *The Oakleigh Monash Leader*, including through various letters it published.

It was in the second week of the drama, the phase of 'mounting crises' that this evocation of a shared British history was at its height. *The Oakleigh Monash Leader* published ten letters all addressing the drama. The letter from P. Rice's is the longest and is used for the heading of the letters page, "Respect our city's pioneers". Rice writes of the disappointment he/she feels at the lack of respect shown to Oakleigh's history arguing that the attempt to change the mall's name erodes the 'settler' history integral to the area. "The hardworking folk who established Oakleigh [...] were mostly from the British Isles' and these 'hardworkers' named the streets". Rice argues that the name changers seem to forget that it took a lot of trouble to get an outdoor mall in the first place. The Greek presence in Oakleigh is acknowledged with the statement that "Our Greek enclave has wrought huge changes in Oakleigh, much of it welcome". The use of 'our' and 'enclave' conjures a sense not only of paternalism but that the Greeks must learn to keep within certain parameters, parameters clearly overstepped in this instance. Rice finishes by claiming that far from reflecting cultural diversity this suggestion would "remove all diversity".

Another letter reveals much the some sense of longing for a British heritage seen as under threat of extinction. "We strongly object to the renaming of the mall. As we are in Australia, we should retain the English name. So leave it alone, please" (Celle, *The Leader*, 23/05/05: 8). A letter by Ronald W. Millett published in the same issue of *The Oakleigh Monash Leader* was titled 'Sacred memory'. Millet argues that the Eaton Mall is directly linked with the Anglo-Saxon founding fathers of Oakleigh and thus should not be changed. He claims that memory of these men should be 'held sacred' because they fought in Gallipoli. "To even consider a name change is an injustice and even insulting". He recognizes that the Greek community has contributed to the area "but that came much later in more prosperous, settled times" (Millett, *The Leader*, 23/05/05: 8). Together these letters leave the reader with no doubt that Australian history is that which links it to Britain and that this is under threat with the proposed name change.

However, the advocates for the name change also invoked history. Angered that they were being accused of 'eroding' history, they argued that post war migration to Australia is also a legitimate part of history. Paul Klisaris, again in *The Leader* (23, May 2005, p. 1) was quoted as saying that he had not intended to 'erode history' as suggested by the Oakleigh Historical Society. "This group is scaremongering the community into believing we are eroding the community. We are not [...] We will

be adding to the history...we won't be destroying". However, this invocation of history is about power in struggles over culture, it is not about accurate accounts of place and its relationship to time. This is most profoundly illustrated by the fact that the indigenous past of the region was completely silenced by both sides in this debate about history. So while those who identify with British immigration are able to invoke a history as continuously lived, those without such a heritage remain outsiders, reminded of their responsibility to assimilate.

Such debates about the constitution of Australianness are not new. The capacity of social structures to accommodate and illustrate cultural difference remain a litmus test for multiculturalism, itself an arguably benign policy (Tsolidis 2001). However, the social drama of the proposed name change of the Oakleigh mall remains a telling reminder of how entrenched resistance to cultural change can be, even in an instance where the stakes are relatively small. In a place like Oakleigh, why does the adoption of a non-Anglophone name for a place that is already Greek in character raise the ire of so many? Such issues, regardless of actual scope, have great symbolic worth and come to represent a line in the sand between those who belong and those who remain perpetual outsiders – those whose narrative of belonging becomes history and those whose history becomes a narrative of interruption.

The invocation of history is not benign as it is linked to visions of community that reflect contestations about belonging. Those who invoked the pioneers during the social drama of the mall renaming, were unwilling to concede that their view of history had been interrupted by additional narratives. These additional narratives were not granted the gravitas accorded to that named as 'history'. Instead 'history' begins with colonization and belongs to those with a British heritage. The rest becomes part of the fine tapestry of benign multiculturalism, illustrative of what is taken to be the tolerance that is one of the hallmarks of the British heritage that characterises Australianness. So instead of history, the Greek character of Oakleigh is distilled down to an annual exhibition of food and dance, a cosmo-multiculturalism (Hage 1997) driven by consumerism in ways that pose no threat to the stridently monocultural structural underpinnings of Australian society.

---

## Liminal Spaces and the City

Turner's schema of the social drama has been criticized for being utopian. It is structured as a status quo, a breach and eventually a reintegration of those who have breached (Weber 1995, p. 530). We have attempted to focus on the revelation of tensions and anxieties that underpin culture and less on the possibilities for re-integration. In reflecting upon social dramas as a method of social analysis, we have found the emphasis on liminality the most important feature of social dramas. It is not who does or doesn't win but the possibility for change that the drama makes public that is important. Turner's method requires the presence of difference and he calls this presentation of difference, 'liminal'. Similar to Bhabha's in-between spaces, liminality is a precondition for cultural change, which requires a dialogue

between an established culture and something else. A social drama framework focuses upon the communicative acts when norms are challenged, challenges rebuffed and tensions revealed. This framework also demands that liminality is brought to the foreground as researchers attempt to look for moments when the difference of the 'outsider' makes a difference to culture. As Bhabha argues (1994), the focus on difference disrupts any claims for a unified and static culture. A focus on difference highlights "the problem of the ambivalence of cultural authority: the attempt to dominate in the *name* of a cultural supremacy which is itself produced only in the moment of differentiation" (Bhabha 1994, p. 51, emphasis in original). Social dramas challenge cultural authority and seek new forms of culture and, in doing so, reveal tensions and anxieties.

In the case of the Oakleigh mall Greek-Australians were suggesting that different ways of being Greek and Australian are possible. This way was different in that it was more public. The initial suggestion was for the mall shared by the community to become more obviously Greek. It was this presentation of difference from the cultural Anglo-Celtic norm that was a moment of liminality. It is these moments that future research into multiculturalism and connections in the city may attempt to look for. Anthias (2001) argues that such research into cultural identities can be an 'acid test' of the health of an area. This test aims to reveal whether dominant groups are open to cultural change in response to marginal groups.

It could be argued that the acid test of hybridity lies in the response of culturally dominant groups, not only in terms of incorporating (or co-opting) cultural products of marginal and subordinate groups, but in being open to transforming and abandoning some other their own central cultural symbols (Anthias 2001, p. 630).

In Oakleigh it became clear that the dominant groups were unwilling to let go of their cultural symbols. Their narrative of belonging won out. However, the process may be more significant than the outcome. "Such narratives are not given or static, but are emergent, [...] and contain elements of contradiction and struggle" (Anthias 2001, p. 633). Research that looks for liminal moments and the connections that arise from them can help to understand the experiences of multiculturalism and see how tensions and anxieties that underpin culture are changing.

---

## Conclusion

In multicultural Melbourne a relatively benign request to rename a shopping mall illustrates the tensions that surround cultural difference. In a suburb known for its Greek character, a proposal to rename a shopping mall after a square in Athens sparked a heated debate about belonging. This 'trouble in the mall' has been examined here using Turner's framework of social drama. In such dramas, conflict is resolved through reintegration. In this instance, history was invoked as a means of resisting change. An antiquarian view of settler history was privileged in order to link belonging and Britishness (Nietzsche 1983). In this way, history and Britishness were conflated, leaving others bereft of both history and belonging.

It has been examined here as an example of how naming can represent belonging. The performances in the social drama cemented the idea that Australia is a nation of pioneers pestered by strange interlopers who have not yet quite learnt their place. However, it is not so much the end result that we were interested in discovering. Perhaps the end result lies in future research revealing that different tensions underpin culture and that belonging to Australian culture has taken on a substantially different character.

## References

- Anthias, F. (2001). New hybridities, old concepts: The limits of 'culture'. *Ethnic and Racial Studies*, 24, 619–641.
- Bhabha, H. (1994). *The location of culture*. London: Routledge.
- Brah, A. (1996). *Cartographies of diaspora: Contesting identities*. London/New York: Routledge.
- Couldry, N. (2002). Playing for celebrity: Big brother as ritualized event. *Television New Media*, 3, 283–292.
- Hage, G. (1997). At home in the entrails of the west: Multiculturalism, 'ethnic food' and migrant home-building. In H. Grace (Ed.), *Home/world: Space, community and marginality in Sydney's west*. Sydney: Pluto Press.
- Nietzsche, F. (1983). On the uses and disadvantages of history for life (1874). In *Untimely meditations* (trans: Hollingdale, R.J.) (pp. 57–124). London: Cambridge University Press.
- OGOC(Oakleigh Greek Orthodox College). (2007). [http://abalinx.com/ogoc\\_college/index.php?section=213](http://abalinx.com/ogoc_college/index.php?section=213). Accessed 4 Dec 2007.
- Permezel, M., & Duffy, M. (2007). Negotiating the geographies of cultural difference in local communities: Two examples from suburban Melbourne. *Geographical Research*, 45(4), 358–375.
- Salusinszky, I. (2007) PM rewrites Australia's history, 11 Oct 2007. <http://www.news.com.au/story/0,23599,22566964-2,00.html>. Accessed 27 Nov 2007.
- Tsolidis, G. (2001). *Schooling, diaspora and gender – Being feminist and being different*. Buckingham/Philadelphia: Open University Press.
- Turner, V. (1974). *Dramas, fields, and metaphors: Symbolic action in human society*. Ithaca: Cornell University Press.
- Turner, V. (1980). Social dramas and stories about them. *Critical Inquiry*, 7, 141–168.
- Valetine, G. (2008). Living with difference: Reflections on geographies of encounter. *Progress in Human Geography*, 32(3), 323–337.
- Weber, D. (1995). From limen to border: A mediation on the legacy of Victor Turner for American Cultural Studies. *American Quarterly*, 47, 525–536.

---

# Beyond Fear and Towards Hope

## Transnationalism and the Recognition of Rights Across Borders

Peter Gale

---

### Introduction: Crossing Borders

Political discourse, particularly in western nation states over the past decade has been dominated by debates over security and protecting national borders. Angus Roxburgh (2002), in his publication *Preachers of Hate*, focuses on the rise of the far right following the terrorist attacks on the Pentagon and the World Trade Centre in New York and traces the rise of racism and 'Islamphobia' across Europe. Political leaders and parties with an anti-immigration policy platform flourished, such as Jean-Marie Le Pen in France who came second in the presidential election, or the shift to right in mainstream politics through changes in law such as the recent legislation passed by the French parliament with the aim to ban the *burqa* in public spaces (Brown 2010). In Australia, following what was commonly referred to as the 'race riots' in Cronulla in December 2005, there was widespread debate about whether Australia was becoming a nation divided on issues of 'race' (Poynting 2006; Noble 2009). Such debates were compounded by the treatment of Dr. Haneef, an Indian national and at the time a practicing doctor in a Queensland hospital in 2007, and violence against Indian students in Australia during 2009. Dr. Haneef was arrested without charge and later deported following the cancellation of his working visa. Three years after his arrest and detention the Australian Government reached a settlement with Dr. Haneef for wrongly being accused of any involvement in a terrorism attack (Pollard 2010). Similarly, violence against Indian students raised many concerns in India and throughout the Indian diaspora questioning the safety of international students in Australia and other western nation states. Many questioned whether Australian politics had entered a new era, moving away from three

---

P. Gale (✉)

Division of Education, Arts and Social Sciences, David Unaipon College of Indigenous Education and Research, University of South Australia, City West Campus, GPO Box 2471, Adelaide, South Australia 5001, Australia  
e-mail: peter.gale@unisa.edu.au

decades of support by the major political parties for multiculturalism, instigated in the early 1970s. Following the terrorism attacks in New York in 2001 and the London bombings in July 2005, discourse on terrorism has often conflated the notions of Islam and violence. This has been the case most particularly in some sections of the media and political debate, contributing to an increased level of anti-Muslim sentiment and fear of the Other in countries such as Britain, France, and Australia.

Such promulgation of fear and anti-Muslim sentiment in political and media discourse is in stark contrast with the concepts of cosmopolitanism and transnationalism that places an emphasis on diversity and crossing national borders, and more inclusive notions of citizenship and belonging. Transnationalism has been central to the analysis of globalization and migration over the past decade. Here the usefulness of the notion of transnationalism is explored in relation to rights and personal security among students, workers, and their families across national borders. There is a particular focus on the Indian diaspora in Australia in the light of significant growth in international labour in Australia with a significant increase in the number of workers on temporary work visas. There has also been significant growth in the number of Indian students within the higher education sector in Australia and the recent violence against Indian students, and issues associated with the treatment of Dr. Mohamed Haneef contributed to wider debates on immigration and concerns over the level of racism in Australia. This paper examines such debates and explores the need for an ethic of transnationalism to address issues related to the internationalization of education and labour, with the aim of contributing to the recognition and implementation of rights across borders, addressing the rights and personal security of students and workers.

---

## Politics of Fear

Fear has become a feature of contemporary politics in many western nation states such as Australia (Gale 2004). Such fears are commonly seen as being fundamentally based on a politics of 'race'. Following the terrorism in the United States in 2001, the deaths of 88 Australian citizens in Bali in October 2002, and the bombings in the United Kingdom in 2005 there has been an escalation in what can be identified as the politics of fear. Similarly, in the Australian context, most people around Australia, on viewing images of the violence in Cronulla in 2005 and the violence against Indian students in 2009 were shocked and responded to such violence with condemnation. However, the violence was also seen by many as representative of the now well-worn theory of Samuel Huntington on the 'clash of civilisations'. Huntington (1993) argues that the primary fault lines and source of conflict in the new world order relate to a clash of cultures based on the premise that there are fundamental differences between 'Western' and 'non-Western' cultures. This common narrative and belief in an inevitable clash of cultures can be traced back to the emergence of what was first described as new racism, by Barker (1981) and others (Gordon and Klug 1986). It is associated with political leaders like the

British Conservative MP Enoch Powell who in 1968 claimed there would be rivers of blood in the streets if immigration was not halted. In the 1980s, the British Prime Minister Thatcher sought to capitalize on such popular nationalist sentiments and subsequently, governments in the west have drawn on nationalism for political advantage as traditional allegiances to the ideologies of left and right politics have diminished. Frank Furendi (2005) argues that political fear is related to an ideological crisis in politics caused by the end of the traditional political left and right ideologies that have been the defining markers of democracy.

Arguably there is nothing new in the present-day politics of fear. Australian immigration policy reflects a long history of anxiety with Government policies, such as the Immigration Restriction Act of 1901 in Australia, commonly referred to as the White Australia policy. For example, the former Labor Party Premier of Western Australia, Carmen Lawrence (2006), has argued that fear-mongers have significantly influenced the development of public policy in Australia over the past decade. Globalisation has possibly contributed to a rise in the prominence of a politics of fear as Governments seek to respond to the perceived decline of the state and the nation associated with economic liberalisation. Governments can be seen to be responding to such a decline in the level of governance over national economies by placing a greater level of emphasis on issues such as national security, foreign policy, and regulation of national boundaries through immigration controls.

Following the election of the Howard Government in 1996 and the emergence of Pauline Hanson and the One Nation Party, there was a renewed political focus on immigration policy, in particular 'Asian Immigration', in what was then commonly referred to as a 'racism debate' (Gale 2005). The politics of fear has become a significant feature of politics in Australia, reflected in the response of the then Howard Government towards the asylum seekers aboard the Tampa in Australia in August 2001 and the terrorism acts of September 11. The representation of asylum seekers arriving by sea as a national crisis leading up to the 2001 election was an example of wedge politics contributed to the subsequent re-election of the Howard Government. Since 2001, and subsequent acts of terrorism, there has been a heightened level of debate over issues of personal and national security and policies of border protection. Debates on national security and the 'war on terror' have also renewed focus on Australia's role in the region, given its common identification as a predominantly western nation in Asia.

Sayyid (2003) highlights that the political response to terrorism among many western nation states, reproducing the binary discourse between the west and Islamic states. This common binary narrative and associated discourse of a clash of cultures has been fueled by concerns over security and a fear of the Other. This narrative of national security and fear of the Other are often conflated into Islamophobia, particularly in the long shadow of September 11th 2001. However, such fears preceded the terrorism attacks in New York, London and Indonesia, as nationalist political movements such as the British Nationalist Party in England, and other nationalist groups in France, Germany, Austria, Denmark, and Australia commonly associate immigration and globalization as a threat to the nation.



Such fears contrast with what can be seen as a more inclusive discourse of cosmopolitanism. Cosmopolitanism is commonly seen as a progressive humanistic ideal (Skrbis et al. 2004; Calcutt et al. 2009). However, cosmopolitanism is often represented as being incompatible with the rise of populist politics founded on fears of cultural homogenization, or extreme claims of an invasion of the Other. While cosmopolitanism does seek to promote an ethical or moral position of tolerance and openness to cultural diversity and an intolerance of human suffering, it is not incompatible with nationalism and the structure of the nation state and citizenship (Turner 2002). Featherstone (2002) notes that there are and have been many critics of and challenges to cosmopolitanism since September 11, with associated discourses of stronger borders and increased regulation across borders. However, he argues that such challenges are unlikely to be sustained in the face of economic globalization and the flows of migrant workers, along with increased demands for a greater level of social justice on the global stage and more interventions towards global governance (Featherstone 2002).

Through analysis on media reporting and public debates surrounding the treatment of Dr. Haneef and the recent violence against Indian students in Australia, this chapter explores the possibility for an alternative response to racism and exclusive nationalism appealing to cosmopolitanism in the form of ethical transnationalism. As such the paper explores how the internationalization of education, and in particular, the experience of Indian students in Australia may challenge fears associated with globalization and the perceived threat of immigration, to embrace an ethic of transnationalism that seeks to enhance the rights and personal security of international students and transnational workers.

---

## Transnationalism and Diaspora

Transnationalism has been most commonly understood and applied as a descriptive term to explain aspects of globalization that transcend the boundaries and regulatory structures of the nation states. Initially, transnationalism was employed as a concept in relation to the rise of multinational corporations, global finance and banking that crossed national boundaries and barriers, and regulation by the state. However there has been less attention accorded to transnationalism as a notion that is applied to analyze issues associated with the global patterns of emigration and immigration, or the more recent growth in international employment, the movement of students across national borders, and the internationalization of education.

The notion of transnationalism can be employed as a term that describes the increased levels of interconnectedness across national boundaries, as well as at a government policy level. It has the potential to address issues such as personal security and safety of individuals working across borders, international students, ethical dimensions of immigration policy and the internationalization of education. Transnationalism as policy could address the broader issues related to the growing significance of transnational employment, and associated issues of security, citizenship, and rights across national borders.

Diaspora studies have flourished in recent years, highlighting the complexity of the diaspora going beyond discussions on migration and identity. The shape and nature of the diaspora has been transformed by the internationalization of labour and education. For example, the Indian diaspora has grown significantly with the number of non-resident Indians living and working in other countries in recent years, particularly through the growth of an international 'working-class' in contrast with what had previously been seen as a 'brain drain' of skilled workers from emerging economies to developed western nation states. Similarly the number of Indian students undertaking higher education in other countries has also grown substantially over the past decade. The significant growth in the number of Indian students studying in Australia has raised a number of concerns, and in particular, issues of personal security associated with the violence against Indian students in Australia. While there has been significant development in research on diaspora including Indian diaspora, to date such research has predominantly emphasised either the tension between the 'need to adjust' to the culture of the host nation or preserving 'cultural identities' of Indianness, that is, the binary between 'Westernisation' and 'traditional identity'. For example, Bhatia (2008) has explored the Indian diaspora following September 11th 2001 and the tension between acculturation among migrants and adaption to the culture of the host country, and related issues of integration and marginalization. Research has sought to address questions on the relationship between the diaspora and the 'homeland', and the nature of the relationship between the 'hostland' and 'homeland'. This is illustrated by Paranjape (2004) who critiques representations of the diaspora, going beyond acculturation and adaption to explore 'racialised' identities within diasporic communities and representations of Indianness beyond territory to include India as both mind and spirit. Similarly, research on the Indian diaspora has also focused on an exploration of the notion of 'Indianness' and newly formed identities among first and second generation migrants. For example, Safran et al. (2008) explore the experiences of migrants and the tension between adjusting to their new culture and attempts to preserve their cultural identity as part of the Indian diaspora.

Other research has focused on the role of religion, or the notion of 'race' and assimilation and adaption in the 'hostland', or issues of language retention and identity, and the significance of class for diaspora. For example, Radhakrishnan (2008) examines the growing "Global" Indian middle class and the increasing transnational interaction between USA and India, through a case study of the Silicon Valley and Bangalore. In a study based on the Indian diaspora in Canada, Sharma (2004, pp. 111, 113) explores "...the role of the Indian diaspora in mediating between India and the world" and the concept of 'Cosmopolitan citizenship' for going beyond an individual's obligations to a particular state, and a shift towards creating world order based on a 'shared vision' and certain 'core values'. For Sharma (2004) the challenge for a transnational world is in part acknowledging the limits of the nation state, while noting the role of the nation state in minimizing conflict and violence. However there has been very limited research on the impact of the increased level of interconnectedness between nations through both education and transnational labour, or the increased levels of communication across borders through the media, including interpersonal communication within the new media.

A transnational approach to researching diasporas can shed light on broader issues such as the place of diaspora in global and economic development, and exploring the significance of 'transnational relations' on issues such as security and international law. Similarly, transnationalism can be employed as a descriptive term for the study of diaspora, noting the complexities of class, gender, ethnicity, or issues of health and ageing and transnational families. Such analysis seeks to go beyond single dimensional analysis of binaries such as 'Westernisation' and 'traditional identity', or marginalization and integration that are commonly associated with studies of diasporic communities and identities. Adamson and Demetriou (2007) explore the implications of diaspora for international relations and the discontinuity between a territorialised state system and deterritorialised practices of collective identities. More recently, Clark (2009) also explored nation-state belonging and transnationalism among members of diaspora living between the local and the global, employing the term 'glocalization' to describe a transnational post-ethnicity cosmopolitan ideal.

Building on Clark's exploration of diaspora and transnationalism, as discussed above this paper adopts the concept of an ethic of transnationalism in a critique of the political debate and media reportage of the arrest and detention of Dr. Haneef in 2007, and violence against Indian students in Australia in 2009. The following section provides an analysis of media reporting through Australian newspaper reports on these two events with the aim of exploring the contrasting narratives of nationalism that frame the media commentary and public debate.

---

## Methodology

The analysis provided in this paper draws mainly but not exclusively from newspaper reportage through the *Newsbank* newspaper database. Articles were selected based on key words including 'India', Dr. Haneef, students, and other terms such as terrorism, violence, and racism. *Newsbank* includes the major daily high circulation national newspapers such as *The Australian*, *The Sydney Morning Herald*, and the *The Age*, as well as the daily state based newspapers such as the *Herald Sun*, *The Advertiser*, the *Courier Mail*, and the *Hobart Mercury*. The research employs critical discourse analysis, placing an emphasis on particular metaphors that form the basis of contrasting ideological perspectives. While texts do not have a fixed meaning the analysis sought to identify the contrasting themes based on the structure of an article, consisting of the headline, lead, the main body of the text and the concluding comments. The generic structure illustrates the way a newspaper seeks to present a particular perspective or persuade the reader as well as the provision of information. While the genre of news reporting often presents what is perceived as two sides of a debate, the way in which this debate is framed with headlines, lead sentences and concluding comments suggests that this reporter may have a clearly preferred position on the issue under discussion (Fairclough 1995). Media discourse can also include apparent disparities even within an article or newspaper. For example, inflammatory headlines can sometimes conflict significantly with more considered

editorials; as headlines are often based on a perceived audience demand for stimulating and exciting news as a form of entertainment, nevertheless such headlines often create a narrative of crisis. Similarly, conflict and controversy are also seen as newsworthy, while news reportage also reproduces ideological or cultural consensus through what is included or omitted. As such, news reportage reproduces normative principles that construct symbolic national and cultural boundaries of inclusion and exclusion, or even the normalization of violence.

The two significant news events in Australia, which are the focus of this paper, occurred under the Howard Liberal Government and the Rudd Labor Government. This provides an opportunity to contrast media reportage on Dr. Haneef under the Howard Government, and the violence against Indian students under the then Rudd Labor Government, while also noting that the framing of the reporting on both events is significantly influenced by previous news media on terrorism and issues of national security. This reportage often draws links between Islam and violence, contributing to a level of anti-Muslim sentiment following 11 September in some sections of the media. During the years following the terrorism attacks in the US on 11 September 2001 there was a renewed focus on people of 'middle eastern appearance', and anti-Muslim sentiment has been heightened through such media reportage in Australia. This was fuelled by the common conflation of asylum seekers and terrorism in debates on both immigration and border security, and Islam being associated with people of 'middle eastern appearance'. Poynting and Mason (2007) highlight that there has been an intensification of anti-Muslim sentiment since 11 September 2001 in western nation states such as Australia.

The Haneef case can also be seen as another example of the politics of fear surrounding what is identified as the crisis in national security. In 2007 over 3,000 articles were published on the arrest and detention of Dr. Haneef in the 20 Australian based national and regional newspapers within the *Newsbank* database. Similarly, there was extensive newspaper coverage of the violence against Indian students in 2009, though this issue was not as prominent as the events surrounding Dr. Haneef. Nonetheless, what was reported as 'racial' violence against Indian students received significant media attention in national and regional newspapers with over 500 articles published during 2009 and a further 430 articles in 2010, based on the national and regional newspapers included in Australia, such as *The Australian*, *The Sydney Morning Herald*, *The Age*, the *Herald Sun*, as well as regional papers such as the *NT News*, *The Advertiser*, *Brisbane News*, *Courier Mail*, and *Hobart Mercury*. The analysis focused on the ways in which the reporting on Dr. Haneef and the violence against Indian students is indicative of, and illustrates the tension between the underlying notion of nationalism on the one hand, and ideas and values associated with the concept of cosmopolitanism on the other.

There were two main themes running through the media debates surrounding both events. The first can be described as a national panic over issues of security and associated debates over immigration policy. This theme is illustrated most prominently through headlines such as "He could still be a terrorist, says PM" (Coorey 2007, p. 1), published on page one of the *Sydney Morning Herald*, or Doctor thought to be al-Qaeda 'sleeper' (Kent 2007, p. 7). Similarly, "Haneef linked

to al-Qaeda – Allegations in Indian police dossier” (McPhedran and Rehn 2007, p. 2), published in the *Daily Telegraph*, and “Andrews dishes dirt on Haneef” (Franklin et al. 2007, p. 1) illustrate the theme of national panic. The second theme running through the media reporting on both Dr. Haneef and the subsequent violence against Indian students is one that can be identified as that of moral outrage over racism in contemporary Australia. This theme is illustrated through headlines such as “Haneef’s tears for baby he is yet to meet” (Marriner, and Dhillon 2007, p. 1) published on page one of the *Sydney Morning Herald*, and Farewell, Dr. Mohame Haneef, from the land of the ‘fair go’ – The Haneef fiasco (Koutsoukis 2007, p. 1). This theme is also illustrated in similar headlines such as “India demands Haneef detail” (Wright et al. 2007, p. 1), and “Haneef to fight detention – bailed Indian doctor remain locked up on character grounds, says Immigration Minister” (Smiles 2007, p. 1). The first theme clearly framed the debate within what was seen as being in the national interest and nationalism. This was reflective of debates on immigration, and in particular ‘Asian immigration’ during the late 1990s. Similarly, this theme reflects the main features of political debate on national security that followed the attacks on New York in 2001 and the Bali bombing that killed 202 people, including 88 Australians in 2002 (Gale 2005).

The second major theme of moral outrage is based on the representation of racism as unacceptable, and the perception of racism as underlying the events surrounding both Dr. Haneef, and more particularly the violence against Indian students. Such outrage was founded on the common representation of ‘racial-violence’ being un-Australian, and Australia being perceived as a multicultural tolerant nation. Significantly, a feature of the media reporting on the violence against Indian students was framed within what is seen as universal human rights, and what is represented as acceptable behavior within liberal democratic nation states such as Australia with no tolerance for racism or racial violence. The moral outrage can be seen as reflective of the ideas and values associated with the notion of cosmopolitanism, as a shared ethic of human rights that crosses national boundaries and ethnicity.

While the research for this paper did not aim to contrast the two events, the analysis did reflect a significant difference in the reporting on the arrest and treatment of Dr. Mohamed Haneef in 2007 and the violence against Indian students reported later. Dr. Haneef’s arrest was instigated by the then Howard Government, whereas the violence against the Indian students was condemned and stridently opposed by the then Rudd Labor Government. The Haneef case began with the arrest of Dr. Mohamed Haneef at the Brisbane airport on July 2nd 2007 and the decision of the Federal Court on the 21st August to overturn the government’s decision on the suspension of Dr. Haneef’s visa. The media reporting on Dr. Haneef was similar to what had been reported previously, during the first 10 years of the Howard Government and focused around the level of racism in Australia. There were daily articles published on what was perceived as a ‘racism debate’ in Australia associated with the popularity of independent member of parliament, Pauline Hanson during the late 1990s with what was also seen as an increased level of racism and opposition to Asian immigration. This contrasts significantly with media reportage

on violence against Indian students that focused predominantly on the issue of racism and any 'racial' motivation for the attacks. While the then Rudd Government sought to deny or downplay any connection with racism in Australia, the media reportage overwhelmingly represented the attacks on Indian students as opportunistic rather than racist (Porter 2009; Tovey and Elliot 2009). This contrasted significantly with media reportage in India that placed an emphasis on claims made by many Indian students that the violence involved racism and that racism was a significant issue in contemporary Australia (Dunn 2009; Whinnett 2009). Nevertheless, Government representatives including the then Prime Minister Kevin Rudd were clearly positioning the debate as one of personal security of students and sought to both condemn racial violence and represent Australia as a tolerant society.

Media reporting on violence against Indian students in Australia under the then Rudd Labor Government continued to focus on debates on whether Australia is a racist country and if so the level of racism (Alexander 2009). However, in reports on the violence against Indian students the Rudd Government was strident in its condemnation of 'racial' violence. While many media reports, particularly newspaper reporting in India, represented the violence as a form of overt racism, such racism was seen as the result of a small minority of individuals motivated by prejudice. However there was very little attention in political debate or media reportage accorded to the level of growth in international student numbers associated with changes in immigration policy, and the growth of transnational labour associated with the increased number of work visas in Australia. While Poster and Wilson (2008) highlights the growth in transnational labour and labour market inequality, he also notes the need to explore "...the role of the nation in the process of race, class, and gender labor hierarchies." Similarly, there has been significant academic attention focusing on the growth of diaspora over the past 30 years, such as the growth in the Indian diaspora to over 20 million people throughout several continents over the past three decades (Safran et al. 2008). However there has been less emphasis on either issues of racism or the working conditions and associated rights or transnational labour.

In Asia, particularly India, most reportage on Australia in 2009 related to violence against Indian students. Even with assurances of Australia being a safe destination for students from the then Prime Minister, Kevin Rudd, and condemnation of any form of violence against students in Australia, the common theme in the reporting in India continued to focus on racism in Australia. Putting aside the justification of such claims of racism, the Government responses were framed by previous media reporting on Australia in India over the past decade that predominantly focused on the recurring racism. Such reporting began soon after the election of Howard Government in 1996 and the rise of popular nationalism associated with Pauline Hanson and the One Nation Party during the late 1990s.

Similarly, much of the focus of the media reporting in India raised questions and concerns over changes in the immigration policy, and the perceived shift in policy away from multiculturalism. Clarke highlights the intersection between domestic politics and foreign policy leading up to the 2007 federal election that illustrated the politicization of the 'Haneef affair' (Clarke 2008). The long term implications of

such a politics raises further questions on how the reporting on racism in Australia affects political, economic and cultural relations between Australian and Asian nations.

Based on the analysis of media reporting on both the events surrounding Dr. Mohamed Haneef under the previous Howard Government and the incidence of violence against Indian students in Australia under the current Labor Government, it can be concluded that the ongoing reporting on issues of racism in Australia has a significant impact on not just the number of students who apply and come to Australia, but also relations between India and Australia. The rights of international students and workers are an issue that must be addressed in Australia, and in all nations, and this is an issue not only for governments and political leaders but also for the business sector, law enforcement agencies, the tourism industry, and for Australian universities. The latter, being part of a growing internationalisation of education that also needs to address issues related to cultural and linguistic difference, and effective delivery of education and related issues of cultural competency in education, as well as the exchange of knowledge going beyond a notion of education and knowledge as a commodity of trade.

Australia does have a long history of cultural diversity, even acknowledging the impact of the Immigration Restriction Act introduced in 1901, and a policy of assimilation that remained in place up to the 1970s, nevertheless as a linguistically and culturally diverse country in a culturally diverse region, Australia is well positioned to be economically and politically engaged with other nations in the region. However, what can be concluded from the analysis of media reportage surrounding the violence against Indian students is that Australia is not perceived as embracing cultural diversity in ways that enhance its relationships in this region. This requires a politics of inclusion rather than exclusion, and policies and practices that mark Australia as being part of Asia. Such policies can be identified as an ethic of transnationalism, policies that are not only seen to be of benefit to Australia but also in the interests of the growing number of non-citizens living in Australia as either students or workers.

The notion of productive diversity was first identified as one of the benefits of multiculturalism during the early 1990s. However, the reporting of recent violence against Indian students was more concerned with a perceived threat to tourism or a decrease in the number of international students coming to Australia. The perceived threat to this trade was a recurring theme associated with concerns over racism and intolerance, being viewed as a threat to Australia's economic interests. However, reporting on Australia in Asia over the past decade represented the Howard Government as being more concerned with domestic political issues, and being seen to have a hard line policy on 'boat people' (asylum seekers arriving by sea), rather than distancing itself from past exclusive 'white Australia' immigration policies.

While the current Labor Government has sought to shift the policy on the mandatory detention of asylum seekers and end the policy of Temporary Protection Visas, representations of Australia, internationally, continues to be one that is associated with racism and the recent violence against Indian students in Australia that has been seen as yet another chapter in a long history of racism. Such representations are also framed within recent history of political debates on 'Asian immigration'

and associated questions of racism in Australia. What can be concluded from more recent media reporting in India on violence against Indian students in Australia is that racism is seen as a primary factor in the number of incidences of violence.

What can be concluded from the analysis of the media reporting on the treatment of Dr. Haneef, and violence against Indian students in Australia, is that it is indicative of the tension within contemporary narratives on popular nationalism on the one hand and concerns for more inclusive cosmopolitanism on the other. The following section seeks to address this issue through exploring the notion of transnationalism as a possible policy response that not only addresses perceptions of Australia in India and internationally more broadly but also seeks to address the experiences of Indian students in Australia and some of the underlying issues that are closely connected to this experience and the rights of the growing number of students from India and a range of countries who are studying or working in Australia.

---

## Multiculturalism and Cosmopolitanism

There has been significant debate on the rise of multiculturalism as policy and cosmopolitanism more generally in many nation states such as Australia, Canada and Britain. In his recent analysis of cosmopolitanism, Holton on the one hand highlights the contrasting definitions of multiculturalism from melting pot notions of assimilation through to expressions of separatism, or a more integrative celebration of cultural difference, while on the other he traces the conceptual shift from multiculturalism to cosmopolitanism (Holton 2009). The Australian experience in the rise and decline of multiculturalism is reflective of many predominantly western democratic nation states. In the Australian experience, the introduction and implementation of the policy of multiculturalism by the Whitlam Government from the early 1970s can be seen as a significant turning point in social policy, and also as representing a significant shift in national identity. Under this policy the long held restrictive immigration policy, commonly referred to as the white Australia policy came to an end, but more importantly the shift in policy also heralded a new era in Australian national identity that was no longer one founded on links with Britain but acknowledged the cultural and linguistic diversity within Australia. Similarly, the commitment of the Keating Government towards engagement in Asia and a movement towards Australia being an Asia Pacific country also reaffirmed the imagined community of Australian multiculturalism to reflect the cultural diversity of the population and the location in the region. While there were policy differences between the Fraser and Hawke Governments during the late 1970s and through the 1980s there was also a significant level of bi-partisan agreement on both immigration policy and multiculturalism between 1972 and 1996. However, during the late 1990s it appeared that Australian policy on immigration was returning to what was seen as a more restrictive 'White Australia' policy and away from multiculturalism and in particular, a rejection of public debates on what had been seen as the Asianisation of Australia (Fitzgerald 1997).



In many ways this was reflective of what has been seen as a shift in political discourse more broadly away from ideologies of the traditional political left and right as a major sphere of influence in Australian political life, as the politics of popular nationalism and identity politics takes on a greater level of significance. For many commentators, such as Lawence (2006) and Poynting and Mason (2007), a more dominant influence in contemporary Australia is seen as the politics of perception as it is played out in opinion polls and the electoral cycles. While also being influenced by leadership styles, the degree to which the major political parties have become poll driven is often seen as reflecting the decline of the nation state in an era of globalization and deregulation rather than being driven by political ideologies and vision.

The shift in policy away from multiculturalism following the election of the Howard government in 1996, and more particularly, since September 11th 2001, associated with an emphasis on national security in Australia has also had a significant impact on relations with countries in Asia, including India. The media reporting on Australia in Asia, and in particular in India, surrounding both the Dr. Mohamed Haneef case and the subsequent reporting on violence against Indian students in Australia is reflective and indicative of this recent shift in both policy and domestic politics in Australia. Such reporting on Australia in Asia is shaped by recent events but also the long history associated with the 'White Australia' policy, or more specifically the immigration restriction act since 1901, as well as the more recent 'racism debate' and demise of multiculturalism towards what is often seen from outside Australia as a shift towards a society with 'racial' undercurrents and a multicultural facade.

---

## **Conclusion: Towards an Ethic of Transnationalism**

In the analysis of diaspora, Ramji (2006, p. 646) notes that transnationalism has taken on a greater level of significance as many within diaspora do not replace identity of homeland with a new one as individuals develop a sense of a transnational identity that "crosses multiple national borders." However the concept of transnationalism is one that encompasses more than identity as it is able to also include ongoing economic, political, social and cultural associations across national borders, with continued connections between homeland and the new hostland within diaspora (Blunt 2007; Vertovec 2001). The concept of transnationalism can also highlight the increased movement between homeland and hostland as immigration is no longer seen as a permanent resettlement. With the emergence of transnational families, as was the case for Dr. Haneef living and working in Australia with his wife and child living in India there is an increased need for an ethic of transnationalism that incorporates the rights and security of international students and workers. Similarly, many students in Australia may also be seeking permanent residency status in Australia while others may seek to work and study for a significant period of time but with the intention of returning to India. Traditionally, immigration has been seen very much in a singular one dimensional way, as migrants seek to integrate and

adapt to their new homeland, whereas much of the research on diaspora indicates that the diasporic communities are far from a narrative of migration and settlement.

Transnationalism as policy can be seen as a way of going beyond domestic political concerns, while adopting aspects of multiculturalism, but also including and addressing the concerns of temporary residents and relations between nations and across national borders. This may include aspects of international law, issues associated with temporary citizenship, and very tangible aspects of economic security, health, education, and employment, as well as issues confronting transnational families such as aged care for family members and caring for children and shared custody of children across national boundaries. Links between homeland and hostland continue to be an important aspect of diaspora, and returning to homeland continues to be a significant aspect of diaspora studies. However, the notion of transnationalism is able to highlight the complexity and diversity of issues confronting the Indian diaspora in Australia, and diaspora more generally. Transnationalism as policy could also begin to address the economic, legal, social and cultural complexities confronting transnational families.

Transnationalism as policy for nation state Governments, and between Governments, can embrace the ongoing connections across borders to the mutual benefit of both home and host nations and transnational individuals and their families. Addressing racism and discrimination is just one aspect of a policy of transnationalism, while the growing transnational population also raises a wide range of other issues that cross national borders. For example, issues involving the shared parenting of children across national borders, or the care of elderly parents. Similarly, legal issues involving property title, access to health care, and human rights within the legal system are just some of the issues confronting many workers and students across national boundaries. Transnationalism as policy is founded on what can be identified as an ethic of transnationalism, similar to what is identified as shared values within cosmopolitanism. This can be seen as an ethic of inclusion in contrast with what is often seen as a politics of fear that has been associated with exclusive expressions of nationalism.

While there has been much written and researched on both diaspora and cosmopolitanism over the past decade this chapter has sought to explore ways to address the issues and concerns that are highlighted in political debate and media reporting on the treatment of Dr. Haneef and the violence against Indian students in Australia and the implications for other western nation states. While acknowledging issues of identity and culture within research on migration and diaspora, the notion of transnationalism can facilitate broader debates on the rights of transnational individuals and families. Media reporting and political debates surrounding the treatment of Dr. Haneef in Australia and the violence against Indian students has highlighted the contrasting narratives of nationalism and cosmopolitanism. However, what can be concluded from this analysis is that the two need not be mutually exclusive and the notion of transnationalism is able to embrace both the ongoing desires and associated loyalties of nationalism while also embracing shared values and rights across national borders. An ethic of transnationalism is able to address the concerns of

international students and workers and temporary residency and incorporates the issues of individual security and safety experienced by Indian students and other temporary residents in host nations such as Australia.

The rapid growth in the number of international students has contributed to a heightening of concerns over the safety and security among students studying in Australia, along with workers on temporary residency visas. This research illustrates the need for a greater level of emphasis on the rights of temporary citizens and issues associated with the growing transnational labour market. There is a need for increased dialogue between nation states addressing the concerns and rights of transnational workers and the personal security of international students and their families. It is argued that an ethic of transnationalism that encompasses rights and issues of security could also address issues confronting transnational families, and the need for increased inter-government relations that incorporates the rights of students, workers, and their families.

---

## References

- Adamson, F., & Demetriou, M. (2007). Remapping the boundaries of 'State' and 'National Identity': Incorporating diasporas into IR theorizing'. *European Journal of International Relations*, 13(4), 289–526.
- Barker, M. (1981). *The new racism: Conservatives and the ideology of the tribe*. London: Junction Books.
- Bhatia, S. (2008). 9/11 and the Indian diaspora: Narratives of race, place and immigrant identity. *Journal of Intercultural Studies*, 29(1), 21–39.
- Blunt, A. (2007). Cultural geographies of migration: Mobility, transnationality and diaspora. *Progress in Human Geography*, 31(5), 684–694.
- Calcutt, L., Woodward, I., & Skrbis, Z. (2009). Conceptualizing otherness: An exploration of the cosmopolitan schema. *Journal of Sociology*, 45(2), 169–186.
- Clark, J. (2009). Nation-state belonging among Asian Australian and the question of transnationalism'. *Current Sociology*, 57(1), 27–46.
- Clarke, M. (2008). Issues in Australian foreign policy. *Australian Journal of Politics and History*, 54(2), 271–288. doi:10.1111/j.1467-8497.2008.00498.x.
- Fairclough, N. (1995). *Media discourse*. London/New York: Edward Arnold.
- Featherstone, M. (2002). Cosmopolis: An introduction. *Theory, Culture & Society*, 19(1–2), 1–16.
- FitzGerald, S. (1997). *Is Australia an Asian country?* St Leonards: Allen & Unwin.
- Furedi, F. (2005). *Politics of fear: Beyond left and right*. London: Continuum.
- Gale, P. (2004). Refugee crisis and fear: Populist politics and media discourse. *Australian Journal of Sociology*, 40(4), 321–340.
- Gale, P. (2005). *The politics of fear: Lighting the wik*. Sydney: Pearson Education.
- Gordon, P., & Klug, F. (1986). *New right, new racism* (pp. 13–23). London: Searchlight.
- Holton, R. (2009). *Cosmopolitanism: New thinking and new directions*. Hampshire: Palgrave Macmillan.
- Huntington, S. (1993). The clash of civilizations? *Foreign Affairs*, 72(3), 22–49.
- Lawence, C. (2006). *Fear and politics*. Melbourne: Scribe.
- Noble, G. (2009). *Lines in the sand: The Cronulla riots, multiculturalism and national belonging*. Sydney: Institute of Criminology Press.
- Paranjape, M. (2004). Interrogating diasporic creativity: The Patan initiative. In A. Pal (Ed.), T. Chakrabarti (Co. Ed.), *Theorizing and critiquing Indian diaspora* (pp. 42–73). New Delhi: Creative.

- Poster, W., & Wilson, G. (2008). Introduction: Race, class, and gender in transnational labor inequality. *American Behavioral Scientist*, 52(3), 295–306. doi:10.1177/0002764208323508.
- Poynting, S. (2006). What caused the Cronulla riot? *Race and Class*, 48(85), 85–92.
- Poynting, S., & Mason, V. (2007). The resistible rise of Islamophobia: Anti-Muslim racism in the UK and Australia before 11 September 2001. *Journal of Sociology*, 43(1), 61–86.
- Radhakrishnan, S. (2008). Examining the “global” Indian middle class: Gender and culture in the Silicon valley/Bangalore circuit. *Journal of Intercultural Studies*, 29(1), 7–20.
- Ramji, H. (2006). British Indians ‘returning home’: An exploration of transnational belongings. *Sociology*, 40(4), 646.
- Roxburgh, A. (2002). *Preachers of hate: The rise of the far right*. London: Gibson Square.
- Safran, W., Sahoo, A. K., & Lal, B. V. (2008). Indian diaspora in transnational contexts: Introduction. *Journal of Intercultural Studies*, 29(1), 1–5.
- Sayyid, S. (2003). *A fundamental fear: Eurocentrism and the emergence of Islamism*. London: Zed Book.
- Sharma, K. (2004). Dual citizenship in a transnational world: Canada and India. In A. Pal (Ed.), T. Chakrabarti (Co Ed.), *Theorizing and Critiquing Indian Diaspora* (pp. 99–116). New Delhi: Creative
- Skrbis, Z., Kendall, G., & Woodward, I. (2004). Investigating the idea of cosmopolitan openness: Strategies, repertoires and practices. *The Sociological Review*, 55(4), 730–747.
- Turner, B. (2002). Sovereignty and emergency: Political theology, Islam and American conservatism. *Theory, Culture & Society*, 19(4), 103–119.
- Vertovec, S. (2001). Conceiving and researching transnationalism. *Ethnic and Racial Studies*, 22(2), 447–462.

## Newspapers

- Alexander, H. (2009). Crime, not racism: Indians rally against attacks. *Sydney Morning Herald*, 2, 8 June.
- Brown, R. (2010). French MPs vote to ban the burka. *ABC News*, 14 July, <http://www.abc.net.au/news/stories/2010/07/14/2952787.htm>. Accessed 15 July 2010.
- Coorey, P. (2007). He could still be a terrorist, says PM. *Sydney Morning Herald*, 1, 31 July.
- Dunn, M. (2009). Violence hits us for six – Indian trade disaster. *Herald Sun*, 16, 29 October.
- Franklin, M., Loudon, B., & Thomas, H. (2007). Andrews dishes dirt on Haneef. *The Australian*, 1, 1 August.
- Kent, P. (2007). Doctor thought to be al-Qaeda ‘ sleeper’. *Courier Mail*, 7, 5 July.
- Koutsoukis, J. (2007). Farewell, Dr. Mohame Haneef, from the land of the ‘fair go’ – The Haneef fiasco. *Sunday Age*, 1, 29 July.
- Marriner, C., & Dhillon, A. (2007). Haneef’s tears for baby he is yet to meet. *Sydney Morning Herald*, 1, 25 July.
- McPhedran, I., & Rehn, A. (2007). Haneef linked to al-Qaeda – Allegations in Indian police dossier. *Daily Telegraph*, 2, 2 August.
- Pollard, E. (2010). Haneef wins ‘substantial’ compensation settlement. *ABC News*, 21 Dec, <http://www.abc.net.au/news/stories/2010/12/21/3098769.htm>. Accessed 22 December.
- Porter, L. (2009). ‘Street violence to blame, not racism’. *The Age*, 3, 14 June.
- Smiles, S. (2007). Haneef to fight detention – Bailed Indian doctor remain locked up on character grounds, says Immigration Minister. *The Age*, 1, 17 July.
- Totaro, P. (2011). First arrests as France bans burqa. *Sydney Morning Herald*, 12 Apr, <http://www.smh.com.au/world/first-arrests-as-france-bans-burqa-20110412-1dcbg.html>. Accessed 20 May 2011.
- Tovey, J., & Elliot, T. (2009). Students are targets but not victims. *Sydney Morning Herald*, 5, 3 June.
- Whinnett, E. (2009). Big rise in attacks on Indians. *Sunday Herald Sun*, 11, 4 January.
- Wright, T., Nicholson, B., Dhillon, A., & Gibson, J. (2007). India demands Haneef detail. *The Age*, 1, 18 July.

---

## **Part III**

# **Sexualised Identifications**

---

# Pedagogies of the Japanese Diaspora

## Racialization and Sexualization in Australia

Julie Matthews and Yuriko Nagata

---

### Introduction

The Japanese diaspora in Australia is gendered, raced and involves disjunctive histories of migration, settlement, internment, repatriation and transnationalism. Discourses of racialization and sexualization fundamentally temper its intergenerational experience. These processes and the historical and cultural circumstances of the Japanese diaspora make it significantly different to the “geo-cultural” model associated with dispersal, myths and memories of homeland, alienation in a host country, desire for return, support for homeland and a collective identity defined by all this (Clifford 1994).

This chapter takes up the bifurcated history of the Japanese diaspora in Australia (Nagata 2001, 2004; Nagata and Nagatomo 2007). It focuses on how claims to diaspora are displaced by particular articulations of identity (Clifford 1994, p. 308), and identifies the disciplinary practices through which “Japaneseness” is regulated, learnt and negotiated. The chapter opens with a discussion of the raced and gendered aspects of the diaspora. Processes of racialization and sexualization in Australia have had, and continue to have, a significant impact on the nature and experience of migration and settlement. Racialization and sexualization are discourses that apply biological and quasi-biological significance to actions and thereby legitimate “subject-formation, inclusion and exclusion, discrimination, inferiorization, exploitation, verbal abuse, and physical harassment and violence” (Rattansi 1995, p. 258). Racism and sexism are evident in overt and covert elements

---

J. Matthews (✉)

Associate Professor Social Sciences, Faculty of Arts and Business,  
The University of the Sunshine Coast, Queensland, Australia  
e-mail: jmathews@usc.edu.au

Y. Nagata

School of Languages and Comparative Cultural Studies,  
The University of Queensland, Queensland, Australia  
e-mail: y.nagata@uq.edu.au

of disciplinary activity. Race and sex assemble social and cultural differences into essential, transcendental, and natural categories to constitute sets of distinctions that have real, material effects. Racialization and sexualization are intersecting and constitutive discourses that operate at multiple levels. The strategic negotiation of disciplinary discourses enables Japanese migrants to live in, and across, cultures and identities and to become Japanese and Asian in Australia. These repertoires of practice are most apparent in the lives of Japanese women (Giroux 1999).

The Japanese diaspora in Australia is distinctive. Rather than comprising of successive waves of migration and settlement, it involved a distinctive pre- and post-WW2 break. Before WW2 the Japanese diaspora was mainly comprised of men and Japanese prostitutes – today it is mainly comprised of women. After WW2 Japanese migrants and their Australian children were interned in Australia and repatriated to Japan. Racialization and sexualization secured the isolation of the pre-WW2 community and limited intergenerational cultural transmission. Cultural and sexual boundary separations limited the capacity of Japanese men and women to set up families, have children and transmit culture, however Japanese women managed to secure their independence. The post-WW2 Japanese diaspora is mainly comprised of women. In the 1950s the sexualization and racism of post-WW2 Australia encouraged war-brides to assimilate and become model minorities while in the 1970s and 1980s globalization enabled them to remake “Japaneseness”. More recently, contemporary marriage migrants and international students have forged new forms of transnationalism and connectivity. Today the Japanese diaspora remains internally differentiated by gender and socio-economic background. It mainly comprises business migrants, international students and marriage migrants, many return to Japan after decades in Australia. By highlighting the historical and cultural processes of racialization and sexualization, this chapter draws attention to the constitutive pedagogical processes through which Japanese migrants learn to live in, and across, cultures and identities.

---

## Diaspora

Since the 1980s there has been an explosion of interest in “diaspora” such that the meaning of the term has stretched to accommodate a wide variety of intellectual, cultural and political agendas. Interest in paradigmatic cases such as the Jewish diaspora has broadened to include other examples, and discussions have become increasing attenuated (Brubaker 2005; Matthews 2002). Three core elements remain constitutive in many understandings of diaspora: (a) dispersal, (b) homeland orientation, and (c) boundary or identity maintenance. Dispersion can be forced or voluntary across or within nation-state boundaries. Orientation to a real or imagined “homeland” is a source of self-esteem, identity and loyalty. It may involve the teleology of return, or a desire to recreate culture in a new location. Boundary or identity maintenance involves identity preservation, but can also involve boundary erosion through hybridization, creolization and syncretism: “something endlessly hybridized and in process but persistently there – memories and practices of collective identity maintained over long stretches of time” (Clifford 1994, p. 319).

As bounded entities, diasporas have been treated as unproblematically quantifiable. The Chinese diaspora is numbered at 35 million, the Jewish diaspora at 9 million and the Japanese diaspora at 3 million (Brubaker 2005). However, it is not clear who such figures include and exclude because political and cultural conditions are affected by racialization and sexualization; they inform citizenship and visa status and these in turn inform cultural identification. In the case of the Japanese diaspora in Australia, passing for white was an important means of surviving the 1950s and 1960s until globalization allowed for its reinvigoration later. Strategies of passing, performativity and mimicry discussed later in this chapter comprise strategic responses to racialization and sexualization.

Attenuation of the term “diaspora” suggests that it is productive to regard it as an idiom, a stance or a claim rather than simply a bounded entity (Brubaker 2005). In this, it can be regarded as a category of practice which articulates claims, and projects, formulates expectations, mobilizes energies and appeals to loyalties; a process that does not simply describe the dispersal and cultural orientations of particular groups, so much as the processes and engagements of their formulation.

This approach to diaspora is able to recognize the struggles and circumstances of migrants who can, and cannot, make claim to cultural identities. It does not presuppose the eventuation of a population into a diasporic community, and it is able to apprehend the deterritorializing effects of cultural hybridities. This is a relevant consideration in the case of Japanese women marriage migrants discussed in detail later in this chapter. A process orientation to diaspora is proposed by Stuart Hall (1992) in an attempt to de-essentialize understandings of culture and ethnic identity in order to accommodate its productive capacity. Regarding the experience of black migrants to the UK as a diaspora experience, Hall considers the term “black” to be a politically and culturally constructed category comprising an:

extraordinary diversity of subjective positions, social experiences and cultural identities ... which cannot be grounded in a set of fixed transcultural or transcendental racial categories and which therefore has no guarantees in Nature (Hall 1992, p. 254).

Hall gestures here to a politics of identity formation arising from a distinctive experience of unsettling, recombination, hybridization and “cut-and-mix” (Hall 1992, p. 254). A focus on processes of diaspora pays attention to the struggle, agony and reconfiguration of cultural identity in and against changing political landscapes (Lo 2000).

This point is salient in the work of Raymond Williams who was concerned with how economic networks of power and control have come to shape and produce identities, desires, visions, passions and social relations (Giroux 2004). It has a pedagogical dimension in that it involves conditions of learning, and hidden dynamics of reproduction. It is not just about the social construction of “knowledge, values, and experiences”, but is performative and involves “lived interactions across a spectrum of social practices and settings” (Giroux 2004, p. 61). Before discussing the performative aspect of the Japanese diaspora, it is necessary to clarify the discourses of racialization and sexualization.



## Racialization and Sexualization

Foucault did not produce a genealogy of racism (Stoler 1995). His interest in governmentality as an overarching technology of power and rationality was initially concerned with the state and later its operations in society at large. Foucault came to argue that like biopolitics (concerned with sexuality), discipline (concerned with penal systems) and segregation (concerned with psychiatry) power/rationality did not remain located in the institutions of their origin (Fontana and Bertani 2003). Accordingly, a genealogy of racism must go beyond Foucault's account of state power as the defense of society against itself as argued in *Society must be defended* (Foucault 2003) and extend his account of the normalization of healthy European bourgeoisie bodies in *The history of sexuality* (Foucault 1986). It must investigate claims to truth made possible by racial discourse and come to recognize the productive operations of racial discourse at the level of both individual and social bodies. A genealogy of racism and thus of sexism must investigate claims to truth made possible and disabled by racialization and sexualization. Such an approach as must go beyond the idea of racism or sexism as hegemonic state power.

It is because race is an ambivalent, incoherent, mobile, political signifier that we should avoid watertight definitions of racism and examine racializing categories and logic in particular situations (Rattansi 1995). The personal experience of race and sex are connected to political consequences such that they need to be understood as practical "ideologies" present in the minutiae of everyday discourse and cultural practices. It is therefore important to interrogate aspects of experience that give expression to the power relationships and sites of oppression previously ruled out by macro theory. A focus on racialization and sexualization, over racism and sexism, pays greater attention to the interwoven, multifaceted and often unpredictable strategies and tactics of repression, resistance, cooperation and alliance and thus to the ambivalent and contradictory effects of discourse (Essed 1990).

"Discourse" refers to what can be spoken or stated about a given condition of existence, and discourses are located in institutional sites from which they gain legitimation and application (Foucault 1972). Feminist poststructural interest in Foucauldian analysis tends to focus on the power/knowledge nexus to analyze technologies of subjugation and strategies of resistance in discourses of femininity (Sawicki 1994); few studies develop the Foucauldian project to examine articulations of racialization and sexualization. Female bodies are racialized and sexualized and while these imply similar processes, the combined racialized/sexualized experience is qualitatively different. It can, but does not automatically constitute a doubling or overlaying of activities and practices. A similar point can be made about racism and sexism. Double or overlaying understandings of oppression are not wholly inaccurate; rather they cover up complexity and contradiction (McCarthy 1988). Indeed, were they additive then one would only need to add race to current understandings of sexism or racialization or sex to current theories of racism or racialization to understand what is going on.

Racialization highlights practices, activities and regimes of thought. While "race" has clearly identifiable social effects, racial significance is created or made through ideological and discursive processes, and historically specific events and

structures (Goldberg 1993). Racialization calls forth signifiers of difference such as race, colour, culture or ethnicity to articulate and rearticulate, as background noise, perceptions and practices. These constrain who can and cannot be included in real or imagined national, cultural or racial categories. Despite its ontological and epistemic indefensibility, racism continues to serve as the locus of a discrimination, derogation exclusion, harassment and physical violence. However, a focus on racialization as a discourse of power/knowledge is not only concerned with its negative and exclusionary practices but also its productivity. Consideration of racialization and sexualization enables thinking beyond cultural repression and incorporates an understanding of cultural survival and cultural hybridity; an understanding of how humans produce the less-than-human and how this in turn produces new social bodies (Shein 2004).

The production of race, culture and identity in the case of the Japanese diaspora shows how these are learnt and responded to in repertoires of social practice and the exercise of power. Importantly, to understand the nature of race and racialization in relation to Asian histories and bodies, it is necessary to move beyond accounts that assume an essential or primordial significance to “blackness” or “whiteness”. While the black-white binary is an authoritative historical discourse, it is not foundational. All bodies are potentially compliant in racializing regimes and have a remarkable capacity for regulation in the service of power. The regulation and governance of Asian bodies is able to take on a range of notations, significance and forms, not only in relation to the black-white binary but also in the service of other less easily identifiable regulatory frames and racialized associations; these are prevalent at different historical junctures and connect disparate communities and social groups. Unfortunately however, is beyond the scope of this chapter to detail the historical associations of the Japanese community with Indigenous Australians and Torres Strait Islanders. The focus of this chapter, as detailed later concerns the recognition of the Japanese in Australia as: model WW2 prisoners; Japanese men as model labourers; Japanese women as model prostitutes; and Japanese war-brides as model housewives. “Japaneseness” was de-racialized to allow men and women to enter Australia despite the 1901 Immigration Restriction Act, and re-racialized when they were interned and deported after WW2. Finally, the sexualized role of women in the service of men was strategised by Japanese prostitutes to achieve financial independence, and by war-brides to become transnational intercultural mediators.

To recap, we want to argue that racialization and sexualization constitute the power relations of the Japanese diaspora and thus shape and mobilize collective conditions, experiences and meaning. They inform the regimes of truth and sites of struggle which by which knowledge and bodies are regulated (Gore 1992). As points of contact with residual and emergent identities and cultures, an analysis of the regulated ways people are able to perceive, engage and envision the world (Luke 2006) requires consideration of:

- (a) How racialization, sexualization inform diaspora-ization to constitute disciplinary discourses;
- (b) How they enable repertoires of social practice (material and ideational) through and in response to representation and signification in performativity and associated process of interpolation, hailing, passing, mimicry and;

(c) How they achieve identifiable cognitive and cultural effects manifest in values and beliefs, cultural identities, ethnicities and hybridities.

To elaborate these further we offer a brief overview of the pre- and post-WW2 Japanese diaspora. Pre-WW2 Japanese communities were established throughout Australia and comprised of pearl divers, sugar cane labourers, prostitutes and traders. However, these communities almost entirely disappeared when Japan entered the WW2. Japanese people and their Australian-born descendants were dispossessed and interned in camps around Australia (Nagata 1996). Most returned penniless to Japan. The internment of Japanese migrants and their subsequent repatriation to Japan disconnected the Japanese diasporic archive. Post-WW2 communities are comprised of war-brides, international students and business communities. However, the highly gendered and racialized forms of boundary and identity maintenance present in the pre-WW2 Japanese diaspora, are apparent in post-WW2 communities.

Today only a few descendants remain to connect pre- and post- WW2 communities. Early Australian Japanese communities disappeared as if they were never part of Australian history; as if they never contributed to Australian growth and development. Although the internment of Japanese Australians is a relatively unknown chapter of Australian history, it is an important reminder of the role of racialization and sexualization in processes of diaspora.

---

## Pre World War Two

The first migrants to Australia in the late nineteenth century were single indentured labourers seeking better economic opportunities and the chance to help their families in Japan. Most worked in the pearl-shell industry in the North of Australia, and they were also dominant in the *bêch-de-mer* fishing industry. Japanese men were efficient workers and much sought after. By the late 1890s the Japanese dominated the pearling industry. The financial incentive for migration was significant and an 18-year-old Japanese labourer could earn as much in Australia as a Japanese high school principal (Ganter 1991). The largest Japanese diving community was on Thursday Island. In 1919–1920, 715 Japanese people lived on the Island (Queensland State Archives). Apart from indentured labourers, the Japanese community also comprised of shore-based boarding-house keepers, storekeepers, soy-sauce makers, laundrymen, prostitutes and a doctor (Queensland State Archives). Japanese life styles were recreated in what came to be known as Yokohama or “Jap Town”, and the local *Nihonjin-kai* (Japanese Society) played a central role in the welfare of residents. Deep-sea diving was dangerous and killed many young men. A tangible reminder of the racial separation of the Japanese community is found in the Japanese section of the Thursday Island cemetery, which contains some 600 Japanese style tombstones inscribed in Japanese.

By 1898, 2,300 Japanese labourers were working in the sugar cane fields of Northern Queensland (Sissons 1977). To protect the interests of Japanese workers at sea and on land the first Japanese consulate (1896–1908) was established in the

major sugar-growing region of Townsville (Kikkawa 1988) After the 1991 Immigration Restriction Act the numbers of Japanese in the industry declined and by 1940 there were only a 178 recorded residents (Nagata 1996). Only Cairns and Mackay had *Nihonjin-kai* organizations (Nagata 1996, p. 22). Prostitution was the third most common occupation and Japanese women were smuggled into Australia to work as prostitutes. In 1897 there were 116 Japanese women in the colony. Apart from the consul's wife all were prostitutes and they worked from Cooktown to Childers. Thirty-four prostitutes lived on Thursday Island (Sissons 1977) and 11 were buried in Thursday Island Cemetery.

In 1901 there were approximately 3,500 Japanese in Australia, however the 1901 Immigration Restriction Act designed to curb Asian labour migration exempted Japanese workers in pearl-shell industry due to the industry's dependence on them (Nagata 1996).

Japanese women were not exempted, but they were 'overlooked'. Although the Act specifically prohibited the entry of "any prostitutes or person living on the prostitution of others", Japanese prostitutes on Thursday Island "enjoyed a remarkably prosecution-free existence" (Frances 1994, p. 52), and "none were ever charged as a prohibited immigrant" (Sissons 1977, p. 477). A former diver on the island recalled the arrival of seven or eight girls:

The girls had their hair all done up and were dressed in Japanese *hakama* with black socks and black high-heel shoes. They strode down the main street. Residents all came to watch them. The girls were just like movie stars or *Takarazuka* performers. They didn't look like they were stowaways (Ogawa 1976, p. 175).

Japanese prostitutes were regarded as providing "a service essential to the economic growth of the north". Not only did their sexual services "made life more palatable for European and Asian men who worked in pearling, mining and pastoral industries" (Hunt 1986, p. 137), but they also maintained the racial and sexual purity of white women and the white community. The Queensland Police Commissioner of the time wrote: "The supply of Japanese women for the Kanaka demand is less revolting and degrading than would be the case were it met by white women" (Nagata 1996, p. 64).

Interestingly most former prostitutes who stayed in Australia remained single and started other businesses catering for the domestic needs of men. They were referred to as *Obāsan* (grandma) and played a maternal service role in the Japanese community. Sadako Ike, born on Thursday Island in 1933 recalled:

They were getting old. Onobu Obāsan was running a bathhouse, Oyone Obāsan was running her own boarding house and others were quiet and doing odd jobs for the workers... They could hardly speak English. We didn't need English. They used to call me and ask me to pick out husks from rice grains (Nagata 2004, p. 146).

Due to their "alternative" entry to Australia, it is difficult to estimate how many Japanese women came to Australia, or indeed how Japanese-Australians are descended from these women (Nagata 2003).

For almost half a century thousands of Japanese men and women worked in Australia and yet few became permanent settlers by marriage to Australians. This was partly due to the availability of sexual services. While Japanese men were

popular among local girls, few marriages took place, however informal interracial unions were common and they often produced Australians of mixed descent (Nagata 2004, p. 149).

Unlike the selective internment of other “enemy” aliens, the Australian Government undertook the whole scale interment of all Japanese residents living in Australia during WW2. Internment was universally applied because the Australian authorities believed that the Japanese were less integrated into Australia and more fanatically nationalist than other migrant groups (Nagata 1996, p. 49).

Japanese internment was anticipated and expedient. When Japan entered the war in 1941 (McKinley 1985, p. 38) 1,141 people were quickly taken into custody. Internees included Japanese nationals and second generation Australian-born *Nisei*, many of whom were mixed heritage. Under the Aliens Control Regulations and the Nationality Act, the wives and children of Japanese men were regarded as “Japanese” and later subject to internment. Jamel Shibasaki, the son of a Japanese diver and a Torres Strait islander mother recalled:

You live on Thursday Island. You never been anywhere else. There are three hundred Japanese divers living there. They talk to you. You talk to them. Then all of a sudden, it’s wartime and you’re picked out as a spy for mixing with the enemy. Makes you think, I was born in this country. I didn’t speak Japanese. I know nothing about spying. As a young fellow, I was so confused. So we were all shipped off south (Nagata 2004, p. 150).

In the rounding-up process, Chinese residents were mistakenly interned and in Sydney Chinese residents were frequently insulted and assaulted when mistaken for Japanese (Nagata 1996, p. 86).

In marked contrast to Japanese prisoners of war, Japanese internees in internment camps were “model prisoners” who caused little disturbance. Japanese popular and traditional culture flourished in the camps to the extent that activities that might be regarded as patriotic or nationalistic were tolerated. Australian camp authorities allowed these activities as the internees remained model prisoners.

After the war, almost all Japanese internees were repatriated. Only 114 Australian-born Japanese and their parents were allowed to remain (Nagata 1996). In 1947, only 147 people were registered as Japanese, and they represented a tiny part of the 0.8 % of the Australian population classified as Asian (Jordens 1995, p. x). Those who remained were dispersed and had little contact with one other. In many cases their property and belongings were forfeited. Reestablishment in Australia was slow and difficult in an environment charged with vehement anti-Japanese sentiment. Most kept silent about their wartime experience and Japanese heritage. The following accounts were reported to Yuriko Nagata, one of the authors of this chapter, in personal communications. Peter Eccleston describing his *Nisei* aunts and uncles said:

[My aunt] tried to hide the fact of her being half-Japanese and is reluctant to talk of her experience. Mum’s other sister who was unmarried changed her last name. My uncle and his wife too changed their family name to an Anglo name. None of my cousins were told of their Japanese ancestry until they were adults (Nagata, Pers. Comm., May 25, 1997).

Joe Murakami was a *Nisei* born in Darwin, he was 18 in 1946 and his brothers were 16 and 13. He wrote:

We tend to withdraw instinctively when such a subject is brought up. This withdrawal is a sort of conditioned reflex attributable to our experience in the early post-war era (Nagata 1996, p. 236).

Tommy Nakata, a *Nisei* born on Thursday Island, commented on the immediate post-war years:

I wanted to get along well with people and didn't want to stir up things. I didn't speak about it a lot myself, but people asked me what the internment camp life was like. I answered 'no ill treatment' (Nagata 2004, p. 152).

Thursday Island was the only place where Japanese returnees were well received and accepted back into the local community.

The re-establishment of a Japanese presence in Australia after the war was slow. A ban was placed on the entry of Japanese nationals into the country in the immediate post-war years. While the Australian Government was reluctant to allow former enemies into the country, they realised that trade with Japan was necessary for the expansion of the Australian economy. After the San Francisco Peace Treaty of 1951, certain categories of Japanese nationals were allowed into the country. This new generation of Japanese settlers included war-brides, pearl divers and wool buyers (Nagata 1996, p. 239). War-brides were the largest group and they changed the gender balance of Japanese nationals in Australia (Coughlan 1999).

*Senso hanayome* (war-bride) are Japanese women who married servicemen during the occupation of Japan (1945–1951). Between 1950 and 1960, 600–650 *senso-hanayome* migrated to Australia (Tamura 1995). Most met their husbands while supporting themselves and their families by working on military bases as maids, barmaids, waitresses, clerical workers and sales staff. Their Japanese families often disapproved of the marriages and some, such as Masako and Haruko Kojima, the mother and aunt of Julie Matthews (one of the authors of this chapter) were told they had brought shame on their families by marrying a foreigner and they were never to return to Japan. The situation was inflamed by depictions in the Japanese media of war-brides as disreputable women and prostitutes (Tamura 1997). The depiction of Asian women as prostitutes, sexually available and promiscuous in discourses of military contact are based on colonial understandings of women as immoral, seductive, corrupting and less-than-human and therefore legitimate targets of violence, aggression and rape. Although the hyper-domestic depiction of Asian femininity is at odds with this, it too is a derivative of colonial discourse where docile, compliant, submissive and subordinate colonized women require the West to secure their liberation (Uchida 1998; Morris 2002).

War brides arrived when Australia was carrying out a vigorous national "assimilation drive" following massive immigration from non-English speaking countries (Nagata 2001, p. 92). They were alienated from their families and support networks, and often socially isolated due to differences of culture, language (Boc-Lim 1977) and racial hostility (Tajima 2000). Some took English names, anglicised their Japanese names and gave their children English names. Masako Kojima, for example,

became Mary Matthews, Haruko Kojima became Nita Chick and they lived with these names for the rest of her life. The Japanese were held in low esteem well into the 1960s (Nagata 2001, p. 96). Because Japanese women feared hostility and wanted their children to assimilate, many war brides did not teach their children Japanese (Tamura 1997).

In many ways these women were the vanguard of the new post-war Japanese community. They played the role of de facto cultural ambassadors because at that time they were among the few who had the required language and cultural skills. Despite an expectation that they would become model homemakers, many became restaurant owners, language teachers and interpreters (Tamura 1997, p. 95). Financial constraints meant that many were unable to maintain ties with their homeland but in the 1980' when globalization opened up the possibility of travel and communication, they resumed connections to Japan after decades of separation, to re-make themselves, and induct their families into Japanese culture and language. In the 1990s they organised themselves into associations and in 1994 the first international convention of Japanese war brides was held in Hawaii (Tamura 1997).

The closeness and relative security of Australia has made it a popular destination for Japanese women tourists, working holiday-makers and international students. The female-dominated demography of the post-war Japanese community in Australia is also bolstered by contemporary international marriages (Coughlan 1999). The increasing accessibility of Japan to Australians and Japan's promotion of Australia English language teachers in Japan has also facilitated the rise in contemporary marriage migration. Japanese women in international marriages actively sustain connections with Japan through trips home, telephone and internet contact. They also encourage biculturalism in their children as a way of retaining connections with family and expanding their global opportunities (Takeda 2009). They can thus be regarded as establishing a vanguard for the transnational Japanese-Australian diaspora (Takeda and Matthews 2009).

---

## Performativity and Power-in-Spacing

“Performativity” highlights the power of words to signify something that is actually its enactment (Butler 1995). Following Foucault, words order objects. The task of revealing and describing what they do is not about:

treating discourses as groups of signs (signifying elements referring to contents or representations) but as practices that systematically form the objects of which they speak. Of course, discourses are composed of signs; but what they do is more than use these signs to designate things. It is this more that renders them irreducible to the language (*langue*) and to speech. It is this more that we must reveal and describe (Foucault 1972, p. 54).

Performativity theory considers what is “*more* to be revealed and described” when words are not deemed separate or instrumental to the accomplishment of an action; when words perform themselves to become a thing done (Butler 1993). We come to recognize and locate ourselves and others under a particular designation

or name though interpolation. We are called, hailed or propelled into a symbolic and discursive order and repetitions serve to construct, constrain and proliferate seemingly natural identity categories (Butler 1993). “Japaneseness” is thus an identification that must be constantly enacted and reenacted, repeated and reiterated. Its repeat performance and replications demonstrate the impossibility of its authenticity for were it simply and essentially there, its repeated performance would be unnecessary (Matthews 2007). Of course, the incompleteness and instability of the subject and body of “Japaneseness” is not just of relevance to thinking about the diaspora but the condition of all identity categories.

The argument that cultural identities are in situ performative achievements, does not correspond with the idea that they can be pinned down and assessed as measurable outcomes in the checkboxes of census and attitudinal surveys which ask whether people feel Asian or Australian. Moreover, the performative nature of racialization and sexualization requires consideration of the ordinary, artful and “rational” repertoires of power and knowledge through which cultural identities are achieved. It draws attention to the regulatory power that at different points in time served to educate, induct, coach and cajole people in particular ways of being, and importantly how corresponding forms and modalities of “counter-conduct” and resistance are initiated (Stoler 1995).

“Passing” is the practice of adopting “whiteness” to become imperceptible, unnamed, unmarked and unnoticed, and to access white security and privilege. Passing as white is undertaken to defend, protect and secure survival in a white scopic regime (Rooney 2001). While passing also points to the emptiness of identity categories it has been argued that it does little to destabilize and undermine systems of racial categorization, knowledge and vision (Ahmed 1999). Nevertheless, we want to argue that passing comprises a significant act of survival in a disparaged community. It does not necessarily mean cultural erasure, as in the case of war-brides where ostensible assimilation gave way to bicultural and transnational orientations. Understood in these terms passing is more than simply survival; survival itself is cultural defiance. Indeed, if understood in as a form of “mimicry” then fashioning bodies and identities to the styles and values of the colonizer is neither a straightforward act of homage nor a straightforward reinforcement of colonial power hierarchies (Bhabha 1994). “Mimicry” in post-colonial discourse is not preoccupied with the question of the insurgent or reproductive aspects of passing, but with the fundamental ambivalence of colonial authority itself, and the absent presence of authentic colonized/colonized identities. Mimicry is a way of becoming same but different; becoming “not quite/not white”. The ambivalence of “mimicry” makes it an act of flattery and act of menace. It opens the colonizer to flattering copies that may also be read as mockeries and parodies (Bhabha 1994). Post-WW2 Japanese communities were demarcated by space, and space is significant of space in the exercise of power (Foucault 1984). Rattansi and Bhabha take this up by underlining the exercise of power in locally specific struggles (Bhabha 1994; Rattansi 1995). For post-war Japanese migrants Australian space was demarcated by boundaries that sought to secure the racial purity of both the living and the deceased. Efforts to secure



discrete racial and cultural homogeneity enabled Japanese communities to thrive and prompted the subsequent migration of Japanese prostitutes to save white women from Japanese men. The fortification of power-in-spacing through state legislation limiting Asian migration and inter-racial marriage required that the very same legislation be flaunted to bring Japanese prostitutes to Australia. Problematically, the same notions of discrete racial and cultural identity and purity that made for harmony in Japanese communities and elsewhere, also allowed “Japaneseness” to be understood as entirely incompatible with “Australianness”. The precariousness of this situation was harshly manifest in the internment of Japanese migrants and their Australian born children. What Australia “knew” about the Japanese community was that it was fundamentally different; that Japanese communities were unassimilated and therefore unable to assimilate; that internments were necessary to protect the Australian nation from the essential “fanatical” and “nationalistic” tendencies of the Japanese wartime stereotypes. In learning to comply with, performing and modify the race regulations and spatial exclusions of the era, Japanese communities unwittingly scripted themselves into conditions that later resulted in their exclusion, repatriation and deportation.

Japanese communities in Australia have long been celebrated as model minorities. In common circulation are stereotypes of the diligent international student, the good and obedient wife, the unassuming group tourist and the hardworking business man. In the internment camps model Japanese prisoners were allowed to engage in cultural, patriotic and even nationalist practices, provided they behaved. Again, the Japanese population found itself in a paradoxical situation; the nationalist performance of Japanese culture was rewarded while at the same time serving to reinforce the rationale underpinning exclusion and incarceration. The repatriation and deportation of the Japanese community, the mistaken inclusion of members of the Chinese community in internment camps, and the insults and violence that many Asian Australians were subjected to at this time taught many Asians the virtues of passing for white. Interpolated into the racial discourse of the day, survival depended on learning when to stay silent about wartime experience and racial origins, learning not to see or hear racist abuse and taunts in order to avoid abuse and violence, and learning to tune out the past in the interests of the present and the future.

Post-WW2 war-brides entered a culture that perceived Japanese people in particular, and Asians in general, as external and internal enemies. Not surprisingly they silently secured themselves into the Australian landscape only to find new ways of becoming Japanese decades later. We have still to investigate the pedagogical forms of new forms of cosmopolitanism and transnationalism amongst contemporary Japanese marriage migrants, international students and business communities. However, celebration of Asian women’s vanguard biculturalism must be somewhat tempered by the fact that they enter an orientalizing mediascape of advertisements, films, magazines and literature. A radicalized and sexualised Eurasian diaspora that absents, exoticizes and eroticizes Asian women in linguistic forms that disparage and sexualize (Matthews 2002, 2007).

## Conclusion

This chapter shows how cultural identities are produced under particular historical conditions. Our interest in racialization and sexualization does not assume that racial discrimination, bigotry and intolerance is *the* problem and will be fixed, or disappear, were we to develop better ethical or socio-political means of coexisting. Rather it suggests the need to first understand past and present power/knowledge practices to comprehend the ways people, groups and communities are included and excluded in pronouns, practices and places, and their struggles to revise and reverse these.

We wanted to draw particular attention to the repertoires of social practice through which the Japanese community in general and Japanese women in particular learn to live with, and under, the racializing and sexualizing radar. These we recognize as pedagogical in as much as they enable people to “learn” and “know” what kinds of locations, activities and behaviours secure success, safety and survival. We argue that consideration of racialization and sexualization pays attention to how people are located and relocated in particular places and how raced and sexed signifying practices, power relations, differentiations, and spatial demarcations, make for experiences of placement and displacement. To understand diasporic cultural identities it is necessary to investigate and understand complex and differential histories. However, in investigating the heterogeneity of diaspora, what is often overlooked are processes through which diaspora-ization is achieved. We have argued here that these are fundamentally pedagogical and involve systematic processes of racialized and sexualized knowledge production, reproduction and navigation.

## References

- Ahmed, S. (1999). She'll wake up one of these days and find she's turned into a nigger: Passing through hybridity. *Theory Culture & Society*, 16(2), 87–106.
- Bhabha, H. K. (1994). *The location of culture*. London: Routledge.
- Boc-Lim, K. (1977). Asian wives of U.S. servicemen: Women in the shadows. *Amerasia*, 4(1), 91–115.
- Brubaker, R. (2005). The 'diaspora' diaspora. *Ethnic and Racial Studies*, 28(1), 1–19.
- Butler, J. (1993). *Bodies that matter: On the discursive limits of 'sex'*. New York/London: Routledge.
- Butler, J. (1995). Burning acts – Injurious speech. In A. Parker & E. K. Sedgwick (Eds.), *Performance and performativity* (pp. 197–227). New York: Routledge.
- Clifford, J. (1994). Diasporas. *Cultural Anthropology*, 9(3), 302–38.
- Coughlan, J. E. (1999). *Japanese immigration in Australia: A socio-demographic and economic profile of the Japan-born communities from the 1996 census*. Paper presented at the Japanese Studies Association of Australia, Rockhampton.
- Essed, P. (1990). *Everyday racism: Reports from women of two cultures*. Alameda: Hunter House.
- Fontana, M., & Bertani, A. (2003). Situating the lectures. In A. Fontana & M. Bertani (Eds.), *Michel Foucault, society must be defended, lectures at the Collège de France* (pp. 1995–1976). London/New York: Penguin.
- Foucault, M. (1972). *The archaeology of knowledge*. London: Tavistock.

- Foucault, M. (1984). Space, knowledge and power. In P. Rabinow (Ed.), *The Foucault reader* (pp. 239–272). Harmondsworth: Penguin Books.
- Foucault, M. (1986). *The history of sexuality* (The use of pleasure, Vol. 1). New York: Vintage Books.
- Foucault, M. (2003). In M. Bertani & A. Fontana (Eds.), *Society must be defended: Lectures at the college de france, 1975–76*. London/New York: Penguin.
- Frances, R. (1994). The history of female prostitution in Australia. In R. Perkins et al. (Eds.), *Sex work & sex workers in Australia*. Sydney: University of New South Wales.
- Ganter, R. (1991). Images of Japanese pearl-shellers in Queensland: An oral history chapter in Australia-Japan relations. *Royal Historical Society of Queensland Journal*, 14(7), 265–268.
- Giroux, H. (2004). Cultural studies, public pedagogy, and the responsibility of intellectuals. *Communication and Critical/Cultural Studies*, 1(1), 59–79.
- Giroux, H. A. (1999). Education after Abu Ghraib: Revisiting Adorno's politics of education. *Cultural Studies*, 18(6), 779–815.
- Goldberg, D. (1993). *Racist culture: Philosophy and the politics of meaning*. Oxford, UK: Blackwell.
- Gore, J. (1992). Neglected practices: A Foucauldian critique of traditional and radical approaches to pedagogy. *Critical Pedagogy Networker*, 5(4), 1–8.
- Hall, S. (1992). New ethnicities. In J. Donald & A. Rattansi (Eds.), *Race, culture and difference* (pp. 252–259). London: Sage in association with Open University Press.
- Hunt, S. J. (1986). *Spinifex Hessians: Women's lives in North Western Australia 1860–1900*. Perth: University of Western Australia Press.
- Jordens, A.-M. (1995). *Redefining Australians: Immigration, citizenship and national identity*. Sydney: Hale & Iremonger.
- Kikkawa, J. (1988). Japanese in Queensland. In M. Brandle & S. Karas (Eds.), *Multicultural Queensland: The people and communities of Queensland: A bicentennial publication*. Kangaroo Point: Ethnic Communities Council of Queensland and the Queensland Migrant Welcome Association.
- Lo, J. (2000). Beyond happy hybridity: Performing Asian-Australian identities. In I. Ang, S. Chalmers, L. Law, & M. Thomas (Eds.), *Alter/Asians: Asian Australian identities in art, media and popular culture* (pp. 52–68). Sydney: Pluto Press.
- Luke, A. (2006). Editorial introduction: Why pedagogies? *Pedagogies: An International Journal*, 1(1), 1–6.
- Matthews, J. (2002). Deconstructing the visual: The diasporic hybridity of Asian and Eurasian female images. *Intersections: Gender, History and Culture in the Asian Context*, 8(October). <http://intersections.anu.edu.au/issue8/matthews.html>
- Matthews, J. (2007). Eurasian persuasions: Mixed race, performativity and cosmopolitanism. *Journal of Intercultural Studies*, 28(1), 41–54.
- McCarthy, C. (1988). Marxist theories of education and the challenge of a cultural politics of non-synchrony. In L. G. Roman & L. Christian-Smith (Eds.), *Becoming feminine: The politics of popular culture* (pp. 185–203). London: Falmer Press.
- McKinley, B. (1985). *Australia 1942: End of innocence*. Sydney: Collins.
- Morris, N. (2002). Innocence to deviance: The fetishisation of Japanese women in Western fiction, 1890s–1990s. *Intersections: Gender, History and Culture in the Asian Context*, 7(March). <http://intersections.anu.edu.au/issue7/morris.html>
- Nagata, Y., & Nagatomo, J. (2007). *Japanese Queenslands; A history, internment in Australia*. Brisbane: Bookpal.
- Nagata, Y. (1996). *Unwanted aliens: Japanese internment in Australia*. Brisbane: University of Queensland Press.
- Nagata, Y. (2001). Lost in space: Ethnicity and identity of Japanese Australians 1945–1960s. In P. Jones & P. Oliver (Eds.), *Changing histories: Australia and Japan* (pp. 85–99). Melbourne: Monash University Press.
- Nagata, Y. (2003). Gendering Australia-Japan relations: Prostitutes and the Japanese diaspora in Australia. *Ritsumeikan Journal of Asia Pacific Studies*, 11(March), 57–70.

- Nagata, Y. (2004). The Japanese in the Torres Strait. In A. Shunkal, G. Ramsey, & Y. Nagata (Eds.), *Navigating boundaries: The Asian diaspora in Torres Strait* (pp. 138–159). Canberra: Pandanus Books.
- Ogawa, T. (1976). *Arafurakai no Shinju*. Tokyo: Ayumi Shuppan.
- Queensland State Archives, File POL/J2
- Rattansi, A. (1995). Just framing: Ethnicities and racisms in a 'postmodern' framework. In L. Nicholson & S. Seidman (Eds.), *Social postmodernism: Beyond identity politics* (pp. 250–286). Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University Press.
- Rooney, M. (2001). Grave endings: The representation of passing. *Australian Humanities Review*. <http://www.lib.latrobe.edu.au/AHR/archive/Issue-September-2001/roon>. Accessed 23 Nov 2001.
- Sawicki, J. (1994). Foucault, feminism and questions of identity. In G. Gutting (Ed.), *The Cambridge companion to Foucault* (pp. 286–313). Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University Press.
- Shein, A. (2004, April 26). *A Foucauldian explanation of racism beyond Foucault's*. Paper presented at the 20 Years after Foucault: Graduate Student Conference, New York.
- Sissons, D. C. S. (1977). Karayuki-san: Japanese prostitutes in Australia, 1887–1916, Part I. *Historical Studies*, 17(68), 323–341.
- Stoler, A. L. (1995). *Race and the education of desire; Foucault's history of sexuality and the colonial order of things*. Durham: Duke University Press.
- Tajima, C. E. (2000). Discovering my mother as an other in the Saturday Evening Post. *Qualitative Inquiry*, 4(6), 443–455.
- Takeda, A., & Matthews, J. (2009). *Japanese women, marriage migration and cultural identity: Thinking through globalisation, diaspora and transnationalism*. Refereed Proceedings TASA Conference. Canberra: ANU.
- Takeda, A. (2009). *Japanese women on the move: International marriage, migration, and transnationalism*. Unpublished thesis, University of the Sunshine Coast, Queensland.
- Tamura, K. (1995). *Border crossing: Changing identities of Japanese war brides*. Ph.D. dissertation. Australian National University, Canberra.
- Tamura, K. (1997). Border crossings: Changing identities of Japanese war brides. *The Asia Pacific Magazine*, 8, 43–47.
- Uchida, A. (1998). The orientalizing of Asian women in America. *Women's Studies International Forum*, 21(2), 161–174.

---

# Body as Gendered and Sexualised and Recent Migration of Poles to the United Kingdom

Bernadetta Siara

---

## Introduction

This material has been previously published as ‘Body, gender and sexuality in recent migration of Poles to the United Kingdom’ in *Migration Studies: Polish Review*, 1, 111-128. It is reprinted here in a modified format by permission of the Editor. This chapter focuses on the constructions around body as gendered and sexualised within recent migration of Poles to the United Kingdom (UK). No attention has generally been paid to the issue of body within migration. Moreover, migration of Poles to the UK attracted a lot of attention among academics; however the gender and sexuality dimension of this migration has been overlooked. Gender and sexuality issues may turn out to be crucial within this migration, as different discourses on gender and sexuality appear to prevail in Poland and the UK and can potentially influence views on body.<sup>1</sup> Around 613,000 Poles have migrated to the United Kingdom since May 2004, when the UK Government decided to open its labour market to the citizens from the new European Union (EU) states (Home Office 2009). Poles migrate, as it appears, from an environment in Poland characterised by more conservative views on gender and sexuality to a more liberal environment in the UK. As the discussions Poles run in the cyberspace show, the body as gendered and sexualised appears to play an important role within this migration.

The online discussions mostly focus on female bodies rather than male ones. Therefore, this chapter uses feminist perspective and examines the influence of this migration on discourses around body as gendered and sexualized and its potential to liberate conservative discourses especially on women’s bodies. Bordo (2004) argues that the body is a medium of culture and the body may be seen as a site for

---

<sup>1</sup> My PhD research project has focused more broadly on issues of gender and sexuality within Polish migration to the UK.

B. Siara (✉)

School of Applied Social Sciences, University Campus Suffolk, Waterfront Building,  
Neptune Quay, Ipswich IP4 1QJ, Suffolk, United Kingdom  
e-mail: b.siara@ucs.ac.uk; bernadetta\_siara@yahoo.co.uk

investigation into gender and sexuality (Petersen 2003), which this chapter undertakes. This chapter uses intersectionality framework as lens to examine issues around body and analyses how specific social categories such as gender and sexuality, seen as 'social processes', simultaneously influence construction of these issues (Nash 2008). Gender allows the focus on the division between women and men and the relationship between them that includes power (Jackson and Scott 2001). Gender as a social category is seen as greatly influencing the construction of social bodies (Lorber and Martin 2008). However, gender operates on multiple social and cultural levels and they include not only the body, but also the state (Mahler and Pessar 2006). This chapter also uses sexuality as a social category and investigates sexualised aspects of the body. Sexuality is seen as encompassing sexual norms, expectations and pressures from others that exist in every cultural context (Lorber 1999). These patterns of sexual behaviour are gendered, and as Lorber (2005) alleges, a departure from established norms of gender and sexuality often provokes a reaction manifesting itself in the use of power and social control.

This chapter looks at body within migration and migration in turn is also a gendered, and for that matter, sexualised phenomenon (Donato et al. 2006; Erel et al. 2002). Mahler and Pessar (2006) argue that although gender ideologies, relations and practices have a great role in migration processes, they are often unexamined. This chapter considers the role gender and sexuality ideologies play in constructions around body by Poles in the UK. The focus of this chapter is on bodies as engaging in relations, also of a sexual nature, bodies as attempting to prevent pregnancies through the use of contraception, and bodies as dealing with unplanned pregnancies through the use of abortion. It also looks at men's sexualised bodies in relation to women's sexualised bodies.<sup>2</sup> The main aim is to show how gender and sexual ideologies are reproduced and negotiated in relation to body within this migration process. In order to be able to understand the gender and sexuality dimension of this migration, this chapter now looks at the local gender contexts, gender ideologies and gender histories prevalent in both Poland and the UK.

---

## Body Politics in Poland

Polish culture is perceived as quite conservative in relation to gender and sexuality (Gontarczyk 1995) and a lot of changes have taken place within the last two decades, when the process of transition from communism to democracy has been taking place. Within the process of the post-communist nation-building the prevalent context has been nationalist (Booth 2005; Graff 2008) and it was especially prominent when right wing governments were in power.<sup>3</sup> Nationalism, however, has deeper historical roots in Poland. The country was partitioned in the late eighteenth century by the Russian Empire, the Kingdom of Prussia and the Habsburg Austria. First

---

<sup>2</sup>For more discussion the physical appearance of bodies, Polish women's and men's sexualities and the perception of inter-ethnic relationships please refer to Siara (2009).

<sup>3</sup>From 1989 until 1993, from 1997 to 2001 and from 2005 to 2007.

partition took part in 1772 and it was followed by second partition in 1793 and third partition in 1795. Following the third partition and until the end of World War One Poland was not officially regarded as a separate independent state on the political arena. During this time the particular focus was on maintaining the continuity of the nation. A special role was then given to women who through their sacrifice and focus on home and motherhood were supposed to help this process and this led to creating a notion of 'Matka Polka' [Eng. Mother-Poland] (Ksieniewicz 2004) seeing woman's role as sacrificing herself for the benefit of the nation.

Apart from the Polish state, its governments and their politics, the influence of the Catholic Church on gender, especially since 1989, has been very visible (Pankowska 2005; Duch-Krzyszczek 1997). The Catholic Church in Poland not only has insisted on traditional understanding of gender, but also strongly influenced changes in the policy concerning women's loss of reproductive rights once the strict anti-abortion law was introduced in 1993 (Pascall and Kwak 2005). This law prohibited abortion for social and economic reasons (Kramer 2007). According to this law, abortion can be carried out only in cases when "the woman's life or health is threatened, when the pregnancy is the result of crime or in cases of severe foetal abnormality" (Nowicka 1996, p. 24). At the same time, there has not been free contraception available and there have been efforts made to limit the access to paid-for contraception (Nowicka 1996). Interestingly, around the time when the anti-abortion law was being introduced, 37 % of Poles supported abortion in the case when a woman wanted it for any reason (Saxonberg 2000). In any case, the strict anti-abortion law did not stop abortions from being carried out as it is evident in existence of so called 'abortion underground' in Poland (Zielinska 2000). Moreover, attitudes to sex in Polish culture are often not only heavily influenced by the Catholic Church's rhetoric, but also patriarchal views (Hauser et al. 1993). In official discourse sex is then constructed as connected to reproduction rather than sexual pleasure.

Generally, women's movement in Poland has been quite weak. This is partly connected to the negative perception of feminism in Poland generally, and resulting from it limited support for a women's movement (Booth 2005). Furthermore, the women's movement in Poland had been heavily attacked by the Catholic Church officials (Nowicka 1996). Although, women's movement in Poland grew in strength in the 1990s with the support from many intellectuals and academics, it did not successfully impact on creating women-friendly policies in Poland or changing discourses on gender and sexuality.

---

## Body Politics in the UK

British gender context appears to be more liberal in comparison to the Polish one. As the historical conditions were different, women's liberation was entirely separated from the nation-building process (Booth 2005). Moreover, the Anglican Church, main religious institution in the UK, has had a weak impact on people's lives choices for a long time (McDowell et al. 2008).

Furthermore, the women's movement in the UK has been strong and has campaigned for many years for liberation of traditionally understood gender roles

(Zweiniger-Bargielowska 2000; Pascall and Kwak 2005). It also led to redefinition of issues around sexuality and the body. It called for the separation of sex from reproduction and insisted on women's sexual pleasure (Charles 2002). The women's movement saw sexuality not as a personal but a political issue and it became concerned with securing free contraception and abortion on demand (Smith 2000). As a result of campaigning, contraception became available free-of-charge on the National Health System (NHS) in 1974 (Zweiniger-Bargielowska 2000). Moreover, "Abortion Act" allowing artificial termination of pregnancy was legalised in 1967 and abortion became available, also free-of-charge, on the NHS in 1974 (Pilcher 1999).

The UK makes it an interesting research terrain when focusing on the issues of body and more generally gender, sexuality and migration as it is inhabited by migrants from various parts of the world. The more intensive movement of people into the UK started in the 1950s (Vertovec 2007). It included migrations from West Indies, India, and Pakistan. However, Vertovec (2007) claims that since the 1990s there has been not only a rise in immigration to the UK, but also a great diversification of migrants' countries of origin as for example from the other (EU) countries or from the Middle East. He also refers to substantial further increases from the accession states since the 2004 EU Enlargement. In Vertovec's (2007) opinion, such diversity leads to greater socio-cultural differences and greater variety of cultural values and practices carried out by migrants. This diversity is especially important when considering social relations, including gender and sexual relations as there are variations in terms of attitudes to gender and sexuality among different migrants.

---

## Internet Forum Discussions

This chapter uses internet forum discussions as data. Such a choice of research technique was motivated by a number of factors. Firstly, choosing such a method gave an access to naturally occurring settings (Romano et al. 2003), which are in no way influenced by the presence of the researcher. Secondly, it also provided access to research participants, who actively engage in debates relating to the topic under study (Markham 2005). What is important is that topics of discussions are set by participants themselves rather than a researcher and this gives an opportunity to analyze issues that are important to discussants themselves. Additionally, such data is unstructured, rich and detailed (Byrne 2001) and not controlled by time or space. However, the researcher does not know much about respondents apart from what is apparent from their opinions. As quite a novel and emergent research technique (Rutter and Smith 2005), analysis of the internet discussions can extend knowledge about gender and sexuality within the migration process, as it gives an insight into the issues important to migrants themselves.

The analyzed discussions were carried out on the forums hosted on a number of internet portals catering to Poles in the UK.<sup>4</sup> The names of the portals are kept

---

<sup>4</sup>For more information on the internet usage by Poles in the UK please refer to Siara (2009).



confidential for ethical reasons (Rutter and Smith 2005). All the identified discussions relating to body, gender and sexuality were included in the study and subsequently analyzed. All these discussions were carried out in a public space i.e. forum participants voluntarily published their opinions on the Internet and as a result made them available to the open public. However, anonymity of forum users is maintained by not stating their real or nick-names (Markham 2005; Hewson et al. 2003).

The analysis involved ten forum discussions. Discussions comprised of between 10 and 175 posts, with the mean of 52. They were carried between 2006 and 2008. The discussions lasted between a few days and several months. All the internet forum discussions were held in Polish. The analysis was firstly carried in Polish, and only afterwards main themes were translated into English. Thematic analysis approach was used in the process of analyzing discussions as this method focuses on identifying themes that are important in describing an analyzed phenomenon (Fereday and Muir-Cochrane 2006; Byrne 2001). As in Polish language a verb agrees with gender, by looking at verb's ending the gender of the speaker can be recognized. Therefore, when the gender of the person expressing an opinion is known, it is marked accordingly in both analysis and the quotes.

Some forum users refer to 'race', which is translated accordingly in the quotes. However, it is recognized in the analysis that 'race', marked in inverted commas, is a socially constructed category without a content created for ideological reasons and used in the processes of racialization, in which people are seen as belonging to distinctive groups – races and this supposed belonging is imposed on them (Pilkington 2003; Miles and Small 1999). However, in order to refer to the multicultural population in the UK in this chapter the term ethnicity is used and ethnicity is seen as a fluid process encompassing variety of people's cultural identities, belongings and attachments, and these are seen embraced by these people themselves (Pilkington 2003; Miles and Small 1999).

---

## Bodies and Sexual Relations

### Women's Bodies and Sexual Relations

According to some (only male) internet forum users Polish women in the UK engage in relations, also of sexual nature, with men of other than Polish ethnic backgrounds and these men disapprove of such practices. Within such statements strong objectification of women as passive sex 'providers' to men rather than those actively participating in sexual activities could be observed:

How is it Polish women that you give yourselves all over, to anyone who wants. (male)

The counter expressed by other forum users suggested that such a statement sexually objectifies women and therefore it was strongly rejected:

Gentlemen, don't exaggerate, Polish women are not prostitutes... and they won't be giving themselves either to you, dear country-fellows, or to any other nation. (male)

Moreover, it was claimed by some male forum participants that apparently some men of other ethnic origins also see Polish women in such an objectifying way; as passive sex ‘providers’:

It pi...s me off that Pakistani or Hindu comes over to me at work and boasts about how many Polish women he slept with. (male)

It was also suggested that Polish men are laughed at by men of other ethnic origins in the UK, because Polish women are sexually active whilst abroad:

Other nations laugh at us, Polish men, and such stories how many Polish women they slept with are very frequent. [...] Many Polish women and girls act outside the country as typical and additionally cheap sl...s. At the moment I don't think as a man. For me, a Pole, it is very upsetting. (male)

It was claimed that Polish women who engage in relationships with men of other than Polish ethnic origins “spoil” the opinion of the whole country Poland. By such users women were seen as ‘representatives of the nation’:

Because of such women from London it is not only them who lose out in the eyes of foreigners but the whole our country does. (male)

Men expressing such views appear to have conservative attitudes to gender and sexuality, according to which women are not allowed to actively engage in sexual relations with a person of their choice (i.e. of different than their own ethnic origins) and when they do so, they risk being stigmatized. This could also be the case in relation to how some men of other ethnic origins may perceive some Polish women in the UK as they may also hold conservative views on gender and sexuality.

Moreover, the suggestion was made by other user that it could simply be a man's talk i.e. men like to talk about their sexual adventures even if they are only the imagined adventures rather than the real ones:

One has to consider how true these stories are coming from Turkish or Afghani men that they ‘slept’ with Polish women. Men like to boost about a lot. (female)

However, the claim was made that it is rather Polish men than men of other ethnic origins who engage in stigmatizing and name-calling Polish women who engage in relations with men of other than their own ethnic background:

Never before I heard about a stereotype of a Polish woman as a slut from an Englishman. However, I heard many times when Polish men called so their female country-fellows, who had relationships with British or Pakistani men. Stereotypes don't come from anywhere. (male)

“Sexual-ethnic double standard”<sup>5</sup> was constructed within these debates as it was claimed that whilst a Polish woman can engage in a sexual activity with a Polish man, she is not allowed to do that with a man of other than her own ethnic origins. At the same time, Polish men are also allowed to do so with women of other ethnic origins, but Polish women should not:

So if a Polish woman goes with me, that's cool, but it's bad if she does it with somebody else. Gentlemen, let's be honest, which one of you didn't feel like [meeting a

---

<sup>5</sup>It is understood as sexual double standard embracing the issues surrounding ethnicities.

woman of other ethnic origins]? If possible I would be very willing. Who wouldn't be? Why do we criticise women? I don't defend anyone, but please be tolerant. It is a private issue of each person. Let everybody live their life, and how they do it, it's their business? (male)

## Men's Bodies and Sexual Relations

It was pointed out that Polish men who express negative opinions towards Polish women engaging in relationships with men of other than Polish ethnic origins may be sexually frustrated as they themselves are not involved in relations with any women:

And why do you write rubbish? Do you have some complexes over racial issues or your hand can't stand it anymore? [...] if any woman prefers other races over you, one should only feel sorry for you. [...] and maybe this problem exists only in your head as a creation of imagination tired of masturbation? (male)

Such men were seen as unable to engage in similar relationships either with Polish or with women of other ethnic origins; in the latter case likely due to poor language knowledge:

Why are you so much focused on Polish women? [...] But be honest men. Do you feel upset because they don't look at you (such great men) and you don't speak good enough English to be able to attract British women or other migrant women? (female)

Rather Poles are hopeless. There aren't any discussions here about English, Hindu, Black or any other wives or fiancées of Polish men... (female)

## When Body, Gender and Sexuality Intersect with Ethnicity

Negative comments made about Polish women were seen by some forum users as driven by nationalistic attitudes and seen as a need to preserve Polish women for Polish men through controlling their activities (also the sexual ones):

You should only get condolences now. No Polish woman was interested in you. And this should justify in your opinion the crusade in defence of POLISH AR...E, understood in wider patriotic terms? (male)

However, such nationalistic attitudes were ridiculed by others and the questions were asked whether there is a "national duty" for Polish women to engage in relations only with Polish men. The claim was also made that Polish women are not owned by Polish men:

Who cares who Polish women sleep with? Does any Polish woman have a duty to see only Polish men? If this is a constitutional duty, you men are such great patriots, and what are you doing on the Isles? (female)

Why are you so jealous about Polish women? You are boiling when you see a Polish woman with a foreigner. Nevermind his nationality, POLISH WOMEN DON'T BELONG TO POLISH MEN. (female)

The discussion was raised to a global level and it was argued that a person's ethnicity whilst engaging in relations with other people does not matter in the global world:

We live in the world in a global village, where nationality doesn't matter. The fact that you offend Polish women who meet with foreigners simply shows your own level! (female)

It was also argued by some that women should be able to act freely the same as men do including engagements in relations, also of sexual nature without a risk of being criticized and their choices should be their private matters:

How is it that a man is always allowed and we, women, have to resign from everything, because they can talk about us. If anybody fancies a foreigner, it is their private matter. (female)

Easy or not easy [women]. Who cares? [...] everybody does what they want and they have a right to it. (male)

## Gender and Sexual Environment

The importance of gender and sexuality environment was also stressed in internet discussions. By some forum users the UK context was seen as more liberal and characterised by sexual liberty, whilst the Polish context was perceived as more conservative:

I don't understand how in the atmosphere of total sexual freedom amongst young people on the Isles anybody can be seen as sleeping around. (female)

The claim was also made that women change the way they think once they move to the UK and it was argued they should never be allowed to leave Poland in the first place:

It is a call for men, never allow your women to go abroad, even if you are to go together. Their brains turn sides as soon as they cross the border. Total reset. It is a fact, tried in practice. (male)

---

## Bodies and Reproductive Issues

### Contraception

Some discussions surrounded contraception i.e. some Polish women sought advice on the forums about places, where they would be able to obtain contraceptives in the UK. Differences between Poland and the UK were discussed, and the UK was described as a "contraceptive paradise", where contraceptives are available free of charge. At the same time, they are quite expensive in Poland and the claim was made that they should be made free as this helps to prevent unplanned pregnancies:

In comparison to Poland it is a 'contraceptive' paradise. (female)

I have lived in the UK for two years. All the contraception is free. When I lived in Poland, I used contraception pills, which are unfortunately quite expensive and most women can't afford to buy them. I think that such basic means as contraception pills should be free-of-charge. (female)

## Abortion

The debate on abortion started with some forum participants quoting newspaper publications which claimed that a large number of Polish women undergo abortion in the UK. However, it was argued that despite a possibility of having abortion done on the NHS many women still use private ways to terminate pregnancy:

Every year ten thousands Polish women undergo abortion in London only. [...] despite abortion being free-of-charge in the UK, most 'Polish' abortions are carried privately or completely illegally (male)

Another claim was made that it is a woman's private matter and comments suggesting interest in these issues is driven by conservative views and is an attempt to control women's activities:

And so what? Why do you care? It stinks with mohair<sup>6</sup>...

Moreover, it was suggested that Polish women use so called 'abortion underground' in the UK. Some forum participants wondered why women would do so in the face of free access to abortion services available on the NHS or the possibility of using private services set up for this purpose. This was seen as a strange practice in the light of legally allowed access to abortion in the UK in opposition to Poland, where abortion is prohibited and abortion underground is well-developed:

But why underground? In the UK one can undergo abortion legally for free on the NHS or privately in the clinic. (female)

If abortion is legally allowed, why so many women undergo illegal abortion, 'in the underground'? (female)

Women experiencing unplanned pregnancies also used the forum to look for information about the ways abortion is done in the UK:

I became pregnant, but it is not a planned pregnancy and I want to terminate it. How do you do it here? Where should I go? Directly to the hospital or to my GP? (female)

The differences in attitudes towards women dealing with the situation of unplanned pregnancies in Poland and in the UK were also stressed. The attitude in

---

<sup>6</sup>Mohair [Polish – Moher] became a symbol of conservative thinking in Poland. The word originated in mohair hats worn by older Polish women who are church-goers and who are seen to have conservative views on gender and sexuality.

the UK was seen as more 'human' and where women have an opportunity to make a decision themselves and this was appreciated by female forum users:

Go to your GP or to the Family Planning Centre – in the UK women in your situation are not treated as an outcast

Every woman has a right to decide because she lives in a FREE country the UK and not a Catholic, bigoted and backward Poland.

---

## **Evaluating Views on Body as Gendered and Sexualised Within Migration Space**

In a wider perspective although the analysis focuses on bodies, it is also helpful for learning more about contexts, ideologies and practices that constitute bodies and the constructions around them. Different views on body were identified through the analysis and it was found that debates contained a mixture of nationalist, patriarchal, conservative and liberal attitudes. These discussions concerning bodies in migration space are initiated within a specific discourse – a nationalist discourse. However, at the same time counter-discourses are also constructed. Conservative and patriarchal attitudes are mostly associated with the Polish gender context, whilst liberal attitudes with the UK context, although they are also present in Poland. This agrees with a claim made by Bator (1999) that there had been two prevalent discourses on gender in Poland in the 1990s; a nationalist, conservative and patriarchal discourse based on the Catholic Church's teachings, which accordingly sets specific roles for women; and a liberal discourse treating women as equal citizens who are aware of their rights and who should fully participate in public life. Migration to the UK gives an opportunity to interact even more with a liberal context, outside of the Catholic Church's politics and the conservative governments' policies. However, some men still expressed more nationalist, patriarchal and conservative views, whilst women and some men articulated more liberal views on body as well as gender and sexuality.

Nationalism has been a dominant political discourse in Poland for quite a long time, but it has been highly prevalent especially since 1989. Initially, it was a backlash against communism, when pro-democratic changes started in Poland and within this backlash; the conservative and nationalistic understandings of ethnic, gender and sexual identities have been revoked. This has been additionally fused with Catholicism and its approach to gender and sexuality (Pryke 1998). McClintock (1997) suggests that all nationalisms are gendered and alleges that the needs of the nation are typically defined by men and often connected to their aspirations. At the same time women's needs and wants are dismissed and this is the case with how some Polish men in the UK talked about women's position and expectations towards them. Furthermore, Milic (1996) argues that nationalism dwells on people's frustrations and fantasies, in this case men's. Within a nationalist project women are perceived as 'mothers of the nation' (Sharp 1996, p. 99) and reproducers of national and ethnic group identities and boundaries (Einhorn 1996; Yuval-Davis and Anthias 1989). As a consequence women's bodies, behaviours and roles are 'objects of national concern', and as such they are closely monitored and controlled

(Puri 2004, p. 115) and this is what happens to Polish women in the UK. There are restrictions exercised on the choice of a partner for their marital and sexual relations. Pryke (1998) suggests that nationalist ideology insist on 'national sexual duty' e.g. an individual is required to seek a partner within his or her national or ethnic group and some forum users required this from Polish women in the UK.

Within the nationalist approach also state-based regulation related to reproduction is also targeted at women (Puri 2004; McClintock 1997). Women's bodies are controlled through anti-abortion laws and as such it means that women have no right as individuals to make decisions about their own bodies (Milic 1996). Such control is also often done in the name of religion and moral values (Melchiori 2001) and this is a case in Poland where strict anti-abortion law is in place. Pryke (1998) alleges that nationalism in its view of gender and sexuality does not allow any space for women's agency.

Furthermore, attitudes to gender and sexuality in Polish culture are influenced by patriarchy (Hauser et al. 1993). As Liu (1994) argues, patriarchal ideology constructs specific meaning of sexuality as to serve the interests of men rather than those of women. It is the men who are allowed to have sexual desires and sexual freedom, and not the women (Abbott et al. 2005) and this can be observed in relation to Polish women in the UK. According to Liu (1994) a woman is expected to abstain from sexual activities and any contravention of these rules is severely punished, as women are then stigmatized and labelled negatively and this is what Polish women in the UK experience. Melosik (2002) suggests that women's sexual activity may lead to anxiety amongst men, as they become afraid of losing power over women as well as losing them as potential sexual partners.

As it was outlined earlier, the nationalist discourse is dominant in Poland and this analysis showed that this discourse in a way "travelled" with migrants. Within this discourse women and their bodies are constructed in a specific way; they are not only a national symbol, but also sexualised aspects of the body are seen in particular ways. However, counter-discourses were created in the process of discussions such as liberal one, which gives women choice in relation to their lives and does not prescribe strict gender and sexual roles. These two discourses have been battled over on 'the symbolic terrain' of Polish women's bodies (Liu 1994, p. 37). Liberalism as an ideology in relation to gender is concerned with the language of gender equality and equal rights for women and men. Generally, such a view is mostly held by women and cultivated by the women's movement, but it is still quite limited in Poland, at least in an official public discourse. However, according to Saxonberg (2000), Polish women, especially the younger and the more educated ones are more in favour of gender equality than men. The analysis also showed that some men have liberal views on gender and sexuality.

In the UK women have more opportunities to interact with a more liberal context. In addition, attitudes are liberal and more personal freedom and choice is allowed in relation to gender and sexuality. This more liberal context offers a lot to women and they are the ones who use these opportunities and this is heavily criticized by some men. It can be observed within discussions that women actively argue against nationalist, patriarchal and conservative views. As Einhorn (1996) alleges, women refuse gender and sexuality constructions imposed on them by others and they want to be able to construct their own understandings. Einhorn (1996) also argues that

women open up the spaces for interethnic dialogue and this is also the case with Polish women in the UK.

However, Poles in the UK encounter not only liberal attitudes but also conservative and patriarchal attitudes from people of other ethnic origins than their own. Within such views, liberated women are seen as commodified and prone to 'sexual exploitation' and such a view also does not allow for women's agency. The analysis shows that some migrant men of other ethnic origins appear to impose their understandings of gender and sexuality on Polish women and men.

There are different constructions of female body and sexuality in Poland and the UK. In the UK, sex is separated from reproduction, and in Poland within the official public gender and sexuality context, sex is constructed as closely connected to reproduction and a strict anti-abortion law is in place. Also, in the UK, women are decision makers with regard to the reproductive sides of their lives, and on the other hand, in Poland, this decision has been made for them in the form of a strict anti-abortion law. This law in Poland takes away women's rights to control their own bodies and reproduction, but women gain this right in the UK. The suggestion that there may be Polish women who undergo abortion in the UK caused stir among some discussants, whilst others thought it was a normal phenomenon. Moreover, whilst some women used legally available abortion services run by the NHS, other women resorted to other alternative ways by undergoing abortion in private clinics, or made a use of "abortion underground". However, for some women liberal attitudes to sexuality and availability of free access to abortion in the UK may not really be important, as it is likely that shame and the lack of language knowledge pushes some women to the underground when they seek help in situations where they want to terminate the unplanned pregnancy.

---

## Conclusion

This chapter looked at the constructions of gendered and sexualised body within Polish migration to the UK. Not much attention has been paid to body within the migration process and this paper attempts to fill this gap. It shows how bodies are becoming 'gendered' and sexualised within migration space (Jackson and Scott 2001). In wider terms, this chapter also contributed to the debate on gender, sexuality and migration. It also showed how the use of novel research techniques such as the analysis of internet forum discussions can help in extending knowledge about gender and sexuality within the migration process.

The analysis showed that gender and sexuality ideologies and contexts have a great impact on people's views on body, particularly on women's bodies. It also demonstrated that gender and sexual ideologies and practices are negotiated and reshaped as part of the migration process (McIlwaine et al. 2006; Datta et al. 2008), where different views on gender and sexuality as well of intersections of these with ethnicity come into play. Gender and sexuality are both reconstructed and reproduced within the transnational space; in the opinion of Dannecker (2005), especially women's migration initiates transformations of gender and this was the case in this



research, which also revealed women's liberalising agency. However, some men were trying to reinforce conservative views on gender and sexuality. As Akpınar (2003) suggests, in the migration context, men who are discriminated and as a result frustrated and who additionally hold conservative views, will attempt to exert pressure on females to hold onto patriarchal values. However, many women were questioning these norms through their individual practices (Mahler and Pessar 2006) and some men did the same. At the same time, some women relied on the sexuality constructions prevalent in Poland and considered abortion as too private an issue to be able to seek help in the public health system.

Practices concerning women's bodies and their sexualities are in flux within this migration process. Two intersecting processes are taking place in relation to sexual practices within this migration. Firstly, the process of liberalisation of sexual practices i.e. women in the new context construct more liberal sexual practices and embrace the 'sexual freedom' of the new context. Secondly, the process of 'nationalisation' of sexual practices is ongoing. As the new multicultural context offers opportunities to mix with people of other ethnic origins than Polish and some women and also men engage in relationships of varied nature with people of other than Polish ethnic origins, such relations are perceived negatively by some Polish men as well as men of other ethnic backgrounds than Polish, who then try to impose their conservative views on Polish women and men. It appears that women's views are changing in the new environment but not all the men's do, or at least women find it liberating in gender and sexual terms.

---

## References

- Abbott, P., Wallace, C., & Tyler, M. (2005). *An introduction to sociology. Feminist perspectives*. London: Routledge.
- Akpınar, A. (2003). The honour/shame complex revisited: Violence against women in the migration context. *Women's Studies International Studies*, 26(5), 425–442.
- Bator, J. (1999). *Wizerunek Kobiety w Polskiej Debacie Politycznej: Perspektywa Feministyczna* [The woman's image in the Polish public debate]. Warsaw: Institute for Public Affairs.
- Booth, S. (2005). Looking-glass women? A comparative analysis of gender and nation in Britain and the Czech Republic. In V. Tolz & S. Booth (Eds.), *Nation and gender in contemporary Europe*. London: Palgrave.
- Bordo, S. (2004). The body and the reproduction of femininity. In M. Kimmell & A. Aronson (Eds.), *The gendered society reader*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Byrne, M. (2001). Data analysis strategies for qualitative research – Research corner. *AORN Journal*, 1. [http://findarticles.com/p/articles/mi\\_m0FSL/is\\_6\\_74/ai\\_81218986/](http://findarticles.com/p/articles/mi_m0FSL/is_6_74/ai_81218986/). Accessed 28 Mar 2010.
- Charles, N. (2002). *Gender in modern Britain*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Dannecker, P. (2005). Transnational migration and the transformation of gender relations: The case of Bangladeshi labour migrants. *Current Sociology*, 53, 655–674.
- Datta, K., McIlwaine, C., Herbert, J., Evans, Y., May, J., & Wills, J. (2008). *Mobile masculinities: Men, migration and low paid work in London*. University of Queen Mary, London. <http://www.geog.qmul.ac.uk/globalcities/reports/docs/wp9.pdf>. Accessed 2 Feb 2009.
- Donato, K., Gabaccia, D., Holdaway, J., Manalansan, M., & Pessar, P. (2006). A glass half full? Gender in migration studies. *International Migration Review*, 40(1), 3–26.
- Duch-Krzysztożek, D. (1997). *Malzeństwo, Seks, Prokreacja. Analiza Socjologiczna* [Marriage, sex and procreation. Sociological analysis]. Warsaw: IFIS PAN.

- Einhorn, B. (1996). Gender, ethnicity, and nationalism. *Women's Studies International Forum*, 19(1/2), 1–3.
- Erel, U., Morokvasic, M., & Shinozaki, K. (2002). Introduction bringing gender into migration. In M. Morokvasic-Muller, K. Shinozaki, & U. Erel (Eds.), *Crossing borders and shifting boundaries* (Gender on the move. International Women's University, Vol. 1). Opladen: Leske and Budrich.
- Fereday, J., & Muir-Cochrane, E. (2006). Demonstrating rigor using thematic analysis: A hybrid approach of inductive and deductive coding and theme development. *International Journal of Qualitative Methods*, 5 (1). [http://www.ualberta.ca/~iiqm/backissues/5\\_1/PDF/FEREDAY.PDF](http://www.ualberta.ca/~iiqm/backissues/5_1/PDF/FEREDAY.PDF). Accessed 5 Apr 2010.
- Foucault, M. (1991). *Discipline and punish: The birth of the prison*. London: Penguin.
- Gontarczyk, E. (1995). *Kobiecosc i Meskosc jako Kategorie Społeczno-Kulturowe w Studiach Feministycznych* [Femininity and masculinity as socio-cultural categories in feminist studies]. Poznan: Eruditus.
- Graff, A. (2008). *Kobieta i Odmieniec – Zakładnicy Narodu* [Woman and the other – Prisoners of the Nation]. *Krytyka Polityczna* [Political Critique]. <http://www.krytykapolityczna.pl/Teksty-poza-KP/Graff-Kobieta-i-odmieniec-zakladnicy-narodu/menu-id-129.html>. Accessed 5 May 2008.
- Hauser, E., Heyns, B., & Mansbridge, J. (1993). Feminism in the interstices of politics and culture: Poland in transition. In N. Funk & M. Mueller (Eds.), *Gender politics and post-communism. Reflections from Eastern Europe and The Former Soviet Union*. London: Routledge.
- Hewson, C., Yule, P., Laurent, D., & Vogel, C. (2003). *Internet research methods: A practical guide for the social and behavioural sciences*. London: Sage.
- Home Office. (2009). *Accession monitoring report May 2004 – December 2008*. A joint online report between the Border and Immigration Agency, the Department of Work and Pensions, the HM Revenue & Customs and Communities and Local Government. [http://www.ukba.homeoffice.gov.uk/sitecontent/documents/aboutus/reports/accession\\_monitoring\\_report](http://www.ukba.homeoffice.gov.uk/sitecontent/documents/aboutus/reports/accession_monitoring_report). Accessed 1 Apr 2009.
- Jackson, S., & Scott, S. (2001). Putting the body's feet on the ground: Towards a sociological reconceptualization of gendered and sexual embodiment. In K. Backett-Milburn & L. McKie (Eds.), *Constructing gendered bodies*. London: Palgrave.
- Kramer, A. M. (2007). The abortion debate in Poland; Opinion polls, ideological politics, citizenship and the erasure of gender as a category of analysis. In J. E. Johnson & J. C. Robinson (Eds.), *Living gender after communism*. Bloomington: Indiana University Press.
- Ksieniewicz, M. (2004). Specyfika polskiego feminizmu [Specificity of Polish feminism]. *Kultura i Historia* [Culture and History], 6. <http://www.kulturaihistoria.umcs.lublin.pl/archives/169>. Accessed 6 June 2008.
- Liu, L. (1994). The female body and nationalist discourse: The field of life and death revisited. In I. Grewal & C. Kaplan (Eds.), *Scattered hegemonies: Postmodernity and transnational feminist practices*. Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press.
- Lorber, J. (1999). Embattled terrain: Gender and sexuality. In M. M. Ferree, J. Lorber, & B. H. Hess (Eds.), *Revisioning gender*. London: Sage.
- Lorber, J. (2005). *Gender inequality: Feminist theories and politics*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Lorber, J., & Martin, P. (2008). The socially constructed body: Insights from feminist theory. In P. Kivisto (Ed.), *Illuminating social life classical and contemporary theory revisited*. London: Pine Forge Press.
- Mahler, S., & Pessar, P. (2006). Gender matters: Ethnographers bring gender from the periphery toward the core of migration studies. *International Migration Review*, 40(1), 27–63.
- Markham, A. (2005). The methods, politics and ethics of representation in online ethnography. In N. Denzin & Y. Lincoln (Eds.), *The sage handbook of qualitative research*. London: Sage.
- McClintock, A. (1997). No longer in a future heaven: Gender, race and nationalism. In A. McClintock, A. Muftić, & E. Shohat (Eds.), *Dangerous liaisons: Gender, nation, and postcolonial perspectives*. Minneapolis: Minnesota University Press.

- McDowell, L., Batnitzky, A., & Dyer, S. (2008). Migration, employment and gender divisions of labour. In J. Scott, S. Dex, & H. Joshi (Eds.), *Women and employment: Changing lives and new challenges*. Cheltenham: Edward Elgar.
- McIlwaine, C., Datta, K., Evans, Y., Herbert, J., May, J., & Wills, J. (2006). *Gender and ethnic identities among low paid migrant workers in London*. <http://www.geog.qmul.ac.uk/globalcities/reports/docs/workingpaper4.pdf>. Accessed 2 Feb 2008.
- Melchiori, P. (2001). Women redefining politics: Between new challenges and old illusions. In V. Demos & M. Texler Segal (Eds.), *An international challenge to theory. Advances in gender research* (Vol. 5). London: JAI.
- Melosik, Z. (2002). *Kryzys Meskosci w Kulturze Wspolczesnej* [The crisis of masculinity in contemporary culture]. Poznan: Wolumin
- Miles, R., & Small, S. (1999). Racism and ethnicity. In S. Taylor (Ed.), *Sociology: Issues and debates*. Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan.
- Milic, A. (1996). Nationalism and sexism: Eastern Europe in transition. In R. Caplan & J. Feffer (Eds.), *Europe's new nationalisms: States and minorities in conflict*. New York: Oxford University Press.
- Nash, J. (2008). Re-thinking intersectionality. *Feminist Review*, 89(1), 1–15.
- Nowicka, W. (1996). Roman catholic fundamentalism against women's reproductive rights in Poland. *Reproductive Health Matters*, 8, 21–29.
- Pankowska, D. (2005). *Wychowanie a Role Plciowe* [Bringing up and gender roles]. Gdansk: GWP.
- Pascall, G., & Kwak, A. (2005). *Gender regimes in transition in central and eastern Europe*. Bristol: Policy Press.
- Petersen, A. (2003). Research on men and masculinities: Some implications of recent theory for future work. *Men and Masculinities*, 6(1), 54–69.
- Pilcher, J. (1999). *Women in contemporary Britain. An introduction*. London: Routledge.
- Pilkington, A. (2003). *Racial disadvantage and ethnic diversity in Britain*. London: Palgrave.
- Pryke, S. (1998). Nationalism and sexuality, what are the issues? *Nations and Nationalism*, 4(4), 529–546.
- Puri, J. (2004). *Encountering nationalism*. Oxford: Blackwell.
- Romano, N., Donovan, C., Chen, H., & Nunamaker, J. F. (2003). A methodology for analyzing web-based qualitative data. *Journal of Management Information Systems*, 19(4), 213–246.
- Rutter, H., & Smith, G. W. H. (2005). Ethnographic presence in a nebulous setting. In C. Hine (Ed.), *Virtual methods. Issues in social research and the internet*. Oxford: Berg.
- Saxonberg, S. (2000). Polish women in the mid 1990s. *Czech Sociological Review*, 8(2), 244–253.
- Sharp, J. (1996). Gendering nationhood: A feminist engagement with national identity. In N. Duncan (Ed.), *Bodyspace: Destabilizing geographies of gender and sexuality*. New York: Routledge.
- Siara, B. (2009). UK poles and the negotiation of gender and ethnic identity in cyberspace. In K. Burrell (Ed.), *Polish migration to the UK in the "new" European Union. After 2004*. Farnham: Ashgate.
- Smith, H. L. (2000). The women's movement, politics and citizenship, 1960s–2000. In I. Zweiniger-Bargielowska (Ed.), *Women in twentieth-century Britain*. London: Longman.
- Vertovec, S. (2007). Super-diversity and its implications. *Ethnic and Racial Studies*, 30(6), 1024–1054.
- Yuval-Davis, N., & Anthias, F. (1989). *Woman – Nation – State*. Basingstoke: Macmillan.
- Zielinska, E. (2000). Between ideology, politics and common sense: The discourse of reproductive rights in Poland. In S. Gal & G. Kligman (Eds.), *Reproducing gender politics, publics, and everyday life after socialism*. Chichester: Princeton University Press.
- Zweiniger-Bargielowska, I. (2000). Introduction. In I. Zweiniger-Bargielowska (Ed.), *Women in twentieth-century Britain*. London: Longman.

---

## **Part IV**

# **Marriage and Family**

---

# Men's Experiences and Masculinity Transformations

## Migration and Family Reunification in the Bangladeshi Diaspora in Italy

Francesco Della Puppa

---

### Alte Ceccato, the New Border of Bangladeshi Diaspora

In Bangladesh emigrants are called “*londoni*” or “*probashi*”. The first nickname derives from one of the first destinations in Bangladeshi migration history: London and Great Britain in general. With the growth of Bangladeshi migration towards other European destinations, this term has become used for all the countries of settlement. The second term literally means “external inhabitants” and it is frequently substituted by “*bideshi*” deriving from *bi-desh* (“the foreign country”), as opposed to *Bangla-desh* (“country where people speak Bangla”) (Gardner 1995).

My study targets the *probashi* of Alte Ceccato, a little hamlet of Montecchio Maggiore, a town in the province of Vicenza (Italy).

At the end of 2009 Montecchio Maggiore had 23,857 inhabitants, 18.28 % of whom were immigrants. Over the last 10 years, the percentage of immigrants has almost tripled. If we consider only Alte Ceccato, the percentage of immigrants has almost doubled with immigrants now constituting 35 % of the total 6,447 inhabitants. Bangladeshis form the majority of these immigrants.

While walking through Piazza San Paolo crowded with Bangladeshi people, especially men, S., who is walking with me, says: “Have you seen that? All niggers,<sup>1</sup> few Italians, all us Bangla as in Bangladesh”.

---

<sup>1</sup>The term derives from the translation of the Italian word “negri” (corresponding to its English homologue “niggers”) which is the pejorative synonym of the less offensive word “neri” (blacks). I think that the protagonist of my ethnographic diary chose the term unconsciously, as a consequence of the assonance between the two words “negro” and “nero” in the Italian language. I do not think it is a result of an internalization of the dominant racist *doxa*. Even if the used language and the adoption of this racist term surely reveal linguistic *habitus* which the subjects incorporated following the daily absorption of such signifiers.

F. Della Puppa (✉)  
Department of Philosophy, Sociology, Education & Applied Psychology,  
University of Padua, Padua, Italy  
e-mail: francesco.dellapuppa@unipd.it

I would like to ask him if he is comforted by the presence of so many compatriots but I only manage to awkwardly answer: “So, sometimes you feel like you are at home?”

With a serious look and a rather melancholic expression, as though he had been expecting my question, he says: “This is never possible. It doesn’t happen when I go home to Bangladesh either”. (Ethnographic Diary)

Bangladeshi community migration presents the characteristics of a *diaspora*. The Alte Ceccato *bidesh* constitutes a “multiple community” (Clifford 1997) “without propinquity” (Faist 2000), composed of a *stabilized* and *settled* population that deploys international solidarity and migrant networks (Castles 2004; Ambrosini 2005) consisting of multiple bonds of attachment. The Bangladeshi men of Alte Ceccato try, through negotiating practices, to fit into the immigration context and to accept its social and political norms, but also to resist and contravene them. This is a community that builds around a mythical image of its homeland a unique, stable and active identity reference that forges collective diasporic memberships. These collective feelings emerge as a result of worrying about the support and the development of the homeland as well as of the attention dedicated to the political and cultural events happening in the biggest places of Bangladeshi diaspora:

[Talking about the Bangladeshi community most viewed TV networks] They are Bengali, but controlled by England. They are in Bangladesh and also here. They do TV programs in Bangladesh, they go to... which country... maybe Singapore, through Singapore they link with satellite, broadcast from England and then in the whole Europe and also Italy. Here we see it by satellite dish, from about three years, five maybe. Not before. We are lucky always to see these channels. They give many things about our country, politics, social system, economy, everything. [...] Now in the English parliament there is a woman from Bangladesh. Have you heard that a woman from our country is now in the English parliament? We are all happy, also here, it’s like an acknowledgement, you know? It took about 50 years, but it’s important, you know? (Bangladeshi immigrant man)

The Alte Ceccato Bangladeshi community presents the diaspora’s constitutive characteristics as identified by Clifford (1997). The Bangladeshi diaspora originates through a detachment from an original centre -or to better identify the current international migration from the South to the North of the world, from a *periphery*- and it settles in at least two places -*peripheral* in relation to the homeland but *central* in relation to the unequal global division of labour (Wallerstein 1974, 1980). The Bangladeshi diaspora unites Asia with Europe; the communities living in the petrol monarchies with the communities settled in the Asiatic South-East; the generational turnover of *Londoni* in Great Britain with the *probashi* communities in Italy and Spain. Moreover, Bangladeshi immigrants keep an idealized memory of their homeland that becomes “a sacred place, a blessed place, a holy land” (Sayad 2006, p. 83), where they periodically go on pilgrimage, “reaching the purpose of every pilgrimage, return to the origins” (Sayad 2006, p. 83). It represents not only a utopian waiting for a definitive return, a physical and a geographic return, but also a return to the self, to the group and, above all, to the time before the emigration, return to the memory. But the impossibility of a real return screams in silence as an

unspeakable truth. A *social "unsaid"* linked to the tacit knowledge that *migration changes everything* and that, even if there was a return, it would not be a cure against the pain of diaspora. This "nostalgia of the present" (Jameson 1991) is not a nostalgia of space but a nostalgia of time, a nostalgia born from the awareness that, even if it is possible to return to the *place* of departure (occasionally), it is not possible to return to the *moment* of departure. So, in a low voice and far from compatriots, it is possible to trust the "stranger" described by Simmel (1908), in this case the researcher who gives the immigrant a moment to reflect on himself: "[To feel at home?] It doesn't happen when I go home to Bangladesh, either".

The Bangladeshi diasporic identity is forged by the perception (supported by real elements of the social, material and political condition) of not being entirely accepted in the country of settlement. Against the hostility encountered in the country of settlement, Bangladeshi men deploy and oppose, in different ways, a group solidarity mostly defined *through the generations* by the persistence of a relationship with the homeland.

The migratory phenomenon of Alte Ceccato shows a crucial characteristic of Bangladeshi diaspora in Europe and in Italy more generally.

In the 1980s the Bangladeshi presence in Italy was minimal, however, since the 1990s the peninsula has become an important migratory destination, especially Rome where 92 % of Bangladeshi immigrants reside. The settlement in the capital city has been so fast that this community (formed almost exclusively of *middle class men*) has become the biggest of the European Bangladeshi communities after the one in Britain (Knights 1996). Moreover, a new phenomenon emerged in the 1990s which is the territorial scattering of the Bangladeshi people throughout Italy. Those with a regular residence permit and work sought to leave Rome in order to obtain better social, working and housing conditions (Knights 1996; Zeitlyn 2006). So, it is in socio-territorial contexts such as Alte Ceccato that many Bangladeshi migrants in the diaspora start a *stabilization process*. This process implies the realization of a *family project* through reunification with their relatives. At the same time, as the Italian immigration policies allow migrant workers to reunite *only* some families (ascendants, descendants and partner), the migrant family is set up as a family "forced into the nuclear family model". In such contexts we also witness the birth and the socialization of the second generation.

The current state of the Bangladeshi presence in this small part of the Italian North-East provides insights into the processes of socio-familial consolidation and stabilization for Bangladeshi migration. Bangladeshi migration presents a strong diasporic nature, develops a sensible tendency towards *familiarization* and a consolidated disposition towards reunification. These characteristics are also confirmed by the high presence of Bangladeshi children in every kind of Alte Ceccato school:

In some classes of the primary school we have almost 50% of Bangladeshi children. But if we look at the nursery school there is an even higher percentage, mostly in the Piaget school that is often in the newspapers because there are classes with 80%, this year also with 100%, of foreign children, almost all coming from Bangladesh. (Italian teacher)

## Family Reunification and Waged Work for the Family

Along with the gendered nature of the Bangladeshi diaspora, in which it is nearly always a *male* first-migrant opening the migratory chain, the families are reunited by *men*. Women's presence is, in almost all the cases, linked to reunification with husbands and has economic, material and emotional meaning in the immigration context:

Every month I had to send part of my income to them, but if they were here with me, it wouldn't be necessary to send money. Besides we are united now. (Bangladeshi immigrant man)

As part of an economic, social and emotional stabilization strategy, a passage to build a solid life project, a step towards an individual and collective emancipation, a release from a *Gastarbeiter* condition, family reunification would allow migrant men to adapt their daily routine to more ideal modes of existential planning.

This stabilization involves the sphere of emotions, a family organization and a family *restructuring process* from the *extended* to the *nuclear* family. This process is strictly linked to stabilization of work (or rather to productive capacity and the capacity to endure available working conditions), a requirement imposed by the Italian migration policies on migrant workers that wish to complete their family reunification.

I work fixed [contract] can't bring wife... Difficult, contract of three months, okay, you bring all, done all, taken home, after contract over, after they don't give another contract and so what do!?! When they [the employer] done contract open-end I was sure 100%: now I bring. Don't think, don't cry, not sad, now I ok, I phoned my wife: "Open-end contract! The contract is open-end, now problem is over, now the only thing is time, but you come for sure!"

Open-end contract is very important. Everything comes after. Without open-end contract they will not give you *nulla osta* [a permit], so you will not get to rent home... You need open-end contract before. (Bangladeshi immigrant man)

Waged work contributes to an adult man's success and strengthens his personal position. It is through waged work that Bangladeshi men build the pride of the "men who sustain the family" (Seccombe 1993) and who become responsible for the family.

I am foreigner, my family, we are foreigner, and everything depends on work... For example if I lose my work or if I am sick, all family on the road. (Bangladeshi immigrant man)

Waged work also contributes to family *structural transformation*, since the reunited family becomes a "western nuclear family" based upon a "male breadwinner regime". It implies a break with the extended family in the homeland that receives a smaller part of the economic resources from the *bidesh*.

The source of masculine "pride" is represented by the coincidence of the personal salary and the "familial salary". Indeed, now the immigrant worker's pay packet does not serve only to assure the regular remittances towards the homeland



but it must also assure personal family reproduction and the fulfilment of his loved ones' needs.

My work is the condition for my family! Very important for family, but also I can stay here if I work, my permit, permit is for my work. Because if I'm without work police doesn't give me residence permit for four years, but for six months and then... away!

When I've problem I think it's problem for everyone [of the family]. (Bangladeshi immigrant man)

In this way, waged work constitutes the cornerstone of the construction of masculinity (Conway-Long 2006; Donaldson and Howson in Donaldson et al. 2009). However, material difficulties, difficult working conditions and exploitation are structurally tied to the immigrant condition (Ambrosini 2005) and define a type of work that is "only for immigrant men":

You want to find an easy job... in an institution, behind the desk, not like our job, a job you [Italians] don't want to do anymore. (Ethnographic diary)

Hard work, "real (immigrant) man's" work, is often inferior relative to their personal proficiencies and the education they achieved in their homeland. This discrepancy gives a multitude of meanings to Bangladeshi men's lives, to their migratory project and to their "being a man".

Immigrant workers express the awareness of being instrumentally used, being reduced to cheap 'hands' and being discredited in the face of a professionalism that would give them greater social recognition in their homeland. They are aware of the inevitable social downgrading embedded in the South-to-North migration. They are, indeed, aware that their social position is determined by the intersection between the global hierarchy of nations and the country of immigration's social stratification.

Forced to give up their working and professional conditions to migrate and *to bring with them their family* (or a part of it), Bangladeshi men do not manage to obtain work commensurate with their qualifications.

In order to fulfil housing and wage parameters, which represent a condition for family reunification under migration policy, the Bangladeshi immigrant man must mentally and physically discipline himself from a working and a social point of view. Thus, he discovers a new discipline of the family embedded in the nuclear family structure.

This determination can be seen in the waged work that immigrants execute day by day, year by year for their whole life. It becomes a "moral" virtue (Pringler and Whithinui in Donaldson et al. 2009). Waged work constitutes a key element of migrant masculinity. It must be seen in relation to expectations towards the relationships socially constructed as "feminine" and assigned to their wives, i.e. the reproductive and caring work delegated to them.

The wage ensures respect for the Bangladeshi man, as well as obedience and loyalty. Waged work is symbolically more relevant than domestic and care work. Wages build a system of values in (productive and reproductive) relationships in the context of capitalism (Donaldson 1987) and patriarchy, which provide men with the

responsibility and capability to protect/control the family. At the same time, a masculine “sense of honour” is reinforced because a wife’s satisfaction is understood as tied to a man’s earning capacity. This ideal that links a husband’s earning capacity and the wife’s satisfaction reinforces the masculine “sense of honour”. However there is a “dark side” to this “sense of honour” because as interviewees described, they are not willing to share the humiliations suffered at the workplace with their wives and so, experience these alone. In this way, the self image they have cultivated is not damaged in the eyes of their family.

Usually in the place of work we foreigner people are not so... [treated] well... not so well. In all the factories the 90% of us is not treated well, for us is bad. They don’t like foreigner people. Also a bit of... I tell you only the truth, also a bit of racism in this zone. I’ve seen it yes. So even if you work well nobody respect much foreigner people. [...] We a bit of... a bit in silence, because we foreigner people don’t talk much, we don’t talk much, we prefer to stay a bit in silence. (Bangladeshi immigrant man)

I’ve got a very painful work, the people, there, is very bad people, they call me like... “negro” [nigger], they also do this [he hits his own shoulder] every now and then. Also do this, every now and then [He hits his own face] [...] “Idiot!” They immediately say so! “Away! Leave this place”.

It’s absolutely racism! Also they told me: “We don’t like you!”

Of this I didn’t tell her [the wife] anything. Because I didn’t explain her they do so, didn’t talk so... (Bangladeshi immigrant man)

---

## Biographic Transformations in the Person and in the Family

Reunifying the family in a new life context assumes also a certain symbolic value, for this process becomes the tangible evidence of migration success, of the fulfilment of familial, social and life objectives. It is the confirmation of a migrant’s realization as a man, as an adult and as a Bangladeshi.

Achieving family reunification is a passage that marks self-realization and achievement for Bangladeshi men. Moreover, it involves the *admittance to adulthood* and the strengthening of their *social identity* as *men*. It also means being a man and having “morality”, but, most of all, it means to be an adult: independent and untied from their original family.

Life prior to migration and becoming the family provider in the diaspora once reunification has been achieved, emerges as a “preparatory phase”, a “run-up” to the “leap in life” or simply as a “no-life”. “Before it wasn’t life! Now it’s good”.

Reuniting the family, in addition to completing successful migration, becomes a *rite of institution* (Bourdieu 1982) embedded in the migratory experience that involves the beginning of a new existential condition and the acquisition of (regard and) respect by their compatriots. It represents a *ritual of foundation* through which the authority embedded in the “new” family and, mostly, in the national community of the diasporic context gives to the subject a new *status*. The actor is a worthy

person because he has satisfied the norms decided by the dominant part of the community, the men who have already reunified their family.

The family reunification process (re)confirms the normative familial relationships between genders and generations. Furthermore, it redefines the identity borders between men (who reunite), women and children (who are reunited), but also between the men who reunite (increasing in this way the personal *symbolic capital* and the personal honour) and the ones who cannot reunite (who are symbolically included in the group of women, children and men who are not mature enough, men who are not “virile” enough).

If for the Italian men of some generations ago (Saraceno and Naldini 2001), as for the Bangladeshi men in their country, marriage (and sons) meant the entrance into the adult world, in the diaspora this “social transubstantiation” happens through family reunification. In a historical period characterized by an intensification of migratory processes, the passage instituted by marriage overlaps the geographical (but also symbolic and biographical) transition, which is constituted by the entrance into the *bidesh* which simultaneously coincides with a biographical transition towards adulthood. *bidesh* becomes the *conditio sine qua non* to “begin life”, to become emancipated from a condition of mere survival on a socio-material level and of incomplete realization on a familiar and personal level.

Carrying out their duty towards themselves and their family through the migratory process, corresponding to “migratory obsession/possession” which Sayad (1999) refers to, are not sufficient conditions to gain manhood anymore. In order to build their identity/image of men of honour, to gain their sense of male adulthood, another fundamental institution is needed, (re)building of their family in the country of immigration. Subsequently, the realization of this biographic, personal and familiar transition becomes possible through the migration experience where the emigrant becomes more desirable on the matrimonial market because he has enriched his *status*. So, migration and family reunification become basic elements of Bangladeshi masculinity. Bangladeshi men emigrate as unmarried men to begin a “*virilization*” process and subsequently, they reunite their family to complete the “evolution” as adult men.

---

## To Marry and to Reunite in the Bangladeshi Diaspora

The administrative act that institutes family reunification hides from the host society the matrimonial dynamics and the family projects of many Bangladeshi migrants. In the personal and matrimonial biography of the *probashi*, reunification is an event that overlaps with the wedding or, at least, happens very soon after the wedding celebration.<sup>2</sup> After having achieved “administrative regularization” through being granted a residence permit and after socio-material stabilization through a work contract and a house required by law, Bangladeshi

---

<sup>2</sup>Usually a marriage arranged by their families and then celebrated during holidays in their own homeland (Erricchiello 2009).

men, who emigrated unmarried, return to their homeland to marry a compatriot. Their desirability on the wedding market has increased because of the migratory experience and their entry into the *bidesh*. The continuation of the practice of arranged marriage as well as the practice of both intra-community and endogamous matrimony must be connected to the norms and to the socio-cultural values of the country of origin and also of the diasporic context. It must also be connected to the social exclusion and dynamics of expulsion related to the autochthonous wedding market that migrants experience. As the interviewees say, it is difficult for a Bangladeshi immigrant to be accepted as a friend by autochthonous men and to create with them relations that go beyond the mere sharing of workplaces. So it will be even more difficult for them to have a “romantic” relationship with autochthonous women. In fact, in Islamic cultures, as in Mediterranean societies, “a woman represents the tension and/or the mediation element *par excellence* between cultural systems [...]. The women are, indeed, the “instrument” through which a man can enter in the group. For this reason, feminine purity is accurately controlled and, if transgressed, brutally punished”. (Douglas 1996, p. 200; also in Saint-Blancat 2000, pp. 182–184) In fact, a man preserves his family and his own honor (Benkheira 1997; Bourdieu 1972; Douglas 1996; Gardner 1995; Scaraffia 1988) through the control of feminine purity (which can be observed in the movements, in the aesthetics as well as in the social and relational behavior).

The repelling force of the wedding market in the receiving society is compensated for by how attractive migrants become in their countries of origin. This attraction is fed by the increase of the economic and *symbolic capital*, along with a big range of socio-material possibilities that diaspora gives them, and so *Londoni* acquire a significant *power* of wedding bargaining and a larger margin of autonomy to choose a partner.

The “diasporic reinforcement” of the “traditional” wedding practise (a combined result of a symbolic closure of the wedding market dynamics in the *bidesh* and the greater desirability acquired in the homeland) can frustrate the different aspirations that men and women construct around the ideal of a new *status* in a new context:

They [wives] thought a good life here. So they arrived here. For example my country, when they were there, all work at home, there was a person who helped at home, as a domestic [...] Women when they arrived here have seen that it's hard they must do all these works at home by themselves. For women it was difficult. Then slowly they also understand. It's life. That's the truth. (Bangladeshi immigrant man)

Women who enter the diaspora through marriage, experience a “collective disregard of emigration truth” (Sayad 1999). This is constituted through lies about the social downgrading and conditions experienced in migration that reproduce the illusions about the exile land and make the diaspora more tolerable. Women, in fact, often have to undertake dual employment in Italy (productive and reproductive) but also to be as invisible in Italy as they are absent in the country of origin. The “double presence” (Balbo 1978) connected to the social downgrading embedded in the

diaspora overlaps the “double absence” (Sayad 1999) of the new emigrant/immigrant *status*, causing frustration, solitude and unsuitability in the men who have reunited their new brides:

I in my life here have just two things: children and wife, but wife doesn't care about me, cares just about the children. Also cares for me, but a little, thinks more about them. Because when she sees their future [she thinks] sacrifice: no love, sacrifice. Sons; she cares just for them. But I two things: them and her. But she not: just them... (Bangladeshi immigrant man)

---

## Intergenerational Identity and Citizenship Paths

In addition to the solitude caused by the distance that can occur between a reunited couple, there is also the frustration originating from the awareness that in exile, despite their studies in the homeland, they will remain “manual workers for life” (Sayad 1999), unskilled workers excluded from every form of upward social mobility:

We all work almost in the same thing: I am workman, the ones that made junior high school workmen too; I finished high school I went to university and I also work as a workman, here. (Bangladeshi immigrant man)

[If you immigrate] You are here. And I am here. You are workman, I am workman, we are working, [...] we can't become anybody, you must stay always as a workman as me. (Bangladeshi immigrant man)

In the diaspora, Bangladeshi men come to abandon the illusions of upward mobility that they hoped would result from migration – the dream that pushed them to leave their homeland. Their own life project and what it means to be part of the diaspora is expressed in the search for a better future for the next generation, the children born in the new context. Their self-fulfilment and the success of their migration becomes a social realization, which is possible only through forthcoming generations. The fathers' project is handed down as a baton to their children.

I've got nothing in my future, because what I thought about my future... is finish! I think nothing about my future, all that I thought before is finish, all, not found. Then I think about future of my daughters. How I have to bring them to university. This is my only thought about future. Nothing more. And for me... nothing. I thought once to become a great researcher, engineer... I have not been there. And now I have family here. I just think about my daughter. For me no future... I want my daughter grow... until the end of university. For me nothing: that's all. (Bangladeshi immigrant man)

The important thing is that he's not a steelworker<sup>8</sup> as his father. For my son I don't want. [...] If good head... also doctor or engineer. Maybe... let's see, at least in an office. No steelworker! (Bangladeshi immigrant man)

I want that my daughters study, ahead until ahead until ahead. Because I work, I make something for my daughters, if they study well, even if I am poor there is no problem. [...] My wealth are my daughters... if they go good then my future is good. (Bangladeshi immigrant man)

Through education, Bangladeshi fathers aim to build for their children a future that is Italian and Bangladeshi at the same time – an existence emblematic of the word “diasporic”.

In this framework of relinquished possibilities and ambivalent feelings, the acquisition of Italian citizenship<sup>3</sup> is an *antidote* against social, material, working and existential precariousness that characterizes immigrant *status*.

I do citizenship so I am more tranquil after, better, after not so many documents to do... you know... at police station every time they ask you lot of documents, do so, so and so... also a lot things you need for house, for family, then municipality doesn't want to give you, then always pay, pay, pay, for all the sons, wife, then there is the stamp, the revenue stamp, many things, problems: many problems for the foreigner ones here, many! Lega Nord [Northern League, an anti-immigration political party]! Racism as... as Mussolini! [laughs]

Italy bad for foreigner ones, it's better France, Germany, England... they're much better! They are open, more open. [...] Let's see: if I manage to take passport we'll see what to do then. Maybe I change country... when little daughters grow I change. (Bangladeshi immigrant man)

In a country where migration policy indissolubly links a breadwinner's work contract with a residency permit, and in an always more deregulated working/labour market, where the termination of employment represents the inevitable anteroom of the expulsion of the whole family, acquiring formal citizenship is a form of *resistance* against the progressive narrowing of immigrants' social citizenship rights. It becomes a stabilization *strategy* for the whole family and, above all, a *guarantee* of geographical mobility in the European space. The possibility to move freely within the European Union (granted to citizens of European Union member states, but not to citizens of “third world countries”) can broaden the range of possibilities of new generations' social realization. Italian citizenship represents a guarantee that permits the easy opening of new gates with other European countries considered, rightly or wrongly, more cosmopolitan and less hostile towards migrants.

With Italian passport you can go... England; but if I find job there, sons study is better. For me educational system of sons in England is better than Italy.

I worked 20 years here, but now I think that maybe I go away in England.

Already five or six persons took Italian citizenship and went away from here. Already gone away. I know. (Bangladeshi immigrant man)

They are always more, they manage [to take] more. Why so many ask [citizenship]? Because we are fed up to go to police station, always lose time, much mess, many words, many money, many words of boss at work. At the police station they treat you... [in a low voice] bad. I mean, good: for the 99,99% of times they treat you bad, then for the rest of times they treat you good [he ironically laughs]. It's so. Then when you lose work you lose permit. When mess at home, you go ten times, twelve times, you don't find offices,

<sup>3</sup>Citizenship in Italy, the European country most reluctant to granting the citizenship, is given after 10 years of regular and continuous stay on national territory. This citizenship is transferred to the sons and to the spouse. (Codini, in Morozzo della Rocca, 2008)

municipality doesn't want, police station doesn't give... Mess at police station. Police station is a bad thing. But other places in Europe are not so. Then if you take the Italian citizenship the mayor don't pester you anymore with house, with problems, understand? (Bangladeshi immigrant man)

*Status civitatis* becomes a *form of protection* through which fathers and husbands (according to the *gendered* migratory dynamics already discussed) try to safeguard a minimum of safety for reunited relatives or for those born in Italy.

The result of this *socio-administrative osmosis*, a process that increases the authority of first-migrant men in the family and also the honour between the compatriots, can be seen in the power embedded in the Italian passport.

In the dialectics between (denied) social citizenship and (desired) formal citizenship, there are substantial citizenship paths practised by Bangladeshi men. One of the most important is *political participation*. The Bangladeshi community in diaspora shows a high level of political organization and an intense associative participation (Mantovan 2007). Bangladeshi men demonstrate an assiduous attendance and a lively participation in many meetings organized by Bangladeshi associations. But *only men* participate in these meetings, many men with their sons, sometimes children who are not even able to walk by themselves. In this way they are weaving together the parental identity and the militant identity, representing simultaneously an ideal model of the scrupulous father and the Bangladeshi man as moral, for their descendants and for the whole Bangladeshi community. To participate in political and association activities becomes a social duty, a moral duty indissolubly linked to family obligations.

Participation in associations and a self-realization linked to political militancy constitute attempts to challenge the adverse position that Bangladeshi men occupy in the informal social hierarchy between the autochthonous and immigrants. At the same time, however, such activities reinforce within the autochthonous community negative images of Bangladeshi men's attitudes towards women.

---

## The Social Polysemy of *Probashi* Islam

On the one hand, migration involves a constant process of social transformation and redefinition of the perception of one's masculinity, as well as a daily negotiation of one's identification. But on the other hand, the stabilization of the *bidesh* presumes a continuous renewal of one's historical and cultural roots and the transmission of a common past which represents a reference also in exile. The religious element, like the linguistic one (Van Schendel 2009), is of utter importance in the process of community building.

There is another fear [worry] for religion because our culture and your culture are a bit different. I want a bit of religion, a bit religious, not too much not like....not like.... well...not fundamentalist but a bit. But I want our daughters close to the religion. That's it. (Bangladeshi immigrant man)

Thus for immigrant fathers Islam is central in the project planned for their children through strategic action. Islam is critical to diasporic educational strategies and to family concerns in the migration context more generally.

Also there [in London] my fellow countrymen...to study the Koran, also madrasa, all this is in London, but here it isn't, it isn't. For our children. [...] [I]mportant for children to think this now. [...] I still don't have citizenship, but I asked, when arrives to me citizenship I [then] bring it to all the family. [...] But for the kids is important my religion how to find a road to God, here it's not like somewhere else, here difficult. Here it isn't, like in my country, madrasa, school, mosque...like in London, so I think [to go to] London... (Bangladeshi immigrant man)

Apart from conveying identity meanings across the international and migratory space in the collective and community context, Islam also becomes an organizing element in the biographical transitions, which allow the attribution of meaning to one's personal story.

These aspects explain constant references to the father figure who represents a model of masculinity, relative to which others can shape their social and religious behavior. This father figure also represents an idealized figure providing inspiration for the socialization of his own children.

Migration deforms every detail of social reality, including religious participation. In fact, in the framework of diaspora, Islam is constantly being adapted to the new context, reinterpreted and redeveloped by the transforming force of hybridization and its related social dynamics. On the other hand, representations created by the autochthonous society propose once again cultural stereotypes which tend to label, crystallize and stigmatize the immigrants of "other cultures". This is specially the case if they come from largely Muslim countries, thus risking the production of conflictual and anomalous situations, the hardening of identity and a retreat into the private domain.

M., who works as a teacher, tells me that two of his ex-students were forced to go back to Bangladesh for a long period, because "according to their father, they became too much occidentalized and wandered far away from the religion". While waiting to interview the father, who is finishing his sunset prayer in the other room, I am talking to his children. They tell me about the summer holidays that they spent in their parents' country of origin so as to visit their grandmother and that they took this occasion to study in depth the Koran, doctrine of their parents, which is not easily accessible in the *bidesh* of Alte Ceccato. The boy and the girl do not seem particularly subjected to their parents' decisions. They rather seem to fit smoothly in the family environment. (Ethnographic Diary)

The attempt to combine, on one side, the deepening of family relationships between the generations with, on the other side, religious knowledge, gets distorted by the autochthonous society until it is eventually reduced to a symbolic violence perpetrated by immigrant fathers towards their own family members.

The actions adopted by the new local government, which are supposed to affect the social conditions of immigrant population, also include reducing the number of Muslim prayer rooms.

"Clash of cultures" -or at least the incompatibility of Islam with Italian society- is the reason given for such changes which are causing agitation in the local context.



Such changes are simultaneously the consequence and the origin of citizens' rights being progressively brought into question on the political level (Basso 2010), as well as of the creation of a latent conflict that will certainly condition the individual choices of the Bangladeshi men in the private sphere.

Yes, sometimes I go [to the mosque]. Not a lot, sometimes. Not a lot. Because I am also scared. Every day a newspaper says, still more often: "Muslims terrorists, Islamic terrorists". [So] I am a bit scared to go to the mosque [...] In the mosque is now Ramadan, in the evening we all eat something together... for thirty days, at the end of the Ramadan it is like a party, no? Eid. A party of Muslims. Some mosques after this party [have] closed, closed now. Closed. Closed. The mosque of Alte [...] now the mayor said: "[In there] no more than 90 people"... or like this.

Me scared. What does it mean scared? I [am] scared that if I go to the mosque maybe they attack me [arrest me], close me, police, they do something to me and then I can't renew my stay permit. When it expires, I can't renew it anymore [if I have problems with the police], I can't renew for family either [not even the permit for the reunited members], this is why [me] scared. So sometimes I pray at home, sometimes I go to mosque, but less now. (Bangladeshi immigrant man)

I don't go [to the mosque] all times: sometime I'm practicing... I'm praying... but these... there's another problem: here we have one cultural centre where we're praying, you know I think.

[...] But from Local Administration... they're making too many problems for us to go there for praying. Because they told we're making [...] disturbance to the others and now they decided [that we can stay into the mosque] not before than 99 people, will be there. So... in this case... so what I did? I'm trying to... not to go all times there: sometime I pray here into my house, because they don't want that other religion... mostly this administration, Comune administration; maybe they don't want other religion, they don't want people practicing their religion here.

Because of... avoiding to create problems to the neighbour [...] or other people they feel disturbed... So if I don't go or I go less at least I will give less trouble to them. This is the thing. (Bangladeshi immigrant man)

Religious belonging and belonging to a practicing community are relevant factors for the social construction of the masculine parental identity as well as that of the Bangladeshi man in the diaspora.

Islam becomes a polysemous reference in the framework of migration, which represents an educational duty towards the descendants born or reunited in Italy. It represents a conceptual map that needs to be passed on them so that they can trace the interpretative categories and reference points useful for orientation in the context of the diaspora. In the meanwhile, however, religious practice and Islamic prayer take the shape of a *corpus* of rituals to be valued in the domestic space in order to avoid a conflict that could possibly harm family well-being. This corresponds to the hostile social and political context that through a masculine figure threatens all the reunited family members.

Consequently, various strategies of *resistance and protection*, which are very often contradictory, are formed around Islam. Bangladeshi men put them into practice with regard to the reunited family and to the image of the community.

## Concluding Considerations

In conclusion, we should think about the material and political conditions that migrants have to face daily and about their impact, in the context of the diaspora, on their gender relationships, cultural and national identities, family practises and educational strategies.

By realizing the future of the family and their descendants, Bangladeshi men of the Alte Ceccato diasporic community try to rebuild honour and the expectations that have been disputed and disregarded during the migratory experience in the (diasporic context) workplaces and in relations with institutions of Italian society. They try to compensate for the subordinate social position they occupy, a position that characterizes their immigrant *status*. They try to reinforce their honour and authority in the eyes of their family and the national community in the new social context.

Diaspora is a process of *constant becoming*, built and negotiated day by day, a process that can engender, in a short time, hardening of cultural and gender identities, but in the long term it can imply a deep and inevitable *transformation* of the individual immigrant and their community also of the autochthonous.

---

## References

- Ambrosini, M. (2005). *Sociologia delle migrazioni*. Bologna: Il Mulino.
- Balbo, L. (1978). La doppia presenza. *Inchiesta*, 32(8), 3–11.
- Basso, P. (Ed.). (2010). *Razzismo di stato. Stati Uniti, Europa, Italia*. Milano: Franco Angeli.
- Benkheira, M. H. (1997). *L'amour de la loi. Essai sur la normativité en Islam*. Paris: Puf.
- Bourdieu, P. (1972). *Esquisse d'une théorie de la pratique précédé de Trois études d'ethnologie kabyle*. Paris: Seuil.
- Bourdieu, P. (1982). *Ce que parler veut dire. L'économie des échanges linguistiques*. Paris: Fayard.
- Castles, S. (2004). The factors that make and unmake migration policies. *International Migration Review*, 3(8), 852–884.
- Clifford, J. (1997). *Routes: Travel and translation in the late 20th century*. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press.
- Codini, E. (2008). L'Acquisto della Cittadinanza: Figli Italiani di Cittadini Stranieri. In P. Morozzo della Rocca (Ed.), *Immigrazione e cittadinanza Profili normativi e giurisprudenziali*. Milano: UTET.
- Conway-Long, D. (2006). Gender, power and social change in Morocco. In L. Ouzgane (Ed.), *Islamic masculinities*. London: Zed Books.
- Donaldson, M. (1987). *Labouring men: Love, sex and strife*. <http://works.bepress.com/mdonaldson/6>. Accessed 3 Mar 2011, Accessed 2 May 2011.
- Donaldson, M., Hibbins, R., Howson, R., & Pease, B. (Eds.). (2009). *Migrant men. Critical studies of masculinities and the migration experience*. New York: Routledge.
- Douglas, M. (1996). *Purity and danger: An analysis of concept of pollution and taboo*. New York: Routledge.
- Erricchiello, G. (2009). Arranged marriage nelle comunità pakistane e bengalesi britanniche. Traduzione culturale e dimensione socio-religiosa. *Mondi Migranti*. doi:10.3280/MM2009-001007.
- Faist, T. (2000). *The volume and dynamics of international migration and transnational social spaces*. New York: Oxford University Press.

- Gardner, K. (1995). *Global migrants, local lives: Migration and transformation in rural Bangladesh*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Jameson, F. (1991). *Postmodernism, or, the cultural logic of late capitalism*. New York: Verso.
- Knights, M. (1996). Bangladeshi in Rome: The political, economic and social structure of a recent migrant group. In M. L. Gentileschi & R. King (Eds.), *Questioni di popolazione in Europa: Una prospettiva geografica* (pp. 129–142). Bologna: Patron Editore.
- Mantovan, C. (2007). *Immigrazione e cittadinanza. Auto-organizzazione e partecipazione dei migranti in Italia*. Milano: Franco Angeli.
- Saint-Blancat, C. (2000). L'immigrazione femminile maghrebina: Nuove identità di genere e mediazioni tra culture. In P. Basso & F. Perocco (Eds.), *Immigrazione e trasformazione della società*. Milano: Franco Angeli.
- Saraceno, C., & Naldini, M. (Eds.). (2001). *Sociologia della famiglia*. Bologna: Il Mulino.
- Sayad, A. (1999). *La double absence. Des illusions de l'émigré aux souffrances de l'immigré*. Paris: Seuil.
- Sayad, A. (2006). *L'immigration ou les paradoxes de l'altérité. I. L'illusion du provisoire*. Paris: Raisons d'agir.
- Scaraffia, L. (1988). Essere uomo, essere donna. In P. Melograni (Ed.), *La famiglia italiana dall'ottocento ad oggi*. Laterza: Roma-Bari.
- Secombe, W. (1993). *Weathering the storm: Working class families from the industrial revolution to the fertility decline*. New York: Verso.
- Simmel, G. (1908). *Soziologie*. Leipzig: Duncker & Humblot.
- Van Schendel, W. (2009). *A history of Bangladesh*. Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University press.
- Wallerstein, I. (1974). *The modern world-system, vol. I: Capitalist agriculture and the origins of the European world-economy in the sixteenth century*. New York/London: Academic.
- Wallerstein, I. (1980). *The modern world-system, vol. II: Mercantilism and the consolidation of the European world-economy, 1600–1750*. New York/London: Academic.
- Zeitlyn, B. (2006). *Migration from Bangladesh to Italy and Spain*. Dhaka: RMMRU.

---

# Shifting Gender Roles and Shifting Power Relations

## Immigrant/Migrant Nepali Families in New York and Los Angeles

Shobha Hamal Gurung

---

### Introduction

Nepalese people are among the fastest growing South Asian immigrant/migrant communities in the United States. Since the 1990s, the flow of Nepalese immigrants/migrants into the US has increased significantly. This is due to a combination of factors, including the Diversity Visa Lottery system (introduced and implemented by the United States Citizenship and Immigration Services) and social, economic, and political upheaval in Nepal.

The period from the late 1980s to the late 1990s represented a significant change in Nepal's political economic history. The main changes in the economic arena were privatization, deregulation of the labor market, trade liberalization, and the establishment of a free market. A free flow of labor, capital, and commodity affected the domestic economy and the labor market. Politically, Nepal has transformed from an absolute monarchy to a democratic nation, and ultimately into a republican state. The ramifications of such transformations have been contradictory and paradoxical. Many underprivileged and marginalized communities have benefited from the emerging social justice and equality-based movements that have focused on ethnic rights, women's rights, religious rights, and human rights. Such transitions have, however, accompanied more than a decade of the "People's War".<sup>1</sup> The long-term armed conflict and political violence incurred by the Maoist rebellion disrupted peace and security on local and national levels, resulting in a state of crisis and turmoil (Hamal Gurung 2010). It hurt local and

---

<sup>1</sup>The Maoist insurgency in Nepal began in 1996. It is also referred to as the People's War. Although this insurgency arose with an aim for a casteless, classless, egalitarian republican state, many people lost their lives during this civil war.

S.H. Gurung (✉)  
Assistant Professor of Sociology, Southern Utah University,  
CN 22H, Cedar City, UT 84720  
e-mail: gurung@suu.edu

national businesses and industries; in particular, the tourist and manufacturing industries suffered. Such a national sociopolitical climate has disrupted many livelihoods and displaced many people. This has led to both voluntary and forced migration. Some people have migrated in search of economic opportunities and better livelihoods; many others have migrated to escape from the political violence and the Maoist threat (Hamal Gurung 2010).

In the case of Nepali women's migration/immigration, the globalization of informal economic sectors – particularly service and care work – and their own transnational networks have added to these dynamics (Hamal Gurung 2010). Nepali women's international migration/immigration is the result of a combination of factors – the political, economic, and social changes in Nepal; cultural and personal factors; and the global restructuring process on a worldwide scale. Nepali women's visibility in the US informal economic sectors started gradually in the early 1990s.

Immigration and migration to a foreign land always brings a shift in the social, cultural, economic, and political lives of immigrants/migrants. A fundamental change occurs in different dimensions of family life. Some of these changes include a disruption of family life, transnational family formation, and shifting gender roles and gender relations. This chapter examines the dynamics of gender and labor, as well as gender roles and gender relations, among immigrant/migrant Nepali families in New York and Los Angeles.

This paper begins with a brief introduction of a group of Nepali female migrants/immigrants and their families in New York and Los Angeles. It then analyzes their family experiences, changing family dynamics, and shifting gender roles and gender relations.

The chapter focuses on the changing nature and status of work for these women and their husbands upon their migration/immigration to the U.S.; subsequent effects; and their responses to such shifts. This chapter explores the following questions: What are the fundamental changes that occur in the work and family lives of these immigrants/migrants? What are some of the subsequent effects of such changes? How do women and their husbands respond to such changes? How are the effects of such changes manifested in different domains of the lives of these women and their husbands? Do these changes bring a shift in gender roles and power relations? How have gender norms and gender socialization contributed to the ways that men and women respond to such changes? Do these shifts generate contradictions?

---

## Method

This study is based on Nepali immigrant/migrant women's experiences and views on their work and family lives, particularly on changing gender roles and relations. Thirty Nepali immigrant/migrant women (ages 16–65) were the research participants of this study. Fifteen of the women were based in New York City and 15 resided in Los Angeles. The research participants were located and approached through precise snowball sampling. The data and information were gathered mainly through informal in-depth interviews and narrative collections in three different phases: 2005–2006; 2009; and 2010.

## **Nepali Female Migrants/Immigrants and Their Families: Socioeconomic and Demographic Backgrounds**

The women and their families in this study migrated/immigrated to the US for various political, economic, and social reasons. One particular reason for migration, however, stood out as the main difference between the New York and Los Angeles groups. The majority of the participants and their families in the Los Angeles area migrated for political reasons – they were political refugees granted or seeking asylum. As compared to the Los Angeles group, the reasons for migration varied among the New York group. Some of the reasons given by the New York participants included: to visit friends and family; to attend a graduation ceremony; to attend a professional conference; to work and to earn; to escape an unhappy family situation; and to flee the political crisis in Nepal. A few New York and Los Angeles participants and their families migrated after they won the diversity visa lottery.

While the research participants in the New York area were diverse in terms of caste and ethnic backgrounds, the majority of the research participants in Los Angeles area were from (upper caste) Brahmin and Chhetri ethnic groups. In terms of marital status, the majority of the Los Angeles research participants were married and had immigrated/migrated with their husbands. Their children, however, still resided back in Nepal. The New York participants were diverse in terms of their marital status (i.e., widowed, separated, or married). Most of the New York women migrated alone.

In terms of education, all of the research participants (except one in LA) had at least a high school education. Prior to coming to the United States, the majority of them had worked as teachers, social workers, or NGO workers in Nepal. Two of the Los Angeles participants had their own family businesses in which they had worked. One of the commonalities about these research participants revealed during the interviews was that they had enjoyed relatively better socio-economic circumstances in Nepal than they did in the United States.

---

## **Immigration, Migration, and Changing Work Status**

Nepali migrant/immigrant women's transnational work and their earned income have become vital not only to their immediate families and household economies, but also to their transnational communities. For the majority of the research participants, labor migration was not the main reason for migration/immigration. During the time of this study, however, all of the research participants were working in informal economic sectors, primarily service and domestic sectors. The major distinction and pattern of women's work in these two cities was that in New York, most of the research participants were child care providers; in Los Angeles, most worked in beauty parlors where they were mainly involved in eyebrow design and henna application.

The research participants were drawn to these jobs for various factors including the ready availability of informal service and domestic work. There were several

reasons for this trend. First, such work did not require any further training or a license. Second, these jobs were easily obtained through word of mouth; often, a woman's circle of friends and relatives became the main source of job placement. Third, such work did not require any legal documents. Even when some research participants had legal documents and proper visa status, they could not acquire jobs in their related fields due to technical issues. Women's prior educational and professional credentials and experiences did not automatically transfer and count in the formal labor market; the whole accreditation process was both time- and money-consuming.

---

### **Dynamics of Labor and Gender Among the Immigrant/Migrant Families**

Prior to their immigration/migration, many of the research participants in this study were working professionals. However, their income was not the primary source of their household economies. Ironically, upon their arrival in the US, many of the research participants (regardless of whether they migrated alone or with their husbands) became the main income earners for their families. A number of social, cultural, and global factors contributed to this shift. First and foremost was the availability of so-called feminized jobs in the service and domestic informal sectors. Second, despite the oppressive work conditions of domestic and care work, the research participants were ready to take such jobs to support their children and families; their husbands, however, were reluctant to take such jobs. Even when some husbands started work in informal sector jobs, they did not last long.<sup>2</sup> Third, unlike in Nepal, most of the research participants in the US worked 6 days a week and longer hours. Fourth, the value of the U.S. dollar is higher than the Nepalese rupee (1 U.S. dollar is equivalent to about 75 Nepalese rupee). The research participants' US-based informal sector work thus generated more money than their professional work back home. If the migrants were single mothers, separated wives, or widows, they then become the main breadwinners for their families. Even many of the married women who migrated with their husbands became the main income earners of their families due to the above-mentioned factors.

The research participants allocated their earnings to household expenditures, children's education, and to their extended family and social organizations. If their children were living in Nepal, they would send a major portion of their earnings to support their children's education and social well-being. If the migrants were single mothers, separated wives, or widows, their remittances were even more critical for their families' sustenance and children's well-being.

All of the research participants' income thus became vital for maintaining and preserving the social and economic well-being of their families both in the US and

---

<sup>2</sup>This is linked to gender, gender socialization, and gender perceptions. I will address this issue more in-depth during the case analyses in the upcoming sections.

in Nepal. Whether by becoming a main income earner of the family, by bearing their family's economic responsibility, or by sending remittances to their families and social organizations back home, these women have become the main agencies of maintaining, preserving, and transforming the social, cultural, and economic aspects of their families and communities. The most dramatic effects of these women's new economic roles have been in gender relations. Economic empowerment has shifted and transformed power relations at different levels and in different domains such as gender relations between spouses and gender relations within and outside the family and transnational community.

---

### **Power Relations at the Crossroads of Labor and Gender: Nepal Context**

Since the 1970s, one of the most highly debated issues in feminist scholarship, sociology, anthropology, and development studies has been the question of whether women's entrance into wage work has improved women's lives. Although there is no disagreement that women's labor participation has increased women's roles and responsibilities, there is no single consensus as to whether women's paid work has enhanced and empowered women's position and status, and provided them freedom. The current research on gender and work in transnational context, however, show positive impacts of women's paid work.

Referring to the Nepali female migrant labor, Bhadra reports, "Migration and remittances have increased women's self-esteem by bringing about a positive change in their gender identity and gender roles, leading to a decrease in violence against women and an increase in love and respect among the family and community" (Bhadra 2007, p. 2). Similarly, Cameron, in her book *On the Edge of the Auspicious: Gender and Caste in Nepal* (1998), also reports the ways in which low-caste women's increasing participation in paid work has improved the socioeconomic condition of their homes and communities. During her research on *Women in Factory-Based and Home-Based Carpet Production in Nepal: Beyond the Formal and Informal Economy*, Hamal Gurung (2003) conducted a survey that included questions about the impact of women's wage or paid work on their family and personal lives. Of the 100 women surveyed, 74 % responded that migration had improved their family's socioeconomic conditions. Similarly, 88 % indicated that their wage work or income had uplifted the living standard of their family. When asked if they were included in household decisions, 75 % answered affirmatively. This may indicate that being a wage earner increases a woman's status within the family. Seventy eight percent of the women stated that their income participation had positively changed their position in the family.

Women's narratives in this particular study suggest somewhat positive trends in personal and familial arenas. The research participants' new economic roles enhanced their decision-making power – they decide where, when, and how to spend or distribute their income. Although their informal economic work in the US has been professionally downgrading, the money earned through these jobs has



helped them to invest in cultural, social, and economic capital. This, in turn, has enabled these women to achieve respect and status on different levels: familial, societal, national, international, and transnational. The narratives in the following sections specifically analyze and illustrate how these women's new economic roles in the U.S. have affected their traditional household gender roles and shifted their conjugal power relations.

---

### **Reversing Roles: Gender Norms, Gender Perceptions, and Gender Socialization**

Gender roles and gender relations in the families where husband and wives both resided in the US illustrated interesting and contradictory patterns. While the research participants appeared to embrace their new economic roles, their husbands seemed to be reluctant to engage in informal economic-earning activities. Female migrants/immigrants have long been the ideal and preferred workers for the kinds of jobs available in informal economic sectors. This is particularly true for domestic and care work, as well as for service jobs, such as those at beauty parlors. As compared to the research participants, it was difficult for the husbands to find jobs in these sectors. But even when husbands found jobs in convenience stores or restaurants, it did not last for very long. Kripa's story indicates how gender socialization and traditional gender roles have contributed to these patterns.

Kripa is 39 and works as a live-out nanny. Kripa and her husband came to Los Angeles after the Maoist group destroyed their paper factory in Nepal. In Los Angeles, both of them started to work at a convenience store for an Indian employer. Although they were both dissatisfied with this kind of job, Kripa's husband was more unhappy than she was. After working for a year, he decided to return to Nepal. Kripa then took a full-time childcare job, worked longer hours, and earned even more. When asked why her husband left the US, Kripa said:

Nepali males are treated like kings by their families in Nepal and when they come here they cannot tolerate any orders from employers or the hardships of such employment. My husband tried to work in an Indian restaurant but he couldn't stand the work conditions. He stated that he would rather leave the country than work here. So he left for Nepal. I have learned that Nepali men cannot really work over here in such jobs. They quit as soon as they feel like they are being mistreated and dominated.

Since Kripa's husband departure for Nepal, he has not returned to the US. Their son now attends a college in the Boston area. Since her husband's return to Nepal, Kripa's income has become crucial for her son's education and for her family back home. Kripa's response clearly indicates that males' positions in Nepali society, as well as their egos, contribute to the disruption of their low status employment in the US. Kripa's husband was not used to performing lower-paying, low status jobs back home. When faced with such jobs in the US, he was willing to return to Nepal rather than work in such jobs and support their family. Kripa herself was not used to doing such jobs back home, but despite the hardships and challenges, she opted to stay in the US to work and support her family.

My interviews with Naina and Prema, however, also revealed another dimension of gender and gender roles, and the dilemmas of immigrant families. Naina is a 44-year old New York-based domestic worker. She works for a family, where she performs both house cleaning and childcare. Two years ago, her husband passed away from a stroke. Her husband had never held a steady job in the US; he occasionally worked here and there. When asked why, Naina replied:

He could not work hard and struggle. I did not mind working and supporting him. Although he didn't have any major health issues at that time, I was concerned and worried about his health. I never asked him to work. He was not very happy with the lifestyle here, I think he was depressed. He wanted to go back to Nepal; we were thinking to go back to Nepal.

Naina's response suggests some of the ramifications of immigration on the emotional and physical health of immigrants. The case of Leela, another research participant, also shows how an occupational and spatial migration brought a drastic change in her and her husband's lives, and the subsequent effects on their health and social well-being, as well as gender roles and gender relations.

Leela, a 45-year-old research participant, came to Los Angeles in 2005 with her husband. In Nepal, Leela and her husband had their own company; they also ran an NGO. They came to the US for political reasons, after political violence increased in Nepal and their lives were threatened. Upon arrival in the U.S., Leela started full-time work in an Indian beauty parlor. Her husband took a manual labor job that required heavy lifting. Both of them were very unhappy to leave Nepal and to become transnational workers. They felt they had lost everything – their business, social circle, status, family, and community. One day, while at work, Leela's husband fainted. He was rushed to the hospital where he spent a week, and was diagnosed with diabetes and hypertension. During the time of the interview, Leela's husband was not working. But he mentioned that he would try to work part-time. With Leela's low-paying wage and without health insurance, it is very difficult for them to deal with his health issues and run the household. The family's financial responsibility has fallen onto Leela's shoulders. In order to meet the economic demands of the household, Leela has taken another part-time job working weekends at a grocery store.

From a gender perspective, it was interesting to learn how the socioeconomic shifts and changes that occurred in Leela and her husband's lives after their migration to the US affected their personal, work, and familial domains. I was interested to learn how Leela would interpret and analyze their situation. So, I asked her if she thought there was any relationship between her husband's work and his health condition. Here is what Leela said:

Yes, my husband was not used to doing this kind of work. He never did manual labor in Nepal. There were so many people working under us. We had our own business and NGO, and he had his own administrative assistant. Here, he worked in a store where he had to load and unload heavy stuff. During the night shift, he also had to clean the store, which including vacuuming, sweeping, and mopping. Within a week, he told me that the work was stressful. He was constantly yelled at for not moving or doing his job fast enough. He was just not used to working that many hours on his feet. He didn't get a break when he needed

one. He complained about aches and pains. He would wake up in the middle of the night. His health started to deteriorate. His health suffered from this job.

I then asked Leela if she was used to doing the kind of work she was doing in Los Angeles. She replied:

Definitely, I am not used to working seven days a week and eight straight hours a day. But I don't have to carry heavy stuff all the time. Only when I have to refill shelves, then I carry big boxes. There are other male employees who load and unload stuff in the grocery store. My work in the grocery store as well as in the beauty parlor is tedious. And I don't get to sit in either place. I have to stand all the time and keep moving. If there are no customers, my employers assign me cleaning tasks such as sweeping and mopping the floor, or cleaning shelves and counters.

I asked her whether there were any health effects of her job. Leela replied:

Yes, I do feel tired. Since I don't get to sit at my job, my feet and legs hurt from standing all the time. As compared to my husband's job, my job is not so physically demanding. I do experience pains and aches but my health has not suffered like my husband's. I treat myself with aspirin and ibuprofen. While growing up as a girl child in a traditional family, I had to learn household tasks such as sweeping, cleaning, washing, cooking, and various other jobs. My jobs include some of these aspects and I am used to doing it. I am more concerned about my husband's health condition. He cannot do manual labor; he is not prepared for it. A respectable office job would be appropriate for him. He would feel better when he gets one.

Leela's response indicates that she clearly underestimates her workload. Although she works 7 days a week, she thinks her husband's job is more stressful and demanding than her own. When it comes to the nature and status of a job, she clearly puts her husband first and above herself. Gender norms and gender socialization seem to have shaped Leela's perceptions and views about gender and work, particularly in the public sphere. Leela's husband's health condition is also linked with gender norms and social class. In Nepal, particularly among the educated middle class, husbands' occupational status and position are higher than those of their wives. They are not involved in manual labor and they rarely participate in household cleaning chores such as sweeping and mopping. While growing up, boys are not assigned these tasks. So, while gender socialization helps wives to adjust to the informal and service labor markets, husbands exhibit emotional and physical distress. Leela does not seem to care about her own workload and the status of her own work, but thinks that an appropriate job for her husband would be an office one and that this would improve his health. She clearly points out the nature and status of a job as critical variables for her husband's social, physical, and emotional well-being.

Prema's case also reflects a similar pattern. Prema is a 35-year-old research participant who was concerned about her husband's work status and social well being. She lives in Los Angeles with her husband. Her children are back home in Nepal. She works in a grocery store during the week and in a beauty parlor on weekends. Prema works 7 days a week and is the main earner for her family. Her husband has

changed jobs many times; he now works part-time in retail. Prema does not know how long her husband will remain in this job. When asked why, Prema said:

He is not used to doing this kind of work. He tried to work in some restaurants but it also didn't last very long. He is not used to doing this kind of work. In Nepal, we had our own business. Although he doesn't say anything, I know he is not happy here. I am worried about his health and well being.

Like Leela, Prema is worried about the possible negative impact of a low-status of job on her husband's health. Not once did she mention her own workload or its ramifications. This may be due to the ways in which Prema and Leela were socialized at an early age. The core gender ideologies formed during their socialization might have shaped their gender perceptions and conducts. Both Prema and Leela come from traditional Hindu families where wives' social recognition and status are based upon their husbands. In a traditional Hindu family, "...before marriage, a woman undergoes many *Bartas* (religious fasts) in the hope of getting a good husband. After marriage, she undergoes as many *Bartas* for her husband's longevity, prosperity, and good health" (Hamal Gurung 2008, p. 201). The Teej festival is such an example.

These women's voices speak to an interesting dynamic of labor and gender among Nepalese immigrant/migrant families in the US. The nature and status of work seemed to most affect those who were reluctant to work in lower-status manual labor jobs. The type of work that the husbands performed seemed to impact their mental and physical health as well. For men, the nature and status of work in the public sphere appears to shape their identity, image, and position in the family, community, and society. Gendered socialization teaches men to acquire, adhere, and maintain power, privilege, and status. Men/ husbands are expected to hold higher-status jobs than their wives. When the research participants' husbands had lower-status manual labor work, similar to their wives, they did not last long in such jobs. It was difficult for these men to cope with and comprehend the obedience and subservience required from them. This led to some interesting ramifications – some husbands preferred to give up their breadwinner role rather than to continue to work in a lower-status manual job; some husbands faced health consequences. The stress and nature of work in the public sphere altered gender roles and relations in the private sphere and, as discussed above, in the household division of labor.

The gender socialization of girls and women in traditional Hindu families has, however, also shaped women's responses to the nature and status of their husbands' work. Many of the research participants have found income-generating informal work to be personally liberating; it took them away from their culturally expected roles of subservience and enhanced their familial position and status. Nonetheless, some research participants were more concerned about their husbands' work status and their physical and emotional health. By protecting their husbands' status quo in the public arenas, and not asserting and demanding a consistent income, some research participants have enacted traditional gender ideologies.

## Gender Roles and Power Relations

In her study of Mexican maquiladoras, Fernandez-Kelly (1983) showed how gender roles and gender relations for men and women shifted and altered when women joined the labor force. In Mexican maquiladoras, when women became the sole breadwinners of their households, men performed the household chores and relied upon the income earned by their wives. In her research work on the women carpet weavers in Nepal, Hamal Gurung also noted such shifts (2003).

As similar to the lives of Mexican maquiladora workers and Nepali carpet weavers, when the research participants continually generated income and became the main income earners of their families, this transition also paradoxically reversed their traditional household gender roles. Naina (whose experience is presented above), expressed her views on this interesting gender dynamic among immigrant and migrant families in New York in this way:

Nepali males look for office work; they don't like to do manual work at all. The other thing is that Nepali wives generally don't want their husbands to struggle in this kind of work so they take on most of the burden. While the Nepali husbands are seeking office work or other non-manual work, the wives are the ones who bring in the income. This is a growing trend. The gender roles have somewhat switched. The males are home cooking food and looking after the children while the wives are working and making money.

Leela's and Prema's (whose cases are presented above) household gender roles, to some extent also support this trend. Leela's and Prema's husbands, who were not involved in any kind of cooking and cleaning chores back home, now participate in such work. Usually, if Leela and Prema work during the night shifts, their husbands prepare dinner. Since both Leela and Prema also work during the weekend, their husbands also prepare meals for most of the weekend. When the wives come from their work, the husbands make tea for them. They also try to help their wives clean their apartments.

These cases illustrate contradictions and paradoxes of gender and gender roles brought by the dynamics of labor and gender in the US. In a way, women are confirming patriarchy by wanting and supporting their husbands to take better-status office jobs. But by doing this, they are also reversing the gender roles on the home front. When the wives are engaged in paid work outside of the home, the husbands are engaged in household non-paid work. This shift dismantles the traditional patriarchal gender relations.

Abha is a 46-year-old live-in nanny, who came to New York in 2003. She has now become the main income earner of her family. Her income is not only crucial for her family's household expenses, but also for her sons' education. In addition, she pays the family debts. Her husband declined to come to the US because he didn't want to perform manual labor. In this context, women seem more adaptable and responsible for their families than men. More important, they tend to be more progressive and ready for any kind of challenges. When I asked Abha how work had impacted her personal life, she replied:

I am happy to support my family. Living and working in America has increased my confidence. Now, I feel that I can go anywhere in the world and work. I am no longer dependent on anyone. Rather, I have become the central figure of my family. I make most of the major decisions, especially when it involves money. I have also gained respect from my family and community.

A 54-year-old New York-based care worker related her main income earner role with her economic autonomy this way:

My economic role has provided me with so many options. I have absolute autonomy in resource allocation and distribution on both familial and community levels. My husband and I make household decisions. I don't have to ask for money from either my son or my husband. I have certainly gained that freedom.

---

## Discussion

The narratives presented in this chapter clearly illustrate that these women now hold important economic and social roles in maintaining families and communities on both local and international levels. As research participants became the main earners for their families, a shift also occurred in their traditional gender roles and relations. The women's stories and voices illustrate that they are more adaptive and open to new changes than their husbands. The nature of employment, and the differences in work patterns between men and women, also indicate the implications of gender perception, gender socialization, and gendered culture (position and status of males and females in Nepali society) in the lives of migrant/immigrant spouses. While the research participants stuck to their informal economic income-generating service and care work, their husbands had a difficult time maintaining such jobs. In Nepal, husbands are in charge of their families' social and economic affairs, and they have higher positions, status, and power than their wives.

What I find unique in this study is how the influence of gender perception and gender socialization reversed the gender roles and gender relations between spouses in the US. The very same reasons for husbands not wanting to work in the informal service sector led to women becoming the breadwinners for their families. In a new role, women have become the main income earners. Nepali women, however, also carry and retain their traditional gender roles through which they care for and nurture their families and communities. Nepali immigrant women, thus, simultaneously preserve and subvert traditional gender roles. Paradoxically, the men's inability and reluctance to adapt to menial employment inadvertently fosters empowerment for the women. It is not the men's direct intent to create this empowerment, but it is a byproduct of the way that their gendered cultural socialization has handicapped them for the informal labor market.

To conclude, to comprehend under what conditions and how a woman becomes a transnational worker requires a thorough understanding of women's social, cultural, and economic locations as well as women's roles and positions in their families and communities on both local and international levels. It is obvious that women's transnational work and income generate multi-dimensional effects on different domains of their lives. These paradoxical effects include economic compulsion to work and support family, combined with economic autonomy and empowerment. Women's contradictory experiences cannot, however, be solely explained within the standard frameworks of globalization and feminization of international migration.

## References

- Bhadra, C. (2007). *International labour migration of Nepalese women: The impact of their remittances on poverty reduction*. Working Paper 44, Asia-Pacific Research and Training Network on Trade Working Paper Series. [Revised Jan 2008]. Available from <http://www.unescap.org/tid/artnet/pub/wp4407.pdf>
- Cameron, M. (1998). *On the edge of auspicious: Gender and caste in Nepal*. Chicago: University of Illinois Press.
- Fernandez-Kelly, M. P. (1983). *For we are sold, I and my people: Women and industry in Mexico's frontier*. San Diego: University of California Press.
- Hamal Gurung, S. (2003). *Women and home-based and factory-based carpet production in Nepal: Beyond formal and informal economy*. Doctoral dissertation, Northeastern University, Boston.
- Hamal Gurung, S. (2008). Mapping the memories of a Nepali woman in the United States. In A. Narayan & B. Purkayastha (Eds.), *Living religions: South Asian Hindu and Muslim women narrate their experiences*. Hartford: Kumarian Press.
- Hamal Gurung, S. (2010). Nepali female migrants and informalization of service and care work: Service or servitude? *The Journal of Workplace Rights*, 14, 3.

---

# Comparing the Family Lives of Vietnamese Wives in Taiwan and the USA

Chyong-fang Ko

---

## Introduction

Taiwan was not a popular destination for international immigration until the 1970s, when the economy took off and the country earned its designation as one of the “Four Asian Tigers.” The ensuing economic prosperity has improved domestic living standards and provided capital for entrepreneurs to make investments abroad, leading to greater exposure regarding Taiwan’s growing wealth, especially in Mainland China and Southeast Asian countries. Economic progress has been accompanied by advancements in women’s educational achievement and labour force participation, resulting in strong demand for domestic assistance. In the 1990s the Republic of China (ROC) government started to relax rules for foreign labour in response to shortages in the domestic care and manufacturing sectors. According to the country’s Bureau of Employment and Vocational Training (2010), in 2009 there were approximately 378,000 foreign labourers working in Taiwan, just under one-half of them providing in-home help and elder care.

Raised in a patriarchal society, Taiwanese women have generally followed hypergamous norms (including, until the latter half of the twentieth century, arranged marriages) for making decisions about marriage. With the advancement of women’s educational achievement, the gender-based educational gap in Taiwan has narrowed, and men with lower educational achievement are facing considerable difficulty in finding marriage partners. The problem is increased by the traditional preference for sons and a steady decline in fertility. According to figures provided by the ROC Department of Household Registration Affairs (2010a), among today’s 6.7 million unmarried Taiwanese 15 years of age and older, men outnumber women by approximately 3.7 million to 3.1 million – a 20 % difference. That means 600,000

---

C.-f. Ko (✉)

Institute of European and American Studies, Academia Sinica,  
128, Academia Road, Section 2, Taipei, Taiwan  
e-mail: ko@sinica.edu.tw



men will have to find other sources for wives or remain unmarried and childless, which is considered unacceptable in a country that places great value on families and extending patriarchal lines of descent.

Thus, a growing number of Taiwanese men are using private social connections or commercial agents to find suitable partners in foreign countries. Between 1987 and 2010 (October), 441,314 foreign spouses were given permission to migrate to Taiwan; this number includes spouses from Mainland China, Hong Kong, and Macao. The large majority of these foreign spouses are female (93.2 %) and from Mainland China (67.4 %), Vietnam (20.3 %), and Indonesia (6.4 %) (National Immigration Agency 2010). They represent between 10 % and 20 % of all newly-weds in Taiwan during the past decade (Department of Household Registration Affairs 2010b).

Although it is difficult to clearly prove an absence of romantic love in transnational marriages, conjugal unions between Taiwanese men and foreign women from Mainland China or Southeast Asian countries are considered commoditized (Lu 2005; Wang and Chang 2002). Since most foreign wives come from economically disadvantaged countries, Taiwanese husbands are often criticized for using their economic advantages to “purchase” wives for sexual gratification and the fulfilment of familial obligations. Accordingly, female marriage migrants are frequently depicted as vulnerable, exploited, marginalized, and lacking agency.

As I have argued elsewhere (Ko 2009, 2010) young women from less well-off countries either choose or are persuaded to marry foreign men from more affluent countries as a means of improving their financial situations or the finances of their natal families. Most of these women try their best to maintain their transnational marriages and retain the benefits of residency permits, better living standards, etc., even if they are not happy in their marriages. In addition, based on her observations of transnational marriages in Asia, Constable (2005) argues that viewing female marriage migrants as victims and/or objects of exchange overlooks their perspectives and various levels of agency. Wang (2007) asserts that even though some female marriage migrants in Taiwan can be perceived as disadvantaged, they have a range of strategies they can use to avoid harsh treatment.

Transnational marriages are also prevalent in Japan, South Korea, Singapore, the United States, and many European Union countries (Breger and Hill 1998; Dribe and Lundh 2008; Gonzalez-Ferrer 2006; Monden and Smith 2005; Nottmeyer 2009; Smits 2010). Some researchers have looked at marital quality and/or life adjustments made by transnational couples in individual countries, but few efforts have been made to compare these factors across two or more countries, especially for spouses from the same ethnic group or nationality. I will focus on Vietnamese wives living in Taiwan and the United States for three reasons:

1. Vietnamese represent the largest number of non-ethnic Chinese foreign spouses in Taiwan, and their lives in Taiwan have generally been described as vulnerable and exploited. However, if their lives are harsh, then why does the number of Vietnamese wives remain steady?
2. The US was militarily involved in Vietnam between 1959 and 1975, resulting in additional social space for extended contact between citizens of the two nations.

In addition, the number of marriages between Vietnamese women and American men increased significantly after the Vietnam War, and the US is home to the largest population of Vietnamese outside of Vietnam.

3. As stated, the Vietnamese wives of Taiwanese men are frequently depicted as exploited. This raises questions about whether perceived mistreatment is the result of traditional Taiwanese patrilocal residence practices that require newly married couples to co-reside with the husband's family. If so, then I wish to determine whether the Vietnamese wives of American men lead better lives in a country where brides feel less pressure to serve their in-laws.

In this paper, I will address the following questions: What qualities of life do Vietnamese wives experience in Taiwan and the United States? Are they as vulnerable and marginalized as they are described in the current literature, or are they strong and sometimes dominant figures in their households? Are their economic desires fulfilled in their new homelands? Do they suffer from culture shock or value conflicts in their daily routines? Do they regret marrying into foreign households? Do they have any plans to return to their homelands in their old age?

---

## Vietnamese Culture

Vietnamese and Taiwanese have similar social norms and family values due to their shared Chinese cultural heritage. Almost one-half of Vietnamese history over the past 2,700 years, especially between 111 BC and AD 939, is marked by Chinese colonial control (Chiang 2002). Independent Vietnam was a tributary state from the tenth century to 1802, when the country started using its current name. Chinese was used as the official language before Vietnamese was Latinized during the sixteenth century. Throughout, ethical rules and practices were derived from Confucian values that promote family as the most important societal institution (Barbieri and Belanger 2009; Nguyen 1967; Pham 1999). According to Confucianism, all family members share collective responsibilities. Parents are expected to educate and discipline their children, and children are taught to behave according to the principle of filial piety. Sibling relationships are determined according to seniority, with younger siblings required to respect older ones, who are expected to provide care in return. Sacrificing one's interests for the benefits of younger siblings – especially sacrifices by older sisters for younger brothers – holds great value in terms of Confucian hierarchies.

Because families are highly valued in Vietnam, both men and women –but especially women –are expected to form families and begin raising children in early adulthood. Men are taught to be strong and independent, and women are taught to keep silent, avoid confrontation, and never contradict their husbands, parents, or parents-in-law (Pham 1999). The gender-role expectations of men as breadwinners and women as homemakers are entrenched in daily routines. Nevertheless, Mies (1986) argues that these rigid standards only apply to wealthy Vietnamese, with most middle- and lower-class Vietnamese women expected to work both inside and

outside the home. Belanger and Oudin (2007) describe Vietnamese women as not only fulfilling their domestic roles, but also working outside their homes in order to contribute to family finances.

---

## Vietnamese-American Marriages

Considered a nation of immigrants, America is depicted as a country where everyone can pursue happiness and achievement. However, U.S. history is marked by strong discrimination against non-white immigrants. Interracial marriages were legally banned in most states well into the twentieth century. Laws such as the Chinese Exclusion Act of 1882 and anti-miscegenation laws in many states stand as proof of institutionalized racism; these particular pieces of legislation were not declared unconstitutional until 1945 and 1967, respectively. Despite new calls for stricter immigration rules, the United States still ranks at the top of the list of countries with the largest number of international migrants (UNFPA 2005).

According to Thai (2008), there were approximately 300 Vietnamese living in the United States after World War II. That number increased to over 1.1 million in 2000. Unlike other Asian migrants, the large majority of Vietnamese arrived in the United States as refugees at the end of the Vietnam War in 1975. For the most part they were unprepared, had few resources, and faced severe linguistic and cultural barriers in their host society.

Lee and Edmonston (2005) report that interracial marriages accounted for more than 5 % of all American marriages in 2000, compared to 1 % in 1970. The most common combination between 1970 and 2000 was a Caucasian husband and Asian wife. According to Hidalgo and Bankston (2008), in 1980, female Vietnamese Americans exhibited a higher rate of exogamy than male Vietnamese Americans (28 % versus 6 %), primarily due to the large number of war brides who entered the US in the 1970s. The interracial marriage rate for Vietnamese women decreased from 28 % in 1980 to 17 % in 2000, while the rate for Vietnamese men increased from 6 % to 10 % during the same period.

---

## Cross-Cultural Marriage Research

The marriage literature generally states that partner selection is not a random-match process – that is, individuals usually establish conjugal relationships with people who share the same socioeconomic background. Researchers have shown that men and women in different age groups and with different education levels, religions, ethnicities, and other social characteristics tend to have conflicting values and communication styles, thus making them less desirable for marriage (Bitter 1986; Bumpass and Sweet 1972; Bumpass et al. 1991; Kalmijn et al. 2005; Lehrer and Chiswick 1993). Others note that “like marrying like” does not guarantee marital success (Jorgensen and Klein 1979; Shehan et al. 1990; Tzeng 1992), and that some individuals marry spouses who are very dissimilar in the interest of maximizing benefits.

From his analysis of 1980 and 1990 U.S. Census data, Qian (1997) concluded that “among interracial married couples with different educational attainments, both men and women from lower status racial groups, but with high education levels, tend to marry spouses from a higher status racial group with a lower education level” (p. 263). Rosenfeld (2005), however, challenges any “status-caste exchange theory” that asserts an exchange of socioeconomic status for racial caste in interracial marriages. He uses multiple U.S. Census samples derived from the Integrated Public Use Microdata Series (IPUMS) to argue that both parties in interracial marriages tend to have similar statuses. Rosenfeld claims that this was true even during the first half of the twentieth century, when racial barriers in the United States were highly impermeable. Based on her analysis of USA Census 2000 PUMS data, Fu (2008, p. 132) reports that “couples have similar statuses in all types of marriages, either endogamous or exogamous, and there is no evidence of status-caste exchange in intermarriage to Whites, except in Asian husband-White wife marriages in income (not in education or job prestige).”

Thai (2005) suggests that it is socially acceptable for a highly educated bride to marry a groom with a lower status and lower-wage job as long as the groom is a citizen of the US or another developed country. In other words, for many Vietnamese the idea of citizenship in an advanced country holds enormous value as an avenue to success and improved quality of life, more so than other traditionally revered factors such as level of education. Based on her study of “correspondence marriages” between Asian women and American men, Constable (2005) asserts that these types of transnational unions must be viewed as examples of spatial hypergamy (i.e., moving from a poorer to richer country) and not individual hypergamy. From her perspective, if a well-educated Asian woman leaves a life of potential privilege (e.g., residing in a large house with household help) in a poor or developing country in order to marry a foreigner who can only afford a small apartment with fewer amenities in an advanced country, that situation must be interpreted as the woman marrying down.

In her description of Filipina-Japanese marriages, Suzuki (2005) notes that many foreign brides have inaccurate expectations of life in their host countries, based on a mix of misleading photos, marriage agents, and mass media stories. Those Filipinas who witness first-hand the spending habits of Japanese tourists, and their possession of merchandise and technology, can easily fall into the trap of believing that Japan is filled with polite, generous, and rich Japanese men. It is difficult to achieve a unified vision of Asian women’s motivations to marry foreigners and move to new countries, but it is clear that many Asian wives from less wealthy countries believe that geographic location is directly tied to resources and social mobility.

---

## Study Sample

The study sample consisted of 47 Vietnamese women, 32 married to Taiwanese husbands and living in Taiwan, and 15 married to American husbands and residing in the United States. Members of the Taiwan group were interviewed in 2008, with

**Table 1** Socio-demographic data for the marriage migrants interviewed for this study

	Taiwanese wives (n=32)		American wives (n=15)	
	Mean	Range	Mean	Range
Age at time of interview	28.4	(22~47)	43.5	(26~58)
Husband's age	43.5	(33~73)	50.3	(34~69)
Spousal age difference	-15.1	(-3~-30)	-6.8	(-2~-16)
Years of formal education	8.1	(4~12)	14.7	(7~18)
Husband years of formal education	8.8	(2~12)	15.6	(13~19)
Age at time of current marriage	23.0	(18~41)	31.5	(18~55)
Duration of current marriage (years)	5.5	(0.5~12)	12.5	(1~36)
Number of children	1.2	(0~3)	1.1	(0~3)
Years living in host society	5.5	(0.5~12)	25.1	(2~38)
How spouses met:				
Agent	20		0	
Friend	6		6	
Relative	5		1	
At work	1		4	
During wartime	0		1	
Other	0		3	
Marital satisfaction <sup>a</sup>	7.3	(1~10)	9.1	(7~10)

<sup>a</sup>Range of 1–10 (low to high)

the majority found and contacted via Chinese literacy classes and non-profit social work organizations. Those in the U.S. group were identified and contacted via snowball sampling, and interviewed in 2009. Six either declined or were unable to be interviewed in person, but did agree to complete questionnaires on the topic of interracial marriage.

As shown in Table 1, the mean age of the Vietnamese wives living in Taiwan at the time of our interviews was 28.4; on average they were 15.1 years younger than their husbands, whose ages ranged from 33 to 73. Average length of marriage and mean length of residency in Taiwan were both 5.5 years. Average age upon arrival in Taiwan was 22.9 years. At time of marriage, average informant age was 22.9 and average husband age was 38.0. Average years of formal education were comparable: 8.1 for the women and 8.8 for the men.

Most of the interviewees married to Taiwanese worked in factories prior to their marriages, earning between US\$30 and \$100 per month. Twenty of the informants met their future husbands through marriage agencies, six were introduced by friends, and five were introduced by relatives. One interviewee was introduced to her future husband by her employer while working as a domestic helper in Taiwan; she subsequently married into the family she was working for.

Due to the many similarities in cultural values between Vietnamese and Taiwanese, most of the informants said that they had few non-linguistic problems adjusting to daily routines. Most stated that they were able to reach a satisfactory level of spoken Chinese/Taiwanese for daily needs within a couple of years, but it took them much longer to learn how to read and write Chinese characters. Some complained about not getting along with their mothers-in-law, but overall

the interviewees appeared to be accepting of their conjugal relationships. On a 1–10 (low-to-high) satisfaction scale, the women gave a mean score of 7.3 to their current situations.

The age range for the 15 Vietnamese wives of Americans was 26–58 (Table 1). Only 1 was born in the US; 10 fled their country of origin at the end of the Vietnam War, and 4 moved to the US at the ages of 11, 28, 35 and 40, either alone or with their families in the 1990s or later. Nine informants were in their first marriages. Average marriage duration for the 15 informants was 12.5 years. With one exception, all of their husbands were white; age range for all husbands was 34–69. On average, the wives were 6.8 years younger than their husbands – 43.5 versus 50.3. All stated that they were very satisfied with their conjugal relationships, giving a mean score of 9.1 on the satisfaction scale.

Data from the existing literature and the present research indicate that most Vietnamese wives of Taiwanese meet their prospective husbands through marriage agencies. Their primary motivations for marrying foreigners and moving abroad are (a) economic reasons, especially for their parents, younger siblings, their own children, or a combination; (b) fantasies regarding life in Taiwan; or (c) a simple alternative to their current lives in Vietnam. In contrast, most Vietnamese wives of American men meet their future husbands via personal encounters, and their primary motivations for marrying are romantic love. In the following sections I will use the life stories of six Vietnamese brides – three each in Taiwan and the US – to illustrate the complexity of transnational marriages.

---

## Vietnamese Wives in Taiwan

### Hong

At the time of our interview, Hong was a 26-year-old high school graduate who had been married for 5 years and given birth to two boys. She grew up in a poor family with one elder sister, one younger sister, and three younger brothers. Her elder sister was married to a Taiwanese that she had met through a marriage agent; that sister had regularly sent money back to Vietnam, which may have influenced Hong's thinking that marrying a Taiwanese would allow her to support her younger siblings' educations. Hong told me that she had been introduced to her Taiwanese husband (21 years her senior) by her elder sister's sister-in-law, who worked as a marriage agent. She told me, "We liked each other and held a wedding ceremony a few days later in Vietnam." According to both Taiwanese and Vietnamese custom, grooms have to pay all wedding costs, and sometimes a bride price as well. According to Hong, "In order to ensure that I and my family were not deceiving him, my husband only paid part of the bride price when we got married. He promised to give me more money once I gave birth." Her husband gave her parents US\$1,000 when they got married, and US\$300 when her first son was born. Hong describes her husband as "generous to me and my natal family. He gives money to each member of my family whenever we visit Vietnam." These remittances have clearly benefitted her family: her father was able to purchase a truck and start his

own business, and her mother was able to give up her part-time business as a breakfast vendor. Regarding her 12-year-old sister, Hong said, “We don’t want her to marry abroad. We hope she can find a man to marry in Vietnam so that my mother can have a daughter around.”

Hong’s husband was 47 years old at the time of our interview, a junior high school graduate who worked in a factory for a monthly salary of approximately US\$1,500. They live in a four-story house with their two sons and her father-in-law, who is in his 80s. She is directly responsible for all of their care. Hong’s description of her daily life indicates that she is a beloved wife and daughter-in-law. She does not need to wake up early to prepare breakfast for her husband and father-in-law, as is the case for most daughters-in-law in Asian societies.

Hong used to send all of her pocket and “red-envelope”<sup>1</sup> money to her natal family, but by the time I met her she had stopped doing so: “I’ve opened accounts for my sons, and I save all of their red envelopes so we can use the money to buy their plane tickets to Vietnam.” Her parents travelled to Taiwan to provide some domestic assistance when Hong had her second child. They were grateful to see that their daughter had a happy family, but according to Hong, her father told her mother, “Tell your daughter don’t be harsh to her husband, I feel shame for her. Her husband is a nice man, she should behave like a gentle and obedient wife.”

Although Hong’s husband is much older, she does not regret her marriage. She believes that Taiwan is a better place to stay, especially in terms of her children’s futures. As part of a transnational marriage, Hong says that she wouldn’t mind if her children married foreigners, but “not to Vietnamese females, because they may have to remit money back, like I am doing now.”

## Minh

At the time of our interview, Minh was a 45-year-old divorcee (first marriage) and widow (second marriage) with two daughters, ages 23 and 21, both living in Vietnam. She said,

I did not get along with my mother-in-law during my first marriage. I was criticized for not working outside the home to make money. But I had to take care of the domestic chores and raise children.

Minh had to raise her daughters on her own after her 12-year-old marriage ended in divorce at the age of 33. Her older daughter is married, and the younger one is still in school.

I wanted to support my daughter’s efforts to get an advanced education, but I could not make it happen by myself, so I decided to marry a Taiwanese to help her. My husband gave me and my mother each about US\$90 when we got married in Vietnam.

---

<sup>1</sup>Known as *hongbao* in Mandarin Chinese, red envelopes are used to give cash gifts during the Lunar New Year holiday or on special occasions such as weddings and birthdays. In Chinese culture, the color red symbolizes good luck and happiness.

Minh met her Taiwanese husband through a Vietnamese marriage agency in 2005. The wedding took place in Vietnam, when she was 41 and he was 69. Minh's new husband had been a widower for 23 years. His three sons and three daughters are married and living in their own households.

Even though Minh had been living in Taiwan for 4 years before our interview, she spoke very little Chinese – one of many signs that she was living in isolation in her new homeland. She told me,

My husband did not let me go out by myself. He always wanted me to stay at home. He did all the shopping, and I just stayed at home taking care of the domestic work ... my husband did not talk to me much.

Minh was eager to work to make money to support her daughter's studies in Vietnam, but she met opposition from her new in-laws:

My stepsons asked me to stay at home to look after their father, and each of them gave me about US\$50 per month to do so. So I saved about US\$150 per month for my daughter.

When we met, one of her first comments was,

My husband died a few days ago, I don't know what to do next. I am not a citizen yet, I only have a long-term residence permit and it will expire soon. I may have to leave this country because of the death of my husband.

Her husband did ask his sons to help Minh apply for citizenship should he die, and she believes that they will take their father's request seriously. According to Taiwanese law, citizenship and legal status as a Taiwanese wife means an inheritance of one-half of a spouse's property. The timing of her citizenship application could stop her from claiming that inheritance.

Minh said she was interested in staying in Taiwan and finding a job in order to live independently. One of her stepdaughters found her a job as an agricultural worker, but Minh is concerned about doing heavy physical work. One of her stepsons has suggested that she find a Taiwanese male to marry her Vietnamese daughter, based on his belief that she would therefore "have someone to take care of you when you are aged."

## Quyên

In Vietnam, 24-year-old Quyên had eleven years of formal education. She married a Taiwanese (10 years her senior) that she met through a Vietnamese marriage agency five years before our interview. She was 19 years old and still in high school when she met her future husband. Quyên's family in Vietnam is better off than most: her father is a policeman, her mother a nurse, and she has only one younger brother. If she had stayed in Vietnam, she likely would have continued with her education, but she preferred establishing a family with a Taiwanese because several of her relatives had done the same, and were therefore living more prosperous lives. She left her name with an agency while she was still attending school. Her future



husband met many other girls over a three-day period, but rejected all of them until he met Quyen. She called her parents to invite them to her wedding, and had to resist their attempts to stop her.

It took Quyen a long time to conceive a child, and the first son that she gave birth to was born premature and almost completely blind. She told me that her mother-in-law and husband both blame her for these difficulties. She is also reluctant to tell her parents the truth about her son: "My parents always ask me about him, it's getting harder to keep the secret. I feel lots of pressure." In addition to looking after her 3-year-old blind son, Quyen must prepare dinner for twelve people every day.

My husband has three elder sisters, one elder brother, and one younger brother. They are all married, but one of his sisters and her family live with us. Both of his brothers are divorced, and one of them has two children.

Quyen claims that she does not mind taking care of her parents-in-law, but believes that someone in the family should help her with domestic chores.

I don't regret marrying a Taiwanese and residing in Taiwan, although I feel discriminated against sometimes. I don't like my in-laws, especially my mother-in-law. She always points out my mistakes in a loud voice, which makes me feel embarrassed. I wish my husband would take my side, not his mother's.

In addition to Mandarin Chinese, Quyen is teaching her son to speak Vietnamese. "He has to learn some Vietnamese to be able to converse with my parents," she says. Her son is studying at a special kindergarten for handicapped children. She says she is eager to have another child, but the chances of that happening are low. "I would move out of this house right away if we could afford it."

---

## Vietnamese Wives in the United States

### Joy

Joy was the only informant in this group who did not meet her husband in the US. She was born into a poor family in Vietnam in 1967, one of 10 children; her father died when she was 13. She was the only child in her family to earn a college degree. After graduating, she worked as a middle school teacher to support her family. A devout Protestant, she was determined to marry a Christian. At the age of 36, she was introduced to her future husband, Kent, through a Vietnamese American woman who attended Kent's church in Orange County, California. Kent and Joy communicated by e-mail in English for four years. He travelled to Vietnam to meet her and her family three times before they decided to get married in 2007, when she was 40 and he was 46. Joy told me,

I am glad I met Kent, I don't regret marrying far away. I am not the first one to marry abroad in my family. One of my younger sisters is married to a Taiwanese who is not rich. I feel sorry for her, but cannot do much.

Joy says that life as a single woman is not easy in Vietnam, a country where most women get married in their 20s. She is the sixth child in her family, but the last to marry. "I felt lots of pressure, but I wasn't worried about it at all. I believed God would take care of it." Although she has a college education and was exposed to Western culture in Vietnam, many of her beliefs and behaviours are very traditional.

As a Christian, I could not have sexual intercourse with Kent before our wedding. As a conservative Vietnamese, I could not have kisses or hugs with Kent before we were formally engaged. I learned how to express my passion for my husband in public after we got married and started living in the States. Now, I feel OK to have kisses and hugs with Kent in public places, but I still feel uncomfortable doing that in front of other Vietnamese.

Joy also told me that she is constantly working to make their house clean and neat, "but Kent always wants me to sit and relax." She wants her husband to eat more, "but he always says he is on a diet. I am afraid he will get sick if he does not eat more." Joy believes that Americans spend too much time and money in pursuit of comfort, and spend all of their earnings as a result: "It is not right to do so, people should work hard and save money."

This is Kent's first marriage. He has an associate degree from a community college, and works in the customer service section of a small business firm. He cannot speak Vietnamese, and Joy speaks little English, but they somehow manage to communicate. Neither Joy nor Kent ever imagined that they would be part of an interracial marriage. They believe it is God's will, and that they should treat their marriage as a precious gift given by God.

## Jean

Jean is Chinese Vietnamese. Her grandfather moved to Vietnam from China when her father was very young. Jean grew up in a large (11 children) and wealthy family in Ho Chi Minh City. She married her first husband, Chen (also Chinese Vietnamese) when she was 20, and they had a son the following year. Jean fled from Vietnam with her 4-year-old son and natal family in 1978. Chen's request for permission to leave was rejected, so he had to wait for seven years before Jean could sponsor his move.

When he arrived, Chen admitted that he had a second family in Vietnam, and asked for a divorce in order to bring his new wife and daughter to the US. Jean could have refused his request, but she said,

My sister persuaded me to give him a chance to act as a father to our boy, who was already 11 years old ... [she] thought that my son might blame me when he grows up for not rescuing his father.

Jean's decision may also be due to the deep-seated Asian belief that maintaining a broken marriage is better than no marriage at all. In Asia, most women are encouraged to tolerate their husbands' unfaithfulness, based on the belief that giving up a husband because of a mistake that "all men may make" is neither wise nor socially

approved. Another factor in her decision may have been acceptance of the idea that Chen was unsure if he would ever be allowed to leave Vietnam. Jean appears to have moved on with her life, claiming that “although I was sad in the beginning, I don’t hate him any more. I am glad that we are all happy in our new marriages.”

She also had the support of a friend named Paul – now her second husband – who she met at an Asian supermarket. He was a divorced man with two daughters, both living with their mother. Paul told her, “It is all right to file for divorce if one is not happy with a marriage.” He gave Jean and her family a lot of help settling in America, especially with administrative procedures for getting her relatives out of Vietnam. Her failure to reunite with her first husband strengthened her resolve to have a second marriage. She told her first husband, “I will get married and have a child within a year” – perhaps an indication of anger and revenge, but perhaps better interpreted as, “I am a loyal spouse, not a deserted wife. I am still competitive in the marriage market.”

Jean describes Paul as unusual in that “He is not only nice to my son, but also to my mother. I told him that the only requirement in this marriage, if there is one, is taking care of my mother. My mother is my dowry.” Paul says he did not intend to marry an Asian woman, even though he was interested in Chinese women when he was young. “It just happened. I am very happy in this marriage. Jean is the kindest person I have ever met. I think I became a better man after I knew her.” Like most American couples, Paul helps Jean with domestic chores, which are almost exclusively considered women’s responsibilities in Asian societies. But in many other respects they are different from most American couples. Paul told me, “We don’t do everything together, as most American couples do. There is no need for Jean to accompany me to certain social events if she doesn’t want to. The same for me. Jean even let me go to a concert with my female neighbour.”

Thirty years after her departure from Vietnam, Jean still feels sad that she had to leave her homeland because of war, yet she feels lucky that she had the opportunity to settle down and establish a family in America, which she describes as “The best place to live out one’s life. I will only visit Vietnam as a tourist, I won’t live there permanently in my old age.”

## Jennifer

Jennifer, a 27-year-old bilingual college graduate at the time of our interview, was born in the United States. She grew up in a Vietnamese neighbourhood, and was raised according to strict Vietnamese cultural values. During our interview she told me,

My parents and their families fled from Vietnam in the 1970s. My father died when I was ten. My grandmother from my mother’s side came over to take care of me and my two younger sisters, so that my mother could keep her job to raise us.

The grandmother never learned to speak English, therefore Jennifer and her sisters had to speak Vietnamese at home, and almost everything had to be done as it would be in Vietnam. “My mother was strict with me, I could neither hang out with

friends nor come home late. I had to behave like a so-called ‘decent Vietnamese girl.’” Any man interested in becoming Jennifer’s husband had to match three requirements set by her mother: same or higher education, Vietnamese, and Catholic. But she met Bob, her future husband, at work when she was 17. She told me,

My mother was mad at me because he is not Vietnamese. I was prohibited from dating him at the beginning. My mother refused to know more about Bob, even though I swore to her that Bob is a reliable person who can make me happy.

All of Jennifer’s relatives tried to persuade her to terminate the relationship:

They told me that I should not go against my mother, because my father died young and my mother worked hard to raise us ... It’s funny, the reason that I should not marry Bob is not because he is a bad guy, but because he is not Vietnamese, not the kind of person that my mother prefers.

It took more than five years for Jennifer to get her mother’s approval for their marriage. “At least he is Catholic ... I told my mother that I would not get married without her presence at my wedding.” This can be interpreted as an Asian way of declaring respect for one’s parents while searching independently for conjugal happiness.

One sign of Jennifer’s pride in her Vietnamese heritage is her decision to only speak Vietnamese with her daughter: “She will learn to speak English at school anyway. I hope she will be fluent in Vietnamese.” Like most Asian women, she keeps her own “secret money” – personal savings not available to other members of the family. “Vietnamese females like to spend money on dresses and jewellery. But I don’t. I’ll use my secret money to help my husband expand his business.”

---

## Concluding Remarks

Instead of arguing that Vietnamese wives of Taiwanese view marriage in terms of financial security and/or overall improvement in status, it may be more accurate to state that Vietnamese women view marriage as a career or permanent job requiring life-long commitment. From that perspective, as long as a Vietnamese wife fulfils the expected roles of good mother, good wife, and good daughter-in-law, a materially comfortable life in Taiwan is likely. Most of the informants I interviewed in Taiwan expressed a preference for partners who are caring, generous, responsible, hard working, and capable of making money, and assumed that it would be easier to find these characteristics in Taiwanese than in Vietnamese males. Although the majority of my informants did not meet their spouses informally, none of them married Taiwanese under duress. Most made efforts to learn Mandarin Chinese or local dialects and to cook local dishes (in some cases before their arrival in their new country), and expressed eagerness to create families with their Taiwanese husbands and to work toward permanent residency in their new homeland.

All of the Vietnamese wives of Taiwanese stated that they consider children as valuable in their lives, and wanted to have at least one. Since they believe that Taiwan is a better place for their children’s futures, very few emphasized a need to

speak Vietnamese at home. All of the Vietnamese wives of Taiwanese agreed that living conditions in Taiwan were better than in Vietnam, yet some still mentioned the possibility of moving back to Vietnam late in life. When asked if they would make the same decisions if they could turn back the clock, 22 of the 32 interviewees said they would still marry a Taiwanese, and 26 stated a preference for living in Taiwan.

For those Vietnamese wives married to Americans, all of them met their spouses via personal encounters or through social networks. Some of them mentioned that their husbands were interested in Vietnamese culture before they met. After an average of 12.5 years of marriage, one-half claimed that they had no major conflicts with their spouses. Those who did have conflicts mentioned five in particular: dealing with children, spending money, time priorities and energy allocation, companionship, and “invisible cultural shadows.”

Since all of the Vietnamese wives of Americans live in nuclear families, none of them reported having conflicts with parents or parents-in-law. Among the twelve informants who have full-time jobs, eleven said that they do most of the domestic work in their homes, yet none mentioned it as a major issue in their marriages. This finding is surprising in light of complaints by working women in cultures all over the world that they do not get sufficient support from their spouses or children in the form of help with domestic chores. This raises questions concerning whether Vietnamese women are by nature less likely to complain, if they are thoroughly socialized to take care of domestic work, or if they believe that technology has made such tasks easier to perform.

None of the Vietnamese wives of Americans gave evidence of having cultural identity problems. Those born in the US or who moved to the US at young ages identify themselves as Americans, while acknowledging that they have inherited some Vietnamese values from their kinship networks. Those who moved to the US at later ages tend to be more judgmental, agreeing that America is a free country that provides better social services than those available in Vietnam. However, they think that Americans tend to lead lives that are too easy and comfortable. Despite these and other objections concerning American society, none of the Vietnamese wives of Americans stated a strong desire to spend their retirement years in Vietnam. Cited reasons include poor health care and air quality, the greater likelihood of getting sick, the hot and humid weather, “my home and family are here,” “I am used to American life,” “it’s more comfortable here,” and “the US is the best place to live out one’s life.” For the two informants who stated that they might return to Vietnam in their old age, the primary motivation seemed to be “it is easy-going over there” and “it is cheaper and easier to find someone to take care of me.” According to these statements, materialist values make the US an attractive place to live, but once money and other material goods are accumulated, it seems wise to take advantage of lower living expenses in other countries.

The lower level of self-reported life satisfaction among the Vietnamese wives of Taiwanese (7.3/10, versus 9.1/10 among the Vietnamese wives of Americans) may be due to patrilocal residence patterns. However, according to the interviews I conducted in Taiwan, the difference may be due to heavy domestic workloads, the need

to serve large families, and distrust on the part of in-laws. Most of the Vietnamese wives of Taiwanese in this study were not opposed to the concept of fulfilling filial obligations to parents-in-law, but they want their contributions to be noticed, appreciated, and rewarded financially. Some of the informants stated that they would move out of their current households if they could afford to do so. Further research is required to determine the impacts of patrilocal residence patterns, education, income, and age on marital satisfaction in transnational marriages.

**Acknowledgements** Financial support was provided by the Republic of China National Science Council (NSC96-2412-H-001-008). The author wishes to thank all of the study informants for their participation, and the anonymous reviewers for their helpful comments on an earlier draft.

---

## References

- Barbieri, M., & Belanger, D. (Eds.). (2009). *Reconfiguring families in contemporary Vietnam*. Stanford: Stanford University Press.
- Belanger, D., & Oudin, X. (2007). For better or for worse? Working mothers in late Vietnamese socialism. In T. Devasahayam & B. S. A. Yeoh (Eds.), *Working and mothering in Asia: Images, ideologies and identities* (pp. 106–135). Singapore: NUS Press.
- Bitter, R. G. (1986). Late marriage and marital instability: The effects of heterogeneity and inflexibility. *Journal of Marriage and the Family*, 48, 631–640.
- Breger, R., & Hill, R. (Eds.). (1998). *Cross-cultural marriage*. Oxford/ New York: Berg.
- Bumpass, L. L., & Sweet, J. A. (1972). Differentials in marital instability. *American Sociological Review*, 37, 754–766.
- Bumpass, L. L., Martin, T. C., & Sweet, J. A. (1991). The impact of family background and early marital factors on marital disruption. *Journal of Family Issues*, 12(1), 22–42.
- Bureau of Employment and Vocational Training. (2010). *Number of contracted foreign laborers in Taiwan by nationality and gender*. Retrieved December 20, 2010, from <http://www.evta.gov.tw/files/57/2140040.pdf>
- Chiang, W.-V. T. (2002, April). *Language, class and nationalism: A study of the changes of Vietnamese language*. Paper presented at the 2002 Annual meeting of Southeast Asian Studies in Taiwan, Gao-Syong, Taiwan.
- Constable, N. (Ed.). (2005). *Cross-border marriages: Gender and mobility in transnational Asia*. Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press.
- Department of Household Registration Affairs, M.O.I. (2010a). *Number of person aged 15 and above by gender and marital status*. Retrieved December 10, 2010, from [http://www.ris.gov.tw/version96/stpeqr\\_01\\_04.html](http://www.ris.gov.tw/version96/stpeqr_01_04.html)
- Department of Household Registration Affairs, M.O.I. (2010b). *Newlywed brides and grooms in Taiwan by year, gender, and region of origin*. Retrieved December 20, 2010, from [www.ris.gov.tw/ch4/static/m0s409909.xls](http://www.ris.gov.tw/ch4/static/m0s409909.xls)
- Dribe, M., & Lundh, C. (2008). Intermarriage and immigrant integration in Sweden: An exploratory analysis. *Acta Sociologica*, 51(4), 329–354.
- Fu, X. (2008). Interracial marriage and family socio-economic well-being: Equal status exchange or caste status exchange? *The Social Science Journal*, 45, 132–155.
- Gonzalez-Ferrer, A. (2006). Who do immigrants marry? Partner choice among single immigrants in Germany. *European Sociological Review*, 22(2), 171–185.
- Hidalgo, D. A., & Bankston, C. L., III. (2008). Military brides and refugees: Vietnamese American wives and shifting links to the military, 1980–2000. *International Migration*, 46(2), 167–185.
- Jorgensen, S. R., & Klein, D. M. (1979). Sociocultural heterogamy, dissensus, and conflict in marriage. *The Pacific Sociological Review*, 22, 51–75.

- Kalmijn, M., de Graaf, P. M., & Janssen, J. P. G. (2005). Intermarriage and the risk of divorce in the Netherlands: The effects of differences in religion and in nationality, 1974–1994. *Population Studies*, 59(1), 71–85.
- Ko, C.-F. (2009). Globalization and value hybridization: Female marriage migrants in Taiwan and the Netherlands. In F. Shizue (Ed.), *Globalization of cultural pass-down* (pp. 3–31). Taipei: Center for Cross-Cultural Studies, National Chengchi University.
- Ko, C.-F. (2010, December). *Value identities and power relationships among Asian-French couples residing in France*. Paper presented at The International Conference on Migration, Identity and Social Cohesion in Europe. Taiwan, Taipei.
- Lee, S. M., & Edmonston, B. (2005). New marriages, new families: U.S. racial and hispanic intermarriage. *Population Bulletin*, 60(2), 1–36.
- Lehrer, E. L., & Chiswick, C. U. (1993). Religion as a determinant of marital stability. *Demography*, 30(3), 385–404.
- Lu, M. C.-W. (2005). Commercially arranged marriage migration: Case studies of cross-border marriages in Taiwan. *Indian Journal of Gender Studies*, 12(2&3), 275–303.
- Mies, M. (1986). *Patriarchy and accumulation on a world scale: Women in the international division of labour*. London: Zed Book.
- Monden, C. W. S., & Smits, J. (2005). Ethnic intermarriage in times of social change: The case of Latvia. *Demography*, 42(2), 323–345.
- National Immigration Agency. (2010). *Number of foreign and Mainland Chinese spouses in Taiwan*. Retrieved December 10, 2010, from <http://taiwanwhatsup.immigration.gov.tw/ct.asp?xItem=1093250&ctNode=29699&mp=1>
- Nguyen, K. K. (1967). *An introduction to Vietnamese culture*. Tokyo: The Center for East Asian Cultural Studies.
- Nottmeyer, O. (2009). Wedding bells are ringing: Increasing rates of intermarriage in Germany. *Migration Information Source*, October 2009, 1–13.
- van Pham, B. (1999). *The Vietnamese family in change: The case of the Red River Delta*. Richmond: Curzon Press.
- Qian, Z. (1997). Breaking the racial barriers: Variations in interracial marriage between 1980 and 1990. *Demography*, 34(2), 263–276.
- Rosenfeld, M. (2005). A critique of exchange theory in mate selection. *The American Journal of Sociology*, 110(5), 1284–1325.
- Shehan, C. L., Bock, E. W., & Lee, G. R. (1990). Religious heterogamy, religiosity, and marital happiness: The case of Catholics. *Journal of Marriage and the Family*, 52(1), 73–79.
- Smits, J. (2010). Ethnic intermarriage and social cohesion: What can we learn from Yugoslavia? *Social Indicators Research*, 96, 417–432.
- Suzuki, N. (2005). Tripartite desires: Filipina-Japanese marriages and fantasies of transnational traversal. In N. Constable (Ed.), *Cross-border marriages: Gender and mobility in transnational Asia* (pp. 124–144). Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press.
- Thai, H.-C. (2005). Clashing dreams in the Vietnamese diaspora: Highly educated overseas brides and low-wage U. S. husbands. In N. Constable (Ed.), *Cross-border marriages: Gender and mobility in transnational Asia* (pp. 145–165). Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press.
- Thai, H.-C. (2008). *For better or for worse: Vietnamese international marriages in the new global economy*. Piscataway: Rutgers University Press.
- Tzeng, M.-S. (1992). The effects of socioeconomic heterogamy and changes on marital dissolution for first marriage. *Journal of Marriage and the Family*, 54(3), 606–619.
- UNFPA. (2005). *International migration and the millennium development goals: Selected papers of the UNFPA Expert Group Meeting at Marrakech, Morocco*. New York: United Nations Population Fund.
- Wang, H.-Z. (2007). Hidden spaces of resistance of the subordinated: Case studies from Vietnamese female migrant partners in Taiwan. *International Migration Review*, 41(3), 706–727.
- Wang, H.-Z., & Chang, S.-M. (2002). The commodification of international marriages: Cross-border marriage business in Taiwan and Vietnam. *International Migration*, 40(6), 93–116.

---

# Index

## A

Adult Migrant English Program (AMEP), 76  
AFL. *See* Australian Football League (AFL)  
Agency, 5, 11, 50, 58, 74–76, 85, 86, 161–163, 196, 203  
Alte Ceccato, 167–169, 178, 180  
American, 12, 13, 92, 197–201, 204–206, 208  
Anthias, F., 6, 7, 29, 39, 44, 53, 106, 107, 116, 160  
Appadurai, A., 22, 44, 51, 52  
Auntie, 35–38, 41–43, 45  
Australia, 1, 9–11, 14, 66, 75, 76, 78, 81, 84, 85, 91, 92, 94, 95, 105, 109, 110, 114, 117, 119–132, 135–147  
Australian Football League (AFL), 92, 95–97, 99, 101  
Australian values, 74–76  
Autochthonous, 3, 9, 17, 19, 31, 174, 177, 180  
Autonomy, 78, 79, 83

## B

Bangladeshi migrants, 169, 173  
Benevolent racism, 95  
Bhabha, H.K., 115, 145  
Blackness, 139  
Body, 11, 37, 97, 124, 145, 151–155, 160–162  
Brah, A., 7, 8, 51, 54, 56, 62, 68, 106  
BrAsians, 9, 51, 53, 55, 59, 61–63, 66–68  
Britishness, 68, 116  
Brubaker, R., 6, 8, 136, 137  
Butler, J., 74, 92, 144, 145

## C

Capabilities for freedom, 78, 85–87  
Capital, 73, 78, 81, 86

Chinese, 30, 109, 137, 142, 146, 196–198, 200, 202–207  
Citizenship, 19, 38, 47, 49–51, 53, 58, 75, 76, 86, 120, 122, 123, 131, 137, 176–178, 199, 203  
Clifford, J., 6, 52, 135, 136, 168  
Contraception, 152–154, 158, 159  
Cosmopolitanism, 2–4, 10, 38, 60, 120, 122, 125, 126, 129, 131, 146  
Critical Race Theory, 10, 91  
Critical thought, 82

## D

Deleuze, G., 50  
Deterritorialization, 50  
Diachronic, 18  
Diaspora, 2, 4–9, 11–14, 18, 32, 35–38, 40, 43, 45, 47, 53, 54, 68, 92–94, 119, 120, 123, 124, 127, 130, 131, 135–137, 139, 140, 144–147, 168–170, 172–175, 177–180  
Diaspora space, 68  
Discourse, 52, 74–76, 82, 83, 85, 86, 92, 94–98, 100–102, 119–122, 124, 130, 138, 139, 143, 145, 146, 151, 153, 160, 161  
reverse, 86  
Dominant culture, 76

## E

Education policy, 10, 13, 73–76, 86  
Empowerment, 83  
Essed, P., 92, 138  
Essentialism, 6, 50



- Ethnicity, 6, 7, 9, 18, 20, 30, 31, 39, 47, 52, 55, 57, 58, 62, 83, 110, 124, 126, 139, 155, 158, 162
- F**
- Faist, T., 5, 6, 168
- Family, 1, 4, 5, 8, 11–13, 19–26, 30, 31, 35–38, 40, 42, 45, 46, 56, 57, 59, 64, 82, 83, 86, 131, 142, 144, 169–180, 184–193, 197, 198, 200–208
- Fathers, 64, 114, 175–178
- Feminism, 7, 73, 153
- Feminist, researchers, 73
- Forced migration policy, 73, 74, 85
- Foreign spouses, 196
- Foucault, M., 73–75, 78, 86, 138, 144, 145  
reverse discourse, 76
- Freedom, 78, 79, 82, 85, 86
- Freire, P., 86
- G**
- Gekas, A., 2, 3
- Gender, 3, 7, 12, 13, 19, 37, 51, 53, 55, 57, 58, 63, 65, 66, 124, 127, 136, 143, 151–156, 158–163, 173, 180, 184, 186–193, 195, 197
- Gender roles, 12, 13, 55, 184, 187–189, 191–193
- Gilroy, P., 6, 49
- Glick Schiller, N., 5, 6, 21, 55, 59
- Globalization, 5, 44, 50, 52, 120–122, 130, 136, 137, 144, 184, 193
- Gorman, D., 49
- Greek community, 9, 105, 108–110, 113, 114
- Guattari, F., 50
- H**
- Hall, S., 4, 6, 8, 32, 39, 47, 63, 137
- Haneef, M. Dr., 119, 120, 122, 124–131
- Hanley, W., 3
- Husbands, 12, 56, 64, 143, 170, 172, 177, 184–186, 188–193, 196, 197, 199–201, 205, 207, 208
- I**
- Independence, 78, 83
- India, 10, 50, 59, 61, 66, 119, 123, 124, 126–130, 154
- Internationalization, 120, 122, 123
- Internet forum discussions, 11, 154, 155, 162
- Intersectionality, 7, 53, 54, 152
- Interviews, 74, 76, 79, 80, 83–85, 87
- Islam, 35–40, 44, 46, 47, 55, 68, 69, 82, 120, 125, 178, 179
- Italy, 11, 17–32, 167–180
- J**
- Japanese, 11, 135–147, 199
- L**
- Ladson-Billings, G., 91, 93
- Letter to the Editor, 10, 14
- Levitt, P., 21, 50, 52, 55, 59
- Los Angeles, 12, 183–193
- Luke, A., 139
- M**
- Mainstream social participation, 76, 86
- Maori, 9, 10, 14, 91–94, 100
- Marginality, 74
- Material effect, 85
- Media, 10, 58, 66, 73, 92–95, 97, 98, 100, 102, 108, 120, 122–131, 143, 199
- Migration, 1, 5, 9–13, 17, 18, 26, 40, 51, 53–55, 61, 73–75, 85, 109, 114, 120, 123, 131, 135, 136, 140, 141, 144, 146, 151, 152, 154, 160, 162, 163, 167–179, 184–187, 189, 193
- Milan, E., 9, 17, 19
- Mimicry, 137, 139, 145
- Multiculturalism, 14, 47, 50, 61, 62, 66, 69, 75, 105, 106, 111, 115, 116, 120, 127–131
- Muslims, 35–47, 179
- N**
- Nationalism, 10, 14, 21, 52, 121, 122, 124–127, 129–131, 160, 161
- Nepali, 183–193
- New York, 12, 119, 121, 126, 183–193
- Norway, 9, 13, 35–46
- Nostalgia, 3, 8, 169
- O**
- Oakleigh, 105–116
- Olssen, M., 74, 78, 79, 85, 86
- Open mind, 79, 81, 82

**P**

Poles, 151–163  
 Polis, 86  
 Potential, 79, 85  
 Power relations, 7, 8, 11, 139, 147, 184, 187, 188  
 Preschool, 36–46  
 Privilege, 75  
 Prostitutes, 11, 136, 139–141, 143, 146, 155

**R**

Race, 6, 7, 47, 55, 57–59, 63–65, 91–97, 99, 100, 102, 119, 120, 123, 127, 135, 138, 139, 146, 155  
 Racialisation, 11, 13  
 Racism, 8–10, 12–14, 20, 21, 49, 55, 58, 62, 64–66, 92–96, 98–100, 102, 106, 119–122, 124, 126–128, 130, 131, 135, 136, 138, 139, 172, 198  
 Racist, 3, 7, 62, 63, 92, 93, 96, 98–102, 127, 146, 167  
 Rattansi, A., 135, 138, 145  
 Refugee journey, 78  
 Refugee women, 9, 10, 13, 73–76, 81, 83–87  
 Religious, 6, 24, 37–39, 44, 47, 50, 52, 55, 61, 62, 80, 153, 177–179, 183, 191  
 Representation(s), 9, 10, 19, 47, 73–76, 83, 85–87, 91, 94, 97, 99, 102, 121, 126, 139, 144  
   material effects, 73  
 Resistance, 8, 9, 12, 23, 50, 59, 60, 62, 63, 67, 68, 75, 111, 115, 138, 145, 176, 179  
 Rights, 5, 29, 38, 44, 61, 76, 79, 120, 122, 126–132, 153, 160–162, 176, 179, 183  
 Romantic love, 196, 201

**S**

Safran, E., 5, 52, 93, 94, 123, 127  
 Sayad, A., 168, 173–175  
 Sayyid, S., 51, 121  
 Self-author, 87  
 Self-authorship, 83, 84, 86  
 Settlement policy, 76  
 Sexualisation, 11, 13  
 Social drama, 10, 13, 105–108, 111–113, 115, 116  
 Social identity, 172

Spatiality, 13, 50  
 Spouse, 176, 203, 206  
 Starr, D., 2  
 Stranger, 92, 169  
 Synchronic dimension, 18

**T**

Tactical ethnicity, 31  
 Taiwan, 12, 13, 195–209  
 Transnational, 5, 19, 21–23, 30, 35, 50, 52, 67, 122–124, 127, 130–132, 139, 144, 145, 162, 184, 185, 187–189, 193, 196, 199, 201, 202, 209  
 Transnational marriages, 196, 201, 209  
 Trouble in the mall, 105, 107, 113, 116  
 Tsolidis, G., 1–14, 40, 44, 51, 105–117  
 Turner, V., 105–108, 111–113, 115, 116, 122

**U**

United Kingdom (UK), 9, 11, 13, 53, 54, 56, 66, 67, 137, 151–156, 158–162  
 USA, 12, 38, 123, 195–209

**V**

Values, 17, 24, 29, 31, 42–44, 46, 60, 75, 76, 79, 81, 84, 86, 92, 106, 107, 123, 125, 126, 131, 137, 140, 145, 154, 161, 163, 171, 174, 197, 198, 200, 206, 208  
 Victimhood, 74, 85  
 Vietnamese, 12, 13, 195–209  
 Vietnamese wives, 196, 197, 200, 201, 207–209  
 Voice, 84

**W**

War-brides, 136, 139, 140, 143–146  
 Whiteness, 49, 60, 62, 63, 139, 145  
 Wives, 12, 84, 142, 157, 171, 172, 174, 186, 188, 190–193, 196, 197, 199–201, 207–209  
 Work status, 190, 191

**Y**

Yuval-Davis, N., 7, 53, 160